PROCEEDINGS

THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

VOLUME III.

PROCEEDINGS RELATING TO THE CENTRAL PROVINCES (INCLUDING THE HYDERABAD ASSIGNED DISTRICTS).

SECTION I.—NOTICES AND PAPERS CALLING FOR EVIDENCE, AND INFORMATION SUPPLIED BY THE CHIEF COMMISSIONER OF THE CENTRAL PROVINCES AND THE RESIDENT AT HYDERABAD.

SECTION II.—MINUTES OF EVIDENCE TAKEN IN THE CENTRAL PROVINCES.

SECTION III.—REPLIES OF SOCIETIES AND ASSOCIATIONS.

CALCUTTA:
PRINTED BY THE SUPERINTENDENT OF GOVERNMENT PRINTING, INDIA.
1888.

PROCEEDINGS

OF

THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

CENTRAL PROVINCES (INCLUDING THE HYDERABAD ASSIGNED DISTRICTS).

VOLUME III SECTIONS I—III.

CONTENTS.

SECTION I, SUB-SECTION A.—NOTICES AND PAPERS CALLING FOR EVIDENCE IN THE CENTRAL PROVINCES.

No. PAGE

I.—NOTICE, dated 27th December 1886, published in the *Central Provinces Gazette* on the 1st of January 1887 1

II.—NOTICE issued by the Chief Commissioner on the 13th December 1886, and published in the Provincial newspapers . . . . . *ib.*

III.—LETTER No. 4, dated the 16th November 1886, from the Secretary, Public Service Commission, to the Secretary to the Chief Commissioner of the Central Provinces, calling for lists of officials, associations, and members of the general public who might be consulted; and the reply No. 5759-328, dated 11th December 1886 . . . . . *ib.*

IV.—LETTER No. 19, dated Lahore, the 30th November 1886, from the Secretary, Public Service Commission, to the Secretary to the Chief Commissioner, forwarding copies of five separate sets of questions for distribution, and list of persons to whom copies were distributed 3

V.—LIST of persons who were summoned or invited or who volunteered to give evidence before the Public Service Commission at its sittings at Jubbulpore, Central Provinces 5

SECTION I, SUB-SECTION B.—INFORMATION SUPPLIED BY THE CHIEF COMMISSIONER OF THE CENTRAL PROVINCES.

I.—Minute by MR. A. MACKENZIE, C.S., Chief Commissioner 9

II.—Replies to set A of the questions (circulated to Local Governments and Administrations) by Mr. A. H. L. FRASER, C.S., Secretary to the Chief Commissioner 11

III.—MEMORANDUM on the special features of the Central Provinces bearing upon its administration 25

IV.—Replies by MR. R. J. CROSTHWAITE, C.S., Judicial Commissioner of the Central Provinces 31

V.—LETTER No. 3, dated the 16th November 1886, calling for detailed information showing the number of "charges" or offices in which Covenanted or Uncovenanted Officers engaged in the Executive and Judicial Administration are employed; and the reply No. 442-329, dated the 28th January 1887 . . 33

VI.—LETTER No. 89, dated the 5th of January 1887, calling for statistics showing the University Examinations passed by persons employed in the Subordinate Judicial and Executive Services; and the reply No. 901-46, dated the 25th of February 1887 35

VII.—LETTER No. 102, dated the 22nd of January 1887, calling for a return showing the nationalities and castes of persons employed in the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Services; and the reply No. 580-26, dated the 4th of February 1887 36

VIII.—LETTER No. 131, dated the 7th of March 1887, calling for information showing the extent to which encouragement is offered to Natives of the Central Pro-

SUB-SECTION B.—*continued.*

PAGE

No. vinces by means of Government scholarships or otherwise to proceed to England for the purpose of completing their education; and the reply No. 1662-86, dated the 31st of March 1887 40

IX.—LETTER No. 133, dated the 10th of March 1887, asking for a full and detailed answer to question 232 41

SECTION I, SUB-SECTION C.—INFORMATION SUPPLIED BY THE RESIDENT, HYDERABAD, REGARDING THE HYDERABAD ASSIGNED DISTRICTS (BERAR).

I.—Memorandum on the special features of the Hyderabad Assigned Districts bearing on their administration 45

II.—LETTER No. 3, dated the 16th November 1886, calling for information showing in detail the number of "charges" or offices in which Covenanted or Uncovenanted Officers engaged in the Executive and Judicial Administration are employed, &c.; and the reply No. 3325R., dated Hyderabad, the 27th of December 1886 48

III.—LETTER No. 4, dated the 16th November 1886, calling for a list of selected officers serving in the Hyderabad Assigned Districts whom it might be considered desirable to invite to give evidence, and a list of associations, editors of newspapers and members of the general public who might be consulted 49

IV.—DEMI-OFFICIAL LETTER, dated the 1st December 1886, to the Secretary (for Berar) to the Resident of Hyderabad, forwarding copies of sets of questions, and calling for evidence 50

V.—LETTER No. 360R, dated Hyderabad Residency, the 12th of February 1887, from the Secretary for Berar to the Resident, to the Secretary, Public Service Commission, (1) stating the measures taken to meet the desire of the Commission to receive evidence from all classes generally known; and (2) giving a list of persons who the Resident thought might be examined with advantage 50

VI.—LETTER No. 89, dated the 5th of January 1887, calling for statistics showing the University Examinations passed by persons employed in the Subordinate Judicial and Executive Services; and the reply No. 614R., dated the 14th of March 1887 51

VII.—LETTER No. 102, dated the 22nd of January 1887, calling for a return showing the nationalities and castes of persons employed in the Subordinate Judicial and Executive Services in the Hyderabad Assigned Districts; and the reply No. 613R., dated the 14th of March 1887 52

VIII.—LETTER No. 131, dated the 7th of March 1887, calling for information as to the extent to which encouragement is offered to Natives of the Hyderabad Assigned Districts by means of Government scholarships or otherwise to proceed to England for the purpose of completing their education; and the reply No. 1455R., dated the 6th of June 1887 53

IX.—LETTER No. 133, dated the 10th of March 1887, calling for a full and detailed reply to question No. 232; and the reply No. 713R., dated the 23rd of March 1887 53

SECTION II.—MINUTES OF EVIDENCE TAKEN IN THE CENTRAL PROVINCES.

(SITTINGS AT JUBBULPORE.)

1.—C. A. R. BROWNING, Esq., M.A., C.I.E., Inspector General of Education, Central Provinces 1

2.—W. YOUNG, Esq., Principal, Rajkumar School, Jubbulpore 10

3.—BABU BISSASSAR DUTT, Extra Assistant Commissioner . . . . . *ib.*

4.—LALLA BEHARI LALL KHAZANCHI, Banker and Landowner 13

5.—PUNDIT HET RAM, C.I.E., Dewan of Rewah 14

6.—DHONDU BALKRISHNA DEV, Editor, *Nagpur News* 15

7.—CHOWDHRI UMRAO SINGH, Delegate of a Hindu Association 18

8.—AULAD HUSSEIN, KHAN BAHADUR, C.I.E., Settlement Officer 19

9.—ALI AHMED, Delegate, Anjuman-i-Islamia 21

10.—SETH GOKALDAS BALABDAS, RAI BAHADUR, Banker 22

11.—C. W. MCMINN, Esq., C.S., Deputy Commissioner 23

12.—J. W. NEILL, Esq., C.S., Commissioner 30

SECTION II.—*concluded.*

No. PAGE
13.—B. M. GREAMY, Esq., Extra Assistant Commissioner 38
14.—VITHAL RAO, Extra Assistant Commissioner 39
15.—SYAD MAHOMMED HUSSEIN, Tahsildar, Marwara 40
16.—SHANKUR RAO MADHO RAO, CHITNAVIS, B.A., Statutory Civilian . . . 42
17.—THAKUR MAHARAJ SINGH, Secretary to the Hit Sabha of Saugor . . . *ib.*
18.—ARTHUR WRIXON, Esq., Pleader, Central Provinces 43
19.—MAULVI MAHOMED NAZAM-UD-DIN HOSSEIN KHAN, B.A., B.L., Assistant Commissioner 44
20.—PURUSHOTTAMRAO NARYAN, Extra Assistant Commissioner, Berar . . . 45
21.—LESLIE SAUNDERS, Esq., C.S., Commissioner of the Berars . . . 47
22.—R. D. HARE, Esq., Assistant Commissioner, Berar 52
23.—SRIRAM BHIKAJI JATAR, B.A., Director, Public Instruction, Berar . . . 54
24.—DEO RAO VINAYAK, Pleader, Berar 55
25.—RANGANATH NARSINH MUDHOLKAR, B.A., LL.B., Pleader, High Court, Bombay 57
26.—VENKATESH RAMCHUNDRA MUDHOLKAR, Editor of the *Berari*, Akola . . 59
27.—PRAHLAD NARAYAN JOG, Pleader, High Court, Bombay 60

SECTION III, SUB-SECTION A.—REPLIES OF SOCIETIES AND ASSOCIATIONS.

I.—The LOKA SABHA, Nagpur 4
II.—The HITKARNI SABHA, Jubbulpur 6
III.—The HIT SABHA, Saugor 8

SECTION III, SUB-SECTION B.—REPLIES OF PERSONS SUMMONED OR INVITED, BUT WHO WERE UNABLE TO ATTEND THE SITTINGS OF THE COMMISSION.

I.—A. H. L. FRASER, Esq., C.S., Secretary to the Chief Commissioner of the Central Provinces 10
II.—J. W. CHISHOLM, Esq., Commissioner, Chhattisgarh Division, Central Provinces 15
III.—F. C. ANDERSON, Esq., C.S., Commissioner of Excise 18
IV.—J. P. GOODRIDGE, Esq., C.S., Deputy Commissioner, Sambalpur . . . 20
V.—BABU HARI DAS GHOSE, M.A., B.L., Pleader, Hoshangabad 22
VI.—GOPAL RAO DONGRE, B.A., Additional Tahsildar, Khandwa 31
VII.—BERESHWAR DUTT, Extra Assistant Commissioner, Jubbulpur . . 33
VIII.—BALWANT RAO BHASKAR, Jagirdar of Tummeim and Honorary Magistrate, Burhanpur 42
IX.—K. K. THAKUR, M.A., B.L., Extra Assistant Commissioner, Khandwa . . 45
X.—KASTUR CHAND DAGA, Honorary Magistrate, Kamptee 49
XI.—VILKA RAM CHANDER, Extra Assistant Commissioner, Hoshangabad . . 51
XII.—BABU BIPIN KRISHNA BOSE, Advocate, Judicial Commissioner's Court, Central Provinces 54
XIII.—SADASHU RAMCHANDRA PATVARDHAN, Pleader and Editor, *Nyaya Sudha* Newspaper, Harda, Central Provinces 62

SECTION III, SUB-SECTION C.—SELECTED REPLIES.

I.—F. W. DILLON, Esq., Barrister-at-Law, Nagpur 66

PROCEEDINGS

OF

THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

VOLUME III.—PROCEEDINGS RELATING TO THE CENTRAL PROVINCES (INCLUDING THE HYDERABAD ASSIGNED DISTRICTS).

SECTION I.—NOTICES AND PAPERS CALLING FOR EVIDENCE, AND INFORMATION SUPPLIED BY THE CENTRAL PROVINCES ADMINISTRATION AND THE RESIDENT AT HYDERABAD.

SECTION I, SUB-SECTION A.—NOTICES AND PAPERS CALLING FOR EVIDENCE IN THE CENTRAL PROVINCES.

SECTION I, SUB-SECTION B.—INFORMATION SUPPLIED BY THE CHIEF COMMISSIONER OF THE CENTRAL PROVINCES.

SECTION I, SUB-SECTION C.—INFORMATION SUPPLIED BY THE RESIDENT AT HYDERABAD REGARDING THE HYDERABAD ASSIGNED DISTRICTS (BERARS).

PROCEEDINGS

OF

THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

VOLUME III—PROCEEDINGS RELATING TO THE CENTRAL PROVINCES (INCLUDING THE HYDERABAD ASSIGNED DISTRICTS).

SECTION I, SUB-SECTION A.—NOTICES AND PAPERS CALLING FOR EVIDENCE.

I.

The following notice dated the 27th December 1886 was published in the *Central Provinces* and Hyderabad Resident's *Gazettes* on the 1st and 3rd January 1887, respectively, by order of the President of the Public Service Commission :— Vol. III. Sec. I. Sub-Sec. A. C. P.

NOTICE.

As the Public Service Commission propose shortly to hold their sittings at Jubbulpore in the Central Provinces, persons resident in the Central Provinces, who may be desirous of tendering evidence on the subject of the Commission's enquiries, are invited to communicate their names and addresses to the Secretary to the Public Service Commission, Allahabad, on or before the 6th January 1887, together with a brief note of the points on which they would wish to give evidence.

F. C. DAUKES,
Secretary to the Public Service Commission.

LAHORE;
27th December 1886.

II.

The Chief Commissioner of the Central Provinces caused the following notice to be circulated to all vernacular newspapers in the Central Provinces :—

NOTICE.

The Public Service Commission, which has been appointed by the Government of India to re-open and consider carefully the question of the admission of Natives of India to higher and more extensive employment in the public service, will be glad to receive the opinions of any association or of any gentlemen, whether or not in the service of Government, who may wish to lay their views before the Commission. Full particulars regarding the appointment and duties of the Commission are given in the Notification by the Government of India in the Home Department, No. 1572, dated the 4th October 1886, published in Part I of the *Central Provinces Gazette* of the 16th October last.

A. H. L. FRASER,
Offg. Secy. to the Chief Commr., Central Provinces.

The 13th December 1886.

III.

No. 4, dated Lahore, the 16th November 1886.

From—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission,

To—The Secretary to the Chief Commissioner of the Central Provinces.

I AM directed to request that, with the permission of the Chief Commissioner, the Public Service Commission may be favoured with a list of the names of selected officers serving in the Central Provinces and belonging to (*a*) the Covenanted Civil Service, (*b*) the Statutory Service, and (*c*) the Uncovenanted Service, whose opinions the Chief Commis- Vol. III. Sec. I. Sub-Sec. A. C. P.

sioner may consider it desirable for the Commission to invite on the subject-matter of the enquiries with which it has been entrusted as set forth in the Resolution of the Government of India in the Home Department No. 34—1573-80, dated 4th October 1886. I am also to request that the Commission may be favoured with a list of (1) any local Associations or Societies, (2) the Editors of the leading Newspapers, both English and Vernacular, published in the Central Provinces who should, in the opinion of the Chief Commissioner, be consulted by the Commission. The Commission would further be glad if the Chief Commissioner would be good enough to suggest the names of any members of the general public, not being in Government service, who might with advantage be consulted on the subject-matter of the enquiries in question.

2. It is hoped that the Chief Commissioner will be good enough to let it be generally known throughout the Central Provinces that the Public Service Commission will be glad to receive the opinions of any Association or Society or of any gentlemen, whether or not in the service of Government, who may wish to lay their views before the Commission.

No. 5759—328, dated Nagpur, the 11th December 1886.

From—A. C. Duff, Esq., C. S., Under-Secretary to the Chief Commissioner, Central Provinces,

To—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission.

I am directed to forward, in compliance with the request contained in your letter No. 4, dated 16th November 1886, a list containing the names of the various officers, local Associations or Societies, Editors and members of the general public whose opinions the Officiating Chief Commissioner considers the Public Service Commission may with advantage invite on the subject-matter of the enquiries with which it has been entrusted as set forth in the Resolution of the Government of India in the Home Department, No. 34—1573-80, dated 4th October 1886.

2. I am to explain that the name of no Statutory Civil Servant is included in the list, as the only two Statutory Civilians hitherto appointed in these Provinces are both too young and inexperienced to give an opinion on the questions involved which would be of value.

3. With regard to paragraph 2 of your letter I am to state that Mr. Fitzpatrick will cause a notice to be inserted in the English and Vernacular Gazettes to the effect that the Public Service Commission will be glad to receive the opinions of any Association or of any gentlemen, whether or not in the service of Government, who may wish to lay their views before the Commission, and he will cause copies of this notice to be distributed to the Editors of all local newspapers.

LIST.

A.—Officers of the Covenanted Civil Service.

1. Mr. J. W. Neill, Commissioner.
2. „ J. P. Goodridge, Deputy Commissioner.

B.—Officers of the Uncovenanted Service.

1. Mr. J. W. Chisholm, Commissioner.
2. Mr. C. A. R. Browning, C. I. E., Inspector General of Education.
3. Babu Biresar Dutt, Extra Assistant Commissioner.
4. Aulad Hussein, Khan Bahadur, C. I. E., Settlement Officer.
5. Mr. Vithal Rao Ramchandra, Extra Assistant Commissioner.

C.—Local Associations.

1. The Lok Sabha, Nagpur.
2. „ Hit Sabha, Saugor.
3. „ Anjaman-i-Islamia, Jubbulpore.
4. „ Hindi Sabha, Jubbulpore.

D.—Editors.

1. Editor of the Nagpur News (Nagpur).
2. „ Central India News (Jubbulpore).
3. „ Nyaya Sudha (Harda).
4. „ Manji-Nerbada (Hoshangabad).

E.—MEMBERS OF THE GENERAL PUBLIC.

1. Babu Bippin Bose, Pleader (Nagpur).
2. Kazi Habib-ul-Rahman (Burhanpur).
3. Seth Gokul Dass, Rai Bahadur (Jubbulpore).
4. Seth Kasturchand (Kamptee).
5. Balwant Rao Bhuskutte (Burhanpur).
6. Raja Sudhal Deo, Chief of Bawra.
7. Mr. Gangadhar Rao Chitnavis (Nagpur).
8. The Reverend J. G. Cooper (Nagpur).
9. The Reverend Father Pelvat (Nagpur).

IV.

No. 19, dated Lahore, 30th November 1886.

From—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission,

To—The Secretary to the Chief Commissioner, Central Provinces.

IN continuation of my letter No. 4, dated 16th November 1886, I am directed by the Public Service Commission to forward herewith five separate sets of questions bearing on their enquiries which the Commission desire to address (1) to the several Local Governments and Administrations, (2) to selected officers of the Covenanted Civil Service, (3) to selected Statutory Civilians, (4) to selected officers of the Uncovenanted Service, and (5) to such Associations and Societies, Editors of Newspapers, Vernacular and English, and members of the general public, not being in the service of Government, as it may be considered desirable to consult on the subject-matter of the enquiries of the Commission.

2. With reference to the questions (marked A) addressed to the Chief Commissioner, twenty-five copies of which are forwarded, I am to say that the Commission would be glad if the Chief Commissioner, after consulting such officers or authorities as he may see fit with regard to any of them, would be good enough to cause replies to be furnished to me with as little delay as possible. It is not necessary that the replies should be detained until all the questions have been answered, and it might be convenient if answers were sent from time to time as prepared, provided that the serial number attached to each question is correctly entered opposite the reply thereto. As some of the questions deal with statistical matters it might further be convenient if the replies to these were thrown into a tabular form; but if this course is adopted, I am to request that care may be taken that the question or questions which each tabular statement embraces are accurately noted. Other questions, again, may possibly be better answered orally than in writing, and if this should appear to the Chief Commissioner to be the case, the Commission would be glad if the Chief Commissioner would indicate in what way the answers to such questions could most conveniently be given, either by the deputation of some special officer to represent the views of the Local Government or in any other manner which may be deemed preferable.

3 As regards the other sets of questions, I am to explain that those marked B, C and D, respectively, are intended to be addressed to such officers, being members of the Covenanted Civil Service, the Statutory Service, or the Uncovenanted Service, as might, in the opinion of the Chief Commissioner, be consulted with advantage by the Commission on the subject-matter of their enquiries. Five copies of set B (for selected officers of the Covenanted Service) are forwarded herewith, with one copy of set C (for selected Statutory Civilians) and five copies of set D (for selected officers of the Uncovenanted Service); and I am to request that, with the permission of the Chief Commissioner a copy of each set of these questions with one of the letters attached thereto in original, may be supplied to those officers serving in the Central Provinces whom the Chief Commissioner may consider it desirable to consult. It will be noticed that alternative covering letters are attached to each of these sets of questions, the object being to distinguish between the cases of officers whom, owing either to their position in the service of Government or to the nature of the evidence which they may be expected to give, it is considered desirable to *summon* as witnesses before the Commission, and of those whom it is not deemed necessary to summon as witnesses, but who might be invited voluntarily to offer evidence. It is left to the Chief Commissioner to determine the officers in the Central Provinces who should be classed under each of these categories, and to distribute accordingly all the sets of questions, or as many sets as may be considered necessary, accompanied by the appropriate covering letter in each case. In order to meet the case of officers of Government or others who, although not specially consulted, may nevertheless be desirous of offering evidence before the Commission, it is proposed to issue a Notification inviting such persons to intimate their names and addresses to the Secretary to the Commission with a brief note of the particular points on which they wish to give evidence. When the plan of the Commission's operations has been further settled, copies of the Notification will be communicated to the Chief Commissioner for

insertion in the local Gazette and in some of the leading local newspapers, English and Vernacular.

4. The remaining set of questions, marked E, of which ten copies are forwarded, is intended for issue with the attached letters to selected local Associations and Societies, Editors of newspapers (English and Vernacular), and members of the general public. It will be observed that two covering letters are attached to this set of questions, one of which is intended for issue to the Editors of newspapers or members of the general public, and the other to Associations or Societies. The Commission would feel obliged if the Chief Commissioner would be good enough to cause these sets of questions to be issued, with the appropriate covering letter in each case, to such bodies or individuals of the classes named in the Central Provinces as may, in the opinion of the Chief Commissioner, be expected to give useful advice on the subject matter of the present enquiries.

5. It is hoped that the questions will be issued under the supervision of some responsible officer and with as little delay as practicable, and I am particularly to request that the Commission may be furnished with a complete and accurate list of all Associations, Societies, or persons, whether official or non-official, to whom sets of the questions may be communicated, the names of the Government officers who may be summoned to attend as witnesses, or who may be invited to give evidence, being separately given with their addresses in each case. The replies should, in all cases, be sent direct by those consulted to the Secretary to the Public Service Commission, and if additional copies of any of the sets of questions are required for use in the Central Provinces, they will be at once supplied on application.

LIST RECEIVED IN REPLY TO THE ABOVE LETTER.

List of persons (official and non-official) and Associations to whom the questions framed by the Public Service Commission have been communicated under the orders of the Chief Commissioner, Central Provinces.

ENCLOSURE A		R. J. Crosthwaite, Esq., Judicial Commissioner, Nagpur. F. C. Anderson, Esq., Commissioner of Excise, Nagpur. Colonel M. M. Bowie, Inspector General of Police, Nagpur.
ENCLOSURE B		J. W. Neill, Esq., Commissioner, Jubbulpore. A. H. L. Fraser, Esq., Secretary to Chief Commissioner, Nagpur. J. P. Goodridge, Esq., Deputy Commissioner, Sambalpur.
ENCLOSURE D		J. W. Chisholm, Esq., Commissioner, Chhattisgarh Division, Raipur. C. A. R. Browning, Esq., M.A., C.I.E., Inspector General of Education, Nagpur. W. Young, Esq., Principal, Rajkumar School, Jubbulpore. Khan Bahadur Aulad Hussain, C.I.E., Settlement Officer, Raipur. Mr. Biresar Datt, Extra Assistant Commissioner, Jubbulpore. Mr. Vithal Rao Ramchandra, Extra Assistant Commissioner, Hoshangabad.
ENCLOSURE E	Non-official.	Babu Bippin Kristo Bose, Pleader, Nagpur. Rao Balwant Rao Bhuskutte, Burhanpur. Habib-ul-Rahman Kazi, Burhanpur. Seth Gokal Dass, Rai Bahadur, Banker, Jubbulpore. Seth Kastur Chand, Banker, Kamptee.
	Associations.	Lok Sabha, Nagpur. Hit Sabha, Saugor. Anjaman-i-Islamia, Jubbulpore. Hindi Sabha, Jubbulpore.
	Editors.	Editor, Nagpur News. Do. Central India News. Do. Nyaya Sudha. Do. Manji-Nerbada.

V.

List of persons who were summoned or invited or who volunteered to give evidence before the Public Service Commission and who were examined at Jubbulpore in the Central Provinces on the 11th, 12th and 13th January 1887.

Serial number.	Names of Witnesses.	Appointment (if in Government service) or profession of witness.	Whether summoned, invited, or voluntary.	Remarks.
1	C. A. R. Browning, Esq., M.A., C.I.E.	Inspector General of Education, Central Provinces	Invited.	
2	W. Young, Esq.	Principal, Rajkumar School, Jubbulpore	"	
3	Babu Bissassar Dutt	Extra Assistant Commissioner	"	
4	Lalla Behari Lall Khazanchi	Banker and Landowner	"	
5	Pundit Het Ram, C.I.E.	Dewan of Rewah	"	
6	Dhondu Balkrishna Dev	Editor, *Nagpur News*	"	
7	Chowdhri Umrao Singh	Delegate of a Hindu Association	"	
8	Aulad Hussein, Khan Bahadur, C.I.E.	Settlement Officer	"	
9	Ali Ahmed	Delegate, Anjaman-i-Islamia	"	
10	Seth Gokaldas Balabdas, Rai Bahadur	Banker	"	
11	C. W. McMinn, Esq., C.S.	Deputy Commissioner	"	
12	J. W. Neill, Esq., C.S.	Commissioner	"	
13	B. M. Greamy, Esq.	Extra Assistant Commissioner	"	
14	Vithal Rao	Ditto ditto	"	
15	Syad Mahomed Hussein	Tahsildar, Marwara	"	
16	Shankur Rao Madho Rao Chitnavis, B.A.	Statutory Civilian	"	
17	Thakur Maharaj Singh	Secretary to the Hit Sabha of Saugor	"	
18	Arthur Wrixon, Esq.	Pleader, Central Provinces	"	
19	Maulvi Mahomed Nizam-ud-din Hossein Khan, B.A.	Assistant Commissioner	"	
20	Purshottam Narain	Extra Assistant Commissioner, Berar	"	
21	Leslie Saunders, Esq., C.S.	Commissioner of the Berars	"	
22	R. D. Hare, Esq.	Assistant Commissioner, Berar	"	
23	Sri Ram Bhikaji Jatar	Director, Public Instruction, Berar	"	
24	Deo Rao Vinayak	Pleader, Berar	"	
25	Ranganath Narsinh Mudholkar, B.A., B.L.	Pleader, High Court, Bombay	"	
26	Venkatash Ramchundra	Editor of the *Berari*, Akola	"	
27	Prublad Narain Yod	Pleader, High Court, Bombay	"	

PROCEEDINGS

OF

THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

VOLUME III.—PROCEEDINGS RELATING TO THE CENTRAL PROVINCES (INCLUDING THE HYDERABAD ASSIGNED DISTRICTS).

SECTION I, SUB-SECTION B.—INFORMATION SUPPLIED BY THE CHIEF COMMISSIONER OF THE CENTRAL PROVINCES.

I.

MINUTE BY A. MACKENZIE, ESQ., C.S., CHIEF COMMISSIONER.

I found on taking charge of this Administration that replies were still due to the Civil Service Commission in respect of their letters—

(1) No. 19 of the 30th November 1886, forwarding their general series of 324 questions;

(2) No. 131 of the 7th March 1887, regarding encouragement to Natives to proceed to England (since disposed of in Secretariat letter No. 1378-73, dated 21st March); and

(3) No. 133 of the 10th March 1887, asking for a full reply to Question No. 232 of the general series as applicable to the Central Provinces.

2. I have been too short a time in office to venture to reply with any authority to the general interrogatories as affecting these Provinces, but as my two immediate predecessors, Messrs. Crosthwaite and Fitzpatrick, have both been members of the Commission, this is perhaps a matter of no great moment. This circumstance may also be held to render it unnecessary that I should trouble the Commission at any length with my personal opinions upon all the interesting problems suggested by their schedule of questions.

I have requested Mr. Fraser, who has filled the office of Secretary to the Chief Commissioner for some years with marked efficiency, and who is intimately acquainted with the Central Provinces and the feelings and wishes of the leading Natives here, to reply to the questions as far as he could from a local point of view, and I have much pleasure in submitting his answers to the Commission. They appear to me to be generally correct and judicious in regard to matters of fact, and Mr. Fraser's opinions, where he travels beyond facts, are deserving of all consideration.

3. There is one point, however, upon which I do not accept his views, and that is the very important question of placing Native officers in executive charge of districts. No man in India can be more anxious than I to see the Natives of India largely employed in the superior service of the State, but our first duty is to maintain the *pax Britannica*, and to hold the Empire securely and without courting avoidable risks. It is, in my opinion, essential to this that the Divisional and District executive officers should be Englishmen. These officers are the true backbone of our administration. They have to interpret our policy to the people, to keep the peace between conflicting interests, to govern in short both strongly and impartially. In the event of trouble it is on their loyalty and efficiency that we should have mainly to rely. I have never, in the twenty-five years of my service, come across a Native whom I should consider a satisfactory district officer. I do not say that here and there you might not in ordinary times place a Native in charge of a small and unimportant district without much immediate loss of efficiency, but you would certainly have to officer the district with Natives all round, and would have to dislocate the whole administrative system in order to secure a very doubtful advantage. You would in the course of a very short time find the inferior offices filled with relatives and friends of the district officer, in spite of any rules laid down to the contrary. If trouble came you would never feel as sure of a district so manned as of one with an English officer at its head, and even in ordinary years the Native district officer would almost certainly fail to have as complete a hold over the people as an Englishman. He would not have the same prestige or *dakhl*. European capital and enterprise would carefully avoid the district so administered, or if it went there the non-official European would in the end prove too strong for the Native officer.

It appears to me folly to run the unnecessary risk of weakening our executive merely to gratify a sentiment. We can find ample work for Native talent elsewhere; and our best hope of doing so safely and permanently is to have reliable Englishmen in those offices upon which the whole administrative fabric really rests.

4. I think it may be gathered from Mr. Fraser's answers that so far as the Central Provinces are concerned we could get on very well without a Statutory Service at all. I believe that Mr. Fraser has correctly stated facts with regard to the general character of the Uncovenanted Service here. I find in that service, so far as I have yet gone, an admirable body of officers who until the Statutory system was invented were quite content with their position. I have seen both the Statutory Civilians of the Province and find them markedly inferior in every way to the best of their Uncovenanted brethren. I should be very sorry to see either of them in charge of any district, however small. If the Statute is maintained it will have to be made clear that our Statutory Civilians are only to be promoted to such offices as they are fit for and are not to be run up the grades of the Commission as a matter of course. If the Statutory Service remain in anything like its present shape, the wants of the Central Provinces would be fully met by making promotions to the Covenanted ranks a reward for specially distinguished Extra Assistant Commissioners.

5. It is rightly said by Mr. Fraser that Natives are generally best fitted for judicial work. In these Provinces, however, we have no distinct separation between judicial and executive work. We should be glad to make a separation up to a certain point, but we cannot afford it. Our Native officers have thus fewer high appointments that could be opened to them than those of other provinces. In executive duties it is essential that they work under European control. As I have said, they were quite content with the position until the Statutory idea arose to disturb their minds. Practically, and if he is, as I think he must be, excluded from district rank, the only advantage the Statutory has over the Uncovenanted officer is a doubtful increment of dignity.

6. My own opinion as to the best solution of the general question of Native employment may be very briefly stated.

The sole *raison d'etre* of a close and costly Covenanted Service appears to me to rest on the recognition of the fact that there are, as we hold India, certain appointments that *must* be filled by trained Englishmen: or by a *personnel* equivalent thereto. I would settle once for all what these appointments are. They should include District and Divisional offices and most of the higher administrative offices. I would strictly limit our Covenanted Service to the strength necessary to supply these offices. I am afraid that now-a-days no Government will venture to say that Natives *shall not* enter the competitive service, though I have no doubt this *ought* to be said. We must therefore be content with seeing that the Natives who do enter this service are presumably as good as Englishmen. They should have an English educational and collegiate training and be made as like Englishmen as may be. (But I believe if we opened sufficiently widely the door of general employment, the best class of Natives would not object to a Civil Service of purely English officers.)

Then I would throw open all other offices in India to Natives of India (including domiciled Europeans) *plus* a certain carefully limited and small percentage of "other British subjects." I agree with Mr. Fraser that second-rate Europeans are no gain to a Local Administration. But there are departments in which a European element is useful. And moreover, absolutely to exclude all Europeans from office in India is as bad as limiting the employment of Natives to the inferior offices only, as used to be the practice.

The system of selection for open offices would vary in each Province and department with regard to local circumstances and requirements.

7. I have now, as requested in the letter from the Commission, No. 133 of the 10th March, to reply to question 232, which is as follows:—

"To what extent could the prescribed Covenanted Civil Service Cadre in your Province be reduced if a corresponding increase were made in the English element of the Uncovenanted Service or in the Native element, or partly in one and partly in the other?"

The sanctioned scale of Covenanted appointments in the Central Provinces, as settled by Financial Department letter No. 2232 of 29th December 1881, paragraph 3, may be compared thus with the actual state of things at the present time:—

	Under Financial Department letter.	At present.
Administration	7	7
Heads of Districts	18	18
Judicial Commissioner	1	1
Special Judges	1	...
Small Cause Courts	2	2
Under Government of India	3	4
Sub-Divisional Officers	7	7
Miscellaneous	4	9
TOTAL	43	48

The Additional Commissioner who was special Judge has been abolished. The number of miscellaneous appointments has been increased by a Commissioner of Settlements and four Settlement officers. The other miscellaneous appointments are an Inspector General of Police and Jails, an Excise Commissioner, a Registrar to the Judicial Commissioner, and a Political Agent at Kalahandi. If we accept three as the normal contribution of staff to the Government of India, we get 47 as the true number of covenanted charges for which we must provide. To this we must add, under the orders of the Government of India—

For men on leave	27·39 per cent.
Do. in training	10·58 „
	37·97

raising our total required strength to 47 + 17·84=64·84, or say 64 as a minimum.

We are at present 4 men short.

The settlement operations will last up to 1898. After that date the permanent special staff in the Revenue, Agricultural and Settlement Department may probably be reduced to 3, which will bring the number of covenanted charges down to 45 and the total strength to 62. I assume that up to 1898 we can borrow from other provinces any officers required in excess of 3. Out of the present covenanted charges I consider that we might safely make over to the Uncovenanted Service

Sub-divisional officers	2
Small Cause Courts	2
Registrar to Judicial Commissioner's Court	1
	5 appointments.

This would leave 40 covenanted charges requiring a strength of 55 officers. Thus (62—55 say) 7 appointments might be transferred to the Uncovenanted Service. So far as these Provinces are concerned we have no wish for a European element in the Uncovenanted Service. We only require "Natives of India" in the statutory sense. It is a rule now not to appoint any but Natives of the province and I would maintain it, including however under the phrase domiciled Europeans and Eurasians when there happened to be a sufficiently good candidate of that class.

II.

Replies to Set A of the Questions (circulated to Local Governments and Administrations) put by the Public Service Commission, by A. H. L. Fraser, Esq., C.S., Secretary to the Chief Commissioner, Central Provinces.

I.—Working of the existing Statutory System.

What systems of selection or nomination for the purposes of the Statutory Rules have been adopted in your Province?—The system of nomination laid down in Government of India, Home, Revenue and Agricultural Department, Notification No. 1534, dated the 22nd August 1879.

2. What subsidiary rules, if any, have been framed in your Province for the purpose of giving effect to the general Statutory Rules?—None.

3. How many Statutory Civilians have been appointed in your Province under the Statutory Rules on the ground of merit and ability proved in the service of Government?—None.

4 to 9. Blank.

10. How many Statutory Civilians have been appointed in your Province on the ground of merit and ability proved in the practice of a profession?—None.

11 to 15. Blank.

16. How many persons have been appointed Statutory Civilians in your Province on the ground of intellectual qualifications alone?—None.

17 to 34. Blank.

35. How many Statutory Civilians have been appointed in your Province on the ground of high birth, of social position or general influence?—One, Mr. Shankar Madho Chitnavis.

36 and 37. If Statutory Civilians have been appointed in your Province on the ground of high birth, social position, or general influence, were any preliminary qualifications required? If so, what were they?—He was B. A. of the Bombay University.

38. What appointments did persons selected on any of these grounds receive under the Statutory Rules?—Assistant Commissioner.

39. What rate of pay did they receive on appointment under the Statutory Rules?—Rs. 200 per mensem.

40. Have persons been appointed in your Province to Covenanted posts on any other grounds than those above mentioned?—One, Syad Ali Mahomed.

41. If so, on what grounds?—On account of his father's services and his own fair education and ability.

42. What appointments did the persons concerned receive?—Assistant Commissioner.

43. What rate of pay did they receive on appointment?—Rs. 200 per mensem.

44. How many Mahomedans and how many Hindus have been appointed to the Statutory Service in your Province?—One of each.

45. Have any Eurasians been appointed to the Statutory Service in your Province?—No.

46. If not, are there any particular reasons why they have not been appointed?—We have none fit.

47. Whatever system of selection or nomination may have been adopted, has it been usual to require a probationary period before the appointment was finally confirmed?—Yes.

48. If so, what have been the incidents of such period as to duration and pay?—They are required to serve on probation for two years on Rs. 200 per mensem. Thereafter the pay is raised to 64 per cent. of that drawn by Covenanted Civilians.

49. Has the requirement of a probationary period been waived in the case of any appointments hitherto made under the Statutory Rules?—Partly in Syad Ali Mahomed's case.

50. If so, in the case of what appointments and on what grounds?—He was an Assistant Commissioner and the concession was made on the ground that he had been an Officiating Extra Assistant Commissioner for a time.

51. To what positions have the persons selected on the various grounds above noted respectively attained in the public service?—They are still only Supernumerary Assistant Commissioners.

52.—Blank.

53. How far have Statutory Civilians succeeded in passing the departmental examinations in cases where such examinations were required?—One, who was appointed at the close of 1882, has passed by the higher standard in all branches of departmental examinations.

The other has passed by the higher standard in Criminal and Revenue Law and Procedure and has still to pass in Civil Law and Procedure. He has five months yet to serve on probation.

54. After what periods from the dates of original appointment were the examinations by the lower and higher standard, respectively, passed in each case?—One passed in all branches before his appointment to the Statutory Civil Service. The other passed by the higher standard in one branch ten months after his appointment and in a second branch after another five months.

55. In how many cases has there been failure to pass by either test within the two years' probationary period?—None.

56. After what periods from the dates of original appointment have Statutory Civilians in your Province been confirmed in their appointments?—One was confirmed within a year, for the reasons given against Question 50. The other has not yet been confirmed.

57 & 58. Has the period before confirmation in any case extended beyond the probationary period of two years? If so, under what circumstances?—No.

59. What is the prevalent feeling in your Province regarding the existing Statutory system? If the feeling is one of dissatisfaction is the dissatisfaction general or is it confined to certain sections of the community?—The general feeling among those interested in Government appointments, so far as I have been able to ascertain it, is one of dissatisfaction. This is chiefly the case with Mr. Ali Mahomed's appointment, because (1) Mahomedans are few and (2) his educational qualifications were small. Besides this, his family is new in this province. As for the people generally here, they care for none of these things.

60. What are the grounds upon which any such feeling is based?—Blank.

61. Is the feeling of dissatisfaction, if it exists, directed against the Statute itself (33 Vic., Chapter 3, Section 6), or is it directed against the rules framed thereunder?—I think it is chiefly against the rules. But there are some who object to the Statute because it does not give them a "service." This latter objection is not, I think, general or strongly held. The desire for a "service" on the part of the intelligent Natives with whom I have discussed the matter is generally associated with the idea of having specially strong claims to promotion to the higher appointments by seniority unless clearly proved unfit. But, as a fact, the special appointments already made have been all along subject to the misconception that the "Statutory Civilians" do belong to the general service. Under orders from the Government of India (I think) they have been graded in the Civil List with Civilians; and Mr. Ali Mahomed has received every promotion in his turn with Civilians. Another strong objection is that the Statute does not fix a proportion of appointments to be held by Natives, and has not been liberally interpreted (they think) by the rules.

62 to 65.—Blank.

66. Do you consider that Section 6 of the Statute supplies such a definition of the words "Natives of India" as describes with sufficient clearness, fulness, and accuracy the various classes of persons for whose appointment to Covenanted posts it is desirable to provide?—The definition is too limited as excluding men born in Native States which are technically outside British India.

67.—Blank.

68. If the objections are directed against the rules framed under the Statute, do they relate to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted?—I think the main objection to the rules on the part of the Natives is that they do not fix a proportion of appointments to be held by Natives. I think there is some reason for this objection. For it will generally be admitted, I think, that the appointment of a Native (to executive or

administrative appointments at least) involves less efficiency and implies more *risk* than the appointment of a Civilian. Consequently if each individual case is decided separately, the tendency of a Local Government must be, as a rule, to appoint the latter. But if a proportion is fixed, the Local Government is bound to choose from amongst the most eligible Natives. For myself, I should not propose to have this proportion fixed by either statute or rule, but determined from time to time in full view of the circumstances of the province by the supreme Government. I believe that even this method would greatly reduce the dissatisfaction.

69 and 70.—Blank.

71. How do Statutory Civilians compare, in regard to their work as public servants, with Native Civilians who have passed in by the channel of the English competition?—We have no such Native Civilians.

72. How do Statutory Civilians nominated or selected by competition compare in regard to their work with Statutory Civilians selected on the ground of merit and ability previously proved in the Uncovenanted Service, or other branches of the Government service, if any such selections have been made?—We have none selected by competition.

73. Do Statutory Civilians regard themselves as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel?—Yes, I think they do, and also that they are regarded as of inferior position to Civilians bythe general public, but how far that is due to their not being *Europeans* it is impossible to say: we have no Native Civilians (Question 71).

74 to 76.—Blank.

77. Do the general public view with any difference the status of Statutory Civilians and that of Uncovenanted Officers?—Certainly they do.

78. If so, on what grounds?—Partly at least because the Statutory Civilians are admitted to the higher grades so much more freely.

79. How is the present Statutory system regarded by members of the Uncovenanted Service?—With jealousy; because some of them see those whom they at least do not regard as better than themselves appointed to higher grades from which they are excluded.

80. Do competitive Civilians, English and Native, and members of the Uncovenanted Service, respectively, stand on a footing of cordiality with Statutory Civilians, or is there any friction between them?—I cannot say that we have any evidence of friction. I think the Covenanted Civilians have shown great cordiality towards the Statutory men and the Uncovenanted, though jealous, have never (as far as I know) allowed friction in work.

81. Has the Statutory system had the effect of securing men, who, in point of education or natural ability, are superior to the average of those appointed or promoted to the higher ranks of the Uncovenanted Service?—I think not as far as our provincial experience goes.

82. Has the result of the Statutory system been to secure the services of men of better social position and better family than those who usually accept posts in the Uncovenanted Service?—I think not, decidedly not.

83. Do young men among the landed aristocracy or of good family display unwillingness to accept employment under the Statutory Rules?—We have never had a man fit to appoint, and whom the Local Government desired to appoint, who did not gladly accept the appointment. But our "aristocracy" is very limited indeed.

84.—Blank.

85. Has experience shown that the Statutory Civilians of aristocratic family are as punctual and regular in the discharge of their duties as those selected from other classes?—We have no Statutory Civilians of really "aristocratic" family.

86. Do young men among the landed aristocracy or of good family display unwillingness to accept posts in the Uncovenanted Service, and a willingness to accept employment under the Statutory Rules?—We have no experience of this, though, of course, *any* young man would rather belong to the Statutory than to the Uncovenanted Service.

87.—Blank.

88. How many Natives in your Province have been appointed under the Statute 24 and 25 Vic., Chapter 54, Sections 3 and 4, to offices reserved for Covenanted Civilians?—None, unless the appointment of Khan Bahadur Aulad Hassain, C.I.E., be regarded as made under that Statute. He was appointed an Assistant Commissioner in 1869.

89 to 92.—Blank.

93. Has the appointment of Natives under the Statutory Rules or under 24 and 25 Vic., Chapter 54, produced uncertainty or uneasiness in the minds of Covenanted Civil Servants as to their promotion and prospects?—No; because the appointment of Natives has been considered in fixing our cadre, and in recruiting, while the Natives have entered at the bottom of the list.

94 & 95.—Blank.

II.—Mode of Selection of Statutory Civilians.

96. On the assumption* that the Statutory system is retained, how would appointment to the Statutory Service by nomination be regarded by influential sections of the Native community in your Province?—I think it would be regarded with favour if, as a rule, the appointments to Assistant Commissionerships were made from among Extra Assistant Commissioners. This would secure (1) a wider selection in making first appointments, and (2) the promotion of tried men.

* The questions which follow down to No. 118 inclusive are put subject to the same assumption.

97. How would a system of nomination to be followed by a period of probation be regarded by the same classes?—Probation is not regarded with disfavour.

98. Would a system of nomination, with or without probation, be likely to secure well-qualified persons?—It would, if the nominations were from men tried for a few years as Tahsildars and Extra Assistant Commissioners.

99. Has experience actually shown such a system to secure well-qualified officers?—I do not think the system of nomination at present in force has secured specially good men, not men better than several of our Extra Assistant Commissioners.

100. Do you consider that nominations should be confined to persons of proved merit and ability?—Yes, certainly.

101. If so, how do you consider that merit and ability should be held to have been proved for this purpose?—By good service in inferior grades or in such public employments as the Bar, &c.

102. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons nominated for this purpose by the Local Governments or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—It would be less invidious than the present system.

103. In preference to either of the above systems (nomination and limited competition) would a system of open competition pure and simple for the Statutory Service commend itself to the Native community?—Certainly not. The educated of our province would not like it; for they would probably be crowded out by foreigners. And our bankers and land-owners view our educated men (until tried and found trustworthy) with grave and avowed suspicion.

104. If competition (whether limited or open) is perferred, should there be one competition for all India or separate competitions in each Province?—Separate competition is preferable. But no system of competition (pure and simple) would at present command general confidence.

105. If there were only one general competition, how would you ensure a due proportion of appointments falling to the population of the several Provinces?—How indeed, except by introducing conditions which would make the competition other than general.

106. Having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several Provinces, and the varying conditions prevalent therein, is it possible to have any one system of selection for all India which would not result in the inhabitants of some Provinces being more or less excluded from a due share of appointments?—It is impossible.

107. Under any of the three systems of nomination, limited competition, and open competition would you prescribe any tests of preliminary qualifications on the part of nominees or candidates in regard to (1) age, (2) intellectual capacity, (3) moral, social, and physical fitness?—Yes, on all these points.

108. If so, what should be the tests under each of the heads specified?—I would prefer to trust to trial (except that I would have educational qualifications).

109. Do you consider that (after selection whether by nomination or competition) there should be a period of probation?—Yes.

110. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—Two years as a maximum, subject to some reduction in case the Local Government thought the nominee had been pretty well tried already.

111. Should the period of probation be passed in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service, or of the Covenanted Service, or in what other manner?—In the Covenanted Service, even after trial in the Uncovenanted; but in that case a shorter period than two years would suffice.

112. Do you consider that after selection and before entering on probation (or on duty) the person selected should undergo special training?—No.

113. If so, should the special training be carried out in India or in England?—I see no great advantage in lads going to England after their characters have been formed by training here, unless they go as mere travellers (when of an age not easily to fall into diverse temptations peculiar to residence in a foreign country).

114. If in India, would it be possible, and, if possible, advisable, to establish an Indian Civil Service College on the basis of the Haileybury College which formerly existed in England?—I am not persuaded of the utility of this.

115. If you do not consider special training in England essential, would you encourage nominees or selected candidates to visit England with a view to add to their qualifications for the Service?—I would give no further encouragement to selected men than merely by giving them leave earlier in their service, if they proposed to go to England to improve their English and increase their knowledge of the world.

116.—Blank

117. Should it be offered before, or during, or after the probationary period, if any, through which nominees or selected candidates may be required to pass?—After.

118. Should it be offered before or after the nominees or selected candidates enter on their duties?—After, when they would see the advantage of it.

119. Are you in favour of the establishment of scholarships tenable by Natives in England for the purpose of enabling them to qualify for the Civil or Statutory Service?—No, not by Government. Let private effort do what it will.

120.—Blank

121. Do you think that any distinction should be made between the emoluments of nominees or selected candidates who have been trained in England or have gone to England to add to their qualifications and those who have not?—No. But it should

be made plain that additional qualifications so gained would lead to increased success (quicker promotion) in Government employment, as it does in other walks of life.

122. If the opportunity of residence in England at a University for two years with a sufficient allowance were offered to nominees or selected candidates, is it likely that it would be taken advantage of to any great extent?—My own experience is that two years' residence at an English University has as much of risk as of advantage to a Native unless he has had an English school training.

123. If the system of examination in England were revised with the result that Natives avail themselves of it in considerable numbers, would it still be necessary to retain the Statutory system?—No. But I cannot recommend this.

124.—Blank.

III.—Competition in England for the Indian Civil Service.

125. What has been the experience in your Province, in regard to their work as public servants, of Natives who have entered the Covenanted Civil Service through the competitive channel in England?—We have none.

126 & 127.—Blank.

128. Is competition of Natives in the examination in England favourably looked upon by large and important classes in India?—I think the classes with "most stake in the country" would regard it with distrust because it opens the door to Natives with little chance of shutting it where necessary.

129. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—I think not.

130 & 131.—Blank.

132. What is your opinion as to giving Statutory appointments to Natives who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition?—I have no matured opinion on this, but should be inclined to distrust such a scheme.

133 & 134.—Blank.

135. Can you say what number of Natives belonging to your Province have presented themselves annually at the competitive examination in England, and what degree of success they attained?—I have heard of one, who (I am told) failed, and is now at Cooper's Hill. He went to England young. I inquired about him when on furlough and had good accounts of him.

136. What class or classes of Natives in your Province readily go to England?—A Native District Superintendent of Police went on short leave. An Extra Assistant Commissioner went and took the Cambridge degrees of B.A. and LL.B. and was called to the Bar. Three lads (sons of pleaders) are now in England. A Mahomedan Assistant is going as soon as he can get leave.

137. Are objections entertained to going to England; and, if so, what are they, and by what classes in particular are they felt?—Caste objections, the question of expense, and inertness all operate. Some also (very properly) object to the risk of the ruin of their sons' characters: many will not even send their sons to schools in large towns in this country without making arrangements to secure them home influences: much less will they send them to a strange land away from family and even social restraint. They are quite right.

138, 139 & 140.—Blank.

141. If a fixed proportion of appointments were allotted for a Native examination in England, do you consider that in view of the objections against a voyage to England and life there, the cost thereof and the chances of failure, a sufficient number of suitable candidates from your Province would be available to make the competition a real competition?—Not for many years to come.

142. If the examinations were distinct, what should be the limits of age for the Native examination?—I would keep the limit low. It seems to me that Natives need hardly go to England, except as boys with characters to mould. I could illustrate this view from my experience of Natives who have passed the competitive examination.

143.—Blank.

144. Assuming only one examination in England for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination and the conditions as to age and other matters in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates?—The age condition certainly does. It will do so unless and until Natives send their boys home early. This they are averse to doing; for parents, especially mothers, all over the world object to sending their boys away from home; this objection has special force in India.

145. If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage?—I recommend no alteration for the reasons given above.

146, 147 & 148.—Blank.

149 & 150. What is the average age at which Natives at the Indian Universities pass the examinations for F. A., B. A., and M. A., respectively? From what classes of Native society are the persons who graduate at the Indian Universities usually drawn in your Province?—These two questions have no doubt been answered by the Inspector General of Education; but his answers were sent to the Public Service Commission direct.

IV.—Competition in India for the Indian Civil Service.

151. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question papers being used at both examinations?—No.

152. How would this method of selection be regarded by the Native community generally?—In this Province the "Native community generally" does not concern itself much in this matter. The educated would like it if it were limited to the province for the province.

153 & 154.—Blank.

155. Do you consider that the educational institutions available in India are at present capable of giving the very high class education which it was the object of the competitive system as introduced in 1855 to secure?—I think they are capable of making lads fit to pass the examination.

156. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native community over others?—Certainly.

157. Would it be likely to lead to the undue preponderance of any one class or caste in the public service?—I think so.

158. Do you think there are any objections on political or administrative grounds to open competition in India?—I think there are strong objections on both grounds.

159. Would the introduction of an open competitive examination in India have the effect of deterring cadets of leading families from aspiring to enter the ranks of the Civil Service?—My experience does not enable me to say.

160. Under such a system how would it be possible to provide against Natives of a Province in which education is comparatively backward, being excluded from appointments in their own Province?—Not if the competition were general for India.

161. Would a system of provincial examinations be preferable to one examination for the whole of India?—Yes.

162. Under a system of open competition in India would the successful candidates be regarded as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Service through the channel of the open competition in England?—The answer to this would depend on the position given them after their appointment.

163. Supposing that the Covenanted appointments were allotted in fixed proportions, a certain number to be obtained by competition in England and a certain number by competition in India, the examinations in each case being open on fairly equal conditions to Native and English candidates alike, and the Statutory system being abolished, how would such a system be viewed?—I fear it would be received in simple accordance with the results it secured in respect to the number of successful candidates of each of the two classes (Native and English).

164 to 169.—Blank.

170. Circumstances being different in the case of persons who enter through the examination in England and of persons who enter through the examination in India, is there any reason why the rules in regard to pay, leave, pension, &c., should not also be different?—None. If the object is to secure Englishmen, or men with an English education and training, there is clear reason for special rules. If not, the examination in England may surely be given up.

171. Should successful candidates go through a period of special study in India like the English candidates who spend two years in special preparation?—If this system were adopted, I think a period of special study would be an advantage.

172. Would it be preferable (*a*) to require them to go to England, or (*b*) to give them the option of going to England, suitable allowances being given to enable them to prosecute their studies there?—For reasons already given, I am doubtful of the expediency of this.

173. Should successful candidates at the Indian competition be required to pass through a probationary period before final appointment?—Yes; it might be worked in with the period of special study much as we try to give our Assistants less work while "under training" (*i.e.*, until they pass their departmental examinations).

174 & 175.—Blank.

V.—Promotion from the Uncovenanted Service.

176. To what extent does the Uncovenanted Service in your Province include in its ranks persons eligible on the ground of proved merit and ability for appointment to offices ordinarily reserved for members of the Covenanted Civil Service?—There are more than one of our Extra Assistant Commissioners whom I think more eligible than either of our Statutory Civilians.

177. If there are such persons in the Uncovenanted Service, could they be appointed to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service without suffering in pay?—Not at present, if they had reached the highest grades: our Extra Assistant Commissioners run up to Rs. 600 a month, while a Statutory Civilian begins (after probation) on Rs. 320.

178. Under existing rules as to pay, &c., how would such appointment be regarded by Uncovenanted Officers?—Probably a very senior man would refuse it.

179. Do you think they would be willing to forego pay for the sake of the advantages which admission to the Civil Service might afterwards bring?—A senior man would not; because he would not be willing to forego pay when his length of service would proba-

bly preclude his hoping for much further promotion. But this would not be necessary if Uncovenanted men were promoted to the "Statutory Service" soon enough.

180. What special provision, if any, do you think should be made for the appointments to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service?—I think that should be the ordinary way of entering what has become known as the "Statutory Service."

181. If such appointments are made, should they be restricted to the holders of any particular classes of appointments in the Uncovenanted Service, and if so, what classes?—To classes service in which would prove capacity for the higher appointments.

182. Should persons so appointed be appointed provisionally and be required to pass through a period of probation before final confirmation?—Yes. Increased responsibility and dignity does not always develop increased powers.

183. Should provision be made for the appointment of qualified members of the Uncovenanted Service to the higher Covenanted offices without requiring them to pass through the lower grades?—No. I would on no account have this. It is unsafe to promote a man from a subordinate and inferior service to higher appointments: he should go through the subordinate grades of the superior service (or branch of the service).

184. If certain appointments in the Covenanted grades were set apart for the Statutory Service, should a fixed proportion of those appointments be expressly reserved for persons of proved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service?—No; I would not fix a proportion.

185. Should special provision be made for the promotion to Covenanted posts of European members of the Uncovenanted Service?—No, not formally; and only informally between the Government of India and the Local Government if necessary to protect the interests of Natives.

186. Should special provision be made for the promotion to such posts of Eurasian or other members of the Uncovenanted Service who, though not Natives of pure descent, fall within the meaning attached in the Statute of 1870 to the term "Natives of India?"—No.

187. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, to be open to all natural born subjects of Her Majesty who possess the qualifications that may be from time to time prescribed?—I am doubtful. Our experience even in this province is that the British prestige is not kept up by second rate Europeans employed throughout the Mufassal. It would be a good thing no doubt to have educated English gentlemen scattered about the country. But I fear it could not be done cheaply. And there is nothing worse for us than sending out a large number of inferior Englishmen to represent Government among the people.

188.—Blank.

VI.—Pay, Leave and Pension for Natives of India appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the channel of competition in England.

189. Is the rate* of pay at present granted to Statutory Civilians during probation and on final appointment respectively sufficient?—I think it is quite sufficient. It is enough to attract our best men. And it forms one of the main arguments in favour of employing Natives that they can thus be got more cheaply than Europeans (Civilians).

* Two hundred rupees a month on first appointment as probationers. Two hundred and fifty rupees a month after passing the departmental examination by the lower standard. After passing the departmental examination by the higher standard (unless specially exempted) and after having been confirmed in their appointments, 64 per cent. of what would be the gross pay or salary of the office if it were held by a Covenanted Civil Servant appointed after competitive examination in England.

190.—Blank.

191. Would these rates of pay be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the Uncovenanted Service?—I would eliminate the special rate of pay in the case of probationers who had already been well tried in the Uncovenanted Service. I would rather view their probationary period as an appointment *sub. pro tem.* to the higher post.

192. Would they be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the professional classes?—I would do the same in their case as is indicated in the answer to 191.

193 & 194.—Blank.

195. Do you consider that a difference should be maintained between the rates of pay granted to Covenanted Civilians who enter through the competitive channel in England, and to persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through that channel?—Certainly I do. The financial argument is one to which I attach great importance. And many of the Native gentlemen with whom I have discussed the matter, show that they quite understand the reasons for such a difference: many too who did not understand them accepted them when explained.

196. If so, what would you consider the fair rate of reduction to be made in the case of persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through the competitive channel in England?—I am pretty well satisfied with the 64 per cent. rate of pay.

197. Would you approve of an arrangement by which the pay of appointments would be a fixed sum to be drawn by the holder whether he is a Covenanted or a Statutory Civilian, with an additional staff

allowance to be drawn by those only who enter the service through the examination in England?—This is practically the same thing, and I do not think the change of name would affect the opinions or feelings of any body concerned.

198 to 200.—Blank.

201. Have you any remarks to make on the leave rules embodied in the Civil Leave Code which apply to Statutory Civilians?—I would alter Rule 83 (*b*) for those at least who wished to go to England. I would give two years at any one time (if spent in England) and allow one year besides afterwards. I would allow the two years' period for a visit to England at any time after two years' service.

202. At what age do you consider that Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the competitive channel in England should be entitled to retire on pension?—At the age of 55 years.

203. After what length of service do you consider that such persons should be entitled to retire on pension?—I think 25 years' service is too short.

204. At what age should they be obliged to retire on pension?—Rule 33 seems to me to be sound; and 60 years would thus be the maximum.

205. After what length of service should they be obliged to retire on pension?—After 35 years' service, if not already superannuated.

206. What amount of pension should, in your opinion, be granted to Natives so appointed if they serve the prescribed period for voluntary and compulsory retirement respectively?—I think Rs. 4,000 should be added as a maximum to Rule 35 *(a)*.

207. If, before serving the prescribed period for pension, they are compelled to retire on medical certificate, what gratuity, if any, would you give them?—I think Rule 35 (*b*) (2) is unnecessarily liberal. I should make the figures Rs. 1,000 and Rs. 100, respectively, with a maximum of Rs. 2,000. I think there is a great tendency to make pensions for officers who spend their pensioned years in India, too high.

VII.—General.

208. How far is the existing system of education in the higher schools and colleges in India well adapted for training young men to the public service? Can you suggest any improvements?—I do not think it is well adapted; but I cannot at present suggest improvements.

209. In 1854 Lord Macaulay's Committee were of opinion that the best, the most liberal, and the most finished education to be procured in England was a necessary qualification for admission to the Civil Service. Do Indian schools and colleges at present supply an education of so high a standard?—As far as mere cram and the getting up of "subjects" is concerned, the Indian schools and colleges are enough.

210. Do you consider that Indian schools at present develop the force of character and other qualities required for English administration?—They do not. They do not develop that self-reliance with sobriety, that commonsense and that sense of justice which are the chief essentials of high administrative office in India, far more essential than cleverness or even "ability."

211 and 212. What has been the actual experience in your Province as to the general efficiency of educated Natives—graduates of the Indian Universities—employed in administrative work? How have Natives placed in charge of sub-divisions or in other quasi-independent positions discharged their duties in your Province?—Some of our Extra Assistant Commissioners are excellent officers, and, take them all in all, I think they are a wonderfully good body of officers. I remember Mr. Fitzpatrick saying to me that he was quite surprised to find so large a body of men with so few really inferior men among them. As a rule they do best in a position of subordination; and sometimes we have been very much disappointed when we have placed a man with an excellent reputation in a post of responsibility and comparative independence. Thus we sent a man of excellent character and reputation to Bastar: he was found to be quite without "backbone," and had to be recalled: he was a Mahomedan. Then we sent one of our best Maratha Brahmans: he behaved like a woman and was removed at his own tearful entreaty. Now we have another Maratha Brahman there: he seems to have "backbone" enough, but to require careful watching lest he err in judgment. He is a good strong man. Again we put a very gentlemanly man in as Extra Assistant Commissioner, Burhanpur. He had been known as "our best Tahsildar"; but he failed in the independent charge of Burhanpur. Again we have had Khan Bahadur Aulad Hassain, C.I.E., as Settlement Officer; and it may be said that no European officer is more trusted or more successful. Mr. Fuller too told me the other day that Mr. Parshottam Dass (Extra Assistant Commissioner, Assistant Settlement Officer) had done splendid work in the quasi-independent charge of settlement operations in Chanda. Altogether, the results of putting Natives in quasi-independent positions are uncertain. The really successful are few. But careful trial and selection secures them.

Settlement work is very different from district administration.

A. MACKENZIE, *Chief Commr.*

213. Do we now obtain for Government service Natives of the classes who under Native rule carried on the civil administration of the country?—We do to some extent. We often hear an official say "My father was so and so under the old Raj."

214.—Blank.

215. How far would any system of appointment which involves a journey to, and residence in England be regarded by the Native community as open to objection on the ground that it requires Hindu candidates to abandon their caste as a condition of entering the Civil Service?—I do not think that the objection would long operate now.

216. How far would such a system be regarded as open to objection on the ground that it restricts the field of selection to those candidates who are wealthy enough to undertake the cost of a journey to, and residence in England?—I think that the educated community would regard it as objectionable on this ground, if it were an exclusive system.

217. Are the Natives who go to England from your Province for purposes of education limited to the wealthier classes?—We have very few who have gone to England. They are not any of them poor. (*Vide* Question 137.)

218. Are they limited to any particular section of the community, or to any particular creed?—No.

219. Does a voyage to, or residence in England involve the loss of social position or other unfavourable consequences in the case of any section of the Native community?—Yes. And though it is not difficult to recover as far as the great body of the community is concerned, there are individuals who never think the stain wiped out.

220. Does it result in placing those Natives who undertake it more or less out of touch and sympathy with their fellow-countrymen on their return to India?—It depends partly on the character of the men.

221. Would the requirement of a temporary residence in England as a condition precedent to, or following on appointment to the Government service have the effect of excluding from such appointment any considerable or important section of the Native community?—I doubt it: not for any length of time.

222. If the Statutory system is discontinued, should special provision be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of Natives who, for religious or other sufficient reasons, are unable or unwilling to undertake a journey to, and residence in England?—I think that would be a very dangerous plan to make a rule requiring English residence for the service and then to exempt men who refused on religious grounds to go. It would produce most inexpedient relations between different Government officers.

223.—Blank.

224. If the Statutory system is discontinued, do you consider that special provision should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of capable members of the professional classes?—I am not prepared to say that special provision is necessary: I think the authority to appoint, with a fixed proportion of Natives (fixed by Government not by Statute), would be enough.

225.—Blank.

226. Whatever system or systems may be adopted, ought power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts candidates of high family subject to such antecedent guarantees of fitness as may be considered sufficient in each case?—I would not specify "candidates of high family:" Government should have power to appoint any person whom it is expedient to appoint.

227. Ought similar power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts persons who have proved their merit and ability in Government service, or in the exercise of a profession, without preliminary examination or competition?—This is my idea of the best mode of appointment.

228. If a thorough knowledge of English were made an essential qualification for appointment to Covenanted posts, would the field of selection in the case of persons already in the Uncovenanted Service, or engaged in the exercise of a profession, be unduly limited thereby?—This has become practically the case with us: a knowledge of English is possessed by all our Assistant Commissioners except Khan Bahadoor Aulad Hossain (aged about 60 years), and by all our Extra Assistant Commissioners except one (and two only know it very imperfectly). So our field of selection would not be limited at all.

229. If such is likely to be the case, could the difficulty be obviated by requiring proficiency in the English language to be tested by periodical examinations after selection, but during a probationary period?—I do not believe in that at all. I have seen good men who tried to learn English after entering the service; and I never saw a man who succeeded in getting it up well.

230. Should provision be made for the occasional appointment in very special and exceptional cases to Covenanted posts of persons of known ability and local influence whom, although they may never have held office and may not possess special professional qualifications, and although their age may exceed the limit laid down for untried candidates, it might nevertheless be considered desirable to appoint to the higher grades for political or other reasons?—We have never felt the necessity of this.

231. To what extent, if any, could the prescribed Covenanted Civil Service *cadre* in your Province be reduced without increase to the Uncovenanted Service?—Not at all. The greatest difficulty has more than once been experienced in suitably filling temporary vacancies among District Officers.

232. To what extent could the prescribed Covenanted Civil Service *cadre* in your Province be reduced if a corresponding increase were made in the English element of the Un-

covenanted Service, or in the Native element, or partly in one and partly in the other?—Our *cadre* could only be reduced if offices now held by Civilians were given over to the said Uncovenanted Service or Native element.

233. Assuming a fixed proportion to be maintained between Europeans and Natives in the Civil Service *cadre*, in what posts or classes of appointments do you consider that Europeans and Natives respectively might be employed with most advantage to the interests of the public service?—There is no doubt that Natives make better judicial than executive officers. But I should not hesitate to put some of the smaller Districts into the charge of well tried Natives, our Commissioners exercising great supervision.*

234. Would it be desirable to rule that the proportion of persons being Hindus and Mahomedans respectively, who are from time to time or over a series of years appointed to the Covenanted ranks in any Province, should bear a certain relation to the number of the two classes composing the population of the Province concerned?—It would be better to forget these distinctions than to stereotype them by rules and orders. We have not 3·5 per cent. Mahomedans as compared with Hindus; and our Mahomedans have thus a full share of office.

235.—Blank.

236. How far should appointments in each Province to Covenanted posts be restricted to Natives of the Province concerned?—I should make it a rule (only to be departed from under very exceptional circumstances) that the only foreign element in the Province should be the European.

237. How would the following scheme be regarded by the Native community:—

(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of European officers, admission being by competition in England confined to European candidates only;

(2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, Natives only being eligible?—I have explained this idea to several Native gentlemen. They have approved it.

238. How would you regard such a scheme?—I should be inclined to approve it. But two questions would arise: (1) Whether a Native boy educated right through an English public school might be regarded as a European; and (2) whether in the definition of Statutory "Native" the words "habitually resident" might not include a man who did the whole work of his life in India, even if he did carry his old bones home to bury them in England.

239. How would the Native community regard the following:—

(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of appointments to be filled by competition in England to which Natives and Europeans alike would be admitted;

(2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, both Natives and Europeans being eligible?—It would not satisfy them unless so planned as to present great facilities to Natives going to England to compete.

240. How would you regard such a scheme?—It seems to me unwise unless the highest appointments were reserved for men appointed at home, and no special facilities were provided for Natives to go home and compete.

241. If either of the above schemes were adopted, how would the Native community view a proposal to combine the higher appointments of the Uncovenanted Service with the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service so as to form an enlarged Civil Service to be recruited in India?—The Natives with whom I have been thrown, as a rule, like this idea.

242. How would you view such a proposal?—I am in favour of one Civil Service recruited in India.

243. How would the Native community regard the following scheme:—

(1) a certain number of appointments in the Covenanted Civil Service to be reserved for Natives;

(2) a certain proportion of that number to be filled by competition or by some other system in India;

(3) the remainder to be filled by competition in England?—They would not like it: the reserving of special appointments for such Natives as went to England, while they were not held eligible for the Covenanted appointments, would be unpopular.

244. How would you regard such a scheme?—As a uselessly elaborate sub-division of appointments.

245. Assuming a system of nomination or of limited competition among nominated candidates, would Native opinion be in favour of giving a preference, as between candidates possessed of certain preliminary essential qualifications and having on general grounds fairly equal claims, in the following or any other order to—

(*a*) members of families of tried loyalty and distinguished service;

* Commissioners are already overworked. Practically this means that we cannot do without European control in the Districts, and if the District Officer is a Native, the Divisional Officer must do district work.

A. MACKENZIE,
Chief Commissioner.

(*b*) persons of good social status and influence in the country; and

(*c*) persons of superior educational attainments, such as persons who have taken the degree of M.A ?

—I think Native opinion generally would be in favour of giving weight to all these matters : the general community would give special weight to (a) and (b); and the new school would give greater weight to (c).

246. What is your opinion as to giving such preference?—I would certainly weigh all these considerations.

247. How would the Native community regard a system of nomination on the ground of merit and ability shown in the service of Government, or in the exercise of a profession, alternating with a system of selection by means of competition, whether entirely open or amongst nominated candidates?—I think they would not object to this.

248. How would you regard such a system?—I am doubtful about "entirely open" competition forming any part of the scheme. Otherwise I think it good.

249. If the Statutory system were maintained, and if a probati onary period were required from nominees or selected candidates before final appointment, would it be necessary to insist upon such probationary period in all cases, *e.g.*, in the case of a person who has done good service in the Uncovenanted ranks?—I would have it for a shorter period in such cases. My experience is that it is good to see the effect of promotion. They might have full pay by being appointed *sub. pro tem.*

250. In the case of persons nominated from the professional classes, is it desirable that a probationary period should be prescribed?—I would have it for a short time.

251. If so, is it necessary that the incidents of such period as to duration and pay should be the same as those attached thereto in the case of Statutory Civilians appointed on probation to the lowest g rade of the Covenanted Service?—I would have it shorter (as above stated) and I would give full pay, making the appointment "*sub. pro tem.*" The reason for reduced pay (that the officer is only under training) would not operate in these cases.

252. On what p rinciples should the promotion of Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than by the channel of the competition in England be regulated?—I would give them steady promotion by seniority (unless superseded as a punishment) within the same kind of appointments, but not from those of one name (*e.g.*, Assistant Commissioner) to those of another (*e.g.*, Deputy Commissioner).

253. Would you regulate such promotion only by considerations of fitness and approved personal merit?—The latter I would only give for fitness and merit.

254. How would the appointment of N atives to the higher reserved posts without passing through the lower grades affect the vested rights or the reasonable expectations and prospects of officers who entered the Covenanted Civil Service before the year 1870?—I think that that can only be answered when it is known how many and what appointments are given.

255. If those rights, expectations, or prospects would be prejudicially affected, how could they be safeguarded?—I do not see any reason for prejudicially affecting the rights and then safeguarding them: there is no such need of haste as to justify schemes of compensation: begin at the beginning.

256. Should Natives appointed to Covenanted posts be required to pass the Departmental Examinations?—Certainly.

257. Should they be required to pass the Departmental Examinations by both the lower and higher standards within their probationary period, subject to the penalty of forfeiture of appointment if they fail to pass within that time, unless the period is for special reasons extended?—I would prefer this rule.

258. Should a period longer than the probationary period be allowed for passing the Departmental Examination by the higher standard?—No.

259. Should the present rule be maintained under which probationers may be confirmed in their appointments at the close of the probationary period of two years, provided that they pass within that period the Departmental Examination by the lower standard prescribed for Covenanted Civilians appointed in England, no obligatory period being fixed for passing the higher standard, but no promotion or increase of pay being attainable until the higher standard examination has been passed, and power being retained to the Government to dispense with the services of a Statutory Civilian who may fail to pass by the higher standard within a reasonable time?—No.

260. What rule in regard to passing the Departmental Examinations should be applied in case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts on the ground of merit and ability proved in the service of Government or in the exercise of a profession?—I should excuse them all examinations not already passed, if they were only appointed to a special post. But, if they were placed in the regular line for promotion, I should insist on the usual examinations under the usual rules.

261 & 262.—Blank.

263. What system, if any, is at present adopted in your Province for bringing into the public service persons who, from their position or otherwise, cannot be expected to enter the service of Government in the lowest grades, and for giving them the necessary apprenticeship?—There is no such system adopted in this Province, except the system of nomination to special posts (*e.g.*, Assistants or Extra Assistant Commissioners) on probation.

264.—Blank.

VIII.—Composition, recruitment, &c., of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services.

265. Of what different classes of appointments is the Subordinate Executive Service in your Province composed, including in the term "Subordinate Executive Service" all Subordinate Executive offices down to and including the office of Tahsildar or other office corresponding to that of Tahsildar, which are not reserved by law for, or not ordinarily held by, members of the Covenanted Civil Service?—Extra Assistant Commissioners and Tahsildars.

266 & 267. Into what grades is each class of the above executive appointments divided in your Province, and of how many appointments does each grade consist? What rate of pay is attached to each grade?—

Extra Asst. Commrs.			Rs.	Tahsildars.			Rs.
6	1st	Grade	at 250	7	1st	Grade	at 250
8	2nd	„	„ 300	11	2nd	„	„ 200
12	3rd	„	„ 400	15	3rd	„	„ 175
7	4th	„	„ 500	17	4th	„	„ 150
3	5th	„	„ 600				

268. Of what different classes of appointments is the Subordinate Judicial Service in your Province composed, including in the term "Subordinate Judicial Service" all Subordinate Judicial offices down to and including the office of Munsif or other office corresponding to that of Munsif, which are not reserved by law for, or not ordinarily held by, members of the Covenanted Civil Service?—Extra Assistant Commissioners and Tahsildars in their judicial capacity; and also "Additional Tahsildars" or "Munsifs."

269. Into what grades is each class of the above judicial appointments divided in your Province, and of how many appointments does each grade consist?—15 Additional Tahsildarships, not divided into grades.

270. What rate of pay is attached to each grade?—Rs. 100 per mensem.

271. In the existing Subordinate Executive Staff how many persons are (1) Europeans; (2) Natives of India of pure descent; (3) Eurasians and others who, though not Natives of India of pure descent, fall within the meaning attached to the words "Natives of India" by the Statute of 1870 (33 Vic., Cap. 3, section 6); and (4) persons who are neither Europeans nor Natives of India, whether of pure descent or within the statutory meaning?—

(1) 1 European.

(2) 95 Natives of India of pure descent.

(3) 5 Eurasians and others who are Natives of India under the Statute.

(4) None.

272. What particular appointments in the Subordinate Executive Service are at present held in your Province by persons falling under each of the above classes?—

1 European is an Extra Assistant Commissioner, 5th grade.

2 Natives of India under the Statute are Extra Assistant Commissioners, 3rd grade.

2 Natives of India under the Statute are Extra Assistant Commissioners, 2nd grade.

1 Native of India under the Statute is an Extra Assistant Commissioner, 1st grade, *sub. pro tem.*

95 Natives of India of pure descent hold the remaining appointments, details of which, including pay of all the above appointments, are given against Questions 266 and 267.

273.—Blank.

274. What particular appointments in the Subordinate Judicial Service are at present held in your Province by persons falling under each of the above classes?—They are all held by class (2) Natives of India of pure descent.

275. What rates of pay are attached to the appointments thus held in each case?—Rs. 100 per mensem.

276. Under what system of selection or nomination are appointments at present made in your Province to the Subordinate Executive Service, as above defined?—Nomination.

277. Under what system are appointments similarly made to the Subordinate Judicial Service, as defined above?—Nomination.

278. Have any rules been framed for the purpose of regulating such appointments, and if so, what are they (*a*) in the case of the Subordinate Executive Service, and (*b*) in that of the Subordinate Judicial Service?—No rules have been framed.

279. What preliminary qualifications, if any, are required in the case of the Subordinate Executive Service and in that of the Subordinate Judicial Service respectively in regard to the age of candidates?—There is no restriction as to age and no prescribed educational standard, as first appointments are made from Clerks of Court or other Government servants who are considered to have received a fair education and who have passed some of the prescribed Departmental Examinations. Promotions to the higher grades are made from among those in the lower grades.

280.—Blank.

281. In regard to their moral, social and physical fitness?—These are taken into consideration before making first appointments; and reports in this respect are also submitted by officers (Commissioners and Deputy Commissioners) when recommending promotions.

282. In other respects (if any)?—In considering the claims of candidates possessing the required qualifications, the services rendered by the father of any of them is taken into account; also occasionally the candidate's birth, caste, or sect.

283. Are the same qualifications, if any, required on the part of the holders of all appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, as above defined, or are different qualifications required on the part of candidates for different classes of appointments?—The same qualifications are required on the part of the holders of all appointments. (See also replies to Questions 279 to 282 and No. 289.)

284.—Blank.

285. Are appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, as above defined, made on probation?—No; except that they are sometimes "Officiating," or "*sub. pro tem.*" appointments. The latter is the usual way in which probation is arranged for if the vacancy is a permanent one. It gives full pay and is continued until Government is satisfied of fitness.

286 to 288.—Blank.

289. What Departmental Examinations (if any) are persons appointed to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, as above defined, required to pass?—

(*a*) By the Higher Standard in Civil, Criminal, and Revenue Law and Procedure; also in portions of the Civil Account Code and Treasury Manual.

(*b*) Departmental Examination in Civil Law and Procedure.

290. Within what period (if any) from the date of original appointment must such examinations be passed?—Usually one year for the lower standard and another year for the higher standard: but there is no fixed period.

291. What is the penalty for failure to pass the examinations within the period prescribed?—Stoppage of promotion.

292. How is promotion regulated in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, as above defined?—Generally by seniority in appointments of the same name, and by selection from those of one name to a higher kind of appointment.

293. Does such promotion depend on fitness only or merely on seniority?—For grade promotion generally on seniority if required examinations are passed and no cause exists for punishment. But on fitness from one kind of appointment to another.

294 and 295.—Blank.

296. How is the present system of regulating appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, regarded by influential sections of the Native community?—It is regarded generally with satisfaction. I have talked to many Natives who condemn our selections for the Statutory Service, but approve those for the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Service. The reason is that (1) the number of the appointments to be filled is so much larger, and (2) the necessity for fitness is borne so much more fully in upon the officers appointing.

297.—Blank.

298. To what sections of Native society do the persons belong who accept under existing conditions appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively?—We have all sections, Mahomedans and Hindus, Brahmans and Sudras, the sons of Landowners and of begging priests, in both of these services.

299. To what extent do Natives of good family and education in your Province offer themselves as candidates for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments?—Since promotion became less tedious to good men, we find no difficulty in any way. We have two B.A's of respectable family among our 15 Additional Tahsildars (pay Rs. 100), and one or two of these Additional Tasíldárs are most superior men: they are, I think, all good.

300. Do Natives who have been to England for purposes of study on their return to India willingly accept such appointments?—None have returned of the boys who went. But we have an Extra Assistant Commissioner who went (*vide* Answer 136) and returned to his old post.

301. How far are such appointments in your Province restricted to persons *bonâ fide* resident in (and connected with) the Province?—Entirely, except "the European element" and a few Educational appointments.

302. How far are the professional classes represented in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, in your Province?—We have four men among our 36 Extra Assistant Commissioners who were pleaders before appointment: there may be more.

303. Do members of the professional classes in your Province readily accept employment in those services?—Yes, pretty readily: we have never taken an inferior professional man. But our promotion of Natives ceases at too low a limit to allow of our securing very successful professional men, *i e.*, men at the top of their profession.

304. Whatever system or systems may at present be adopted for the purpose of regulating appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, are any class or classes of persons expressly or practically excluded from such appointments?—Europeans, who do not come under the Statutory definition of "Natives," are excluded.

305. If so, how is such exclusion justified?—By Government order.

306. Is it the case that certain classes of Uncovenanted appointments are practically reserved for Natives of pure descent, owing to the fact that conditions are imposed which have resulted in shutting out Eurasians and other Statutory Natives of mixed descent?—Not with us. We find Natives of pure descent usually more fit; but we have a few

Eurasians and other Statutory Natives among our Extra Assistant Commissioners (4 in all).

307.—Blank.

308. What has been the effect on the efficiency of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services in your Province of the orders of the Government of India, dated 18th April 1879, which debar, unless with the previous sanction of the Governor-General in Council, (1) the appointment of any person, not being a Native of India within the Statutory meaning, to an office carrying a salary of Rs. 200 a month or upwards ; and (2) the promotion to such an office of persons, not being Statutory Natives, who entered the Department concerned after the 1st January 1879 ?—I do not know that there has been much effect. One man we have who is a European (not Statutory Native) among our Extra Assistant Commissioners. He is not an ornament to the class. Our experience of him would probably have led to considerable hesitation in appointing another. He has never passed his examination. Another (an old mutiny man) came to us from another Province over twenty years ago. He has always had a good character and been a useful officer.

309. Since the issue of the orders above cited have any undomiciled Europeans or other persons, not being Statutory Natives of India, been appointed either to the Subordinate Executive Service or to the Subordinate Judicial Service in your Province ?—None have been appointed.

310.—Blank.

311. Is it, in your opinion, necessary that there should be a proportion of Europeans either in the Subordinate Executive Service or in the Subordinate Judicial Service, or in both of those services ?—I do not think it is necessary. I doubt if it is even expedient unless we could, by holding out better prospects, secure a better class of men. Inferior Europeans are no advantage in the Mufassal.

312 and 313.—Blank.

314. How do European members of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, work with Native members of those services ?—There is no friction in our little community.

315. Has experience shown that Europeans serving in such capacities become dissatisfied with their position and with the general conditions as to pay, promotion, and retiring annuity under which they hold their appointments, and that their efficiency as public servants is consequently impaired ?—I should say this would certainly be the case if we happened to catch a superior man by chance and put him into one of these appointments under present conditions.

316. Are you in favour of laying down a rule that high educational capacity should be regarded as an essential qualification for appointment to the Subordinate Executive and to the Subordinate Judicial Services as defined for the purposes of these questions ?—I would recruit partly from among men already in the service and partly from among outsiders. For the latter I would make higher educational qualifications a *sine quâ non*.

317. If so, what test would you apply ?—University success.

318. Do you think that the test should vary according to the character of the office to be filled ?—I would like to see men who are appointed Additional Tahsildars in this Province told that, if they did well, they might rise to any position in the service (not reserved for Europeans) so that they might have such prospects as would secure first-rate men. Therefore I would not have different tests. We have already two B.A's, three F. A's, and some matriculated men among our 15 Additional Tahsíldárs. Natives, too, like this idea.

319. Generally, what system do you advocate for filling appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services as above defined ?—I would advocate a system of nomination for the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services. I know of no man in this Province whose services we need care to secure who would not be content to enter the service as a Tahsildar (pay Rs. 150 to 250) or even as an Additional Tahsíldár (pay Rs. 100), provided that good hope of sure and speedy promotion were held out to men found really able and efficient Government servants. When the area of selection is narrowed, as it is at present, by the necessity to find a man worthy to be put into the higher grades (Assistant Commissionership, &c.,) over the heads of a large and excellent body of public servants, there cannot but be a great suspicion of favouritism and good cause for discontent. Besides, such appointments come only very occasionally : we have only one every three years or so. Meanwhile our young Additional Tahsildar under the system hitherto in force looks forward (if he is the very luckiest man in all the service) to rising to be an Extra Assistant Commissioner on Rs. 600, just when he is going to be superannuated. That is, the very best thing he can possibly hope for is to be a subordinate all his life and to have at most half the pay that many pleaders get. It is suprising that we have been able to secure such men as we now have in the service. But let men be appointed Additional Tahsildars (whether from among outsiders or from among men already in service) whom it is intended to train for better things : let the ablest of them be made Tahsíldárs : let Tahsildars rise in their grades as a rule by seniority ; but let only able Tahsildars be selected (from any part of the list) to be made Extra Assistant Commissioners.* Let Extra Assistant Commissioners rise in their grades by seniority as

* I would also sometimes appoint Extra Assistant Commissioners from among officials of other Departments (Clerks of Court, Education Inspectors, &c.) as at present.

a rule; but let only thoroughly able and efficient and trustworthy Extra Assistant Commissioners be promoted to Assistant Commissionerships. Let these again be promoted by seniority so long as there is no good ground for superseding them; and let only the few who may be found fit to hold charge of a small district be appointed Deputy Commissioners, or only those who are the best and most thoroughly qualified be appointed to our Small Cause Courts or to District Judgeships. If this were done, I am sure we should have first-rate men. As, at present, the man who makes a good Tahsildar but is not fit for higher work, would rise by his seniority to Rs. 250. The good Extra Assistant Commissioner who was not (by education, character and manner) fit for more than this would rise to Rs. 600. But our best men might rise to be even Deputy Commissioners on Rs. 1,200 or Rs. 1,300.

I am sure that this would give great satisfaction for years to come, and would secure to Government the services of our best men. And this is the system which I should like to see made the normal system. I would permit appointments to be made from outsiders (especially from the professional classes) to higher grades than that of Tahsildar. But they would be exceptional.

In this province I think we could afford to have four (or even six) Deputy Commissioners Natives. I know that this means very probable loss of efficiency, and that it involves some risk. I know also that the Native landowners and bankers as a rule object to the idea of Native Deputy Commissioners. But I think that the authority and control of the Commissioner is so real in this province that a small district might safely be entrusted to a Native gentleman who had, after trial in many grades, come to the very top of a picked service. And I believe that some sacrifice must be made (1) to the hope of securing the best men for Government employ, and (2) to the feeling of dissatisfaction which has originated the Public Service Commission, and which that Commission may in turn intensely aggravate if nothing of a substantial character results from its labours.

Looking down the list I see among the Native Assistant and Extra Assistant Commissioners five men whom I should hope to see good Deputy Commissioners if they were tried; and I know of one professional Native gentleman whom I should not hesitate to try: he has held the Chief Small Cause Court with great acceptance and success for two years.* I have already said that, even with a good man, we should have to try the effect of promotion; but I should not fear to have men ready when the time came to put them in charge even of districts after they had risen steadily without interfering with the rights of our present civilians.

320 & 321.—Blank.

322. Do you advocate the requirement of a probationary period, and, if so, what should be the incidents of such period as to duration, pay, and in other respects?—I have already indicated that in some cases I would give full pay (*vide* answers 249 and 251).

323. Would you require a probationary period in all cases, or would you dispense with it in certain, and if so in what, cases?—I am generally in favour of probation whether called "period of probation" or "officiating" or "*sub. pro tem.*" appointment. I wish we could have had some of our own civilians on probation in Government service before finally appointing them.

324. If an open competitive examination were held in India for the Covenanted posts reserved for Natives, would persons who gained high marks in that examination and showed decided proficiency, but who failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, form suitable nominees for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments in the Uncovenanted Service?—They might.

* I regret to have to differ from Mr. Fraser here. I too have seen the gentleman in question. He is a pleasant, clever, rather nervous Bengali Babu. A very good Judicial Officer no doubt, but utterly unfit for the charge of a district.

A. MACKENZIE,
Chief Commissioner.

III.

MEMORANDUM ON THE SPECIAL FEATURES OF THE CENTRAL PROVINCES BEARING UPON ITS ADMINISTRATION.

Area and population.

The area of the Central Provinces with its Feudatory States, 15 in number, is 115,936 square miles, of which 86,501 square miles are British territory and 29,435 square miles the territory of dependent Native Chiefs. The total population of the Province according to the census of 1881 was 11,548,511, to which total the Feudatory States contributed the number of 1,709,720 persons. In addition to the Feudatories there are 116 non-feudatory Zamindaris, comprising an area of 21,368 square miles and a total population of 1,332,549 persons.

The Province is bounded on the north by the independent States of Bundelkhand, of which the principal are Tehri and Panna; on the west and north-west by the British district of Lalitpur belonging to the North-Western Provinces, by Bhopal, by Holkar's territory and Khandesh, by Berar and the Nizam's dominions; on the south and south-east by the Nizam's dominions, and by the Madras district of Rajamandri; on the east by the Jeypur Chiefship, under Madras jurisdiction, by those portions of Bengal known as the Tributary

Mahals and by the Rewa State. The Central Provinces therefore occupy a vast tract of country in the centre of the Peninsula. They are enclosed on nearly every side by foreign territory, and are cut off geographically from other British Provinces.

Cultivated area and forest.

2. The total cultivated area (in British territory) is about 21,000 square miles in extent. Of culturable and unculturable waste there are about 30,000 square miles each. The area of Government forest alone (including 1st and 2nd class reserves and the small area of unreserved forest) extends to about 20,067 square miles.

Races.

3. The mass of the population, whether including or excluding the Native States, consists of Hindus and aborigines, the number of all other classes including Mahomedans being insignificant. The number of Hindus in the whole Province was in 1881 6,518,137; that of aborigines 2,014,791. The Mahomedans numbered only 240,965.

Towns.

4. No town in the Central Provinces contains 100,000 inhabitants. The following towns have over 50,000 inhabitants :—

Nagpur	98,299
Jubbulpur	75,705
Kamptee	50,987

There are 48 towns in British territory and 4 in the Feudatory States which contain more than 5,000 inhabitants. Of the total population 698,566, or 6 per cent. only, are urban, that is, inhabit these 52 towns, the average population of which is 13,434.

The remaining 94 per cent of the population are rural, inhabiting 45,802 smaller places or villages, the average population of each being 237 inhabitants.

Administrative Divisions.

5. The Central Provinces are divided for administrative purposes into four Divisions, each controlled by a Commissioner; and subordinate to Commissioners are 18 Deputy Commissioners, each holding Executive charge of a District. In every District there are two or more sub-divisions, the direct management of each being entrusted to a Native Sub-Collector called a Tahsildar. There are 50 such sub-divisions in the 18 districts of the Central Provinces distributed as follows :—

Divisions.	Districts.	Tahsils.
Nagpur	Nagpur	Ramtek.
		Katol.
		Nagpur.
		Umrer.
	Bhandara	Bhandara.
		Tirora.
		Sakoli.
	Chanda	Warora.
		Brahmapuri.
		Mul.
		Sironcha.
	Wardha	Arvi.
		Wardha.
		Hinganghat.
	Balaghat	Burha.
		Behir.
Jubbulpur	Jubbulpur	Murwara.
		Sihora.
		Jubbulpur.
	Saugor	Banda.
		Kurai.
		Saugor.
		Rehli.
	Damoh	Hatta.
		Damoh.
	Seoni	Lakhnadon.
		Seoni.
	Mandla	Ramgarh.
		Mandla.
Nerbudda	Betul	Betul.
		Multai.
	Chhindwara	Chhindwara.
		Sausar.
	Hoshangabad	Sohagpur.
		Hoshangabad.
		Harada.
	Narsinghpur	Seoni.
		Narsinghpur.
		Gadarwara.
	Nimar	Khandwa.
		Burhanpur.
Chhattisgarh	Raipur	Simga.
		Raipur.
		Drug.
		Dhamtari.
	Sambalpur	Sambalpur.
		Bargarh.
	Bilaspur	Mungeli.
		Bilaspur.
		Seorinarain.

The last named Division, *i.e.*, Chhattisgarh, is the stronghold of the two great sects of Hindu dissenters,—the Satnamis, who number nearly 266,000 and the Kabirpanthis, who number over 164,000. The only districts in which the Mahomedans equal even 5 per cent. of the population, are Nimar with 24,426 or 10·6 per cent., Nagpur with 39,785 or 5·7 per cent., and Jubbulpur with 34,790 or 5 per cent. It may be noted here that over 94 per cent. of the Mahomedans in these Provinces are of the Suni sect. The Saugor district

contains nearly a third of the total number of Jains (26,583 persons). Appended is a list of the 12 most largely prevailing castes and tribes:—

No.	Name.	Number of both sexes.
1	Gond	2,040,355
2	Chamar	760,101
3	Kurmi (including Kunbi)	740,528
4	Teli	632,934
5	Ahir (including Gaoli, &c.)	509,526
6	Brahman	359,886
7	Mahar	322,016
8	Lodhi	265,147
9	Ganda	250,133
10	Mehra	242,304
11	Rajput	240,985
12	Gaur	214,936
	TOTAL	6,578,851

Of the Gonds certain tribes are special to certain localities, but they are found in greater or less numbers in nearly every district; they are chiefly found in the Satpura Districts and in the hill country to the south and east of the province.

Languages.

6. The general mother-tongue of the Provinces is Hindi, but in the Nagpur Division (except the Balaghat district) Marathi is the common mother-tongue, and in the Sambalpur district, Uriya. Even in these Marathi districts a considerable proportion of the inhabitants were recorded at the census as of Hindi mother-tongue, *viz.*, in Nagpur 16·6 per cent., Bhandara 21·7 per cent, Chanda 8 per cent., and Wardha 8·9 per cent. Marathi is also the mother-tongue of 24·9 per cent. of the inhabitants of the Balaghat district, 18·9 per cent. of Chindwara, 22·4 per cent. of Betul and 19·2 per cent. of Nimar.

Uriya is the mother-tongue of 76·3 per cent. of the inhabitants of the Sambalpur district, and 4·4 per cent. of Raipur.

The only district in which the mother-tongue of any considerable proportion of the inhabitants is Telugu is Chanda, where it is spoken by 11·5 per cent.

Area of districts.

7. The area of the districts exclusive of Feudatory States in the Central Provinces varies from 11,885 square miles in the case of Raipur, to 1,916 square miles in that of Narsinghpur. The average area of a district is 6,293 square miles if Feudatory States are included, and 4,691 square miles if they are excluded. Each district is divided into tahsils in charge of Tahsildars, while in two cases (Harda and Burhanpur), tahsils form sub-divisions in charge of an Assistant Commissioner or Extra Assistant Commissioner, as the case may be, with a Tahsildar working under him: the number of tahsils is 50.

Form of administration.

8. The administration of the Central Provinces is carried on by a Chief Commissioner aided by a Secretary, Under Secretary, and Permanent Uncovenanted Assistant Secretary in direct subordination to the Government of India. In addition to his general duties of superintendence the Chief Commissioner is charged with the special supervision of the Revenue and Executive. The Courts, Civil and Criminal, are separately controlled by a Chief Judge under the name of Judicial Commissioner, in deference to the principle of guarding against abuse from the combination of judicial and executive functions, by keeping the former in the last resort independent of the latter. The administrative staff consists of four Commissioners, eighteen Deputy Commissioners, seven Assistant Commissioners, besides Supernumeraries and the Assistant Commissioners, available for other duty, thirty-six Extra Assistant Commissioners, and fifty Tahsildars or Sub-Collectors, who are distributed over eighteen districts, grouped into four divisions. The Police force, consisting of eighteen District Superintendents, eleven Assistant District Superintendents, sixty Inspectors, and 7,303 petty Officers and Constables, is controlled by an Inspector-General in matters of discipline and in its internal relations generally, but in its executive functions it is subordinate to the district authorities. Education, Forest, Conservancy and Vaccination have separate establishments of their own, though the regular civil staff is expected to contribute assistance, direct or indirect, to the operations of these departments. Jail management, Excise, Sanitation, and Registration, are more or less in the hands of the local authorities, but are supervised by special officers. The Medical staff, consisting of eighteen Civil Surgeons and Apothecaries, twelve Assistant Surgeons, and 138 Hospital Assistants or Native Doctors, is directly subordinate to the Provincial Deputy Surgeon-General. The Public Works Department is more detached from the regular administrative staff, owning no subordination

to any local authority but the Chief Commissioner, to whom the Provincial Chief Engineer is Secretary in that branch of the administration.

9. Next in the scale of Executive authority to the Chief Commissioner come the Commissioners of Division, whose charges in three cases include five districts—in one (Chhattisgarh) only three. A Commissioner of Division in these Provinces is at the same time the Judge of the Court of Session for all the districts comprised in his Division, and the Civil Judge to whom appeals lie in all causes decided by Deputy Commissioners and by Assistant Commissioners when the subject-matter of the suit exceeds Rs. 1,000 in value. In three Divisions there are 5 districts: in the fourth, Chhattisgarh, there are 3 only. The average area of a Division is 4,691 square miles, and the average population about half a million, the Chhattisgarh Division exceeding the others in area and also slightly in population.*

As Judge of the Court of Session the Commissioner has to try all persons committed for offences which are exclusively triable by that Court and which Deputy Commissioners cannot legally try or think deserving of severer punishment than they are by law empowered to inflict. He also hears appeals from all sentences passed by Magistrates.

As a Civil Judge he disposes of all appeals from decisions of Deputy Commissioners and of Assistant Commissioners in suits exceeding Rs. 1,000 in value.

He supervises the administration of Criminal and Civil Justice in the Division generally, examines the work of the different officers and inspects the offices and record-rooms.

In Revenue matters he controls the work of the Deputy Commissioners and their subordinates, and, under the Central Provinces Land Revenue and Tenancy Acts, all appeals from the orders of Deputy Commissioners lie to him. In all matters affecting the agricultural community—whether it be the partition of landed estates, the grant of loans for improvements, the maintenance of village records—he superintends the working of the Deputy Commissioner and his Assistants. In every matter connected with the assessment and collection of the public revenue he may be called on to interfere. He is *ex-officio* a visitor of every gaol in the Division and is required to see that the gaols are managed in accordance with the law and the rules which have been laid down by Government.

He has to control the expenditure of all Municipal Committees and District Councils, and copies of their proceedings are regularly sent to him in order that he may be kept aware of all that passes.

He is required to inspect all treasuries and to satisfy himself that the treasury work is carried on in accordance with the orders of the Financial Department.

In every one of the numerous matters which the Deputy Commissioner's duty embraces, he acts as regulator and controller.

10. In many respects the work of Deputy Commissioner in his district is similar to that of the Commissioner in his Division. As the immediate executive representative of Government he is brought into closer contact with the people of his district, and also with the officers of other departments of Government who are either not under his control at all or only generally subject to his orders. Among the latter are the District Superintendent of Police, the Civil Surgeon, the Superintendent of the Jail, the Forest Officer and the Officers of the Registration Department and also (in some respects) of the Education Department. He is the Chief Magistrate of a district, averaging in these Provinces 4,691 square miles in extent, with an average revenue of Rs. 7,20,000, and an average population of 546,599 souls, and has also special criminal powers of imprisonment up to seven years in certain cases. His original civil jurisdiction is unlimited in amount, and he hears appeals from his Assistants up to Rs. 1,000. He is also the Collector of his district and the chief revenue officer in it. These duties branch into many others too numerous to mention, but it may safely be said that the miscellaneous work of a Deputy Commissioner in a central district often occupies more time than his more regular functions.

The Assistant and Extra Assistant Commissioners aid Deputy Commissioners in their general duties, and try cases within the limits of their powers, to obtain which they must pass two examinations by the higher and lower standards.

11. Settlement operations are now being carried on in all the three districts of the Chhattisgarh Division, and preliminary arrangements are being made in the Jubbulpur Division. The Directorship of Agriculture has recently been converted into a Commissionership of Settlements and Agriculture, and this Officer, who as a temporary arrangement acts also as Secretary to the Chief Commissioner in Revenue matters, is the head of the Settlement Department. There are now four Settlement Officers and eight Assistant Settlement Officers at work in the various districts under settlement.

Political duties.

12. Political duties are in the Central Provinces confined almost exclusively to the Chhattisgarh Division. Of the 15 Feudatory States, all except one are attached to that Division. The exception is the small Chiefship of Makrai, in the district of Hoshangabad, which has an area of 215 square miles only.

* NOTE.—There appears to be some mistake here. Compare paras. 1 and 7; the average area of a Division is 21,625 square miles, and the average population is 2,459,697.—*Editor.*

The Feudatory Chiefships in Chhattisgarh are :—

Name.	Area.	Population.	Income.	Tribute.
	Sq. m.		R	R
Khairagarh	940	166,138	1,61,980	49,000
Nandgaon	903	154,339	2,76,161	46,000
Kanker	639	63,610	47,513	*Nil.*
Chhuikadan	174	32,979	31,266	11,000
Bamra	1,988	81,286	35,220	350
Rehrakohl	838	17,750	14,044	580
Sonpur	906	178,180	99,076	5,000
Bastar	13,062	196,248	1,00,000	3,056
Patna	2,399	251,959	1,01,305	600
Kalahandi	3,745	224,548	1,03,356	3,975
Sarangarh	540	71,274	35,294	1,350
Sakti	570	71,277	18,389	1,850
Kawardha	887	86,362	79,894	1,600
Raigarh	1,486	128,943	47,205	400

It must be said that the Chiefs of these States are as a rule men of small education and little enlightenment. Cases have been frequent in which the Local Administration has been compelled to interpose to prevent reckless extravagance and extensive oppression. There are at present no less than six of these States under the direct management of Government,—Raigarh, Kawardha, Sakti, Patna, Kalahandi and Sarangarh ; and in the largest of these States—Bastar—an Extra Assistant Commissioner from the ranks of the Central Provinces Commission was last year appointed Dewan by the Raja, at the instance of the Local Administration, in order to remedy the various laxities and abuses that were found on enquiry to exist in the management of affairs.

It is impossible to specify in detail the duties entailed on the Commissioner and the Deputy Commissioners of the Chhattisgarh Division in consequence of the control exercised by them over the States. Their principal duties are to prevent reckless extravagance and oppression and to secure the due observance by the Chiefs of their treaty obligations. In the case of States under management the Deputy Commissioner occupies very much the same position in regard to the people of the State, which he occupies in regard to the people of his own district.

Military force.

13. The Military force stationed in these Provinces is a small one. Its normal strength (for since the commencement of operations in Burma it has been considerably weakened) is—

2 Batteries of European Artillery.
2 Battalions and a detached Company of European Infantry.
2 Regiments of Native Cavalry less one squadron.
6 Regiments of Native Infantry.

The force is distributed as follows :—

BENGAL ARMY.

Saugor Cantonment.

1 Battery of Artillery.
1 Wing of European Infantry.
2 Squadrons of Native Cavalry.
1 Regiment of Native Infantry (Madras).

Jubbulpur.

1 Wing (Head Quarters) of European Infantry.
1 Squadron, Native Cavalry.
1 Regiment of Native Infantry (Madras).

MADRAS ARMY.

Kamptee Cantonment.

1 Battalion of European Infantry.
1 Regiment of Native Cavalry.
1 Regiment and a Wing of Native Infantry.
1 Battery of Artillery.

Sitabaldi.

1 Detachment of the European Infantry stationed at Kamptee (relieved every month).
1 Wing of a Regiment of Native Infantry.

Hoshangabad.

1 Wing of a Regiment of Native Infantry.

Raipur.

1 Regiment of Native Infantry.

Sambalpur.

1 Wing of a Regiment of Native Infantry.

BOMBAY ARMY.

Asirgarh Fort.

1 Company of European Infantry.

There is also a Volunteer Rifle Corps at Nagpur, the enrolled strength of which is about 350.

Industrial arts.

14. The Provinces are almost entirely wanting in any handicrafts of artistic merit, and the only manufactures which possess even local interest are the silver gilt wire and silk fabrics of Burhanpur, the fine cotton cloth woven at various places in the Nagpur, Chanda and Bhandara districts, and the Tassar silk of Chanda, Seoni and Chhattisgarh. The city of Nagpur has no artistic manufacture peculiar to it, notwithstanding that it has a population of over 98,000, and formerly held a Native Court of considerable wealth and importance. Under Native rule Nagpur had some reputation for the art of embroidery with seed pearls, and the treasury of the Bhonsla estate contains some very fine specimens of Nagpur work of this class. But the art has entirely died out in the absence of any demand for it. Wood-carving of some merit is procurable at Saugor, Damoh, Jubbulpur and Nagpur.

General characteristics of people.

15. There is in the Central Provinces little of that religious animosity which is the source of so many difficulties in Upper India. The overwhelming preponderance in numbers of the Hindus in nearly every town and district precludes the possibility of any serious disturbances. In Burhanpur, however, where the Mussulmans are very numerous, special measures have to be taken at the Muharram and Dasehra festivals in order to prevent any collision between the rival sects. And this is true in a less degree of several of the larger towns, *e. g.*, Jubbulpur and Saugor. As a general rule it may be said that the people of the Province are orderly and law abiding.

Strength of Staff.

16. The staff at the disposal of the Local Administration consists of the officers of the Commission and those of the Uncovenanted or subordinate service.

Excluding the Chief and Judicial Commissioners and the officers of the Secretariat, the sanctioned strength of the Commission is as follows :—

ADMINISTRATIVE.

Commissioners of Divisions	4
Deputy Commissioners of Districts (4 grades)	18
Assistant Commissioners (3 grades)	7

JUDICIAL.

Judges, Small Cause Courts	2

These appointments are held by Covenanted Civilians, Military Officers and Uncovenanted officers. There are also at the present time six Assistant Commissioners and eleven Supernumerary Assistant Commissioners who fill the places of officers on leave or are considered to be in training. Of the total number of officers employed in the Commission, as above mentioned, 25 belong to the Covenanted Civil Service, 16 are Military Officers, 5 are Uncovenanted European officers, 2 are Statutory Civilians and 1 is a Native Uncovenanted officer. The subordinate service consists of the following officers :—

Extra Assistant Commissioners, 5th grade	3
" " 4th "	7
" " 3rd "	12
" " 2nd "	8
" " 1st "	6
Total	36
Tahsildars	50
Munsifs	15

Of these, the Munsifs perform only judicial functions. In the subordinate service there are 5 Europeans and 96 Natives.

There are five Cantonment Magistracies, *viz.*, Kamptee, Saugor, Jubbulpur, Pachmarhi

and Asirgarh. Only the first two have a separate officer as Cantonment Magistrate. At Jubbulpur the duties are performed by the Military officer in charge of the Central Jail; and at the last two places, an officer of the local staff performs the duties of Cantonment Magistrate.

IV.

Replies of R. J. Crosthwaite, Esq., C. S., Judicial Commissioner of the Central Provinces.

No. 1708—95, dated Nagpur, the 4th April 1887.

From—A. C. Duff, Esq., C. S., Under-Secretary to the Chief Commissioner, Central Provinces,

To—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission, Calcutta.

I am directed by the Chief Commissioner to forward herewith a copy of a memorandum* of replies by the Judicial Commissioner of these Provinces to the questions of the Public Service Commission.

* Dated the 30th March 1887.

Replies of the Judicial Commissioner, Central Provinces, to the interrogatories of the Public Service Commission.

Replies of Judicial Commr., C. P.

1. The only points on which I would submit any remarks are the following:—
   (1) Whether any alteration in the rules regarding the competition in England should be made in order to facilitate the entrance of Natives into the Indian Civil Service (Qs. 129—130).
   (2) Whether Natives of India should be appointed to the Covenanted Civil Service by competitive examination in India (Q. 151).
   (3) The mode of selection of Statutory Civilians (Qs. 96—124).
   (4) How appointments should be made to the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Service (Q. 319).

2. As to the first point I think that the only alteration that should be made in the rules regarding the examination in England is to restore the former limit of age which was I think 22. There are numerous arguments for and against the former limit of age, but I doubt if the Government of India gets better men under the present, than it did under the former system. The service is not so attractive as it was for various reasons, especially because of the large reduction of salaries arising from the fall in exchange and the uncertainty whether the salaries even will continue to be as good as they are now. It must be admitted therefore that it is probable that first-class University men will not come forward now and compete as they did formerly. Still I am disposed to think that it would be well to make it possible for persons who have had a University training to enter the service. Under the old system such persons obtained appointments and have done well in India. Others also entered the service who had not been to a University. Government obtained both classes of candidates. Now University men are excluded. Moreover, there is no doubt that the educated classes of India regard the limitation of age as a great hardship and inasmuch as a Native of India who goes to England and passes the examination there, is sure to have exceptional qualifications, I think it is desirable to have such Natives in the service. I think the wishes of the educated classes of India might be consulted in this respect without lowering the standard of English competitors.

3. I object very strongly to making any alteration in the subject of the examination in order to make it more easy for Natives. The object of the examination is not to get Natives into the Civil Service, but to select the men best fitted for it. To substitute Arabic and Sanskrit for Greek and Latin either by increasing the marks for Arabic and Sanskrit or otherwise would be, I submit, most ill-judged. Not only is the study of Latin and Greek writers more improving to the mind than the study of Sanskrit and Arabic works, but the training which boys get by the way in which they are instructed in Latin and Greek is a training which it is extremely unlikely that they will ever get while studying Arabic or Sanskrit. The object of the examination in England must be to select the best Englishmen, and the subjects of the examination must be chosen so that we may get the best men trained in the schools in which those of the class from which we wish to select our Civilians are educated.

4. I think that Natives of India should not be selected for the Covenanted Civil Service by competitive examination in India. If the examination in England is conducted as it is now, I have no objection to the appointment of Natives who go to England and pass the examination there; but I would not have a special examination for Natives. In selecting Englishmen for the Civil Service by examination, we start with the knowledge that if we

get the ablest and best educated of a certain class of Englishmen we shall, as a rule, get the men we want. We have then to make the examination of such a nature as to secure our getting men of this class. But in India we could not so arrange. An examination in India for Natives would merely give us the cleverest and best educated of the large class which looks to Government service and the Bar as its profession. The schools and Universities in India give instruction, but they give no moral or other general training in habits of self-government and discipline such as our Universities and schools in England afford. In both countries the acquisition of the knowledge requisite for passing the examination is evidence of moral and other qualifications for the Government service; but I think much less so in India than in England. An examination of Natives in India would be principally an intellectual and educational test. The persons selected might be good Government servants, or they might not. There are special reasons why the selection of Englishmen by examination succeeds, and these reasons do not apply in the case of the Natives of India.

5. The rules for the appointment of Natives of India to the Statutory Service have not been long in force, and it is difficult to say whether they will be a success or not. They are unpopular for two reasons I think. First, because the appointments are entirely in the hands of the Government, and secondly, because persons who have been a long time in the Government service find young men who in point of intellect and education are their equals or inferiors put over their heads into a higher grade of the service. The persons who object to the Statutory Service rules are those who are now in the Government service or who hope to be in it, and not the landowners, merchants or others who do not seek for appointments in the public service and who, therefore, are not interested in the way in which those appointments are conferred. We have two Statutory Civilians, and one of these will, I think, certainly as regards his Civil judicial work be a good officer. There is no prospect of the Statutory Civilian being equal to the competition Civilian, and I do not see how we can expect that he can be. His promotion must be regulated mainly by considerations of fitness and approved personal merit. The Native Statutory Civilian will, I believe, be best fitted for judicial work, especially civil work, but with experience and careful training we may get officers competent to take charge of districts.

6. The Statutory Service should be retained, but the rules should secure that persons appointed to it shall have received a good education, and members of the Subordinate Service should sometimes be appointed. It is important that the Government should retain the power of appointing Native Civilians, because it may be necessary for political reasons to appoint a person of a particular class. If persons of good family and position are willing to enter the service, it is expedient that the Government should have the power of appointing them. Not only will such persons be more independent and free from temptation, but they will be better able to command the obedience and respect of their subordinates. If the son of an office clerk were raised to the position of a Covenanted Civilian, it would be difficult for him to avoid an undue intimacy with his subordinates which would weaken his authority. There is no reason, however, why some educational standard should not be prescribed as a necessary qualification for the Statutory Civil Service, or the appointments might be made by the examination of a number of candidates selected by the Local Government. The claims of officers of the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Service to appointments in the Statutory Civil Service should be considered. Of course when such an officer is appointed to the Commission he must take his place at the bottom of the list. It would injure the service materially and be most unpopular to allow the Government to appoint at once to the higher posts and thus stop the regular promotion. The only way in which such officers or persons not in the Government service could be with fairness placed in high appointments over the heads of those in the regular line, would be by setting apart a certain number of high appointments to be reserved exclusively for officers of the Subordinate Service or for persons not in the Government service. This might be done, though I do not recommend it, when those who are now in the regular line have been provided for. I do not think that persons appointed from the Subordinate Service in these Provinces would be better than those whom the Government could appoint under the Statutory Rules. But I consider that the members of the Subordinate Service have a strong claim to be promoted to the Statutory Civil Service, and that their promotion will improve the Subordinate Service.

The salary of a probationer for the Statutory Civil Service should, I think, be raised to Rs. 250. He should not draw less than the lowest grade Extra Assistant Commissioner.

7. The present system of making appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Service works well. I do not think that it is desirable to make the appointments to that service by competitive examination. To separate the separate service into two branches, the higher and the lower grade, and to appoint to the higher by examination would injure our lower grade service. At present the prospect of promotion is a great inducement to a man to accept a clerkship or a muharrir's post. Take that prospect away and the office establishments are deprived of all chance of rising to superior posts. We shall not only get a class of men inferior to those we have now, but we can hardly expect so much industry and care on the part of our subordinate officials. Persons are sometimes now appointed in the first instance to be Extra Assistant Commissioners, but

officials are also promoted to that office and their previous experience is of great benefit to them. I would not recommend that there should be an examination for all appointments in the Subordinate Service, and that those appointed should begin in the lower grades and rise by regular promotion. This system would not answer, as there are many men who should not be put in the lower grades, but who should commence in the higher grades. There are also many who are fit for the lower appointments, but not for the higher, and promotion must go by selection and not by seniority. There would however be no objection to making a rule that a person should not be eligible for an appointment above a certain grade unless he had passed a certain examination or possessed certain educational qualifications.

Vol, III. Sec. I. Sub-Sec. B. C. P.

Replies of Judicial Commr., C. P.

8. My opinion then on the questions I have noted on is:—

(1) that the limit of age for the competitive examination in England should be raised to facilitate the admission of Natives;

(2) that Natives of India should not be appointed to the Covenanted Civil Service by examination other than the examination in England;

(3) that Statutory Civilians should be appointed, as heretofore, by the Local Government, but that ordinarily no one should be appointed who did not possess high educational qualifications, and that in making appointments to the service the claims of members of the Subordinate Service, if they are of proved merit and ability, should be considered; and

(4) that no change should be made in the mode of recruiting the Subordinate Service in these Provinces.

V.

No. 3, dated the 16th November 1886.

From—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission,

To—The Secretary to the Chief Commissioner of the Central Provinces.

With reference to the Resolution of the Government of India in the Home Department, No. 34—1573-83, dated 4th October 1886, on the subject of the appointment of a Commission for the purpose of enquiring into the question of the employment of Natives of India in the Public Service, I am directed to request that, with the permission of the Chief Commissioner, you will be good enough to favour the Commission with full details showing the number of "charges" or offices in which Covenanted and Uncovenanted officers, engaged in the Executive and Judicial administration of the country, are at present employed, together with complete information as to the apportionment of these "charges" or offices amongst members of the Covenanted and Uncovenanted Services respectively in the Central Provinces.

Vol. III. Sec. I. Sub-Sec. B. C. P.

Information supplied by the Chief Commr., C. P.

2. Columns 2—14, inclusive, of the statement embodied in paragraph 7 of the Resolution of the Government of India in the Home Department, No. 68—2024-35, dated 15th December 1881, show the nature of the statistics required, and I am to request that the return now asked for may be rendered as complete as possible so as accurately to represent existing facts. I am at the same time to enclose detailed lists of appointments upon which the figures given in the Resolution of 15th December 1881 in regard to the Central Provinces were based, and to request that corresponding details may be furnished of the figures entered under each column of the present return.

3. The Commission would also be glad to be furnished with figures showing the existing cadre of the Covenanted Civil Service in the Central Provinces, together with information regarding the proportion to the total strength of that service of (1) effectives, (2) officerson leave and other non-effectives, and (3) officers in training, respectively.

No. 442-329, dated Nagpur, the 28th January 1887.

From—A. C. Duff, Esq., C.S., Under-Secretary to the Chief Commissioner, Central Provinces,

To—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission, Bombay.

I am directed to forward, in substitution of the statements previously forwarded, Statements A, B, and C containing the information called for in your letter No. 3, dated the 16th November last. I am to explain that in the Central Provinces, there are no "Sub-divisional Officers" in the ordinary sense, except one at Harda.

STATEMENT A.

Statement showing the number of "charges" or offices in which Covenanted and Uncovenanted Officers are employed in the Executive and Judical Administration of the Central Provinces.

Central Provinces.	Government of India.	COVENANTED, INCLUDING MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION.							UNCOVENANTED.					Covenanted officers.	Uncovenanted officers.
		EXECUTIVE.			JUDICIAL.				EXECUTIVE.		JUDICIAL.				
		Administration.	*Districts.* Headships of Districts and the like.	*Districts.* Sub-Divisional Officers.	High and Chief Courts and Judicial Commissioner.	*Districts.* District or special Judges and the like.	*Districts.* Assistant Judges and the like.	General.	Sub-Divisional Officers.	Tahsildars, Mamlatdars, Sub-Deputies, &c.	High and Chief Courts and Judicial Commissioner.	Assistant Judges and the like.	Subordinate Judges, Munsifs and the like.		
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16
	2	8	18	7	1	*Nil.*	2	9	36	50	*Nil.*	*Nil.*	15	47	101

A. C. DUFF,
Under-Secretary.

STATEMENT B.

CENTRAL PROVINCES.

Government of India—2.*

* (At present there is only *one* officer with the Government of India, *viz.*, Colonel Ward, Minister of Bhopal, but as an average, it is better to take *two*.)

Administration—8.

1 Chief Commissioner.
4 Commissionerships of Divisions.
1 Commissionership of Settlements and Agriculture.
2 Secretaryship and Under-Secretaryship.

Total . 8

Headships of Districts—18.

4 Deputy Commissioners, 1st Class.
5 Ditto 2nd „
5 Ditto 3rd „
4 Ditto 4th „

Total . 18

Sub-Divisional and similar offices—43.

† 4 Assistant Commissioners of more than two years' service.

† (The number was six in 1881. Since then the Sub-Divisional Office at Pachmarhi which was held by an officer of the Commission has been abolished. The four Districts where a passed Assistant at head-quarters is essential are Saugor, Jubbulpur, Nagpur, and Raipur. There is now no strictly sub-divisional charge where a Covenanted officer is essential.)

36 Extra Assistant Commissionerships.
‡ 3 Cantonment Magistrates

‡ (One of these, that of Jubbulpur, has recently been doubled up with the office of Superintendent, Central Jail and School of Industry, Jubbulpur, which is held by a member of the Commission.)

Total . 43

Tahsils and similar minor executive charges and offices—50.

50 Tahsildars.

(A new Tahsil has been created since 1881 in the Bhandara District, hence an increase of one in the number of Tahsildars.)

Total . 50

High and Chief Court and Judicial Commissioner—1.

1 Judicial Commissioner.

Total . 1

District Judges—*Nil.*

Total . *Nil.*

(The Additional Commissionership included in the figures for 1881 has been abolished.)

STATEMENT B—*continued.*

Cantonment and Subordinate Judges and Munsifs—17.

*1 Small Cause Court, Nagpur.
*1 Do. do. Jubbulpur.

15 Munsifs (appointed under the Central Provinces Civil Courts' Act).

*(Both the Judges of these Courts are Covenanted officers, and the charges have therefore been entered as covenanted charges in Statement A, but since 1881, both have been held for periods of some length by an Uncovenanted officer in the case of Jubbulpur and by a pleader in the case of Nagpur: both are held at this moment by Covenanted officers.)

Total . 17

Average of higher miscellaneous appointments held by Covenanted Civil Servants or other members of Commission of rank of Assistant Commissioner or upwards—9.

1 Inspector General of Excise and Registration.
1 Inspector General of Jails and Police.
1 Registrar, Judicial Commissioner's Court.
1 Political Agent (stationed at Bhowani, Patna).
†4 Settlement Officers.
†1 Assistant Settlement Officer.

Total . 9

†(This is the actual number of officers of the Commission of the rank of Assistant Commissioner and upwards now employed in the Settlement Department. Settlement operations in the Central Provinces will be extensive until the end of 1897.)

A. C. DUFF,
Under-Secretary.

STATEMENT C.

Statement showing the existing cadre of the Covenanted Civil Service in the Central Provinces together with information regarding the proportion to the total strength of that service of (1) effectives, (2) officers on leave and other non-effectives, and (3) officers in training.

	Total Civilians in the Central Provinces.	Officers on leave and non-effectives.	Officers in training.	Proportion of effective to the total strength.	Proportion of officers on leave and non-effective to the total strength.	Proportion of officers in training to the total strength.	REMARKS.
Number . .	(a)34	*3	(b)4	91·1	8·8	11·7	(a) 32 Covenanted Civilians. 1 Statutory Civilian. 1 Probationer for Statutory Service. (b) 3 Civilians under 2 years' service, and 1 Native Probationer for the Statutory Service.

* Mr. Crosthwaite.
,, Howell.
,, Venning.

A. C. DUFF,
Under-Secretary.

VI.

No. 89, dated Allahabad, the 5th of January 1887.

From—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission,

To—The Secretary to the Chief Commissioner of the Central Provinces.

I am directed to request that, with the permission of the Chief Commissioner, you will be good enough to favour the Public Service Commission with accurate statistics showing how many persons at present employed in the Subordinate Judicial Service and in the Subordinate Executive Service in the Central Provinces have (1) passed the Entrance examination, (2) passed the First Arts or other corresponding examination, and (3) taken the degree of Bachelor or Master of Arts at an Indian University.

2. I am to explain that the information is required for each class of appointments separately, and that the terms "Subordinate Judicial Service" and "Subordinate Executive

Service" are intended to embrace respectively all Subordinate Executive and Judicial offices down to and including the office of Munsif or Tahsildar, or other offices corresponding to that of Munsif or Tahsildar which are not reserved for, or not ordinarily held by, members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

3. The favour of an early reply is requested.

No. 901-46, dated Nagpur, the 25th of February 1887.

From—A. C. Duff, Esq., C.S., Under-Secretary to the Chief Commissioner, Central Provinces,

To—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission.

In accordance with your letter No. 89, dated 5th January, I am to inform you that out of 44 Extra Assistant Commissioners, 16 have passed a University examination; out of 61 Tahsildars 5, and out of 16 Additional Tahsildars 7 have passed. The particulars about these officers will be found in the annexed list. These figures include Officiating Officers.

2. In reference to paragraph 2 of your letter I am to explain that Extra Assistant Commissioners and Tahsildars, do both Executive and Judicial work; and Additional Tahsildars alone have exclusively judicial functions.

List of Extra Assistant Commissioners, Tahsildars and Additional Tahsildars who have passed the University Examination.

Office.	Name of Officer.	Date of appointment to the Public Service.	What University Examinations the officer has passed.
Extra Asstt. Commr.	Mr. Bapu Rao Patwardhan	22nd December 1862	Matriculation, Bombay University.
Ditto	Mr. Vasudeo Balal Kher	22nd February 1863	Ditto do.
Ditto	„ Adhar Singh Gour	June 1863	B. A., LL. B., Cambridge.
Ditto	„ Balkrishna Martand Samarth	June 1863	Entrance, Bombay University.
Ditto	Mr. Ganpat Rao Srikhande	3rd March 1866	Do Calcutta do.
Ditto	Mr. Waman Rao	April 1879	F. A., Bombay University.
Ditto	„ Hari Gopal Padhya	13th March 1869	B. A. do. do.
Ditto	„ Ganpat Rao Gokhle	17th February 1872	F. A. do. do.
Ditto	„ Balaji Bhicaji Pinge	4th October 1868	Matriculation do.
Ditto	„ Kashinath Kesheo Thakur	19th March 1885	M. A., B. L., Calcutta University.
Ditto	Mr. Trimbak Rao Sathe	18th March 1865	Matriculation, Bombay do.
Ditto	„ Durga Pershad	2nd December 1885	Entrance, Calcutta do.
Ditto	„ Trimbak Rao Nilkant Deshmukh	October 1886	Ditto do.
Offg. Extra Assistant Commissioner	Mr. Raghunath Rao	15th September 1876	F. A. do. do.
Ditto ditto	„ Hari Luximam Indurkar	11th August 1884	M. A. with Honours do.
Ditto ditto	Mr. Haris Chandra Bose	2nd November 1882	Entrance.
Tahsildar	Balmukund Purohit	July 1866	Ditto.
Ditto	Moreshwar Atmaram	September 1873	Ditto.
Ditto	Rajaram Gungadhur	9th November 1881	F. A., Calcutta University.
Offg. Tahsildar	T. Goondiah	22nd January 1875	Entrance, do.
Ditto ditto	Kutubuddin	1st April 1876	Ditto, do.
Additional Tahsildar	Ragonath Gajanand	July 1879	Ditto, do.
Ditto ditto	Krishnaji Anant	15th June 1880	Ditto, do.
Ditto ditto	Mahomed Habibullah	11th August 1876	F. A., Calcutta do.
Ditto ditto	Gopal Rao Dongre	1st April 1881	B. A., do. do.
Ditto ditto	Narayan Sabaji Shergar Pawor	6th December 1883	B. A., Bombay do.
Ditto ditto	Jaikrishna Babaji	22nd April 1881	F. A., Calcutta do.
Offg. Additional Tahsildar.	Hanuman Pershad	28th March 1876	Ditto do.

VII.

No. 102, dated Bombay, the 22nd of January 1887.

From—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission,

To—The Secretary to the Chief Commissioner, Central Provinces.

I am directed to request that, with the permission of the Chief Commissioner, you will be good enough to favour the Public Service Commission with a return in the annexed form showing the nationalities and castes of the several persons at present employed in the Subordinate Judicial Service and in the Subordinate Executive Service in the Central Provinces.

2. I am to explain that the information is required for each class of appointments separately, and that the terms "Subordinate Judicial Service" and "Subordinate Executive Service" are intended to embrace respectively all Subordinate Executive and Judicial offices down to and including the office of Munsif or Tahsildar, or other offices corresponding to that of Munsif or Tahsildar which are not reserved for, or not ordinarily held by, members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

3. The favour of an early reply is requested.

No. 580—26, dated Nagpur, the 4th of February 1887.

From—A. C. DUFF, Esq., C.S., Under-Secretary to the Chief Commissioner, Central Provinces,

To—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission.

With reference to your letter No. 102, dated the 22nd ultimo, I am directed to forward herewith a statement in the form therein prescribed, showing the nationalities and castes of the several persons at present employed in the Subordinate Judicial Service and in the Subordinate Executive Service in the Central Provinces; and to state that the information required by the foot-note to the form is not at present available, but will follow shortly.

A.

Class of appointment.	Europeans or Eurasians domiciled in India.	Europeans or Eurasians not domiciled in India at the time of appointment.	Mahomedans.	Hindus.						Sikhs.	Other.
				Brahmans including Shenvis.	Kshatriyas.	Kayasthas (Parbhus.)	Banyas and Vyses.	Shudras.	Others.		
	SUBORDINATE JUDICIAL SERVICE.										
Extra Assistant Commissioners.	5	1	2	25	2	5	...	2	...	...	2
Tahsildars		...	18	23	3	14	...	2	...	...	...
Munsifs	...	...	2	14	...	...	...	...	...	...	...

NOTE.—Extra Assistant Commissioners and Tahsildars in these Provinces have to perform both Executive and Judicial duties. Munsifs perform judicial duties only.

A. C. DUFF,
Under-Secretary.

B.

Class of appointment.	Europeans or Eurasians domiciled in India.	Europeans or Eurasians not domiciled in India at the time of appointment.	Mahomedans.	Hindus.						Sikhs.	Others.
				Brahmans including Shenvis.	Kshatriyas.	Kayasthas (Parbhus).	Banyas or Vyses.	Shudras.	Others.		
EXTRA ASSISTANT COMMISSIONERS.	SUBORDINATE JUDICIAL SERVICE.										
F. St. C. Williams . . .	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Biresar Dat	...	...	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...
Bapu Rao Patwardhan . .	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Debi Pershad Rai . . .	...	...	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...
Nobin Chandra Banerji . .	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Girish Chandra . . .	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	..	...
Vasudeo Balal Kher . .	...	..	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
C. Rungaya	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	1	...	...	...
Rai Bhog Chand . . .	...	...	...	...	...	1	...	...	..	...	...
Moreshwar Rao . . .	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
M. B. Tulsing . . .	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	1
J. Hornby	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...

Class of appointment.	Europeans or Eurasians domiciled in India.	Europeans or Eurasians not domiciled in India at the time of appointment.	Mahomedans.	Hindus.						Sikhs.	Others.
				Brahmins including Shenvis.	Kshatriyas.	Kayasthas (Parbhus).	Bunyas or Vysias.	Shudras.	Others.		
Extra Assistant Commissioners.—*contd.*			**Subordinate Judicial Service,—*contd.***								
H. E. Stranbrough	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Madho Rao	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Bhargo Rao	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Rambaji Rao Mahadik	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	1	...	...	...
Vithal Rao	...	...	...	1	..	...	...	...	...	...	...
Adhar Singh Gour	...	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...
Dadaji Jaiwant	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Balkrishna Martand	...	..	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Purshotum Dass	...	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...
Ganpat Rao Shrikunde	...	..	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Krishna Rao	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
K. M. Anderson	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
P. M. Greamy	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Waman Rao	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Balwant Rao Manday	...	...	..	1	...	...	...	...	..	...	...
Hari Gopal Padhye	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Ghulam Mustaffa	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Balwant Rao Gadgiel	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Mohan Chander Chatterjee	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Mehdi Hussain	...	...	1	...	..	...	...	...	...	...	...
Yado Madho Rao	..	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Ganpat Rao Goklo	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Balaji Bhicaji Pinge	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Khasinath Kosheo Thakur	...	...	...	1	...	..	...	...	...	...	...
Madho Rao Jagannath	...	...	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...
Trimbak Rao Sathe	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
A. Barclay	1	...	...		...	...	...	...	.	...	...
Doorga Pershad	...	...	...	..	...	1	...	...	...	...	...
Trimbak Rao Nilkant	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Officiating Extra Assistant Commissioners.											
Raghunath Rao	...	..	...	1	..	...	...	...	...	...	...
Hari Lakshman	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Harish Chandra Bose	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	..	...	...	1
Tahsildars.											
Mahfuzal Bari	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Abdul Subhan	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Amrit Rao Mahiput	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Ajudhia Prasad	...	...	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...
Banwari Lal	...	...	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...
Irshad Ali	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Yadho Rao Sakharam	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Shivraj Singh	...	...	..	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...
Ram Charan Lal	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Mahomad Hussain	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Wasyath Ali	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	..
Sakharam Mahiput	...	...	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...
Dori Lal	...	...	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...
Abdul Rahim	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Ganpat Rao Dain	.	...	...	...	..	...	...	1	...	...	...
Ram Rao Rajeshwar	...	...	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...
Kishu Kumar	...	...	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...
Vishwanath Rao	..	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Ram Chand	...	...	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...
Gopinath Guru	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Ram Chander Sheoram	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Mahomed Ahmad	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	..	...	...	...
Zahurul Hussain	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Moulvi Mahomad Hussain	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Ganesh Vishnu	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Bhatuk Bharti	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	1	...	...	...
Bhugwant Rai	...	...	..	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	..
Balmukund Purohit	...	...	.	1	...	...	...	...	..	...	...

Class of appointment.	Europeans or Eurasians domiciled in India.	Europeans or Eurasians not domiciled in India at the time of appointment.	Mahomedans.	Hindu. Brahmins including Shenvis.	Hindu. Kshatriyas.	Hindu. Kayasthas (Parbhus).	Hindu. Bunyas or Vysias.	Hindu. Shudras.	Hindu. Others.	Sikhs.	Others.
TAHSILDARS—*contd.*	**SUBORDINATE JUDICIAL SERVICE—*contd.***										
Wasudeo Narain	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Narhar Govind	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	..
Anand Rao	...	...	...	...	...	1		...	...	...	..
Kishen Pershad	...	...	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	..
Ras Behari Lal	...	...	...	...	...	1	..	...	...	...	...
Alam Chand	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Zulfikar Ali	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Damodhar Pant	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Monshwar Atmaram	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Sher Mahomad Khan	...	...	1	...	..	...	...	...	...	..	...
Hussan Khan	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Pundit Durga Shanker	...	...	..	1	...	...	...	...	..	...	...
Mohan Lal	...	...	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...
Moula Bux	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Jairam Gunesh	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Dhondiraj Janardhan	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Jagmohan Sinha Thakur	...	..	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...
Gajraj Singh	...	..	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...
Syed Ibrar Hussain	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Kashi Pershad	...	...	..	..	...	1	...	...	...	...	...
Mahomad Ashraf Khan	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	..	...
Ganpat Rao Narain	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
OFFICIATING TAHSILDARS.											
Deo Shankar	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Ahmedulla	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
T. Goondiah	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Baikanth Misser	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	..
Ganput Rao	...	..	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Kutabuddin	..	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Byjnath Sahai	...	...	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...
Rang Rao Venktesh	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Mohamoodul Hussain	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Ganpat Rao Malhar	...	...	...	1	...	...		...	...	...	...
MUNSIFS.											
Abaji Wasudeo	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Raghunath Gajanand	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Balkrishan Narain	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Krishnaji Anant	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Mahomad Amin	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Mahomad Habibullah	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Gopal Rao Deo Dongre	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Narayen Rao Deo	...	...	...	1	..	...	...	...	...	...	...
Narayen Subhaji	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Ram Chandra Sakharam	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Mookoond Rao	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Jaikrishna Babajee	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Binda Pershad	...	...	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...
OFFICIATING MUNSIFS.											
Bapu Rao	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Damodhar Misra	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Hanuman Pershad	...	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
Banaji Anant	..	...	...	1	...	...	...	...	...	...	...

A. C. DUFF,
Under-Secretary.

Vol. III.
Sec. I.
Sub-Sec. B.
C. P.

Information regarding the Central Provinces.

No. 1045-26, dated Nagpur, the 5th of March 1887.

From—A. C. Duff, Esq., C.S., Under-Secretary to the Chief Commissioner, Central Provinces,

To—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission.

I am directed to forward in continuation of my letter No. 580-26, dated 4th ultimo, a statement giving the information which was promised in the last clause of that letter.

Extra Assistant Commissioners.

5th Grade, 3.

	Province.
One from	Wales.
" "	Bengal.
" "	Bombay Presidency.

4th Grade, 7.

Two from	Central Provinces.
" "	Bengal.
" "	North-Western Provinces.
One "	Bombay Presidency.

3rd Grade, 12.

Five from	Bombay Presidency.
Three "	Central Provinces.
Two "	North-Western Provinces.
One "	Madras Presidency.
" "	Berar.

2nd Grade, 8.

Four from	Bombay Presidency.
Three "	Central Provinces.
One "	Madras Presidency.

1st Grade, 6 and 9 Officiating.

Nine from	Central Provinces.
Three "	North-Western Provinces.
Two "	Bombay Presidency.
One "	Bengal.

Tahsildars.

1st Grade, 7.

Four from	North-Western Provinces.
Two "	Central Provinces.
One "	Behar (Bengal).

Tahsildars—*contd.*

2nd Grade, 11.

	Province.
Seven from	Central Provinces.
Two "	North-Western Provinces.
One "	Oudh.
" "	Rajputana.

3rd Grade, 15.

Nine from	Central Provinces.
Two "	North-Western Provinces.
" "	Oudh.
One "	Bombay Presidency.
" "	Punjab.

4th Grade, 17 and 9 Officiating.

Fourteen from	Central Provinces.
Six "	North-Western Provinces.
Two "	Bengal.
One "	Punjab.
" "	Berar.
" "	Oudh.
" "	Madras.

Additional Tahsildars.

Eleven from	Central Provinces.
Two "	Oudh.
" "	Bombay Presidency.
One "	North-Western Provinces.

Abstract.

Seven from	Bengal.
Sixteen "	Bombay.
Sixty "	Central Provinces.
Twenty-two "	North-Western Provinces.
Three "	Madras.
Two "	Berar.
Six "	Oudh.
One "	Rajputana.
Two "	Punjab.
One "	England (Wales).

VIII.

No. 131, dated Calcutta, the 7th of March 1887.

From—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission,

To—The Secretary to the Chief Commissioner, Central Provinces.

I am desired to request that, with the permission of the Chief Commissioner, you will be good enough to furnish the Public Service Commission with information showing the extent to which encouragement is offered to Natives of the Central Provinces by means of Government scholarships or otherwise to proceed to England for the purpose of completing their education. The Commission are aware of the fact that certain scholarships have been recently established for this purpose by the Government of India, but the present enquiry is made with a view to ascertain (1) whether any similar encouragement is offered by Local Governments and Administrations, and, if so, subject to what rules and conditions; and (2) to what extent advantage is taken of the same.

2. It would be convenient if you would be good enough at the same time to supply such information as may be available regarding scholarships, if any, which may have been established with a similar object in the Central Provinces, but the cost of which is not borne by the State.

No. 1662—86, dated Nagpur, the 31st of March 1887.

From—A. C. DUFF, Esq., C.S., Under-Secretary to the Chief Commissioner, Central Provinces,
To—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission, Calcutta.

Information regarding the Central Provinces.

I am directed to acknowledge the receipt of your letter No. 131 of the 7th instant, calling for information shewing (1) the extent to which encouragement is offered to Natives of these Provinces by means of Government scholarships or otherwise to proceed to England for the purpose of completing their education, and (2) the scholarships, if any, which may have been established with a similar object in the Central Provinces, but the cost of which is not borne by the State. In reply, I am to forward herewith copy of a letter No. 2990, dated the 24th instant, from the Inspector General of Education on the subject.

2. I am to add that Mr. Adhar Singh Gour, referred to in paragraph 3 of the Inspector General's letter, is an Extra Assistant Commissioner, who was 38 years of age when he proceeded to England to enter at the University of Cambridge and be called to the Bar. He was called and also graduated B. A. and LL. B., Cantab, and then returned to his appointment in the Central Provinces as Extra Assistant Commissioner.

No. 2990, dated 24th March 1887.

From—The Inspector General of Education, Central Provinces,
To—The Secretary to the Chief Commissioner, Central Provinces.

In reply to your endorsement No. 1378—73 of 22nd March 1887, I have the honour to say that no scholarships are offered by the Local Administration to encourage Natives of these Provinces to proceed to England for the purpose of completing their education.

2. No such scholarships have been yet provided by private liberality.

3. Though we have no scholarships for the object mentioned, yet Natives of these Provinces do proceed to England to study. There are two of our students entered at Downing College, Cambridge. They are supported by their father, Mr. Narain Swamy, pleader, and so far as I can judge from the private accounts I have received, they are doing well. Very recently Mr. Adhar Singh Gour proceeded to England at his own cost, graduated, was called to the "bar," and has returned to these Provinces. If any student of good education and more than ordinary capacity desired to proceed to England to complete his studies, I do not think assistance would be wanting. Very recently, simply on the appeal of an undergraduate of respectable family from Bengal, Mr. Munna Lal Chowdry, Rai Bahadur, of Mandla, gave Rs. 5,000 to enable him to proceed to England to study for the Civil Service, and he is now pursuing his studies at Mr. Wren's, I believe, in London.

IX.

No. 133, dated Calcutta, the 10th March 1887.

From—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission,
To—The Secretary to the Chief Commissioner of the Central Provinces.

To what extent could the prescribed Covenanted Civil Service cadre in your Province be reduced if a corresponding increase were made in the English element of the Uncovenanted Service or in the Native element, or partly in one and partly in the other?

I am directed by the Public Service Commission to request that, in the replies of the Chief Commissioner to the questions forwarded with my letter No. 19, dated 30th November 1886, particular care may be taken to embody a full and detailed answer to question No. 232 quoted in the margin. This question has a very important bearing upon the enquiries of the Commission, and I am to forward a copy of the reply thereto furnished by the Punjab Government as showing generally the nature of the particulars which the Commission desire to procure. I am at the same time to request that the answer to the question may be framed on the assumption that appointments will no longer be made to the Covenanted grades under the Statutory Rules or in any other way except through the channel of the competition in England, save in very exceptional cases, and that the present system, whereby a proportion of appointments in the Covenanted Service is practically reserved for Natives of India by the rules issued under the Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, is discontinued.

Note.—The reply to this letter is given in Mr. Mackenzie's *Minute*,—see page 10 *ante*.

PROCEEDINGS

OF

THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

VOLUME III.—PROCEEDINGS RELATING TO THE CENTRAL PROVINCES (INCLUING THE HYDERABAD ASSIGNED DISTRICTS).

SECTION I, SUB-SECTION C.—INFORMATION SUPPLIED BY THE RESIDENT AT HYDERABAD.

I.

MEMORANDUM ON THE SPECIAL FEATURES OF THE HYDERABAD ASSIGNED DISTRICTS BEARING ON THEIR ADMINISTRATION.

Special features of the Hyderabad Assigned Districts (Berars).

1. THE administration of the province known as the Hyderadad Assigned Districts or Berar was made over to the British Government under the provisions of the treaty with His Highness the Nizam of 1853; the tenure of the province depends only on the dissolution of this agreement by the consent of both parties. The first charge upon the revenues is the payment of the Hyderabad Contingent and the cost of the civil administration inclusive of public works. After these charges have been met, the surplus, whatever it may be, is made over to the Hyderabad State, but no accounts are rendered or called for.

2. The Hyderabad Assigned Districts, in their present form, are composed entirely of the valley of Berar, which extends from the confines of the Central Provinces on the east to those of the Bombay Presidency on the west, with the Satpura range of mountains as its northern, and the Ajanta range and the Paeen Ganga river as its southern boundaries.

3. The province embraces an area of 17,711 square miles, of which 4,575 square miles consist of hill country and unculturable waste; 11,541 square miles of the area are under cultivation, and only 1,595 square miles of culturable land remain to be utilised. Thus the province is purely an agricultural one with 68 per cent. of its population belonging to the agricultural class. Cotton and great millet (jowari) are its staple produce. Its commerce and its chief industry are mainly concerned with, or dependent on, the products of the soil.

4. The population of the province, according to the last census, was 2,672,673. Of these, 2,425,654 are Hindus, 187,555 Mussulmans, 37,338 aborigines, and 20,020 Jains. The numbers of Sikhs, Christians, and others are numerically unimportant.

5. The language of five-sixths of the population is Marathi, and of about one-eighth Hindustani. The remainder speak the aboriginal languages—Gondi and Kurku.

6. The largest towns in the province are Amraoti, Akola, Akot, and Ellichpur; these contain respectively 23,550, 16,614, 16,137, and 26,728 inhabitants. Other towns which contain more than 10,000 inhabitants are Karinja, Khamgaon, Balapur, Shegaon, Jalgaon, and Basim. Nearly all of them are head-quarters stations of the districts and talukas in which they are situated. Of towns with over 5,000 of population but less than 10,000 there are 24; of over 3,000 but less than 5,000—53; of over 2,000 but less than 3,000—72; and of over 1,000 but less than 2,000 there are 356. The remainder are villages of less than 1,000 inhabitants.

7. For administrative purposes, the province is under the control of the Resident at Hyderabad, who acts in the capacity of a Chief Commissioner, having under him one Revenue and Fiscal Commissioner and one Judicial Commissioner, who conduct the administration of the province and have their head-quarters at Amraoti. The province is divided into six districts, each under the control of a Deputy Commissioner, who is assisted by Assistant and Extra Assistant Commissioners according to the requirements of his district. The districts again are sub-divided into twenty-two tahsils or taluks, which are revenue and judicial sub-divisions. The Revenue Commissioner is the head of the local administration in the province, subject to the control of the Resident. The Judicial Commissioner exercises the powers of Civil and Sessions Judge, and superintends administratively the working of the courts of justice in all their departments subject to the orders and instructions of the Resi-

Special features of the Hyderabad Assigned Districts.

dent, whose court is the High Court for the province. The Judicial Commissioner in addition exercises general supervision over the Jail Department.

8. The sanctioned staff for conducting the district administration consists of six Deputy Commissioners, 11 Assistant Commissioners, and 17 Extra Assistant Commissioners, who exercise usually civil, magisterial, and revenue powers on the system in vogue in what are termed non-regulation provinces. There are also 3 Attachés from the staff of the Resident at Hyderabad to strengthen the staff of Assistant Commissioners. Assistance is moreover rendered by Special or Honorary Magistrates, of whom there are in all 19. Separate departments, such as the Police, Educational, Sanitary, Medical, Jail, Registration, Vaccination, and Forest Departments, are managed and supervised by special officers. At the head of each revenue sub-division or taluk is a Tahsildar, who is assisted by a Naib and other assistants called Karkuns. The last link in the chain of administrative organisation consists of the village officials, who are the patel (the organized head), and the patwari or accountant, both of which offices are usually hereditary.

9. The civil divisions of the province and the taluks comprised in each are shown below, together with their respective area, population, and revenue :—

Districts.	Taluks.	No. of villages inhabited.	Area in square miles.	Population.	Land revenue.*
					Rs.
Amraoti	Amraoti	248	672	163,456	4,64,971
	Chandur	298	855	171,611	3,77,949
	Morsi	212	622	129,688	4,20,730
	Murtazapur	257	610	110,573	3,12,080
Akola	Akola	285	739	139,421	4,48,219
	Akot	221	518	144,253	5,06,390
	Balapur	168	570	107,200	2,81,819
	Jalgaon	165	392	105,739	3,15,821
	Khamgaon	131	441	96,179	2,34,005
Ellichpur	Ellichpur	213	469	148,041	4,03,598
	Daryapur	207	505	123,109	4,80,941
	Melghat	313	1,649	42,655	34,968
Buldana	Chikhli	273	1,009	140,011	2,87,478
	Mehkar	299	790	168,508	2,65,294
	Malkapur	315	1,005	131,244	4,06,210
Wun	Wun	276	909	107,846	97,237
	Yeotmal	323	1,062	132,788	1,47,540
	Darwha	275	1,079	78,814	2,00,498
	Kelapur	265	857	72,654	81,923
Basim	Basim	322	1,051	157,690	2,92,371
	Pusad	208	634	76,142	1,82,631
	Mangrul	311	1,273	125,051	1,23,055

* The figures in this column represent the revenue of 1881-82.

10. The duties of the Revenue and Fiscal Commissioner, properly known as *the Commissioner*, are much the same as those exercised by similar officers in other non-regulation provinces of British India. He is the appellate court in respect of revenue suits, and appeals against his orders in such suits only lie to the Resident. Other matters which claim his attention, although the final authority for their disposal is vested in the Resident, are the same as in the Punjab and other provinces. The Commissioner, as elsewhere, exercises a general control over the several districts in the province and the different officers connected with the administration of them. He is the channel of communication between the Resident and all heads of departments (except the Judicial Commissioner), who are more or less under his orders. He has no political work to perform as is the case with Commissioners of Divisions in the Punjab and other provinces, as there are no Native States under his control.

11. Except that the circle of his duties is much more limited, the work of the Deputy Commissioner may be said to resemble that of the Commissioner in nearly all respects. He has the same revenue work to attend to; he exercises the same supervision over his subordinate officers, and the same subjects claim his attention. Side by side, however, with his district work he has judicial functions to exercise, and these bring him, so far as they alone are concerned, under the control of the Judicial Commissioner. He is usually a Justice of the Peace as well as a District Judge and Magistrate, exercising enhanced powers under Section 30 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, and has power to try and determine suits of every description and of any amount, and hear appeals from the original decisions in suits and from the orders of the Courts of the Tahsildars and Assistant Commissioners (except that of an Assistant Commissioner of the 1st Class) under his orders.

Special features of the Hyderabad Assigned Districts.

It has been, however, deemed advisable to relieve him of some of his judicial work and distribute it between two officers whom it is proposed to specially appoint to Berar for the purpose, under the title of Judicial Assistant Commissioners.

12. The Assistant and Extra Assistant Commissioners exercise revenue, civil, and magisterial powers according to the grade and class to which they belong, and are in charge of a sub-division consisting of two, or in large districts three, taluks for which, so far as the administration is concerned, they are primarily responsible. Where there is a treasury, the Extra Assistant Commissioner is placed in charge of it. This is the general rule; the exception is only when there is no Extra Assistant Commissioner available, in which case the charge of the treasury is held by an Assistant Commissioner.

13. The military strength of the garrisons in Berar is insignificant. The cantonment of Ellichpur, which is the only one in the province, contains a troop of cavalry furnished by the Hyderabad Contingent, a battery of artillery from the same force, as well as a regiment of infantry, which sends out a company for the garrison at Amraoti to furnish jail guards. There is also a company of infantry of the Hyderabad Contingent stationed at Akola for the purpose of guarding the Central Jail at that place. This company is furnished by a regiment at Hingoli, outside of Berar.

14. As stated before, the revenues of Berar maintain a local force, now called the Hyderabad Contingent, comprising six regiments of infantry, four of cavalry, and four batteries of artillery. This force has several times been employed by the Government of India, and two regiments are at present in Burma co-operating with the Imperial troops. The force is directly under the orders of the Resident at Hyderabad. The province of Berar is administered by the Resident at Hyderabad on behalf of the Nizam's Government, and the surplus revenue is annually transferred to that Government. Last year this surplus reached the large amount of Rs. 19,42,500. The agency for carrying on the administration of the Province among the upper grades is European with a sprinkling of the Native element. The highest appointment, *i.e.*, the Commissionership, is invariably held by a member of the Covenanted Civil Service. The Judicial Commissioner and five of the Deputy Commissioners are military officers of the Indian Staff Corps, and the remaining Deputy Commissioner is an Uncovenanted European officer. Seven out of the eleven Assistant Commissioners are either Military Staff Corps or Uncovenanted European officers, one is an Eurasian, and the remaining three are Natives.

The Attachés to the Resident and the Extra Assistant Commissioners are either pure Asiatics or Natives of India in the statutory sense.

15. This memorandum may be appropriately concluded by the mention of some of the improvements that have been effected since the province passed under British management. The land revenue in the year 1860-61 amounted to Rs. 29,61,722; in 1885-86 it was Rs. 64,19,350. Thet otal revenue in the former year, excluding local cesses, was Rs. 34,12,027; last year it amounted to Rs. 95,27,200. The area of land under cultivation rose from 2,871,444 acres in 1860-61 to 7,429,429 acres in 1885-86. When the province passed under British management, no made roads existed in the districts; there are now 1,500 miles of excellent roads and 197½ miles of railway. The development of the trade of the Assigned Districts has been equally satisfactory. There are no statistics for the earlier years of our administration, doubtless because the trade of the Province was too insignificant to mention, but the returns for the year 1885-86 give the following figures:—*Imports*, over 20,00,000 maunds, valued at nearly a crore of rupees. *Exports*, over 40,00,000 maunds, valued at nearly three crores of rupees. Of the above, the principal articles imported were—

	Mds.	Rs.
Coal	3,79,312	1,18,535
Grains	4,80,787	14,39.443
Salt	3,87,873	13,57,555
Railway plant, &c.	1,53,994	6,15,976
Metals	1,01,330	8,13,580

The value of spices and sugar imported amounted to Rs. 16,04,820 and Rs. 10,53,377, respectively.

The principal items of export were—

	Mds.	Rs.
Cotton	12,78,108	2,04,49,728
Grains	13,20,721	22,97,725
Oil-seeds	13,95,337	43,48,526

Not less gratifying is the progress made in education. When the Berar Educational Department was established in 1866, there were but 35 boys' schools and 1,881 pupils. At the close of the year 1885-86 the province contained 917 boys' schools with 39,981 boys, and 34 girls' schools with 1,037 girls.

16. The Berar Commission has also been made use of by the late Sir Salar Jung and the present Minister as a school for the political education of young men of good family intended for service in their own territory, but with one or two notable exceptions, it cannot be said that the youths so chosen have been sufficiently industrious to profit much by the experiment.

II.

No. 3, dated the 16th of November 1886.

From—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission,

To—The Secretary to the Resident at Hyderabad (for Berars).

WITH reference to the Resolution of the Government of India in the Home Department, No. 34—1573-83, dated 4th October 1886, on the subject of the appointment of a Commission for the purpose of enquiring into the question of the employment of Natives of India in the Public Service, I am directed to request that, with the permission of the Resident you will be good enough to favour the Commission with full details showing the number of "charges" or offices in which Covenanted and Uncovenanted Officers engaged in the Executive and Judicial administration of the country are at present employed, together with complete information as to the apportionment of these "charges" or offices amongst members of the Covenanted and Uncovenanted Services respectively in the Hyderabad Assigned Districts.

2. Columns 2—14, inclusive, of the statement embodied in paragraph 7 of the Resolution of the Government of India in the Home Department, No. 68—2024-35, dated 15th December 1881, show the nature of the statistics required, and I am to request that the return now asked for may be rendered as complete as possible so as accurately to represent existing facts. I am at the same time to enclose detailed lists of appointments upon which the figures given in the Resolution of 15th December 1881 in regard to the Hyderabad Assigned Districts were based, and to request that corresponding details may be furnished of the figures entered under each column of the present return.

3. The Commission would also be glad to be furnished with figures showing the existing cadre of the Covenanted Civil Service in the Hyderabad Assigned Districts together with information regarding the proportion to the total strength of that service of (1) effectives, (2) officers on leave and other non-effectives, and (3) officers in training, respectively.

No. 3325 R., dated Hyderabad Residency, the 27th December 1886.

From—A. H. T. MARTINDALE, Esq., C. S., Secretary for Berar to the Resident, Hyderabad,

To—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission.

I am directed to ackowledge the receipt of your letter No. 3, dated 16th November 1886, and in reply to enclose a statement giving the information asked for in the second paragraph regarding the charges or offices held by Covenanted and Uncovenanted Officers respectively, who are engaged in the Administration of the Hyderabad Assigned Districts.

2. With regard to the third paragraph of your letter I am to say that the only appointments at present held by members of the Covenanted Civil Service in the Hyderabad Assigned Districts are those of the Resident at Hyderabad, the Commissioner at Amraoti and the Secretary to the Resident for Berar.

Statement giving particulars of appointments in the Hyderabad Assigned Districts (enclosure to letter from Secretary for Berar, to the Secretary to Public Service Commission dated 24th December 1886).

Number of charges or offices in each class.	Official designation of the charges or offices.	Number of charges held by Covenanted officers, including Military officers in Civil employ.	Number of charges held by Uncovenanted officers.	Nature of charge or office.	REMARKS.
1	2	3	4	5	6
1	Resident at Hyderabad*	1*	...	Head of the Berar Administration and High Court of the Hyderabad Assigned Districts.	* The appointments of Resident, 1st Assistant Resident, and Commissioner of Berar are the only appointments now held by Covenanted Civil Servants. The remaining appointments in column 3 are all held by Military officers in Civil employ.
1	First Assistant and Secretary* for Berar to the Resident.	1*	...	Secretary for Berar to Resident.	
1	Second Assistant and Assistant Secretary for Berar to the Resident.	1	...	Assistant Secretary for Berar.	
1	Commissioner, Hyderabad Assigned Districts*	1*	...	Commissioner of Berar.	

Statement giving particulars of appointments in the H. A. Districts, &c.—contd.

Number of charges or offices in each class.	Official designation of the charges or offices.	Number of charges held by Covenanted officers, including Military officers in Civil employ.	Number of charges held by Uncovenanted officers.	Nature of charge or office.	REMARKS.
1	2	3	4	5	6
1	Judicial Commissioner, Hyderabad Assigned Districts.	1	...	Judicial Commissioner.	
6	Deputy Commissioners.	5	1	Executive and Judicial combined.	
11	Assistant Commissioners	3	8(*a*)	Both Executive and Judicial.	(*a*) One of these officers, though borne on the Provincial Lists, is employed outside the Province, *i.e.*, as Assistant Cantonment Magistrate, Secunderabad.
1	Assistant Commissioner, Supernumerary.	1	...	Both Executive and Judicial.	
4	Attachés to the Resident	...	4(*b*)	Intended to supply vacancies in the grade of Assistant Commissioner.	(*b*) Two only of these have been given Judicial powers. The other two have recently joined and have been placed under selected officers to learn work.
16	Extra Assistant Commissioners.	...	15(*c*) 1(*d*)	.....	(*c*) One of these officers is a purely Judicial officer. The duties of the rest are according to the exigencies of the public service partly Executive and partly Judicial. (*d*) One of these appointments is vacant at present. It will be filled by an Uncovenanted officer.
22	Tahsildars . . .	...	22	Executive and Judicial.	
1	Conservator of Forests .	1	...		
7	Deputy Assistant and Sub-Assistant Conservators.	...	7(*e*)	.....	(*e*) Six of these officers are District Forest officers. One of the six has also been appointed an Assistant to a Deputy Commissioner in the Revenue Department. The seventh officer is an Assistant to a District Forest officer.
1	Inspector General of Police, Jails, Registration and Stamps.	1	...	.....	
6	District Superintendents of Police.	1	5	.....	
	Assistant District Superintendents of Police.	...	3(*f*)	.....	(*f*) One of these officers, though borne on the Provincial List, is employed outside the Province, *i.e.*, as Assistant Superintendent of Police, Secunderabad.
83	TOTAL	16*	67		

* Please see note at top of column 6.

A. MARTINDALE,

Secretary for Berar to the Resident.

III.

No. 4, dated Lahore, the 16th of November 1886.

From—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission,

To—The Secretary to the Resident at Hyderabad for Berars.

I AM directed to request that, with the permission of the Resident, the Public Service Commission may be favoured with a list of the names of selected officers serving in the Hyderabad Assigned Districts and belonging to (*a*) the Covenanted Civil Service, (*b*) the Statutory Service, and (*c*) the Uncovenanted Service, whose opinions the Resident may consider it desirable for the Commission to invite on the subject-matter of the enquiries with which it has been entrusted, as set forth in the Resolution of the Government of India in the Home Department, No. 34—1573-80, dated 4th October 1886. I am also to request that the Commission may be favoured with a list of (1) any local Associations or Societies, (2) the Editors of the leading newspapers, both English and Vernacular, pub-

lished in the Hyderabad Assigned Districts who should, in the opinion of the Resident, be consulted by the Commission. The Commission would further be glad if the Resident would be good enough to suggest the names of any members of the general public, not being in Government service, who might with advantage be consulted on the subject-matter of the enquiries in question.

2. It is hoped that the Resident will be good enough to let it be generally known throughout Hyderabad that the Public Service Commission will be glad to receive the opinions of any Association or Society or of any gentlemen, whether or not in the service of Government, who may wish to lay their views before the Commission.

IV.

Demi-official, dated the 1st December 1886.

From—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission,

To—The Secretary (for Berar) to the Resident at Hyderabad.

I AM desired to forward herewith two copies of five sets of questions which are being circulated to Local Governments and Administrations in connection with the enquiries of the Public Service Commission, and to say that the Commission leave it to the Resident to determine whether it is desirable to take the opinion of any officers, Associations, Editors or members of the general public in the Hyderabad Assigned Districts, and, if so, to utilize the questions accordingly. I am to add that, if the Resident considers that there are any officers or persons in the Hyderabad Assigned Districts who ought to give evidence before the Commission, such officers or persons might conveniently be in attendance at Madras to await the arrival of the Commission at that place. If the Resident should consider it desirable for the Commission to examine any witnesses from the Berars, and if you will kindly let me know who they will be, I will in due course intimate to you the precise date of the arrival of the Commission at Madras.

I need scarcely add that the Commission would be glad to be favoured with the views of the Resident on the set of questions addressed to Local Governments and Administrations, if Mr. Cordery should see fit to record his opinion thereon. If an opinion is sent, would you kindly see that the serial number of each question is correctly entered opposite the reply thereto.

V.

No. 360 R., dated Hyderabad Residency, the 12th February 1887.

From—A. H. T. MARTINDALE, Esq., C.S., Secretary for Berar to the Resident at Hyderabad,

To—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission, Madras.

I am directed to acknowledge the receipt of your letter No. 110 of the 2nd instant requesting to be supplied with a copy of the notice issued by the Resident of Hyderabad inviting persons who wished to tender their evidence on the subject of the enquiries of the Public Service Commission at Jubbulpur on the 11th January last, to submit their names on or before the 7th idem, together with a brief note of the points on which they proposed to speak.

2. In reply, I am to state that your telegram regarding the notice in question reached this office on the 30th December, but the public notice referred to in it was only received from the Central Provinces Government on the 4th of January, which was too late to allow of its publication in the Berar newspapers.

3. Measures had, however, been adopted to publish the desire of the Commission to receive evidence from all classes, and the Commissioner of Berar submitted to the Resident the list noted in the margin of gentlemen who he thought might with advantage be examined at Jubbulpur. He also reported that the Editors of the Vernacular papers in the province had been requested to announce in their journals the readiness of the Commission to receive the opinions of any Association or Society, or of any gentleman, official or non-official, who might wish to give evidence before the Commission.

COVENANTED CIVIL SERVICE.

Mr. Leslie S. Saunders, Comissioner, Hyderabad Assigned Districts.

UNCOVENANTED CIVIL SERVICE.

Mr. H. B. Knowleys, Deputy Commissioner, Bassim.
" R. D. Hare, Assistant Commissioner, Khamgaon.
" Maulvi Mahomed Nizam-ud-din Hussain Khan, Assistant Commissioner, Amraoti.
" Poorshotam Narayan, Extra Assistant Commissioner, Amraoti.
" Shriram Bhikaji Jatar, Director, Public Instruction, Akola.

EDITORS OF NEWSPAPERS.

Mr. Venkatesh Ramchandra, Editor, *Vaidharba*, Akola.
" Chintamon Ramchandra, Editor, *Pramodh Sindhu*, Amraoti.
" Balwant Rao Soman, Editor, *Berar Samachar*, Akola.

MEMBERS OF GENERAL PUBLIC.

Mr. R. W. Mudholkar, Pleader, Amraoti.
" P. U. Jag, Pleader, Amraoti.
" Deorao Vennik, Pleader, and *Vice*-President, Akola Municipality, Akola.

4. The Resident allowed all the gentlemen mentioned in the Commissioner's list, with one exception, to go to Jubbulpur to give evidence, and at the same time he was in communication with His Highness the Nizam's Government regarding the members of the Hyderabad Service who might also wish to express their opinion upon the matters under consideration.

5. It will thus be seen that the fact that the Commissioner was prepared to receive evidence was generally made known, and advantage has been widely taken of the invitation.

6. In conclusion, I am to enclose copy of the notice* published in the Hyderabad Residency Orders, and extracts from *Vaidharba* or the *Berari* of the 25th December 1886 and from the *Berar Samachar* of the 27th idem, notifying the desire of the Commission to receive opinions from Berar.

* This will be found at page 7, Part 2 of the Hyderabad Residency Orders herewith sent.

NOTICE.

Extract from the *Vaidharba* or the Berari, Akola (*Berar*), Saturday, the 25th December 1886.

We have been requested by the Commissioner's Office to inform the public that the Public Service Commission will be glad to receive the opinions of any Association or Society or of any gentlemen, whether or not in the service of Government, who may wish to lay their views before the Commission.

Memorandum.

A similar notice in vernacular was published in the *Berar Samachar*, Akola, dated 27th December 1886.

VI.

No. 89, dated Allahabad, the 5th January 1887.

From—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission,

To—The Secretary to the Resident at Hyderabad (for Berars).

I AM directed to request that, with the permission of the Resident, you will be good enough to favour the Public Service Commission with accurate statistics showing how many persons at present employed in the Subordinate Judicial Service and in the Subordinate Executive Service in the Hyderâbad Assigned Districts have (1) passed the Entrance examination, (2) passed the First Arts or other corresponding examination, and (3) taken the degree of Bachelor or Master of Arts at an Indian University.

2. I am to explain that the information is required for each class of appointments separately, and that the terms "Subordinate Judicial Service" and "Subordinate Executive Service" are intended to embrace respectively all Subordinate Executive and Judicial offices down to and including the office of Munsif or Tahsildar, or other offices corresponding to that of Munsif or Tahsildar which are not reserved for, or not ordinarily held by members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

3. The favour of an early reply is requested.

No. 614 R., dated Hyderabad Residency, the 14th March 1887.

From—A. H. T. MARTINDALE, Esq., C.S., Secretary for Berar to the Resident, Hyderabad,

To—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission.

I am directed to acknowledge the receipt of your letter No. 89, dated 5th January 1887, and, in reply, to forward a statement showing the number of persons at present employed in the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Services in the Hyderabad Assigned Districts who have passed the examinations specified in the 1st paragraph of your letter under acknowledgment.

Statement showing the number of officers at present employed in the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Services of the Hyderabad Assigned Districts who have passed the examinations specified in paragraph 1 of letter No. 89, dated 5th January 1887, from the Secretary, Public Service Commission, to the Secretary for Berar to the Resident, Hyderabad.

Class of Appointment.	Number of Officials who have			
	passed the Entrance examination.	passed the First Arts or other corresponding examination.	taken the degree of Bachelor of Arts at an Indian University.	taken the degree of Master of Arts at an Indian University.
I. Extra Assistant Commissioners . . .	7	1	1	*Nil*
II. Tahsildars	1	*Nil*	*Nil*	*Nil*

A. MARTINDALE,
Secretary for Berar to the Resident.

VII.

No. 102, dated Bombay, the 22nd January 1887.

From—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission,
To—The Secretary to the Resident (for Berars), Hyderabad.

I AM directed to request that, with the permission of the Resident, you will be good enough to favour the Public Service Commission with a return in the annexed form showing the nationalities and castes of the several persons at present employed in the Subordinate Judicial Service and in the Subordinate Executive Service in the Hyderabad Assigned Districts.

2. I am to explain that the information is required for each class of appointments separately, and that the terms "Subordinate Judicial Service" and "Subordinate Executive Service" are intended to embrace respectively all Subordinate Executive and Judicial offices down to and including the office of Munsif or Tahsildar, or other offices corresponding to that of Munsif or Tahsildar which are not reserved for, or not ordinarily held by members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

3. The favour of an early reply is requested.

No. 613 R., dated Hyderabad Residency, the 14th March 1887.

From—A. H. T. MARTINDALE, Esq., C.S., Secretary for Berar to the Resident, Hyderabad,
To—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission.

In compliance with the request contained in your letter No. 102, dated 22nd January 1887, I am directed to forward a return prepared in the office of the Commissioner, Hyderabad Assigned Districts, showing the nationalities and castes of the several persons at present employed in the Subordinate Judicial Service and in the Subordinate Executive Service in the Province of Berar.

Statement showing the nationalities and castes of the several persons at present employed in the Subordinate Judicial Service and in the Subordinate Executive Service in the Hyderabad Assigned Districts.

Class of appointments.	Europeans or Eurasians domiciled in India.	Europeans or Eurasians not domiciled in India at the time of appointment.	Mahomedans.	Hindus.						Sikhs.	Others.	Remarks. Province to which the number of persons in each class belongs				
				Brahmans including Shenvis.	Kshatriyas.	Kayasths (Purbhus).	Banyas and Vyias.	Shudras.	Others.			Bombay Presidency.	North-Western Provinces.	Central Provinces.	Hyderabad.	Berar.
Extra Assistant Commissioners	3	...	1	8	...	2	1	...	...	...	2	6	1	...	3	7
Tahsildars	...	...	6	1	...	3	3	1	...	...	1	11	1	1	5	7

Information regarding the Hyderabad Assigned Districts.

VIII.

No 131, dated Calcutta, the 7th March 1887.

From—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission,
To—The Secretary to the Resident, Hyderabad.

I AM desired to request that, with the permission of the Resident, you will be good enough to furnish the Public Service Commission with information showing the extent to which encouragement is offered to Natives of the Hyderabad Assigned Districts by means of Government scholarships or otherwise to proceed to England for the purpose of completing their education. The Commission are aware of the fact that certain scholarships have been recently established for this purpose by the Government of India, but the present enquiry is made with a view to ascertain (1) whether any similar encouragement is offered by Local Governments and Administrations, and, if so, subject to what rules and conditions; and (2) to what extent advantage is taken of the same.

2. It would be convenient if you would be good enough at the same time to supply such information as may be available regarding scholarships, if any, which may have been established with a similar object in the Hyderabad Assigned Districts but the cost of which is not borne by the State.

No. 1455 R, dated Hyderabad Residency, the 6th June 1887.

From—W. H. CORNISH, Esq., Officiating Secretary for Berar to the Resident, Hyderabad,
To—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission.

In reply to your letter No. 131 of the 7th March last, I am directed to say that as far as the Hyderabad Assigned Districts are concerned, there are no Government or private scholarships for the purpose of encouraging Natives of the province to proceed to England to complete their education.

IX.

No. 133, dated Calcutta, the 10th March 1887.

From—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission,
To—The Secretary to the Resident at Hyderabad.

WITH reference to No. 232 * of the set of questions prepared in connection with the enquiries of the Public Service Commission, which have been already communicated to you, I am directed to say that the Commission would be glad to receive a full and detailed reply to this particular question as applicable to the circumstances of the Hyderabad Assigned Districts. The question has a very important bearing upon the enquiries of the Commission, and I am to forward a copy of the reply thereto furnished by the Punjab Government, as showing generally the nature of the particulars which the Commission desire to procure. I am at the same time to request that the answer to the question may be framed on the assumption that appointments will no longer be made to the Covenanted grades under the Statutory Rules, or in any other way except through the channel of the competition in England, save in very exceptional cases, and that the present system, whereby a proportion of appointments in the Covenanted Service is practically reserved for Natives of India by the rules issued under the Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, is discontinued.

* To what extent could the prescribed Covenanted Civil Service cadre in your Province be reduced if a corresponding increase were made in the English element of the Uncovenanted Service, or in the Native element, or partly in one and partly in the other?

No. 713 R., dated Hyderabad Residency, the 23rd March 1887.

From—The Secretary for Berar to the Resident at Hyderabad,
To—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission, Calcutta.

I am directed to acknowledge the receipt of your letter No. 133, dated 10th instant, and in reply to say that as there is no prescribed Covenanted Civil Service cadre in the Hyderabad Assigned Districts, question No. 232 does not apply to the circumstances of that Province.

Govt. of India Central Printing Office.—No. 11 P. S. C.—19-9-87.—525.

CENTRAL PROVINCES, JUBBULPUR.

SITTING OF 11TH JANUARY, 1887.

PRESENT :

(1). The Hon'ble Sir C. U. AITCHISON, K.C.S.I., C.I.E., *President.*

(2). Sir CHARLES TURNER, Kt., C.I.E.

(3). The Hon'ble J. W. QUINTON, C.S.

(4). C. H. T. CROSTHWAITE, Esq., C.S.

(5). H. J. STOKES, Esq., C.S.

(6). Ráo Báhádur KRISHNAJI LUKSHMAN NULKAR.

(7). D. S. WHITE, Esq.

12th January, 1887 (same as on 11th January, 1887), with the addition of Mr. W. H. RYLAND.

13th January, 1887 (same as on 12th January, 1887).

PROCEEDINGS
OF THE
PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

VOLUME III.—PROCEEDINGS RELATING TO THE CENTRAL PROVINCES.

SECTION II.—MINUTES OF EVIDENCE TAKEN IN THE CENTRAL PROVINCES.

SITTINGS AT JUBBULPUR.

WITNESS I.—11th January 1887.

Examination of C. A. R. BROWNING, Esq., M.A., C.I.E., of the Uncovenanted Service, Director of Public Instruction and Inspector-General of Schools, Central Provinces.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

You are Director of Public Instruction in this Province. How long have you held that post?—I have been Inspector of Schools and Director of Public Instruction for twenty-five years. I have been in India thirty-one years.

How long have you been Inspector-General of Education in these Provinces?—Since 1873.

In the course of your duties you have to travel about the country?—I have been all over the Province.

And you mix a great deal with the people?—It is very necessary for Educational officers to mix with the people so as to interest them in schools.

You were a member of the Education Commission, were you not?—Yes.

Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—There is great diversity of opinion. The younger class of educated Hindus would prefer that there should be no Statutory Civil Service: they would have all appointments thrown open to public competition. The older and more experienced men of education with whom I have conversed on the subject think that the Statutory Civil Service should be retained, but that only men, either of education or of proved merit and ability, should be appointed. They think that merit and ability should have been proved in the Government service, or in the exercise of a profession, and that non-professional men—men not in the service of the Government and under 25 years of age—should at least possess a degree of some recognised University before nomination. They would not appoint a young man to the Statutory Civil Service, simply on the ground of his rank, or of his father's services. They think he should be required to prove that he has received a good education and would be quite satisfied with the possession of an Indian University degree, or with the degree of any recognised University given after examination. This view is also held by the class from whom our honorary magistrates are usually chosen. The mass of the people are profoundly indifferent. So long as they are received with courtesy, heard with attention, and protected from the insolence and extortion of subordinates, they are quite satisfied. But some even of the mass of the people would prefer that the higher officials with whom they are brought into contact, should be men whom they know, whose ancestors they knew, and to whose family they have been accustomed to look for help and guidance. The prestige, however, of a Statutory Civilian would, of course, only at first influence the small circle acquainted with his antecedents. This prestige the Statutory Civilian would at once lose if he were found deficient in industry or probity. Mahomedans that I have conversed with, members of the Uncovenanted Service generally, and most professional men desire, I think, that the Statutory Civil Service should continue.

What are your own views about this system?—I think it should continue.

Would you make any alterations in the rules?—As the rules have not yet been tried very long I think it would be premature to make any. No dissatisfaction with the rules has been expressed to me personally.

How many Statutory Civilians have we in these Provinces?—Only two. I know one of them intimately, and the other I have seen merely.

NOTE.—The questions have not been consecutive numbers in this volume as the evidence of some of the witnesses has been reported in narrative form.—*Editor.*

Vol. III. Sec. II. C. P.

C. A. R. Browning, Esq.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

Should you say that in point of education they were up to the mark?—One of them is a graduate of the Bombay University. The other is not a graduate of any University.

Is he acquainted with English?—I don't know that.

You are well acquainted with the other you say?—Yes; I see him constantly. I think he is a very excellent man indeed. I had a very high regard for his father, and brother also. They are much respected by the natives I know.

Is he a member of a "good family"?—He is a member of the Chitnavis family. It is a well known Mahratta family and possesses large landed property in Nagpur and Warda.

You say you are not so well acquainted with the other?—Yes, but I know his father very well indeed. He is an old and tried servant of Government.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

In what capacity?—He is now Settlement Officer and a C.I.E.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

Then you would not amend the rules?—No, except that I think, as I have said already, that a degree should be required.

Do you think that the Province has so far advanced in education as to enable us to make a degree a condition of the service?—If it is not, it ought to be, and I believe we are almost sufficiently advanced. At any rate I believe that if we accept a lower standard—for instance the F.A.—it would not carry so much weight with the educated Natives of this Province. Therefore, I do not think it should be less than a degree, and as we only appoint one Statutory Civilian in two years, I hope that in two years' time we shall have more men who take their degree.

Have we any young men of good family studying for a degree now?—I only know of two.

We have graduates in the uncovenanted ranks, have we not?—Oh yes, several.

And some of them belong to very respectable families?—Very respectable, indeed. One of them has just been made Settlement Officer on Rs. 200 a month. He was for eight years in the Educational Department.

Is he a graduate?—Yes.

Then you think we might make a degree a condition of the service?—Yes.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

Have you seen the definition of Natives of India in the Statute 33 Victoria?—I have seen it and read it carefully.

Would you alter it in any way?—Not, I think, for Statutory Civilians.

Are you satisfied with the present mode of selection by nomination?—Yes, speaking only for these Provinces.

If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so?—I do not think that selected candidates for the Statutory Civil Service should be compelled to proceed to England, nor that they should at first be encouraged to proceed to England by any pecuniary reward or allowance. Most of the young Native gentlemen selected for the Statutory Service are married men. They themselves might be anxious to visit England, but the contrary advice of their friends and relatives should be allowed its full weight. I would not hold out special inducements to young men to neglect such advice, lest, in the present state of native society, the influence of our nominees be diminished on their return to this country. Every facility, however, might be afforded to Statutory Civilians, after their two years' probationary service, to visit England. Some facilities are offered by the "National Indian Association" and by the "Northbrook Indian Society and Club," and I think it might be in the power of the Local Administration to grant special leave to those Statutory Civilians, after their confirmation in the service, who desire to visit England, and such special leave might count as service.

By facilities do you mean paying their passage?—No; I would not pay their passage.

Have you known any instances of Natives of this Province going to England for education or otherwise?—I know two such instances well: one was in this Province. One of them was very unfortunate. I mean, that when he returned he was entirely cut off from his family. The other instance was eminently satisfactory, except, perhaps, in his family relations.

Is there, so far as you know, any strong feeling against going, amongst the Hindus of this Province, on the ground of caste or religious prejudice?—I cannot say. I know of none. Two young Hindus have just gone, the sons of a pleader in Nagpur. They are going to be called to the Bar, I think.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

To what caste do they belong?—I know the father intimately. I fancy he is a Brahman, but I am not certain about it. He is a Madrasi, and not, strictly speaking, a man of this Province. He was head clerk in my office in 1864.

Was he born here?—He came from Madras, I think. He has been resident here for the last twenty-five years.

Mr. *White.*

Do you not think that it would be more consistent with the policy of 33 Victoria if men of proved merit and ability were appointed? The Statute does not say that men of proved merit and ability below twenty-five years of age shall be appointed? Nor does the Statute say men whose ability shall be hereafter proved, that is, after appointment?—No.

Well, the Statutory Civilians who have been appointed are to prove their merit and ability after nomination by a two-years' probation?—That is if they are under twenty-five. I know nothing about other Provinces; but I should have imagined that Uncovenanted Officers and professional men, who had proved their ability and merit, were eligible for appointment. But I have understood that one of the objects of the Statutory system was to enable us to enlist on our side the wealthy and influential classes of this country: those classes probably would not be found in the Uncovenanted ranks, and, not being found there, perhaps cadets of those classes, who had received a fair education, might be inclined to enter the Statutory service, and in that way bring over to us the wealthier and older families, who would look favourably on our rule and be exceedingly loyal, and so on.

Can you point to those conditions in the Statute?—Certainly not in the Statute: only in the rules.

You would not object to men of proved merit and ability, not members of those classes, being appointed?—Certainly not.

You are aware of course that, during the probationary period of the Statutory Civilian, the State is put to a good deal of expense?—About Rs. 200 per mensem or less. I don't consider that very much.

But then there is the chance of his turning out a failure?—There is a chance of course in everything; but if the candidate is well selected, not a very likely one.

And then the whole of the money is wasted?—It is very little money, and

Mr. *White*—continued.

I don't consider that it is wasted even in that case. It would, at all events, show the people that we are anxious to employ a better class in our administration.

Mr. *Stokes.*

About how many men graduate here annually?—Some years ago we applied to the Government of India to allow us to open classes for graduates, what we call here "Senior College Classes," that is two years below the B.A. standard. Sanction was refused, and it is only during the last two years that we have had Senior College Classes. So that all our men who have passed the F.A. have always been sent to Canning College, Lucknow; Muir College, Allahabad; and to Bombay to complete their education. Last year five men passed, four from Canning College and one from Bombay.

How many schools in this Province now teach up to the B.A. standard?—We have three regular colleges, two aided and one departmental.

Can you tell us how much each degree of B.A. costs the State?—I have not calculated that. I can easily find out.

Do the Mahomedans of this Province resort freely to the schools?—Yes, they go more freely, in proportion to their numbers, than the Hindus; the reason being generally supposed to be that the majority of the Mahomedans live in towns.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

Can you tell us off-hand what proportion of the population of these Provinces receives high education: I mean education leading to the B.A.?—The proportion is unfortunately small.

I understand you to be adverse to the candidates for this service being required to proceed to England for training. Do you consider that the visit to England has anything to do with the candidate's efficiency or otherwise?—His efficiency might be impaired by it. It might or might not be improved: probably it would be the latter, should pressure be put on him to go; but if the candidate is himself anxious to go and his friends approve of it, I think the visit might be found beneficial. It would of course depend much upon the man himself and the class of people he would associate with in England. Even among our own people at home it is not every young man whose University training is a success.

That of course is only the case of a small minority?—Yes; but in the case of India we should have men

Vol. III, Sec. II. C. P.

C. A. R. Browning, Esq.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*—continued.

going far from their families and country, perhaps, also, without intimate friends in England except those they might make among the undergraduates. I would prefer not to give a decided opinion on this point.

But don't you think that by not sending them to England you are likely to perpetuate the idea that the Statutory Service is an inferior service?—Not if there is a proper educational test, that is, if the man is a graduate as a condition of his nomination, and the nominees compete among themselves: I think, on the contrary, they might form the *élite* of the public service. I don't mean as compared with Europeans or with Natives who have passed in England, but as compared with the better class of the Uncovenanted Service.

My question had reference to a comparison with the English competitive service. We have heard it said that these men look down on the Statutory Service as a lower service. Do you think this feeling is likely to be perpetuated in the absence of this English training?—These Statutory Civilians would be men of rank and wealth. Rank and wealth have, I believe in every country in the world, a certain weight, and men possessed of them and of education, who do well in the service, would, I think, hold, even amongst Civilians, as good a place as if they had been to England, and amongst Natives a very much higher place.

The *President*.

Are the members of your Statutory Service decidedly superior, apart from questions of family, to the graduate members of your Uncovenanted Service?—As regards education they are much the same.

At what age do men, as a rule, graduate here?—I have had a list made out for the last three years. Taking one college as a standard, the average age for the F.A. is nineteen years

The *President*—continued.

and eight months, and for the B A. two years more, that is twenty-one years and eight months.

What classes, as a rule, seek degrees in these Provinces?—Of the men of this particular college, during the last three years, the majority were Brahmans. Out of 34 who passed the F.A. 20 belong to this class.

Mr. *Nulkar*.

One reason you give for the fact that Mahomedans in this Province resort more freely than Hindus to schools and colleges, is that they live in the towns, but so do the Hindus?—I only mean in proportion to their numbers. We have very few Mahomedans in these Provinces. Of course in every large town we have several schools, and it is easier for those who live in towns than for those who live in the villages, where there is only one school among a group of villages, to resort to them. There is no other reason for it that I am aware of.

I ask you, because in other provinces the complaint is that the Mahomedans are backward in education?—When I was in Oudh, and had to write a report on Mahomedan education, we found that there were more Mahomedans in proportion to their numbers, who went to school, than Hindus.

Mr. *Stokes*.

In Calcutta and Bombay Universities the graduates are classed, are they not?—Yes.

When you insist upon a degree, do you insist upon any particular class?—No.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*.

You say that out of the 34 men from one college who had passed the F.A., 20 were Brahmans. Can you give us any information as regards the social status of these men?—I have had a statement* made for the whole of the Central Provinces. In our Departmental

---

* *Memo. for Public Service Commission.*

(1) The number of High School and College students as compared with the population.

(2) The cost of educating a graduate in (1) Departmental Colleges, in (2) Aided Colleges.

A. We have no girls in any High Schools or Colleges. The comparison is therefore between male students and the male population—

College Students 79
High School Students.....386
——465

Male population 5,827,122

1 High School and College student to every 12,531 of the population.

B. Up to April 1885 we had no Senior College classes. We now have such classes in one Departmental and in two Aided Colleges.

The direct cost to Government of educating a student from Matriculation to B.A. is as follows:—

		Departmental.	Aided.
Cost of each student to Government calculated on average number enrolled	1883-84	239	171
	1884-85	314	97
	1885-86	256	103
Estimated charge in	1887-88	256	103
		1,065	474

The above is the direct charge. There is an indirect charge for scholarships. Scholarships given to students who pass the Middle School Examination are given for the encouragement of

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

College last April, there were 39 pupils. The parents of nine of those pupils enjoy incomes of more than Rs. 5,000 a year, the parents of twenty-two incomes of from Rs. 200 to Rs. 5,000 a year, and the parents of seventeen incomes of less than Rs. 200 a year.

What was their occupation for the most part?—Eight were in Government service and nine in private service, and of the rest three had estates, three professions, three were traders, seven were agriculturists, and six were of miscellaneous professions.

Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Much dissatisfaction was evinced when the age limit of candidates for the Covenanted Civil Service of India was reduced to nineteen years. Loyal but misinformed Natives of India have said in my hearing that the age was reduced in order that Natives of this country might not be able to compete. I have always endeavoured to show the opinion to be erroneous, but there is, I think, no doubt that it was, and is, extensively held by those educated Natives who have not had, or have not availed themselves of, opportunities of intimacy with English gentlemen. Those Native gentlemen who do not suppose the age limit was reduced to exclude the Natives of India from competition still lament the reduction of the age limit as prejudicial to Natives of India. The younger class of educated Hindus, and some of the older class, often desire open competition and simultaneous examinations in India and in England, but the Natives of these Provinces are by no means unanimous even on the question of open competition and simultaneous examinations. The majority have formed no opinion on the subject.

Do Natives of India labour under any, and, if any, what, disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the service?—The great disadvantage under which Natives of India labour in competing for the Civil Service of India is the reduction of the limit of age. The mere fact of the examination

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

being held in England may be a disadvantage to poor and needy students without sufficient merit to attract patrons. In other cases it is counterbalanced by the cheapness of higher education in India as compared with the cost of higher education in England. The limit of age might be raised to 23 and the time of probation in England reduced to one year. The marks for English composition might be increased, and so might the marks for Sanskrit and Arabic. I would add Persian, and would allot at least as many marks for Persian as are given for Italian. I do not think that examinations for the Covenanted Civil Service should be held in India. I have already mentioned the comparative cheapness of higher education in India. I do not think that Englishmen competing for the Civil Service of India should, as compared with Natives of India, labour under a positive disadvantage. Every one knows who has had any practical experience regarding the training of students for the Indian Civil Service, that the process to the English parent is usually very costly. In India, on the contrary, higher education may be obtained with such comparative cheapness that the Hindu or Mahomedan parent can train his son in India and send him to England for one or two years' special preparation, at a less charge than an English parent, who sends his son to a public school, can usually train his son in England. I am also of opinion that our Covenanted Civil Service should not be too fully recruited from the poorer classes of Natives, and this, I am afraid, would happen if there were simultaneous examinations in India and in England. Above all, I think force of character and physical and moral courage, quite as essential to a Civilian as the mental ability tested by competitive examinations. I think that if the age limit were revised, the determination and moral courage shown by a Native student in proceeding to England to compete, would deserve success, and such determination and courage would be quite

Middle School education, and scholarships given to students who matriculate are given for the promotion of High School education. The only scholarships given for the encouragement of College education are those given to F.A. students and to B.A. students studying for M.A. We only have to do with the former. There are ten scholarships given annually, tenable for two years at any college here or in Bombay, or in the N.-W. P. or in Bengal. Assuming that only one is held at a foreign college, practically three or four will be so held, we have nine scholarships which may be thus distributed:—Three at the Departmental College, three at each of the Aided Colleges. The value of each scholarship is Rs. 15 per mensem. The cost of educating a graduate to Government is thus, if this indirect charge be added—

Departmental Colleges, Rs. $1,065 + 3 \times 15 \times 12 \times 2 = 1,065 + 1,080 = 2,145$.

Aided Colleges, Rs. $474 + 3 \times 15 \times 12 \times 2 = 474 + 1,080 = 1,554$.

Vol. III. Sec. II. C P.

C. A. R. Browning, Esq.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

as valuable characteristics as those tested by examination. I would not, therefore, hold simultaneous competitive examinations in England and India for admission to the Covenanted Civil Service.

Mr. *White.*

You say that Natives with whom you came in contact have held the erroneous opinion that the age limit was reduced in order to exclude Natives from competition in England ?—The reasons for the reduction were really these: (1) that it was supposed that if clever young men were not secured for India at a very early age, but were allowed to proceed to the Universities, they might possibly be induced to prefer an English to an Indian career, and we should lose the best men ; (2) it was supposed that if they were sent to India at a more youthful age, they would speedily effect more kindly relations with the Natives there, and would themselves be more pliable, and likely to settle and live longer in India than if they came out at a more advanced period of life ; and (3) that if the age of admission to the Civil Service remained at twenty-one or twenty-two, men failing in the competition for the Civil Service would not have a career in England, they would not be able to enter the army, and so on.

You said that the cheapness of education in this country would place the English candidate at a disadvantage, but is any special training available in this country for passing the Civil Service examination, such as can be obtained in England—such a training, for instance, as would enable the student to go to England and pass the examination at once ?—If you slightly increase the marks for Sanskrit in the case of Hindus and for Arabic in the case of Mahomedans, I think the Native of India would stand a very fair chance. He would not probably be able to secure anything for Greek. If he belonged to Bombay, he would be able to learn Latin. As regards Calcutta, I am unable to speak.

But are there any training facilities here which would enable him to go and pass straight off ?—I think not.

Mr. *Nulkar.*

Would you increase the age for both Europeans and Natives ?—Yes.

You have said that the reason why the age was reduced was that we might catch the best men. How would that object be gained by raising it ?—I did not say that that was my opinion, but that it was the reason which brought about the reduction.

Mr. *Nulkar*—continued.

My own opinion is that it was exceedingly unfortunate to reduce the age, believing as I do that the best men mature more slowly.

You object to a simultaneous examination in India because you think it would facilitate the entry of indigent persons. For the same reason would you close the competition in England to such as owed their education to subscription among friends ?—Certainly not, because such cases would be so few. It is only in case they became numerous that the disadvantage would arise.

Do we get the very best and fittest Natives in every respect by limiting the examination to England ?—I think so. The voyage to England, when it is voluntary, is a test of character and courage, and, besides that, the money required is a proof that the boy has received gentle nurture, and has been brought up in the best traditions of his caste, creed and nationality.

Are boys who would otherwise come forward now debarred by the uncertainty of passing ?—I don't think they would have a worse chance than the ordinary bright student ; and I believe that any young man who goes to England and studies for the Civil Service will be able to study for the Bar.

You propose to make Sanskrit and Arabic equal to Latin and Greek ?—No. I only propose to increase the marks to 600, which would place them on a level with Greek.

Is that simply in order to give an advantage to Natives of this country ?—Mainly it is on the ground that if Natives do labour under any disadvantage, it may be changed, if anything, to their advantage. Another reason is that Sanskrit and Arabic grammar and poetry are a valuable mental training ; another is that a knowledge of Sanskrit enables a young man to master Bengali, Uria, Mahratti and Hindi with greater facility ; and in the same way a knowledge of Arabic makes the study of Persian easier. I think it is also very essential that our Covenanted Civilians should command the respect of the people of the country, by which I mean the masses, who, if they do not care very much about a knowledge of Mathematics or even of English, yet highly respect a man who is well up in Arabic and Sanskrit accordingly as he is a Mahomedan or a Hindu. I think it advisable that this feeling of reverence should be enlisted on our side and in favour of the members of the Covenanted Service.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

Do you think that if there was a simultaneous examination in India, a great number of educated Natives would pass?—It all depends whether Englishmen competed too. Supposing the examinations were as identical as possible, and there was one list in order of merit, I do not see why the English candidates should not hold their own.

Do you think that a large number of Natives would get in?—I cannot say.

You do not wish the young Statutory men to be sent to England?—Certainly not.

But would you like the men of the Covenanted Service to go?—I do not recommend that the successful competitors should be compelled to complete their training in England. If the age limit be raised, perhaps the future training of successful candidates in England might be compulsory. But even on this point I am not sure. I would only mention that the voluntary visit to England by a young Hindu or Mahomedan to complete his education is a very different matter from the compulsory residence there of a poor and needy man, whose future prospects appear to depend on his compliance with a rule making training in England unavoidable and providing him with funds for such future training.

Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in statute 33 Vic., chapter 3, section 6, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—The Uncovenanted Service might be recruited from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty. Of course, Natives of India, as described in statute 33 Vic., chapter 3, section 6, should usually be selected for vacant appointments. In the case of any person not a Native of India, as defined in the above-quoted statute, being selected, a report might be made to the Government of India. I do not add this provision from any distrust of Local Governments and Administrations, but to save the Heads of such Governments and Administrations from solicitation and odium.

Should the recruitments be by competition, or by nomination, or by both systems combined; and if by both combined, should one system be applied to all offices or classes of offices, or should the system be varied with the class of offices? (By the Uncovenanted Service is here meant Munsiffs, Tahsildars and Extra Assistant Commissioners.)—The recruitments might be by nomination and competition. I think the system might be varied with the class of offices. I think, for instance, graduates in law who have practised in our Courts might be appointed Judges of Small Cause Courts and Extra Assistant Commissioners, and that could not very well be by competition. In other cases there might be competition for the lower grades.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

In fact you would not lay down any hard and fast rule?—No. I think I would leave it to the discretion of the Local Governments.

Whatever system be adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several administrations only from persons resident in the territories under such administrations, respectively, or with a preference for such residents?—The recruitments might only be made from persons resident in the territories under the administrations making appointments. It is highly advantageous that the families and relatives of Uncovenanted Officers be residents of the territories in which such officers exercise their functions. They are the more affected by public opinion. There are no such strong temptations to save and grasp as much money as possible in order to retire to their own country as soon as they can. Their relations with the people will be more kindly. The people themselves will more readily learn any formalities and rules, with which compliance may sometimes be necessary in matters of official business.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

Has there been a rule in these Provinces for a long time against recruiting from foreigners?—Always. We make no appointment, except with the permission of the Chief Commissioner, from men not born in this Province.

Natives from other provinces who have permanently settled here are eligible, are they not?—Oh yes.

When you first came to these Provinces, were foreigners largely employed?—The whole of the appointments in the Saugor and Nerbudda territories, and very many in the Nagpur District were held by up-country Natives.

Is that the case now?—It is not.

If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the portion

Vol. III. Sec. II. C. P.

C. A. R. Browning, Esq.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

of offices assigned to that service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service? —I hope that the Statutory Civil Service will not be abolished; but if it is abolished, Uncovenanted servants of proved merit and ability might be freely admitted to offices usually held by members of the Covenanted Civil Service. I do not think that the Government should be hampered in their choice of the best available men for any particular office, or that the stimulus of promotion and privilege should be withheld from the best members of the Uncovenanted Civil Service, who are fit to hold appointments usually reserved for Covenanted Civilians.

Are many men of your department selected for the Extra Assistant Commissionerships?—I made out a list this morning, and found that about one-third of the Extra Assistant Commissioners in this Province formerly held appointments in the Educational Department.

And some Tahsildars also?—Many Tahsildars and three Assistant Settlement Officers.

Who had all been in your department?—Yes.

Do you find that opening these ranks of the Executive Service to your department enables you to get better men?—Certainly. It makes my department very popular, provided they are not hindered from leaving it when an opportunity occurs.

Do you find that at all inconvenient?—Sometimes of course, but not to any great extent.

Mr. *Stokes*.

Suppose you had competition for the Uncovenanted Service, up to what age do you think that men would be ready to go in and compete?—Our men do not complete their education, or any way nearly complete it, as soon as they do in Bengal.

I mean what is the highest age at which they would compete without reluctance?—They would go in if they were grey-headed.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*.

With any chance of success?—It is impossible to say. Now and then I have three or four candidates for places in my office. Some of them have been very old men, and when told they would have to compete, once or twice they have consented, but generally they have refused.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*—continued.

Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service according as the posts are held by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branch?—The grant of 64 per cent. of the gross pay or salary of an office usually held by a Covenanted Civilian to a Statutory Civilian or Native Uncovenanted Officer holding the appointment seems liberal. Native Uncovenanted Officers should not suffer any pecuniary loss, however, by their promotion. I think that European Uncovenanted Officers and professional men appointed by permission from the Secretary of State to any office usually held by a Covenanted Civilian should receive the full pay of the post. In the case of extraordinary merit, the Governor-General in Council might be empowered to grant the full pay to any officer holding the appointment.

If such distinction should be made, on what principle should it be regulated?—It should be defended only on the plea of economy.

Should any distinction be made in the Furlough Rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches of the Service according to the nationality of the officer or on any other grounds?—The Furlough Rules granted to Native Statutory Civilians and to Native Uncovenanted Officers are, I believe, thought sufficiently liberal. But European officers appointed to special posts by permission of the Secretary of State for India might enjoy the Leave Rules of the Covenanted Civil Service or other special rules. The ordinary Uncovenanted Leave Rules in the case of European Officers specially selected to fill offices usually held by Covenanted Civilians, or to occupy offices in special departments of the Service, for which the services of competent Native gentlemen are not available, are not sufficiently liberal. The distinction that some officers should be allowed more liberal furlough rules should exist only on the ground of economy.

Are the privileges in regard to pay, promotion, and retiring annuity, and the general conditions of office belonging to the Covenanted Civil Service suitable to Natives obtaining office under the Statutory Rules?—On the ground of economy I do not think the privileges in regard to pay, promotion

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*—continued.

and retiring annuity belonging to the Covenanted Civil Service are suitable to Natives obtaining office under the Statutory Rules.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

What salary do you find that a B. A. is willing to take?—I have now three in the department on salaries varying from Rs. 60 to Rs. 80. I could get one for Rs. 60, but he would expect speedy promotion.

There are some Native gentlemen employed as professors in the College here?—Yes. But they are men of experience very often, and have taken a very high degree.

What do you pay them?—Rs. 200. I should say they ought to begin on Rs. 300.

The *President.*

Can you say how much it costs a student to educate himself up to the B.A. degree in the Government college, the aided college, and privately?—It takes a student four years in the High School at Bombay—I take Bombay, because the fees are not so high as here. Four years at the High School at Rs. 4 a month, or Rs. 48 a year, is Rs. 192. Books at Rs. 20 a year would be another Rs. 80. Then in the College the rate is Rs. 10 a month, or Rs. 120 a year, for four years Rs. 480; altogether less than Rs. 800.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

Your students who go to Bombay have to be boarded?—There are boarding-houses in Bombay, and in Poona also. The cost of boarding in Nagpur is about Rs. 3 a month. I cannot speak as regards Bombay. Here it would be about Rs. 3 also. In Bombay it would be dearer.

Mr. *Stokes.*

Have you ever found it desirable to pension any of your subordinates at an earlier age than is allowed under the present rules?—There have been instances of men being kept in the service who were not quite up to the mark as regards efficiency, but whom we could not get rid of because they would lose everything. (To the *President.*) There is a rule forbidding our turning men out of the service.

The *President.*

Is there not a rule forbidding you to retain inefficient men?—The men I refer to are not so efficient as we could wish, but they are not absolutely inefficient.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

You say you pay your professors, who are graduates of high standing, Rs. 200 a month. Are they satisfied?—If they get promotion, they are. Graduates get from Rs. 130 to Rs. 270.

You said you would pay them Rs. 300?—That is, they would begin on Rs. 200 and rise to Rs. 300. I think I could get good men on that pay. Our men are not, I believe, so highly paid as those of other provinces. I think they would be more contented if I could give them better pay. They have not complained, because they like the service.

Do you find that your professors leave the Educational for other departments when they have the opportunity?—Sometimes.

You are somewhat opposed to the education of Native boys in Europe, because you think the temptations to which they are exposed out-balance the advantages they derive. Is that so?—I think that may be so.

Have you considered whether the intimacy of the Covenanted with the Native Civilian would not be increased when the Native Civilian has received a higher education?—I do not think it would be much increased. I have not been a Covenanted Civilian myself, and do not know.

Have you yourself, in your intercourse with Natives, found difficulty from the absence of subjects of common interest?—I think our interests are common though our modes of thought are different.

Whether from the absence of common interests or the difference of modes of thought, have you found it difficult to mix freely with Native society?—Our habits are very different from Native habits. I do not say they are superior: all I say is they are different. I do not wish a Native to be other than he is except in some respects, nor an Englishman to be other than he is except in some respects. I think both are capable of improvement.

Would not European education remove to some extent that difference, so as to enable the senior members of the Service, Native and Covenanted, to associate more freely together?—I do not think it would.

WITNESS II.—11th January 1887.

Examination of WILLIAM YOUNG, ESQ., Principal of the High School and College, Jubbulpur.

William Young, Esq.

In answer to the President, Mr. *Young* said :—I have held the office of Principal of the High School for some years, and for twenty-three years have been engaged in the Educational Department, Central Provinces. Education has in that period greatly progressed.

In a competition open to all India our students would, I think, hold their own, but they would be overborne by numbers. Some of our graduates have taken high honours in Mathematics, Physical Science, and English. I must explain that up to this year they have graduated from colleges in other provinces. This is the first year in which we have sent up students for the B.A. degree. I am opposed to an examination in India for the Covenanted Civil Service, because I think the educational institutions in India cannot give such a training as is essential for officers to whom the highest posts in the administration are to be committed.

Up to this time I think hardly any students in these provinces would have been successful at the competitive examination for the Covenanted Civil Service.

All classes of the population are fairly represented in our schools, including Rajputs to a small extent. In the higher education the larger number of students are Brahmins.

WITNESS III.—11th January 1887.

Examination of Babu BISSASSAR DUTT, Extra Assistant Commissioner, Jubbulpur.

Babu Bissassar Dutt.

In answer to the President, *Bissassar Dutt* stated :—I have been forty-two years in the service ; I began as an English clerk in the Deputy Commissioner's Office ; became a Tahsildar ; was appointed Extra Assistant Commissioner in 1863 ; I am now in the highest grade, and have been acting as Small Cause Judge for twenty months.

Is the existing system of appointing natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved ? If it is not, what are the grounds of disapprobation ?—Not generally as I understand, because : (1) Selection is not based upon any well-designed test of merit and ability. (2) The rules as to pay and promotion give the appearance of an inferior status to the service. (3) It does not fulfil the expectation of the educated classes. (4) Members of the Covenanted Service look down on those who enter it as their inferiors, which no doubt they are.

Are the defects of the existing system (if any) susceptible of remedy—(*a*) by an amendment of the Rules ; (*b*) by an amendment of the Statutory provisions in that behalf ; or should those provisions be repealed ? If the provisions of the Statute 33 Vic., section 6, are not repealed nor substantially amended so as to take away the power conferred on the local administrations, should they be amended in respect of the description

The *President*—continued.

of persons on whose behalf such powers may be exercised, or in respect of the sanction required for appointments made thereunder ? If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so ?—I am for abolishing the present system ; but if it is to be retained, the Statute does not require amendment, for the provisions are clear enough. The rules require to be reconsidered. I would leave the power of nomination by the Local Government untouched, but to secure men of respectability and good status in society, I would suggest the selection of candidates for each province separately after they shall have passed the University entrance test. They should then undergo a course of special training in some public or private institution in India and pass the departmental examination. In special cases Government might utilize local or foreign students with or without such training. The selections should, as a rule, be made from amongst those who are permanent residents of the province or who are connected with it otherwise. I would not compel, but would encourage them to go to England.

Mr. *White.*

Would you promote men from the Uncovenanted Civil Service and the Bar if qualified ?—Yes.

The *President.*

Are Statutory Civilians regarded as superior to the men of the Uncovenanted line?—Men appointed to the Statutory Civil Service have yet to prove their superiority to Uncovenanted Civil Servants.

I would not alter the Statute.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

In selected districts would you appoint a Native Deputy Commissioner?—Yes.

Are there many districts in the Central Provinces where there are no religious factions?—They prevail in all important districts.

Is the feeling strong?—It has been so for the last few years; but it is due to temporary causes, festivals having synchronized.

Are there districts where this feeling does not prevail?—Yes, in four or five smaller districts, where there are no large towns.

Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service? Should any, and if any, what, change be made in that system?—I should say that the competitive examination in England for the Covenanted Civil Service is not looked upon unfavourably by large and important classes in India.

Do Natives of India labour under any, and if any, what disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the Service?—Yes, they do. The chief complaint is about the limit of age.

By what changes may those disadvantages be minimized or removed, *e.g.*:—(*a*) by the establishment of scholarships and allowance of passage-money to Native candidates; (*b*) by altering the limit of age?—The limit of age might be raised to twenty-two. Passage-money, or pecuniary help of any kind, I would not advocate. In urgent cases, Government might, for special considerations, lend a helping hand. As a rule, I should like to see Indians compete in England without any special advantage which English candidates do not enjoy.

(*c*) By adding to the subjects of examination, or by altering the maxima marks obtainable in certain subjects?—The maxima marks in classical languages might be re-adjusted.

(*d*) By holding simultaneously examinations in England and in India?—The competitive examination should be held in England only.

If any examination is held in India, should it be identical with that held in England?—Yes.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*—continued.

Should it be held at one or more centres in India?—At the several Presidency towns.

Should the candidates in England and in India compete with one another and be selected in order of merit? If such an apportionment is made, on what principle is it to be regulated?—The candidates in England and India should compete with one another and be selected in order of merit.

Should there be an apportionment between the residents in the territories of the several administrations, respectively, or between the members of the principal religious sects?—There need be no apportionment of the kind contemplated when candidates enter the service by competition in England. Government may, at discretion, post successful candidates to any part of the Empire with due reference to their usefulness and political necessity.

If an examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—They must undergo a regular course of training in England.

Mr. *Nulkar.*

Are there not many Bengali families in these Provinces?—There are many Bengali families settled in these Provinces. There is no jealousy between them and natives of these Provinces as regards Government Service.

Mr. *Stokes.*

What are your views as to competition in India with subsequent training in England?—I do not advocate competition in India as candidates have not the advantage of an English training. Two years' training afterwards would not answer the same purpose.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

Do you think there would be an objection to Bengalis being employed in this Province?—There would be jealousy against Bengalis coming in. There is a standing order since Sir Richard Temple's time against the employing of foreigners.

To Mr. *Stokes*:—There are numerous Gonds in these Provinces. The better classes who own lands and pay revenue—a small minority—are Hindus. The Gonds have no feeling against either Hindus or Mahomedans. They would not object to a Deputy Commissioner of those religions.

The *President.*

Is there any objection to going to England on caste or other grounds?—

Vol. III. Sec. II. C. P.

Babu Bissasar Dutt.

The *President*—continued.

Only four men have gone to England from these Provinces. There is a strong objection on the part of Hindus; but it is waning. Many would embrace the opportunity of going if facilities were given.

Should provision be made for the appointment of members of the Uncovenanted Service to posts usually held by Covenanted Civilians?—Yes. There are some members of the Uncovenanted Civil Service who have proved their fitness for the Covenanted Civil Service.

Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in Statute 33 Vic, cap. 3, section 6, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—I would reserve the Uncovenanted Service for the Natives of India as described in the Statute, Government having the option, of course, of putting in any natural-born subject of Her Majesty for any special or political reason.

Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or by both systems combined; and if by both combined, should one system be applied to all offices or classes of offices, or should the system be varied with the class of offices?—The recruitment should be by nomination after passing the University entrance test. The candidates selected should undergo a special training and pass a departmental examination, the same as I would have for the Statutory Service if it is to be retained. Pleaders might also be nominated for the Uncovenanted Service. There should be one system for all higher classes of offices, and another for the ministerial offices below the grade of clerks and deputy clerks of Courts.

Whatever system be adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several administrations only from persons resident in the territories under such administrations, respectively, or with a preference for such residents?—The recruitment should be provincial, from amongst the permanent residents in, or persons connected with, the Province. In special cases, or when no local talent is available, outsiders may be selected.

If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—No; I would allow the proportion now allotted to merge with the Covenanted Service, and, to make up for the loss, permit the promotion of Uncovenanted Servants of proved merit and ability to the Covenanted Service.

The *President*—continued.

Do men of good family and members of the professional classes enter the Uncovenanted Service freely?—Yes, there are some who do so.

Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service according as the posts are held by members of that branch of the Service, or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches? If such distinction should be made, on what principle should it be regulated?—The present scale is fair: but such men as are promoted from the Uncovenanted Service should be guaranteed against any loss of the emoluments they enjoyed at the time of advancement, and against any diminution of their pension at the close of their service.

Should any distinction be made in the Furlough Rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches of the Service according to the nationality of the officer, or on any other, and what ground?—The Furlough Rules are fair enough. Special leave may be allowed to Uncovenanted and Statutory Civil Servants to proceed to England in order to acquire higher attainments, either in general subjects or law, with some allowance, for two or three years, according to the requirements of each case.

Are the privileges in regard to pay, promotion and retiring annuity, and the general conditions of office belonging to the Covenanted Civil Service suitable to Natives obtaining office under the Statutory Rules?—They appear to be fair; but with regard to the pay of such men as might be promoted from the Uncovenanted Service or the Bar, I would have some well-considered rules, so that they may not suffer in the income they enjoy at the time of advancement. I would allow Uncovenanted Servants to hold on until the age of sixty, if physically and intellectually fit.

You consider the present rules satisfactory in short?—Yes, the present rules are fair; but arrangements ought to be made to prevent men promoted from the Uncovenanted Civil Service suffering loss, *i.e.*, they should not receive less pay when promoted than before.

Mr. *Stokes*.

Is there any objection to going to England amongst the Brahmins?—It is decreasing among Brahmins. None have gone to England from this Province. I have stated all I wished to say.

WITNESS IV.—11th January 1887.

Examination of LALLA BEHARI LALL KHAZANCHI, Landowner of twenty-two villages, and Banker.

Lalla Behari Lall Khazanchi.

Lalla Behari Lall stated as follows in answer to the questions put :—

Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved ?—The Statute of 33, ch. 6, is approved, as in the Central Provinces experience has shown. Certain persons have objections on the score of want of education, as there is no educational test. I am of opinion that there should be an educational test, and that candidates should be men of family. The rules intend that Uncovenanted Civil Service men should be appointed to Covenanted posts ; but such men have not been appointed, because the pay of Statutory posts is below that given to Covenanted Civilians. A rule should be made by which Uncovenanted men might be appointed to Statutory posts without loss of pay and with the hope of regular promotion, on condition of merit and ability. This will break down the barrier which now hedges in Covenanted men.

Are the defects of the existing system (if any) susceptible of remedy—(*a*) by an amendment of the Rules ; (*b*) by an amendment of the Statutory provisions in that behalf ; or should those provisions be repealed?—There is no need to alter the rules which regulate the discretion of the Local Government.

If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so ?—It is not necessary to send candidates selected for the Statutory Service to England, because the period of two years, in which they pass their examination, is sufficient training, particularly as the Statutory Service is set apart for men of rank. If persons are appointed to the Statutory Service from the Uncovenanted Civil Service, or professions, the mere fact of their selection by Government is a sufficient guarantee, and they don't want training.

Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service? Do Natives of India labour under any, and, if any, what disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the Service ?—These objections are made : —(1) The limit of age is too low for Natives to go to England ; (2) the cost of the journey ; (3) religious objections amongst a large section.

By what changes may those disadvantages be minimized or removed?—(1) Raise the age to twenty-three ; (2) if Government give allowances and passage-money, this objection will be removed, but it will be inadvisable financially ; (3) the third objection is irremoveable.

If an examination is held in India—(1) Should it be identical with that held in England? (2) Should it be held at one or more centres in India ? Should the candidates in England and in India compete with one another and be selected in order of merit, or should a certain number of appointments be apportioned for competition to the candidates at the respective examinations ? (3) If such an apportionment is made, on what principle is it to be regulated ? (4) Should there be an apportionment between the residents in the territories of the several administrations, respectively, or between the members of the principal religious sects ?—If the examination is held in India, objections 2 and 3 will be removed. There should be an identical and simultaneous examination in India and England, candidates to compete at either place. Examination to be held at one central place in India. It would be better to fix a proportion of appointments for each examination. The proportion of appointments to be given to Natives and Europeans should be fixed. I would have no distribution according to race, religion, or province. Successful candidates should not be compelled to go to England. It should be left to their option.

What class of men would succeed under your plan?—I do not advocate an open competition which would admit the lowest classes. I would limit it to a competition amongst candidates selected from good families, with an educational test.

Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in Statute 33 Vic., cap. 3, section 6, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—Statutory Natives only should be admitted by a combined system of nomination and competition as now. Local Governments should retain the power of nomination, so that persons of family may be appointed.

Vol. III. Sec II. C. P.

Lalla Behari Lall Khazanchi.

A preference should be given to a permanent resident of a province in making appointments in that province.

If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service? —I would hand over the appointments.

Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service according as the posts are held by members of that branch of the Service, or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—There should be a distinction in pay between residents of India and England, amounting to 25 per cent. I would retain the present Rules for Leave and Pension.

I have nothing more to state.

WITNESS V.—11th January 1887.

Examination of Pundit HET RAM, C.I.E., Dewan of Rewah, Brahmin, Native of Rohilcund, for eighteen years Deputy Inspector of Schools, Tahsildar and Deputy Collector in the N.-W. Provinces.

Pundit Hét Ram.

Pundit HÉT RAM said :—

In 1875 my services were lent to the Rewah State. I receive Rs. 1,000 per mensem as pay.

To Mr. *Crosthwaite* :—The existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service is approved generally, but not altogether. The disapprobation exists for the following reasons:—There is no educational test, and men are chosen only on account of good family, while the Statute contemplates the appointment of men of proved merit and ability. Some of the persons appointed are mere boys, fresh from school, who have not proved their merit or ability. They draw less pay, and therefore hold an inferior position in the eyes of the public, and are regarded by themselves as inferior. If they do the same work, they should get the same pay as Covenanted Civilians.

It is argued that the Covenanted Civilians who are chosen in England should get higher pay, because their education has been more costly and their expenses are increased by the voyage and other causes; but when one employs a private servant, one obtains the best man and pays him regardless of the cost he has incurred in training; and if this principle is adopted by a private man, it should be by the Government.

The larger pay though it may be proportionate to the larger cost of an English education and the expenses of an Englishman, suggests to the Native mind partiality, and this is likely to create a gulf between Natives and Europeans. It should be the policy to treat both on the same footing, and the Natives should be inspired with the sentiment that the Government of the country is their own, and in the event of the invasion of India by a foreign foe they would fight shoulder to shoulder with Europeans, not thinking in the least they were under a foreign ruler.

I would recruit the Statutory Service from the Uncovenanted.

The definition of the term "Native" should include Natives of Feudatory States; if they are included, I would also include an Englishman brought up and domiciled in India. I would compel the persons appointed to the Statutory Civil Service to go to England for two or three years, otherwise they would not be fit to govern Englishmen. I would insist on this, although the person appointed had been for some years in the service.

As to the competition for the Covenanted Civil Service, the present system is disapproved.

I would raise the age to twenty-two years.

I would have two simultaneous and identical examinations, open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty; but as an examination in India would produce a flood of candidates, and the English would be at a disadvantage, this might be dangerous to the security of the British Empire. I would, therefore, fix a proportion of appointments which must be held by the British subjects. The proportion should be, say, five Natives to three Europeans, as in the army. I would in these examinations fix a qualifying number of marks, and any candidate who obtained the qualifying marks, but failed to get such marks as would place him sufficiently high in the list, to obtain an appointment, should be compensated by obtaining employment in the Uncovenanted Civil Service or the privilege of practising at the Bar.

Pundit Hét Ram.

If mental training and intellectual culture can be obtained in India, there is no use sending students to England for examination, and this applies to all classes—Asiatics, Eurasians, and Anglo-Indians—but they should be sent to England for such training as the present competitive Civilians receive after their first examination. The examination in India will relieve parents living or domiciled in India of the heavy expense attendant on sending their sons to England for competition, and this will relieve them of the loss by exchange.

I would recruit the Uncovenanted Service chiefly from the Natives of India, but I would exclude no class. I would employ both nomination and competition in selecting men for the appointments. For instance, in the case of Tahsildars fit men should be promoted; and if there are no fit men, then competition should be resorted to. The competition should be among nominees. Such nominees to be residents of the Province and of any creed or caste. If no fit person is to be obtained in the Province, then persons of other provinces may be admitted. For Extra Assistant Commissioners there should be a similar system, some being selected by competition among the persons nominated by the Government and some being appointed without competition. Appointments might be made of persons who have proved their merit and ability in the public service or professional practise, but these must be persons of clear merit. The Natives of the country do not require so much furlough as Europeans. They might have a little less.

I wish to add that I have no fear that educated and enlightened Natives will show any partiality. They are to be presumed to be superior to such weakness.

To Mr. *Nulkar*: In the N.-W. Provinces there is jealousy between those officers of different creeds who have not received a liberal education. English education makes them independent. If I had to decide a dispute between one of my own creed and a person of another creed, I think that, in a case of doubt, I should lean to the side of the person of such other creed. English education has a liberalizing effect on the mind, which is not the case with persons who have only had an Oriental education.

I consider the number of higher posts in the Civil Service open to Natives should be largely increased. I would leave it to Government to fix the number. It should certainly be in excess of one-sixth.

As Dewan I receive Rs. 1,000 a month with a house, leave to use carriage and horses, and also the services of a few menial servants. I was appointed on the recommendation of the British Government. Under me there are two officers, a Magistrate and a Civil Judge. The Magistrate is paid Rs. 200, and the Civil Judge Rs. 150 per mensem. They have no recognized perquisites. Unrecognized perquisites prevail more or less everywhere, but in Rewah they take less than in British India. I am not sure they would take less if they were better paid, but I have found that educated men certainly take less.

I have appointed pensioners of the British Government to places in the State whenever they were strong enough, both in order to avail myself of their experience and as a matter of economy. The Magistrate and Civil Judge are not pensioned men. I have two assistants, one my personal assistant, who receives Rs. 200 a month, and the other, who is entrusted with settlement operations, receives Rs. 400 per mensem. My personal assistant on Rs. 200 is a pensioner.

My authority in Rewah is subject to the sanction of the Political Agent.

The State is now free from debt.

WITNESS VI.—11th January 1887.

Examination of Dhondu Balkrishna Dev, Editor of the *Nagpore News*.

Dhondu Balkrishna Dev.

With reference to the Statutory Civil Service, the witness stated:—

The people, that is the educated class, who have at all thought upon the subject of the Statutory system, condemn it generally on the ground of its being based upon the principle of selection, which varies with times and with persons who have the working out of the system in their hand for the time being. In the Central Provinces the appointments (two only up to this time) under the system are such as people have no reason to be dissatisfied with. The nominees are in every way fitted for the honour done to them; but there is no guarantee that such would invariably be the case, because in this very province we see in the case of other appointments, though not Statutory yet not less important, that the selection has been only whimsical or an achieve-

Vol. III. Sec. II. P. O.

Dhondu Balkrishna Dev.

ment of high-handedness. In the older provinces, in Bombay for instance, the selection has been not of one and the same character, that is, the criteria seem to be different in different cases ; and hence some appointments under the system are very satisfactory, while some are quite otherwise. As regards the definition of the words " Natives of India," I will mention presently who should properly be considered as Natives of India. Eurasians are often heard to say, " Oh, in our country we have different manners," &c. ; by " our country" meaning *England*. So that I cannot understand what country they consider as their mother-country, and it is very natural that they should fall into this confusion. They had better form a separate class and have special privileges bestowed upon them.

There can be no question as to who are looked upon as Natives of India as regards Hindus, and I might say even as regard Mahomedans. Even rustics recognize that the Mahomedans are Natives of India. In every village we find a sprinkling of Mahomedans. Very many are hereditary landholders like their Hindu brothers. Mahomedans of large towns and cities are trying to separate themselves from Hindus, but I fear they are doing it to their own injury. According to the definition given by the Government of India, the words " Natives of India " include any person born and domiciled within the dominions of Her Majesty in India, of parents habitually resident in India and not established there for temporary purposes only. This definition of Natives of India brings Parsees and Eurasians under the category of Natives of India. But it will be remembered that these (Parsees and Eurasians) are looked upon in a different light from Hindus and Mahomedans. However, as they cannot be better placed under any other class, and as their association with India has created in them, especially in the Parsees, a strong feeling of attachment to the land of the Aryans or Rishis, I would not dispute the correctness of the definition of Natives of India as given by the Government of India and sanctioned by higher authorities. So that Hindus, Mahomedans, Parsees and Eurasians group into Natives of India. I would include all, even Europeans, who have made India their permanent residence.

I would amend the rules ; and I would have an open competitive Civil Service Examination, and so would abolish the Statutory Civil Service altogether. I consider competitive examination for the Civil Service a sufficient qualification for admission.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

Are there objections to going to England on religious or other grounds?—Yes, but prejudices are being dispelled. I have no objection to my relatives going, and would receive them on their return. I would maintain the present rules. I would select B.A.'s for Tahsildars and Small Cause Court Judges.

With reference to the essential qualifications for the Public Service, the highest possible intellectual and moral culture should be insisted on. Family status and money-influence are only help-mates ; in other words, I would say that the latter play only a subordinate and secondary part. History points to this difference between intellectual and moral culture and family status and money-influence. The history of English civilization is an instance in point. For some time the middle class carried all the influence by dint of their intellectual superiority, as is the case now in India, though it is a fact that the strength of civilizing influences grew as the moneyed class improved in intellectual attainments.

For the Uncovenanted Service I would recruit from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, *i.e.* provided they reside permanently in India.

Such recruitment should be by open competition for all classes of offices and should be provincial. These appointments are numerous. Men from some provinces might be expected to pass in large numbers, and so I would exclude men from other provinces.

Natives of good families and a few B.A.'s and pleaders are in the Uncovenanted Civil Service.

There should be a difference between pay of Uncovenanted Civilians and Covenanted Servants, but no difference on account of nationality. I would make a difference between the Covenanted Civil Service and the Statutory Service. As the examination for the former is much severer, few Natives would succeed in entering it in the present state of education in India.

To Mr. *Nulkar*: Classes other than Brahmins who receive education are increasing in proportion.

To the *President*: A Native pleader, a Bengali, in the Central Provinces, has sent one of his sons to England to compete at the examination in England.

I would make passing in oriental languages compulsory. I am not aware that selected candidates are obliged to pass in these languages before they come out.

As regards limited competition and nomination as modes of recruitment, I think that both the systems have a very narrow scope: open competition is the only measure under the Statutory system that would secure proper persons for the service, and this competition should be one and the same for the whole of India. Backward provinces will be highly benefited by it. Importation into them of men of high culture would be beneficial to them in every respect. Examples of this wholesome influence of importation of foreigners are not wanting. We need not go far to seek for examples of this. What would have been the fate of the people of India if they were not brought into contact with the English? One competition would do good in several other respects. In advanced provinces the field may be overflooded with men of high intellectual attainments, and having no outlet they might rot there. Different competitions for different provinces would create no feeling of intellectual rivalry, and different provinces may thus keep to themselves without making such progress as would bring the whole community to a common standard. Taking all these things into consideration, it seems desirable that there should be open competition, and it should be one and the same for the whole of India, a number of appointments being allotted to each province; different standards of selection should not be prescribed for Statutory appointments. They would only make the system worse.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

Would you apportion the appointments to the various provinces?—I see no objection to appointments in the Punjab being held by Natives of Bombay, Madras, and Bengal. I see no administrative difficulties in such an arrangement. I have never travelled in the N.-W. Provinces or the Punjab. I am a Native of Poona; and have been in Berar for eight years, and three years at Nagpur. I am a member of the Nagpur branch of the Poona Sarvajanik Sabha. The Nagpur paper was established three years ago. Its circulation is over 1,000.

With regard to the questions relating to the Covenanted Civil Service, and the advisability of holding the competition in India, I would remark

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*—continued.

that the people of India are orthodox in the extreme, though modern civilization has wrought some change in their antiquated notions. But having regard to the ideas of the majority of the people here, I would recommend that an examination be held in India simultaneously with the competitive examination in England. It should be conducted in every respect on the same principles as the examination in England. Without being presumptuous, I may say that the youths of India are not a whit inferior to English youths in their intellectual powers; so that there is no necessity to prescribe different standards for English and Indian candidates. In physical powers the former may be superior to the latter, for they have on their side the advantage of a bracing climate; but it must be remembered that the sort of food and the mode of life recommended to the people of India keeps them agile and energetic enough in their movements, so that they cannot be said to be at a great disadvantage in comparison with their English brothers. The only change in the standards that I would recommend is that the knowledge of Indian languages be made compulsory for European candidates, and the knowledge of Latin for an Indian candidate. History, Arabic and Persian must be added to the curriculum. Now, there remains the question of age. I cannot, even with any appearance of justice, recommend different limits of age for English and Indian candidates. I would propose that the limit be twenty-three. The average age at which natives at the Indian Universities pass the examinations for F.A., B.A. and M.A. respectively may be said to be nineteen, twenty-one, and twenty-two. The persons who go up for these examinations belong generally to the middle class of the Native society.

I am for competition in India. In general, Natives would approve of the measure. As regards the admission of English candidates to competition in India, I must say it would be unjust to exclude these candidates from the Indian competition. But there is one thing to be said against it, and it is, that as the best possible Natives can be had in India, so the best possible Englishmen can be had only in England. There the influence of boarding-schools and association with professors of eminent abilities go a great length to instruct pupils in morals. There is nothing like it here in India for English candidates; and taking several other cir-

Vol. III. Sec. II. C. P.

Dhondu Balkrishna Dev.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*—continued.

cumstances into consideration, it would not be quite unjust to give preference to English candidates brought up in England. Our object being to secure the best possible men for the service, when first-class men are available, why should inferior persons be admitted? I do not know why the capability of Indian educational institutions should be questioned. If the late Dr. Harkness and Sir Alexander Grant were, and the present Professor Hill, Professor Griffith, Dr. Haines and Professor Wordsworth, can be ornaments to English Universities, with what reason can the educational institutions managed by these gentlemen be said to be less efficient than educational institutions in England?

Should the examination held in India be held at one or more centres?—One centre of examination in India would be sufficient. I would compel men who passed in India to go to England to add to their knowledge and learn the manners and customs of the country.

Mr. *Stokes.*

Would you insist on a knowledge of Latin for Native candidates?—Yes; a knowledge of Latin is necessary to make them good English scholars.

WITNESS VII.—11th January 1887.

Examination of Chowdhri UMRAO SINGH, representative of the *Hitkarni Sabha*, a Society established at Jubbulpur.

Chowdhri Umrao Singh.

Chowdhri UMRAO SINGH stated, in reply to the President, that he appeared on behalf of the *Hitkarni Sabha*, an Association, the object of which was the promotion of brotherly love. The Society comprised fifty or sixty members who belonged to all castes of Hindus.

The *President.*

Is the existing system of appointment of natives to the Statutory Service approved? If not, what are the grounds of disapprobation?—The existing system is not approved. The Rules under the Statute are defective. The Statute provides that proved merit and ability should be the test of nomination, thereby, it is believed, intending to confine nominations to persons selected from the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service or the professional classes; but the rules framed under the Statute do not make any such provision. The *Sabha* would, therefore, confine the operation of the Statute to the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service and the professional classes, and close the service for first appointments.

If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so?—No. It is not necessary for members of the Uncovenanted Service or the professional classes, from which the recruitment is proposed, to proceed to England.

Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service? Do

The *President*—continued.

Natives labor under any disadvantages, and, if so, what are they?—Yes; dissati-faction is felt, and the Natives of India do labor under the disadvantage, not only of age and subjects of examination, but parents and guardians are unwilling to send their children at so tender an age as seventeen or eighteen to a distant country, where the chance of success is very small. Besides these difficulties, there are also caste prejudices on the part of certain sections of the community.

By what changes may these disadvantages be minimised or removed?—The disadvantages may be removed or minimised in the following way:—

(*a*) By raising the limit of age from nineteen to twenty-three years.

(*b*) By adding Persian and altering the maxima marks obtainable in Sanskrit and other subjects.

(*c*) By holding simultaneously examinations in England and in India.

If an examination is held in India—should it be identical with that held in England?—It should be identical.

Should it be held at one or more centres in India? Should the candidates in England and in India compete with one another and be selected in order of merit, or should a certain number of appointments be appointed for competition to the candidates at the respective examinations?—It would be convenient for the candidates to have

Chowdhri Umrao Singh.

The *President*—continued.

two centres—one at Calcutta and another at Bombay. If this be not feasible, one centre of examination at any suitable place in India will suffice. The candidates in England and in India should compete with one another, and be selected in order of merit.

(3) If such an apportionment is made, on what principle is it to be regulated?—Should there be an apportionment between the residents in the territories of the several administrations, respectively, or between the members of the principal religious sects?—There should be no apportionment between the residents in the territories of the several administrations, nor between the members of the principal religious sects.

If an examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—No, but they may be encouraged to do so if they wish.

Are the young Natives obtained under the existing system of the open competition in England the best as regards character and capacity who could be obtained under any system?—The *Sabha* is not in a position to give any decided opinion on the point.

Mr. *Stokes.*

Would you admit any one of any caste?—The successful men of whatever caste should be appointed, Brahmins or not; others might get in.

Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—The service should be recruited only from Natives of India, as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6.

Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or by both

Mr. *Stokes*—continued.

systems combined; and if by both combined, should one system be applied to all offices or classes of offices, or should the system be varied with the class of offices?—The recruitment should be by competition and nomination, and for this purpose the service should be divided into two branches. In the upper one the appointments down to the grade of Tahsildars, and requiring special training, should be filled (except in special cases, for providing suitable appointments to men of high and respectable families), by some competitive test to be prescribed by Local Government, and in the lower branch Government may nominate desirable persons, but a graded system should be introduced.

Whatever system be adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several administrations, only from persons resident in the territories under such administrations, respectively, or with a preference for such residents?—Whatever may be the system, the recruitment should, as a rule, be confined to all the permanent residents of the province.

If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service according as the posts are held by members of that branch of the Service, or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—The *Sabha* is of opinion that there should be some distinction maintained. A Native of India serving in his own country does not require to be so highly remunerated as foreigners.

WITNESS VIII.—11th January 1887.

Examination of AULAD HUSEIN, Khan Bahadur, C.I.E., Assistant Commissioner and Settlement Officer in the Central Provinces.

Aulad Husein, Khan Bahadur.

Munshi AULAD HUSEIN stated:—I am a Native of Agra. I have been forty-two years in the Government service. I have a son who is in the Statutory Service.

Is the existing system of appointing natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—I have not heard of general dissatisfaction against the Statutory Civil Service. The educated classes do not like the system of selection, for they think that the sons and relations of those who have influence with, and access to, higher authorities, are, as a rule, nominated. The Uncovenanted also, in their opinion, are kept back from promotion. Also dissatisfaction is felt, because the scale of pay is only two-thirds.

Vol. III. Sec. II. C. P.

Aulad Husein, Khan Bahadur.

Would you amend either the Statute or the Rules?—The Statute need not be amended, for it provides for the selection of only those who are of approved merit and ability. The nomination of all candidates should rest with Local Government, so that qualified candidates may be selected according to the exigencies of the service with due regard to the interest (as regards pay and pension) of such men as might be selected from the Uncovenanted Service. There is, however, one objection; those who are already in the Statutory Service will, in case of the promotion of Uncovenanted servants over their heads, have a grievance, this, however, may be remedied by placing the Uncovenanted servants in the lowest grade with a personal allowance to make up for their loss of pay, and it should at the same time be provided that the receipt of personal allowance will, to prevent loss at the time of pension, be reckoned as substantive pay of the person so situated, until he rises to post in the Statutory Service of which the pay and emoluments equal those enjoyed by him whilst in the Uncovenanted ranks.

Would you alter the definition of the term "Natives of India" in the Statute?—The term "Natives of India" is well defined in Statute 33 Vic., Sec. 6, and does not require to be further qualified. As to distinction of classes of persons, I would simply suggest the nomination of members of respectable family; and if they do not belong to the Uncovenanted Service, they should, on first nomination, be kept two years on probation, with the object of being trained either in the department to which they stand nominated, or in some public institution, or by attending any public lectures on general subjects and Law.

Would you require selected candidates for the Statutory Service to undergo training in England, or would you encourage them to do so?—It need not be made obligatory for Native Statutory or Uncovenanted Servants to proceed to England, but I should like their being encouraged to go.

Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—None are dissatisfied with the present rules for the competitive examination in England.

Do Natives of India labour under any, and, if so, what disadvantages in regard to the competition in England?—The Natives are laboring under certain disadvantages, the chief of which is the low limit of age and want of equalisation of maximum marks in classical languages. To rectify which I would propose—1. The age of twenty-two. 2. The re-adjustment of marks in equal numbers for all classical languages. 3. I would not advocate scholarships or pecuniary help of any other kind; but Government might give a helping hand in special cases. 4. The disadvantage based on caste prejudices is fast disappearing. The remedy for this disadvantage was to have the competitive examination in India and in England. But some of the provinces are not so far advanced in point of education as to induce me to propose it. 5. If the competitive examination is held also in India, the standard should be the same as in England. At the seat of every Local Government a certain number of appointments should be apportioned for competition to the candidates at the respective examinations, and the portion should be one-third, which should be divided between all the provinces without regard to the principal religious sects. But in such of the provinces as may be backward, and, therefore, fail to pass candidates Government may make nominations.

If an examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—The successful candidates in India should be encouraged rather than compelled to proceed to England.

Are the young Natives obtained under the existing system of the open competition in England the best as regards character and capacity who could be obtained under any system?—The native Competitionwallahs are, no doubt, men of superior abilities, and I have heard of no complaint against their character.

Why do you disapprove of competitive examination in India?—The provinces are not all ready for it, and there would have to be separate rules for each province.

Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—All natural-born subjects may enter the Uncovenanted Service with no distinction.

Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or by both systems combined; and if by both combined, should one system be applied to all offices or classes of offices, or should the system be varied with the class of offices?—The recruitment should be made by nomination and competition,

and one system should be observed for all offices not below the rank of Munsiffs and Tahsildars, or officers of equal position.

Whatever system be adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several administrations, only from persons resident in the territories under such administrations, respectively, or with a preference for such residents?—Whatever system be adopted, the recruitment should be made provincially from amongst the permanent residents, and also from those connected with the province.

If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes. This will entitle so many Uncovenanted servants to go up to the higher grade.

What do you mean by "natural-born?"—I mean all subjects without any exclusion.

Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service according as the posts are held by members of that branch of the Service, or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—The present scale of two-thirds is fair, because the salaries of the Statutory or Uncovenanted Civilians are not subject to deductions.

Should any distinction be made in the Furlough Rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches of the Service according to the nationality of the officer, or any other, and what ground?—I have no objection to urge, except that special leave for two or three years on fit allowances be given to such of the Statutory or Uncovenanted Civilians as declare their intention to proceed to England for higher culture.

Are the privileges in regard to pay, promotion and retiring annuity, and the general conditions of office belonging to the Covenanted Civil Service suitable to Natives obtaining office under the Statutory Rules?—It is enough for the promotion of Statutory Servants that the Covenanted Service be opened out to them if found fit. As to pension, the present rules may be allowed to continue, and, if health permits, the employé may be kept on to the age of sixty years.

Can you discharge the duties of a District Officer?—No; because I don't know English.

Was not your son in the Uncovenanted Civil Service at first?—He was two years Extra Assistant Commissioner.

Do men of family enter the Uncovenanted Civil Service willingly?—Yes; they were quite ready to enter it when there was no Statutory Service, and they don't object to do so now.

WITNESS IX.—11th January 1887.

Examination of ALI AHMED, of the Anjuman-i-Islamia of Jubbulpur.

Ali Ahmed.

ALI AHMED stated:—I appear on behalf of the Anjuman-i-Islamia of Jubbulpur. There are about fifty members, all Mahomedans, and all residents of Jubbulpur. Thirty-five members were present when our answers were determined on.

Is the existing system of appointing natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—Yes.

Are the defects of the existing system (if any) susceptible of remedy—(*a*) by an amendment of the Rules; (*b*) by an amendment of the Statutory provisions in that behalf; or should those provisions be repealed? If the provisions of the Statute 33 Vic., Section 6, are not repealed nor substantially amended so as to take away the power conferred on the local administrations, should they be amended in respect of the description of persons on whose behalf such powers may be exercised or in respect of the sanction required for appointments made thereunder?—No alteration is necessary, except that selection should be confined to men of high family.

If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so?—They might go if they liked. All classes of these Provinces, Brahmans, Chaittrias and Vais are ready to go. A Brahman Pleader has sent his two sons, and I have seen in the papers that a Kashmiri Pundit of high class said there was no objection. Subscrip-

Vol. III. Sec. II. C. P.

Ali Ahmed.

tions have been raised to send men who wanted to become barristers. No one whose education is sufficiently advanced to give him a chance of success objects. Those only object who would not succeed, and this would be the case if the examinations were held in India.

Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes. Dissatisfaction is felt with the age and subjects of examination. Arabic and Sanskrit should be marked higher, and Persian included. I would not have an examination in India. Very few Uncovenanted Officers are fit to be promoted to the Covenanted Civil Service. I am of opinion that none of them should be appointed as District Officers. I will not say that no Natives should be appointed, but I know of none fit to be appointed.

Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6, or from all natural born subjects of Her Majesty?—I would appoint Natives of India as defined in Statute. I would include children of domiciled European parents born during a temporary residence in England: but I would not include subjects of Feudatory States.

Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or by both systems combined; and if by both combined, should one system be applied to all offices or classes of offices, or should the system be varied with the class of offices?—By nomination only and for all classes of offices.

Whatever system be adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several administrations, only from persons resident in the territories under such administrations, respectively, or with a preference for such residents?—Provincially.

If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—I would give back the Statutory posts to Covenanted Civil Servants. Members of good family are willing to take Uncovenanted Civil Service appointments.

Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service according as the posts are held by members of that branch of the Service, or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—No difference should be made between Statutory and Covenanted. The distinction is invidious, and natives have to support their families.

I have nothing more to say.

WITNESS X.—11th January 1887.

Examination of Seth GOKALDAS BALABDAS, Rao Bahadur, Banker, Jubbulpur.

Seth Gokaldas Balabdas.

Seth GOKALDAS said he was a Banker, and Zemindar of 225 villages, and paid Rs. 50,000 annual revenue. His villages are in seven districts; and he has ten large branches of his Bank.

Is the existing system of appointing natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—Approved, except that instead of pure nomination I would have five or six nominations for appointments; the nominated candidates to compete. Their conduct and physical fitness should be considered. Their extraction should also be considered.

If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so?—It should be optional with candidates to go to England.

Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service? Should any, and if any, what change be made in that system?—The age should be raised to twenty-two or twenty-four.

Do Natives of India labour under any, and if any, what disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the Service?—The journey to England is a disadvantage, and there is a religious objection to it.

By what changes may those disadvantages be minimized or removed?—Urdu and Sanskrit are insufficiently marked. There should be an examination in India, as well as in England, identical and simultaneous, held at one centre. I would have only one list and selection in order of merit.

If an examination is held in India, should the successful candidates

be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—I would not compel, but would encourage, selected candidates to go to England.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

If there was an examination in India, what people are likely to succeed?—Bengalis and Madrasis would be most successful.

Would you object to the preponderance of such men?—The difficulty so arising might be removed by distribution of the appointments. People of all classes ought to be admitted to the examination; and it is not likely that men of this Province would all fail. If there were one hundred vacancies I would reserve two-thirds for Europeans; and part of the remaining third should be reserved for men of rank: the rest should be open to all.

Would you like a Native of India to be Deputy Commissioner in the district where you hold property?—I should not.

Why not?—Because Natives have not got the necessary strength of mind

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*—continued.

as they have not gone to England. I would object to Natives who had not gone to England until we are satisfied that people of that kind had attained to the necessary force of character.

What high appointments would you give Natives?—Judicial appointments and Assistant Commissionerships, and Accounts and Treasury work.

In old days of Hindu and Mahomedan rule, were rulers deficient in "himmat"?—They had not as much as is now needed.

Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—I would recruit from all natural-born subjects by competition; but it should be provincial, and the candidates should be nominated by the Local Government.

Would you pay Natives the same as Europeans?—A reduction of one-third should be made in the pay of natives of India, as compared with the pay of Covenanted Civilians.

WITNESS XI.—12th January 1887.

Examination of C. W. McMinn, Esq., of the Covenanted Civil Service; Deputy Commissioner, Jubbulpur, Central Provinces.

The *President.*

You are a Covenanted Civilian?—Yes.

Of how many years' standing?—I am in my twenty-fifth year.

You have served in the North-West and Oudh?—I have served in the North-West and Oudh and in the Central Provinces, and have been engaged in Settlement, Civil, Criminal, and Revenue works, and have been Deputy Commissioner of Jubbulpur for nearly three years.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

How long have you been in these Provinces?—Since 1879.

Before that you were in the North-West?—Yes. I was also on special duty for three years on the *Gazetteer* of Oudh, in Lucknow and Simla.

Is the existing system of appointing Statutory Civilians approved?—I think it might be improved.

Is it approved by the natives, do you think?—On that point my opinion is not of value.

Have you seen any of the Statutory Civilians either here or in the North-West?—Only in the Central Provinces:

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

one of them was my assistant for a short time.

Were you satisfied with him?—Decidedly. He was superior to the average of Uncovenanted men.

He is quite a young man, is he not?—Quite a young man.

How long had he been in the service?—Only about a year I think then.

Have you any objection to the system or to the Statute itself or to the Rules?—I have no objection to the Statute.

Have you any objection to the Rules or to the manner in which they are worked?—I have objections to the way in which they are worked.

Kindly state the objections which you have?—I think the proportion of one-sixth of the posts reserved for Covenanted Civilians which is assigned to the Statutory Service is insufficient; and I think that the men should certainly pass a strict examination. My own idea is that there should be a local service, consisting half of men selected by open competition for the

Vol. III. Sec. II. C. P.

C. W. McMinn, Esq.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

present; one-fourth of men appointed as the present Statutory Service is, only with an examination afterwards; and one-fourth of men promoted on account of approved service, from the Uncovenanted. I would retain the present home competitive service exactly as it is. I would take the upper layer, the best men of the present Uncovenanted Service, make them a Local Provincial service, and add to them a certain number by open competition, and a certain number recruited as is now done for the present Statutory Service; only compelling these last-mentioned persons to submit to an examination. I do not desire to frame a scheme; I only wish to indicate the principles on which I would act. I would give weight to family, also to competitive ability and to proved capacity in the Uncovenanted Service.

When you say that the present proportion of posts allowed to the Statutory Service is insufficient, what do you mean by being insufficient?—I think the present proportion is insufficient for many reasons. First, it is not sufficient to gratify the natural ambition of the natives of this country; and it is not sufficient to give a stimulus to education in the country by offering an honourable object of ambition; and I think it is insufficient for mere departmental reasons, for I consider the present Uncovenanted Service—I am sorry to say—very inefficient, indeed extremely inefficient. I have a very faint hope it would improve rapidly if the candidates for employment had such a stimulus—such an opening for ambition and inducement—to obtain education. I wrote a book upon the subject about seventeen years ago.

On what subject?—On the competitive service generally, and its superiority to the other services. On that point I have no reason to alter my mind.

In your experience of the Central Provinces, are there many men fit for these appointments, young men of good family and sufficient education?—In these Provinces none; in Oudh a good many.

In these Provinces could you point us out one man whom you could appoint if there were a vacancy to-morrow?—On two years' probation as Extra Assistant?

No, under the Statute to a Covenanted post?—One possibly; yes, I think I could point out one.

Of good family?—Yes, decidedly.

Of sufficient education?—I think so.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

What do you call sufficient education?—He knows English. I speak with great hesitation. I would enforce the Rules very strictly as regards the two years' probation.

One-quarter of the local service you would fill up in that way, and one-quarter from the Uncovenanted Service. I want to ask you if you think there are fit men in the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes, there are now fit men in the Uncovenanted Service to take charge of districts, both Natives and Europeans. A number of Uncovenanted Europeans have already taken charge of districts.

They are in the ranks of the Commission?—Yes, in the ranks of the Commission.

That is to say, the Europeans that you speak of are at present in the Commission?—Yes, in the Commission. Some of them have been so for years.

The *President*.

That is to say, in appointments usually filled by Covenanted Officers?—Yes, there are seven of them.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*.

In the present ranks of Extra Assistant Commissioners, out of which you propose to make so many appointments, are there now men fit for such promotion?—I think there are now one or two natives to whom I would gladly entrust small districts on trial. This could certainly be done without any risk.

One or two?—Yes, I have been only in three districts of these Provinces. Some of the men of best reputation I have not met. I am talking of men I have met.

Are there any Europeans among the Extra Assistant Commissioners you would appoint to a district?—At present I do not think so; none.

How do you reconcile these opinions with what you said, that you had the lowest opinion of the officers of the Uncovenanted Service?—I consider the latter very inferior as compared with the competitive service.

Of the Uncovenanted Service you have the lowest opinion?—Perhaps not *low*: it is a word I would rather not use; but I have a very inferior opinion indeed of them, as compared with competitioners.

Still there are gentlemen fit for promotion?—That is to say they would manage a district with safety to our administration and without disgrace. I do not say they would do as well as competition men, certainly not: but they

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

could do it tolerably well; and if they did get that promotion, much better men would come into the service—able men.

I understand you to say you do not want to alter the Statute in any way as to the definition of "Native of India" or otherwise?—I do not think so, provided it includes Europeans domiciled in the country, whether born in the country or not. I believe that is the dispute.

The *President.*

What do you mean by domiciled?—The sons of men permanently resident in the country.

The Act of 1833 does not say domiciled: it says resident?—Permanently resident.

No, the word is "resident." You want to limit it to domiciled Europeans. Do you deliberately prefer the restricted provisions of the Statute of 1870 to the wider words of the Statute of 1833?—Yes, certainly.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

If you select candidates from outside the service for appointments under the Statute, would you compel them to go to England or not for training?—It is a difficult question. I would rather not express an opinion, though I have thought a great deal over it.

Mr. *Ryland.*

You stated that there are Europeans in the Uncovenanted Service who have charge of districts and are now performing duties ordinarily performed by Covenanted officers.—Yes.

And you said they were performing those duties satisfactorily?—No.

Do you not think so?—I was not asked the question, I think.

Might I now ask it?—I think they discharge their duties sufficiently well, but they were never entrusted with large or important districts.

Do you think they are unfitted?—I do not think that any of the individuals, except one gentleman who is a Commissioner, are so well fitted for important districts as Covenanted officers.

Some that have hitherto been in the service of Government?—Uncovenanted men? Yes, I specially except one man within my knowledge in my seven years' experience of the Central Provinces. In Oudh there have been several of high qualifications.

I believe Uncovenanted Service men have held high positions in these Provinces?—Yes; three men have been Commissioners in Oudh and the Central Provinces.

Mr. *Ryland*—continued.

To what do you attribute the deterioration of which you now complain?—To a want of encouragement in a great measure. It would be dangerous, I think, to give them encouragement.

I mean Europeans who are domiciled or make India their home?—None of these three men was domiciled.

I am not drawing that distinction. I am talking of Europeans who take appointments here, and intend, as far as they can see, to remain in India?—I can only speak generally, that the class is very inferior.

Do you not think this class is increasing very much; the numbers of European officers who cannot keep their sons in England and who are bringing them out, for whom some position should be provided?—I admit the class is increasing, but I do not think places should be found for it in the interior of the country in the judicial and administrative service.

The *President.*

You think they ought not to be excluded from the local service?—Certainly; I perfectly admit that they ought to be admitted to the open competitive local service which I would propose to be a large expansion of the present Statutory Service. I should call it a Civil Service, *not* Uncovenanted Service, which is a word I hope will be abolished. The present Civil Service I would call the "Indian Civil Service." Each of the local services I would call the North-West Provinces Civil Service, the Central Provinces or the Bengal Civil Service, and so on.

Mr. *Nulkar.*

You would encourage European Uncovenanted Servants to get higher places?—I would rather not.

May I ask your reason for that?—I am afraid of jobbery for one thing.

Cannot that be guarded against by Rules?—I think it is absolutely impossible. There are all kinds of jobbery, some of a very mild description indeed.

Mr. *Stokes.*

Do I understand you to be of opinion that the actual number of Civil Servants should be reduced?—No; we have one man to each quarter of a million of the Indian population. I would not reduce it by a man.

How would you arrange? You take away half the appointments now held by Covenanted Civilians and hold them over to form your new service?—No, I did not say that. What I said was I would take away the upper layer of

Vol. III. Sec. II. C. P.

C. W. McMinn, Esq.

Mr. *Stokes*—continued.

the best men from the Uncovenanted Service, appoint them as a Provincial Covenanted Service; to repeat, I would appoint half of the men by open competition, a quarter from the Uncovenanted Service, a quarter from men of good families. I would aim at this proportion and make a new Provincial Civil Service. I did not say I would take away any men from the Covenanted Civil Service, not from this Province, not a man. I have been asking for years for more European assistants; you perhaps might spare some from the North-West, not from here certainly.

I do not quite understand you?—I am not saying where the money is to come from: I only state the principles on which I would make a new Provincial Civil Service, not an Uncovenanted Service.

The *President.*

In addition to the existing Civil Service, you would take half of the upper Uncovenanted Service?—No, I would premise that there are two things: one is to say, how the service should be ultimately constituted; the other is, how it is to be gradually recruited, and how the funds and appointments are to be provided. At present I am only looking to what I think should be the ultimate composition of this service: that it should be composed half of men chosen by open competition in India, a quarter chosen from good families, compelled to submit to examinations, and a quarter from the present Uncovenanted Service, men promoted for good work. I am not disposed to take away any men, certainly, out of this province: it cannot spare any competition men. In the first place these men would do the work which the Extra Assistant Commissioners are now doing badly—they could do it better.

If you take appointments now held by Covenanted Officers, you lose a number of appointments. Would you maintain the Covenanted Service at the present strength?—In the Central Provinces, certainly.

What is the encouragement you would hold out to the Provincial Service?—Of the same nature as the Uncovenanted Service has now: men are now taken out of the Uncovenanted Service and taken into the Covenanted, promoted to Deputy Commissionerships, so these men should have appointments left open to them.

Every appointment you make from the Uncovenanted Service to the Covenanted Service is depriving the Covenanted Service of one man?—I reduce not the number of the staff but the number of posts held by that staff. The number at present, say, is twenty, it would remain twenty; but there would not be so many Deputy Commissionerships among them perhaps. In this Province there are three which might be given over to natives if Natives showed themselves fit for them.

The *President*—continued.

What would you do with members of the Covenanted Civil Service ousted by that arrangement?—They would gradually retire.

How many districts are there?—Eighteen.

Suppose three were held by Natives, you would then have fifteen filled by Covenanted servants. The staff of the latter class would be three less?—No; some would remain as assistants. The two services should work abreast of each other. If there were a better man of the Uncovenanted Service, appoint him by all means. Several of us can go back to other provinces, or might be replaced by younger men.

Mr. *Stokes.*

Possibly you mean that in the special provincial service you would constitute you would include a great number of other appointments besides those with which we are now concerned—Police and other appointments?—Yes, Police and Education.

This will explain your scheme I think. In your Central Provinces Service you would include a great number of other appointments besides the ones we are now enquiring about?—That is not necessarily a part of it. At present men rise from the Uncovenanted Service to Deputy Commissionerships.

That would be a very expensive arrangement?—There would be an addition to the expenses admittedly, but our revenue is largely increasing I cannot describe the amount of bad work sometimes done in these Provinces in ordinary civil and criminal cases by many of the Tahsildars and Extra Assistant Commissioners. Expenses would certainly increase, but so would revenue, and the quality of work would improve.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

You said you would take 50 per cent. of the appointments and give them to the local Civil Service?—I never said that. I never said I would take 50 per cent.

The *President:* Mr. McMinn said he would create, in addition to the existing Civil Service, which he would maintain

The *President*—continued.

at the present strength, a local Service consisting half of men chosen by competition, one-fourth of men nominated, and one-fourth of men from the present Uncovenanted Service. This local Service would continue for the present to hold the posts that men now hold—that the Uncovenanted Service now hold—but they would be eligible, equally with the Covenanted Service, for posts held by the present Covenanted Service now.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

You would give them an opportunity of rising to the other Service?

The *President:* Mr. McMinn said he would retain his 200 men and create an additional 200 outside the Covenanted Service: the 200 to be recruited, 100 by competition, 50 by nomination, and 50 by selection from men of proved merit in the present Uncovenanted Service.

Witness: The principle is correctly stated, but I have not stated yet what, in my opinion, should be the numbers of the two Services.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

You say you think the limitation of one-sixth of reserved posts for Statutory Civilians insufficient and you would enlarge it, and in making that enlargement what is your principle? Is it in order to improve the administration?—For several reasons: one object is that of improving the administration, another that of gratifying the natives. I think the Uncovenanted Service would improve. I certainly think that this one-sixth of posts could not be filled as well as by competition men, certainly; but then I bear in mind the other posts in the Uncovenanted Service.

I want to know if you think it would tend to the improvement of the administration if a larger portion of men were appointed to the Statutory Service in order to fill those posts now filled by the Covenanted Service. I am not talking of other posts now filled by Uncovenanted men?—I cannot give an answer. My meaning is that the whole service of Government would be much improved, although that particular one-sixth of appointments might not be so well filled as formerly.

In order to improve the efficiency of the whole service?—This one-sixth might be allowed to deteriorate a little. Such is my opinion decidedly. I might add that the deterioration in that one-sixth would only be for the present: I expect no deterioration in the future.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*—continued.

In this Province there are no subordinate Judges: the work done elsewhere by subordinate Judges is, in this Province, done by Extra Assistant Commissioners?—And Tahsildars.

When Mr. Ryland asked you about Europeans in the Uncovenanted Service generally, had you in mind only those men who are now Extra Assistant Commissioners, or were you thinking of men included in the ranks of the Commission, that is men who became Covenanted officers?—I included the entire number of Uncovenanted men I have known occupying posts filled by Civilians, or men who were Magistrates and gazetted officers.

As to the Uncovenanted men in the Central Provinces, do you think they are below the average of men you have met in other provinces, or below the average of Native officers?—The men are about on a par. There are exceptional men—very good men—but the mass of them are very inferior indeed, to what competition men are. They are, in many cases, not fit for their appointments. I do not wish to say anything invidious. I have known sixty-six men in the last twenty-five years—eleven were very good men, all Europeans or Eurasians.

And the others?—Some of them extremely inferior: most of them very poor. I have taken notes for many years.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

Are you of opinion that Tahsildars in the Central Provinces are, in many instances, incompetent?—Very incompetent. I have no doubt about that whatever.

From what classes are they recruited?—Many of them have commenced service on Rs. 15 and Rs. 20 a month: very few indeed have been made Tahsildars or Naib Tahsildars at once; but now they are improving very much.

May I take it that the Tahsildars you have found incompetent were men who entered the service as clerks on low salaries?—Many of them.

Have you had a large experience of Tahsildars?—I suppose I have seen the work of at least twenty in my seven years in these Provinces.

Were the men whose work you condemn wanting in ability, or wanting in moral character?—I should say most of them were honest men, but many were wanting in ability, in simple capacity—that is to say, they could not try civil cases or criminal cases presenting any difficulty: they had no judicial acumen.

Vol. III. Sec. II. C. P.

C. W. McMinn, Esq.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

You tell us the class of Tahsildars is now improving ?—Yes, decidedly.

To what do you attribute the improvement?—To men being selected who are better educated and to their getting good appointments to commence with.

In your judgment, if you made selections for the office of Tahsildars from men of education, and induced men to enter the service by the offer of pay which would attract men of education, you would get better officers?—Decidedly; we are getting a much better class now.

And you also think promotions from the ministerial officers should be rarer ?—Certainly.

With regard to the civil judicial work, is that largely disposed of by natives in this Province?—Largely.

In your judgment is it well done?—Badly done where the work is at all difficult.

What class of officers are you now speaking of?—Extra Assistant Commissioners drawing Rs. 250, Rs. 400 and Rs. 600 a month.

From whom is that class of officers recruited?—Many of them have been Tahsildars; many of them have been recruited from the Education Department.

Have any been appointed from pleaders?—A few.

How is their work, compared with that of other judicial officers of the same class?—I cannot remember now that I ever had a pleader Extra Assistant.

Have you a strong Bar in the districts in these Provinces?—Excessively weak.

And in the principal towns ? Have you been serving at Nagpur as well as Jubbulpur?—No ; but I have served at Wardha, which has a large Bar.

Is that Bar weak ?—With exceptions, of course, decidedly weak.

Do you think it would be difficult to find, in these Provinces, a sufficient number of men of the Bar qualified to fill judicial appointments?—Very few. Government have appointed several.

You tell us you have had experience of Oudh ?—Yes, twelve years.

And you said you found in Oudh a considerable number of natives qualified for executive appointments ?—I said better qualified than in the Central Provinces : a larger number certainly. I suppose I may add that wherever I have gone in India, and have carefully watched the Bar, I have found Europeans leading the Bar at Lucknow, Agra, Benares, Allahabad, Jubbulpur, Nagpur, everywhere.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

Have you ever been to Nagpur?—I have often been to Nagpur certainly, and have been to the Courts.

Have you ever been to Nagpur in an official capacity ?—No, not in an official capacity.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

Is not that to be accounted for in some way by the circumstance that the codes of the country are published in English, and that Englishmen have access to a larger Law library in their own language than natives?—I do not think that accounts for it. That certainly is a factor. (Witness here gave instances of men leading the Bar). These gentlemen attained their place simply by superior brains. Such is my opinion. Of course what you mean is a consideration; but there are other considerations. The native lawyers are much more familiar with the natives and able to deal with witnesses better. Still the Europeans pass them.

Out of the Extra Assistants appointed since 1863 four have been pleaders?—I know of three who have been pleaders. I do not think I have met them personally.

Were they men very well qualified?—I would not like to express an opinion. I think they were ; but my opinion is not of value.

Are you aware of many instances of Bengalis being appointed to the Judicial Service in the North-West Provinces and Oudh?—Yes, and in the Central Provinces too.

Have you met the gentlemen appointed in the North-West ?—There were no Bengalis in Oudh in my time. I am not able to speak of Bengali Judges or Munsifs in the North-West and Oudh from experience. I expressed in my book a very high opinion of them.

Do you think it desirable in backward provinces to admit a certain number of men of other provinces who have had superior training in judicial work?—Only if you cannot expect to get good men in your own province.

But do you think it would be advisable to admit train in the Central Provinces?—No. This is a very backward Province, but I would have no more Bengali gentlemen here. Here the executive and judicial work is joined.

May I explain to Mr. Crosthwaite, that although I never served in Nagpur, I served for several years within forty miles of Nagpur and had some opportunities of observing the Bar at Nagpur.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service, that is by competition in England?—My opinion on that subject is worthless compared to Mr. Browning's, because the Natives do not speak to me confidentially about it. I would rather not give an opinion. The general feeling of Natives with regard to my own service are things they would not speak to me about.

Well, I ask you your opinion, whether in your own opinion the Natives of India labor under any disadvantage?—Certainly; the distance of London from India is a disadvantage, the age another, crossing the seas another (this is not a mere question of distance) because it involves cooking on boardship which they object to: they could go by rail anywhere.

Any others?—Of course there is another, very early marriages: a young man of eighteen can hardly go out of India and leave a young wife: that is a serious objection with natives. It is the early marriage which, in a great measure, hinders some from going. A boy marries, as a rule, at or before fourteen or fifteen and is fond of his wife at seventeen or eighteen, and cannot well leave her. Certain caste ceremonies are also an obstruction.

Would you make any changes?—I would raise the age by one year—it is now nineteen—to twenty: that is, to the completion of twenty. I would allow every one who had not completed twenty-one years to come up. Aristotle in his Politics makes the observation that men should not study much while they are growing. Men continue growing until they are twenty, therefore they should not study hard for competitive examinations so early. The reason why a larger number of the later men are so undergrown is, I think, not that examination interferes with their growth, but that men who have completed their bodily growth have a better chance in competing than young men.

What other alterations do you advocate?—I would certainly raise the marks for Sanskrit, but I would not put it on an equality with Greek and Latin. I would put it about half-way between German and Latin.

How many marks are now given to Sanskrit?—I think 375: it may be 500. They change marks so often.

How many to Greek?—I think now 850: it was only 500.

The Latin is 800?—I would not assign to Sanskrit so high marks as

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

to Latin, but certainly higher than German. I would give Sanskrit 600.

Any other change, for instance as to the place?—As to the place of examination I would retain the examination for the Indian Civil Service in London certainly, and for the Provincial Civil Service which I propose I would have one centre at Allahabad for the North-West and Punjab Provinces, and the Central Provinces; one for Bengal at Calcutta; and one for Bombay and Madras: that is three centres, for three divisions, giving a population of 60 or 70 millions to each. The examination for South India might be held alternately at Madras and Bombay.

Have you anything else to say about the Uncovenanted Service? Would you recruit it from Natives of India as defined in the Statute 33 Victoria, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—I think I answered that I would recruit it from the Natives of India, the same as regards the open competition in India, which should be open to all natural-born subjects.

Mr. *Stokes.*

If you raise the marks for Sanskrit, you would make it easier for a Hindu to pass?—Certainly.

But, on the contrary, it would be just the opposite for a Mahomedan?—I do not consider Persian and Arabic are to be compared with Sanskrit and Latin as regards utility in an Indian career. After all, Hindi is the language of the country, not Urdu.

Would you add Arabic and Persian?—I cannot express an opinion.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

As to the Pay and Furlough Rules, would you make any distinction in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service according as the posts are held by members of that branch of the service, or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches; or, under your scheme, would you make any difference in the pay of appointments according as they are held by the Covenanted Service or by members of your Provincial Service?—Where a European gets Rs. 100, a native should have Rs. 66 on an average. I think that is fair.

Would you make any distinction in the Furlough Rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches of the Service, according to the nationality of the officer or in any other and on what ground?—Certainly; Natives do not care so much for furlough as we

Vol. III. Sec. II. C. P.

C. W. McMinn, Esq.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

do, and do not need so much. They will also stay longer in the country. One reason why I would give 66 per cent. is that a Native will retire later: he will draw less monthly pay, but he will draw for more years. I am also decidedly of opinion that Government should be able to compel men to retire on graduated pensions earlier than at present, when it is the interest of the State that they should retire.

Mr. *Stokes.*

You have often in your experience found the desirability of that?—Yes.

What is your opinion of the relation of the Gonds to Brahmans in this Province?—The Gond population in this Province and the aboriginal population are nearly three millions, and, on the whole, certainly distinct from the Hindus in a marked degree; and the Native Officers would require to be either specially selected or specially watched in a district in which there are many Gonds. The estates of the Gonds and other illiterate zemindars have been rapidly passing into the hands of money-lenders, and in many cases the money-lender is the relative of some judicial or executive officer, the son or cousin: really, I am afraid the officer is himself the purchaser or part purchaser. I have made special investigations into the matter during several years.

Mr. *Stokes*—continued.

Mr. *Ryland.*

You said that the majority of the Europeans you have known in the Uncovenanted Service are decidedly inferior to Covenanted Officers, do you judge merely from educational tests or from the result of their work in the way of appeals, &c.?—I judge partly from appeals; but that is not quite a reliable test. I am, I think, perfectly impartial myself in this matter, and I am also perfectly certain of it. Some two months ago I wanted to select the record of a trial in a criminal case as a model to send round to all my subordinates who are of ten, twenty, thirty and forty years' standing in the Uncovenanted Service, I had to select one tried by the Assistant Commissioner, a competitive Civilian of two years' standing!

WITNESS XII.—12th January 1887.

Examination of J. W. Neill, Esq., of the Covenanted Civil Service, Commissioner, Jubbulpur Division, Central Provinces.

J. W. Neill, Esq.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

You are Commissioner of Jubbulpur?—I am.

How long have you served in this Province?—For twenty-one years; the whole of my service, except one year which was passed in Calcutta.

You held the post of Secretary to the Chief Commissioner?—Yes, for six or seven years.

You were Deputy Commissioner?—No, I was not; I was Assistant Commissioner. I was not Deputy Commissioner at all. I have been a Commissioner for nearly ten years. I was Judicial Commissioner for more than a year—on two separate occasions.

Is the existing system of appointing natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—It is approved, I think, by some; by others it is not. It is certainly approved by those who have a chance of being appointed, or who think they have a chance. It is not approved by those who think they ought to have everything to themselves; that is to say, by the so-called educated natives it is not approved.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

On what ground?—On the ground that they have less chance of being appointed than some persons whose superiors in education they think themselves to be.

Do you approve of it?—I do not.

Will you state your grounds of disapproval?—I approve of the Statute: I disapprove of the Rules.

Why do you disapprove of the Rules?—Because in my opinion it is very desirable that, as the Statute declares, natives of proved merit and ability should be appointed to posts held by officers of the Covenanted Civil Service; I do not think that persons should be appointed to lower posts of that service as members of that service.

Are they appointed now as members of the service?—It is generally understood so. I am not prepared to say they are not. It is certainly understood that they form part of the service: that is the general understanding.

Have you not heard that by the orders of the Government of India they are not to be considered members of

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

the service, but merely appointed to posts reserved for the Covenanted Service ?—I cannot say I have.

In what way do you wish the Rules should be amended ?—I would bring the Rules into accordance with the Statute, and appoint Natives of proved ability and experience.

How can such merit and ability be proved ?—I would generally appoint from the Uncovenanted Service.

Do you wish to alter the Statute in any way, as to definition or otherwise ?—No, I think not.

Would you compel persons appointed to posts under the Statute to go to England for training ?—No, I would not.

Would you encourage them to do so ?—I would offer no encouragement.

The *President.*

Does the Statutory system secure men who, in point of ability or education, are superior to the best men in the Uncovenanted Service in the upper ranks ?—We have only had two appointed here : one two years ago, the other a year ago I think. It is almost impossible to speak from so limited an experience; but I should say, judging simply from the two examples, it does not, and, if I may add it, I do not see why it should.

You would not alter the Statute. Would you not like to see Natives of Feudatory States made eligible ?—I presume they are excluded as not being subjects of Her Majesty. I should like to see them included. That would require a modification of the Statute, and so far I should not object to its being modified.

Are there at present in the Uncovenanted Service any large number of men who have proved their merit and ability in such a way that you would, if you could, appoint them to Statutory appointments ?—I think there are some that might be appointed to lower posts that are ordinarily reserved for the Covenanted Service.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

You say there are men in the Uncovenanted Service fit for promotion to covenanted posts ?—I say some men in the Uncovenanted Service.

Do you mean men already in the ranks of the Commission or amongst the Extra Assistant Commissioners ?—I was thinking of only one officer already in the ranks of the Commission: he belongs to the Uncovenanted Service: he is not in the Statutory Service. There are men that could be appointed to certain posts, but I do not think there are many.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

Would you rank Deputy Commissionerships among those posts ?—I am not sure that I am prepared to recommend any Uncovenanted Service officers, with the exception of those already in the Commission, for appointment as Deputy Commissioners.

The *President.*

The Statutory Service is very small in this Province ?—It is, there are only two such officers.

The recruitment is ·43 per annum ?—Yes.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

As the Central Provinces Commission is constituted, there would be no posts to which you could appoint such a man except to Deputy Commissionerships and the Small Cause Courts ?—Yes ; Assistant Commissionerships, Commissioner of Excise, Superintendent of Stamps, and such appointments as that ; and there are appointments in the Settlement Department.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

Are there no small districts of which you think some gentlemen in the service, not Military Officers or Covenanted Civilians, could be put in charge ?—We have some districts in which there are certain Uncovenanted men acting, but they are in the Commission.

Are there any men in the service, not being members of the Commission, who might be appointed to the charge of districts ?—I could not exactly recommend any.

Whence were obtained the men, not being Covenanted Civilians, officers of the Staff Corps, or Statutory Civilians, at present serving in the Central Provinces Commission ?—They were obtained from the Uncovenanted Service.

What would prevent the obtaining such men in the future ?—Nothing, in these Provinces.

Mr. *Ryland.*

Have you found the work of those officers generally satisfactory and efficient: I mean the work of those Uncovenanted men who have been appointed to the Central Provinces Commission ?—Yes. You are speaking of the whole body of Uncovenanted officers, I presume.

Generally of the whole body, but especially of those in charge of

Vol. III. Sec. II. C. P.

J. W. Neill, Esq.

Mr. *Ryland*—continued.

districts ?—Very few are in charge of districts.

Have you had experience of their work?—I have.

Has that work been done as efficiently as by their *confrères* in the service generally ?—I think so.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

Can you say whether any dissatisfaction is felt with the existing system of recruitment to the Covenanted Civil Service ?—I think dissatisfaction is felt with regard to the age at which the competition is held.

On what grounds ?—On the ground that the maximum age is fixed too low.

Is it that the men come out too young, or that the chances of the Natives in the competition are diminished by the low maximum age ?—On both grounds.

On any other ground ?—No: these have been the main ones. I know of no other ground.

Do you think the Natives of India labor under any disadvantage in competing ?—Naturally: as they have to compete at a distance from home; secondly, the examination is conducted in a foreign language. These are the main disadvantages.

Would you make any change in order to remove those disadvantages ?—I would raise the maximum age. I would do nothing else.

Would you alter the subjects of examination or the number of marks given to a particular subject ?—I do not remember what is given to Sanskrit. 600 I think are the marks for Latin. I would not object to the marks for Sanskrit being raised to 600 : otherwise I would make no change. If the marks for Sanskrit were raised to that standard, I should hold that the examination should include Sanskrit literature and antiquities. I would not have simply a language examination.

You have studied Sanskrit yourself ?—Some years ago I did. I cannot pretend to any good knowledge of it now. I passed the high proficiency examination in Sanskrit. I merely mention this to show that I know something about it.

Would you hold an examination in India simultaneously with an examination in England ?—Certainly not.

Mr. *Nulkar.*

You said you would raise the age limit for the competitive examination. To what maximum would you advance it?—I would be willing to raise

Mr. *Nulkar*—continued.

the age to twenty-one, which I think quite sufficient, and I would insist on one year's residence in England afterwards, for training, as was required in former days.

Mr. *Stokes.*

You said you would certainly not have an examination in India?—Certainly not.

Why not ?—Because the Covenanted Civil Service of India must mainly consist of Englishmen. If it is necessary to reduce the number of appointments held by the Covenanted Service let them be reduced ; but I consider that the appointments made in England are the appointments for Englishmen.

The *President.*

Is the existing system of competitive examination in England favourably looked upon by the Natives of these Provinces?—I do not think they have any very strong opinion on the subject, one way or another.

Do they go readily to England ?—Certainly few have gone as yet, but more are going. One gentleman of the Uncovenanted Service, an Extra Assistant Commissioner, went and was called to the Bar. He went twice in the space of two years. He is now a barrister and he is still in Government service as an Extra Assistant Commissioner. One Native gentleman, a pleader, sent his two sons home to study for the Bar ; and another gentleman, recently acting as Judge of the Small Cause Court at Nagpur, sent his son home to compete for the Civil Service, so that the numbers are gradually increasing.

Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited from Natives of India as defined in the Statute?—Appointments to posts reserved to the Covenanted Service should be confined to Natives as defined by the Statute, but as for the Uncovenanted Service I would have it open to all Her Majesty's subjects.

Would you recruit by competition or by nomination, or by both systems combined?—I would recruit by nomination.

Tahsildars and Extra Assistant Commissioners?—By nomination.

Would you have any educational test?—If it were thought desirable ; but I can scarcely imagine that persons insufficiently educated would be appointed.

Would you recruit only from persons resident in the Province, or permanently connected with the Province,

The *President*—continued.

in accordance with the existing orders; or would you recruit all over India?—I would give preference to persons born in the Province or who live in the Province.

Do you approve of the existing orders on the subject?—I do.

If the power of appointing to posts in the Statutory Service was taken away, would you give the appointments now reserved to that service—under the Statute—to the Uncovenanted Service or throw them back to the Covenanted service?—It is difficult to answer the question in that way; but I should like to put it in this way: reduce the Covenanted Service to the smallest limits thought safe; then, the remaining posts would naturally fall to the Uncovenanted Service.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

As Secretary you were well acquainted with the method in which the Uncovenanted Service, *i.e.* Extra Assistants and Tahsildars, was recruited. Can you tell me from what classes those officers were mostly selected?—A great number of men were brought in from the Education Department.

All the appointments are made by the Chief Commissioner, are they not?—Yes; all appointments of Tahsildars and Extra Assistant Commissioners are made by the Chief Commissioner on the recommendation of Commissioners, Deputy Commissioners, and Heads of Departments.

How many men were appointed from the Education Department?—A good many from the Education Department were appointed Extra Assistant Commissioners and Tahsildars, and some persons who had been Naib Tahsildars and were brought up in the vernacular offices.

In this Province are there not officers called Clerks of the Court?—There are.

What sort of men are they?—Clerks of the Court are some of the most responsible officers we have: they are paid from Rs. 120 up to Rs. 200.

Do they know English as a rule?—They must know English to do their duty properly.

Are they generally good men?—Generally they are the best men we have. I don't say all; but certainly some of them are.

Have many of them been appointed Extra Assistant Commissioners?—A very great number, and some Tahsildars.

Can you give, roughly, an idea of the duties of a Clerk of the Court?—A Clerk of the Court has to supervise the

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

whole of the vernacular establishment of the Deputy Commissioner's and Commissioner's offices; he is also the principal ministerial officer in the Deputy Commissioner's Court; he receives plaints, distributes the work, sees it is properly done, and supervises all the Court officials.

Does he generally acquire some acquaintance with the law?—He is required to pass the same Departmental Examination as Extra Assistant Commissioners and junior Covenanted and Uncovenanted officers.

How many Divisions have you served in?—I have held charge of two Divisions, Nagpur and Jubbulpur. I have, as Judicial Commissioner, visited all the other divisions—in fact every district—having to examine the offices and the work of the officers.

As a Judge, have you exercised both appellate criminal and civil powers?—I have.

What is your opinion of the work generally done by Extra Assistant Commissioners?—I think that on the whole the work is generally fairly done, and that if officers were not so hard-pressed for time, had not so much work to do, they would do much better still.

As to Tahsildars?—I should give the same opinion. I think their work is pretty fairly good; but the work of a Tahsildar is multifarious. I don't think the same results can be expected from Tahsildars as you would expect from a judicial officer who has only one kind of work. The work is certainly very heavy, but not greater in later years. By the appointment of additional Tahsildars an attempt was made to relieve Tahsildars of their civil judicial work. These additional Tahsildars do nothing but judicial work.

Have you had much experience of the pleaders and other members of the Bar?—I see a great deal of the Bar.

What is your opinion of their qualities?—I think some of the members of the Bar are very able men indeed, especially at Nagpur. I think some of the men there are as good as any I have met elsewhere in India: Natives I am speaking of. I have had before me gentlemen who come from Bombay and also from Allahabad, and I think some of the members of the Bar at Nagpur were quite their equals. One member of the Bar at Nagpur has been appointed to the Small Cause Court. He is probably the leader of that Bar.

Vol. III. Sec. II. C. P.

J. W. Neill, Esq.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

Do you know of any cases of pleaders being appointed Extra Assistant Commissioners ?—Personally I know three gentlemen who have been so appointed.

Are you satisfied with their qualifications ?—I am satisfied with them ; but they are not superior to the other Extra Assistant Commissioners.

Do you get men of fairly high family in the Uncovenanted ranks ?—We do. If I may be allowed to explain, I think we are getting more men of that kind now than we did before, simply because education is spreading : there are more facilities, and men of high family have now availed themselves of them.

When you first came to the Province there was great difficulty in procuring such men ?—When I joined the Province the men who monopolized most of the offices were from the North-West, and of the Kyast caste.

If a competitive examination was held in India for the Uncovenanted or Covenanted posts, do you think men of these Provinces would have a fair chance of success ?—I think not: a very poor chance of success.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

Why do you think that they would have a poor chance of success ?—Because I think the facilities for education in other provinces are greater. We are a poor province. Here we cannot afford to spend much money on high-class education ; but in the North-West, Bengal, Madras and Bombay they spend much more money than we can afford.

May I take it that you mean that men are more highly educated in other provinces ?—Fewer men are so highly educated in these provinces. Our College in Jubbulpur is probably as successful as any College in the North-West or even in Bengal; but the number of well educated men turned out is comparatively fewer.

What do you mean by men of good family ? Men of respectable family, or men who have local influence ?—Men of influence.

Chiefs, such as the Maharaja of Rewa, the Maharaja of Benares ?—We have not men of that standing here.

Whom then do you call men of influence here—the heads of classes ?—They are heads of families.

The *President.*

Are any of the Bhonsla family in our service ?—No, none of the Bhonsla family. There is a man of considerable ability, the head of a family, Rai Lutchman Ram at Saugor, whose nephew has been appointed an Extra Assistant Commissioner of these Provinces. He is one of the Saugor Mahrattas. I would also mention the name of Shunkar Rao Chitnavis, who belongs to an excellent Mahratta family.

Are there any others ?—May I glance over the Civil List ? (Refers.) Another man recently appointed is Trimbuck Rao Nilkant Deshmukh, of Nagpur, whose ancestor held a distinguished office under the Mahratta Government years ago—I cannot say what. His father was a Tahsildar in these Provinces.

Are there any others of this class who have been appointed of late years? —There have not been so many vacancies.

Are the gentlemen referred to by you men of good education ?—Of the gentlemen I mention, two are graduates.

Would not these gentlemen have entered the service, even if you had competition in these Provinces for appointments ?—They might have entered, but if they had had to compete with candidates from the whole of India their chances would have been less. If they had had to compete with men of these Provinces they might have held their own.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

You say the work of the Extra Assistant Commissioners is in your opinion fairly good ?—I think it is.

Also of the Tahsildars ?—I think it is.

Were you speaking of criminal or civil work ?—I am speaking of both.

You do not agree with Mr. McMinn that the work is not done well, especially criminal work ?—I think Mr. McMinn sets up too high a standard. Mr. McMinn might object to the manner in which the cases are prepared or got up.

What is the reason ?—Haste probably. I have seen defects in the work. I have often had to point them out.

If there is haste, is there not the danger of convicting an innocent person ?—It is rather haste in writing and carelessness of formalities.

You consider there is carelessness in writing judgments rather than in dealing with witnesses ?—Yes. The evidence is taken by every Criminal and Civil Judge in his own handwriting.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

It is never taken down by clerks ?—Never.

Have you received any complaints as to the character of the Bench in these Provinces ?—I have had complaints made of individuals, but I have no reason to believe those complaints were well-founded.

Have you examined them ?—I have frequently examined the complaints and have not found reason to think they were well-founded. I refer to anonymous complaints.

I am speaking now of complaints made by responsible persons ?—Very few such complaints are made.

Have you heard the opinion expressed that officers appointed from the Amlah class are less free from suspicion of malpractices than those appointed directly to the post of Tahsildar ?—I cannot say I have heard that. I think that great care is now taken in appointing persons from the class of Amlah to the post of Tahsildar. It was formerly necessary to do that because they were the only available material, but the practice now is to appoint a young man first as Naib-Tahsildar, then he works his way upwards. There are various grades of Tahsildars, and a man may serve many years, receiving periodical promotion, before he reaches the highest grade.

You think there is no foundation for the opinion expressed, I think by a witness yesterday, that a certain number of unrecognized perquisites are taken in the Courts ?—It is difficult to get the Natives of the country to believe that any practice of that kind, which formerly existed, has now ceased to exist, but there is no reason to believe it exists to any extent. I think such cases are now extremely rare.

You think no irregular payments are made to Tahsildars ?—I think not.

Nor to the Ministerial officers of the Tahsil ?—I should think not. There may be some, but we can never discover it. Your question had reference mainly to the officials appointed from Ministerial offices to those offices. I should like to add that such complaints as have been made with regard to officials receiving bribes or presents have more frequently been made with regard to higher officers than Tahsildars.

I am speaking of officials promoted from the Amlah class ?—Exactly : with regard to them I do not know I have ever heard complaints.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

In connexion with Sir Charles Turner's question, do you know of any case where men have retired from the service as Tahsildars or Extra Assistant Commissioners, with large fortunes, or with fortunes disproportionate to the amount of their salaries ?—I have been in this Province for about twenty-one years, and with regard to men who were appointed before, I may state most of them were foreigners, most of whom have gone away to their own countries. I do not know if they retired with large fortunes. Of persons appointed recently I do not know of any one who has retired.

Do you know the means of the men now named in the list ?—Of very few only.

Have they made fortunes which seem large for persons in their position in life?—I could not say I am aware of it. I am personally acquainted with almost every man in the list.

With regard to the Treasury work of the Province, what officers do the Treasury work ?—An Extra Assistant Commissioner generally holds the post of Treasury officer. There are so few Europeans that I should say Natives generally hold the Treasuries.

Where are the Cantonments ?—At Saugor, Jubbulpur, Hoshungabad, Raipur and Kamptee.

Who does the Treasury work there ?—At Jubbulpur a Native officer has been doing it till quite recently, when a European officer relieved him. Until within the last six weeks a Native officer held the post for fifteen or sixteen years. At Saugor a European holds the post, an Extra Assistant Commissioner who has been there for the last two or three years ; before him it must have been a Native, I cannot recall him, but it must have been, because he was not an Assistant Commissioner. At Nagpur a Native official is in charge, and at Hoshungabad a Native is in charge.

Have you found any difficulty in having Natives in charge?—Certainly not. There are six European Magistrates of the Uncovenanted Service now among the Extra Assistant Commissioners.

Do you think, as a rule, they are better than Native Extra Commissioners ?—No, I will not say better : in some respects they are more useful, in others not so useful.

Of those now in the ranks, do you think any of them fit to hold districts ?—Certainly not.

Vol III
Sec. II.
C. P.

J. W. Neill, Esq.

The *President.*

You said you would have a system of nomination for the Uncovenanted Service; would you impose any restrictions in regard to age, good family, influence, intellectual attainments, &c.?—With regard to age the general rule is that no one should be appointed to the Government service after the age of twenty-five, unless for exceptional reasons, which apparently must be stated.

Would you appoint at fifteen?—No; I should not appoint below twenty-one.

And with regard to educational qualifications, would you leave the Government a free hand?—I would. I think my experience justifies me in saying Government might be left free.

Have you a sub-divisional system here, separate from the district?—Not in the sense in which the word is understood in the North-West or Bengal. We have one or two sub-divisions, but the powers of sub-divisional Officers are not so great. We have a Native Extra Assistant Commissioner in charge of a sub-division at Berhampur: his work is satisfactory. His work is not of the same kind as a Deputy Commissioner: he has not the same powers as sub-divisional officers in Bengal, nor is it the same kind as a Deputy Commissioner's. He gets orders on every matter of any importance. He is like a Magistrate at an out-station.

Mr. *White.*

Do you not think that a man's efficiency and independence of character come out if he is a man of ability, respectability, and so forth, when he is put into a position of responsibility?—Undoubtedly.

Mr. *Ryland.*

You have said those persons, Europeans and Eurasians, now in the service, are not fit to be put in charge of districts. Do you think they are of inferior stamp to those who formerly used to be appointed to the Uncovenanted Service?—We were speaking, I think, just now of Extra Assistant Commissioners, not of the Uncovenanted Officers generally.

I think you were asked if there were any Europeans or Eurasians in the service?—I was asked if there were any among the Extra Assistant Commissioners. There are some men in the service not Extra but Assistant Commissioners: of these one or two are in charge of districts I said there were one or two who performed their work well. I was asked whether European or Eurasian Extra Assistant

Mr. *Ryland*—continued.

Commissioners could be appointed as Assistant Commissioners, and I said not. There is only one of any standing in the province: he is considerably more than fifty-five years of age, and it certainly would be too late now to think of appointing him to the charge of a district. All the others have been recently appointed, but I do not think that even these are actually fitted by training and education to hold charge of a district.

The *President.*

Are they Europeans or Eurasians?—It is very difficult to distinguish between Europeans and Eurasians.

Are they not Natives of India in the Statutory sense?—Of those appointed since 1879, all are Natives of India in the Statutory sense.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

As to Pay and Furlough Rules, should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service according as the posts are held by members of that branch of the service, or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—I think it is only reasonable to make such a difference.

How much difference would you make, and on what principle?—I think the difference made in the present rules framed under the Statute might be accepted as reasonable. That some difference ought to exist, I am quite certain. I would make it on this principle, that you must pay higher for Europeans than you pay for Natives, and for Europeans recruited in a particular way.

In the Railways and other departments, are Europeans as a rule paid more than Natives for the same kind of work?—I will not say for the same quality of work.

Is a European engine-driver paid the same as a Native driver?—I am not prepared to say that. I do not know.

Should any distinction be made in the Furlough Rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches of the service according to the nationality of the officer or on any other and what ground?—I have practically explained my wish that the Statutory Service should cease as a service, and that being the case, I think that officers who belong to the Uncovenanted Service should get the furlough to which they are now entitled under the present rules.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

Although you appointed men to posts ordinarily reserved for the Covenanted Service, you would not give them the same furlough ?—Certainly not ; they should also be entitled to the same allowances on furlough as officers ordinarily appointed to the Uncovenanted Service.

Have you ever felt it desirable to be able to pension any one of your subordinates before it was permissible to do so under the rules ?—I have.

On many occasions ?—Half-a-dozen occasions I might say.

The *President.*

Is there anything you wish to add ? —I would merely add with reference to this question that a number of officials appointed in former days were not Natives of these Provinces : some were hard bargains whom I should have been glad to have pensioned, some have gone recently ; and that is why I said there were half-a-dozen cases in which I should have liked to pension subordinates.

You recruit for your Covenanted Service on a strength of forty-five : that is, the number given in the return. In the return of 1887 sent for the Central Provinces the number is put down at fifty-eight. Can you explain that ? —If you turn to the list you will find we have a number of Deputy Commissioners, Assistant Commissioners, and Supernumerary Assistant Commissioners. I have no papers with me now, but I believe the fact is that when the Central Provinces Commission was formed it was proposed that there should be only a certain number of Deputy Commissioners and Assistant Commissioners ; but it was impossible to carry on the work with that number, and therefore a number of officers were appointed as Supernumerary Assistant Commissioners, and up to to-day these remain. They are fewer than they used to be, but still there is a great number. The result is that two months ago, of all Assistant and Supernumerary Assistant Commissioners on the list, only seven were doing the work of Assistant Commissioners, and, of these, four were under two years' standing. Eighteen was the number of Deputy Commissioners fixed by the Government of India in 1881, and eighteen is the number given in this return.

Mr. *Ryland.*

Are there any districts that in your opinion might be held by well-educated Natives ?—Any one of the districts might be held by a Native who was competent.

But a Native such as you would get in the Statutory Service of sufficient experience ?—Possibly ; I could not undertake to say : it would depend on the individual, not on the district. Of course, a lighter and a smaller district could be more easily held by one of these gentlemen, but it depends upon the individual rather than the district.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

Have you no Natives to whom you could entrust the charge of a district in these Provinces ?—I mentioned already that I know one.

The *President.*

Are there none of the districts in these Provinces in which there are large cantonments ?—Three : Jubbulpur, Nagpur, and Saugor.

Are those of the same class as the others in respect to the desirability of having Natives or Europeans in charge ? —It might be desirable to have a European in charge of those districts, but if a Native was found fit to have charge I think he would get on perfectly well.

How many districts in the Central Provinces are there in which there is only one European officer ?—I should say that in fourteen districts out of eighteen there is only one European officer, that is the Deputy Commissioner. The Deputy Commissioner has no European Assistant. Very great difficulty has arisen in consequence. The result is that when an officer wants leave he is sometimes refused it.

Would there have been any difficulty if there had been Natives in the district to whom it would have been permissible for you to make over charge of the district?—There is nothing, so far as I know, to prevent the Chief Commissioner allowing a native to assume charge of a district.

Could you do so without the sanction of the Secretary of State?—For the Central Provinces, I think so.

Suppose you had it in your power to put an Extra Assistant Commissioner in charge of a district, would this difficulty have been in any sense mitigated?—It would to some extent.

We come now to sub-divisional officers. Your numbers have risen from nine to twenty-five ; the cadre on which you recruit sub-divisional officers consists of six Assistant Commissioners of more than two years' service, and three Cantonment Magistrates, that is nine : that is the number calculated by

Vol III. Sec. II. C P.

J. W. Neill, Esq.

The *President*—continued.

the Government of India. You now make it up to twenty-five. You put down—

Assistant Commissioners	3
Second Grade	4
First Grade	5
And you create Assistants Supernumerary	11
Cantonment Magistrates	2

that is twenty-five?—I am afraid I could not answer that without reading the numbers through.

The question is with regard to these twenty-five Assistant Commissioners: could not a considerable number of Natives be substituted?—I think not. The European officers of the Commission are reduced to the very lowest limit.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

Were you in this Division in 1885?—For a portion of the time.

Do you remember Mr. Carey was sent to take charge of Seoni?—Yes; he was an officer of two years' service. He came out in December 1882. Before Mr. Carey took charge, and until he joined, the Civil Surgeon was put in charge for a few days.

Mr. *Ryland.*

Then he was an European?—There

Mr. *Ryland*—continued.

was no other European and only one Native Assistant in the district.

The *President.*

You say there are none of these appointments that could be properly taken by Natives?—I think not.

Then are you aware that that cadre of forty-five appointments includes the one-sixth which ought to be filled by Statutory Natives?—That is, there will be one-sixth so filled in the future.

You say there are none of the appointments that could be filled by natives under the rules?—I disapproved of the rules altogether and the proportion in the rules. I approve of the Statute, but not of the rules. We have reduced the number of European officers in the Central Provinces as low as we can.

Then you do not think the Covenanted cadre ought to be recruited in the Central Provinces even up to one-sixth from Natives of India?—No. At the time when the cadre was fixed I remonstrated on the subject.

Do you wish to give evidence on any other point or to suggest anything more?—I have no wish to offer any suggestions.

WITNESS XIII.—12th January 1887.

Examination of B. M. Greamy, Esq., Extra Assistant Commissioner. Entered the Uncovenanted Civil Service in April 1871 as European Constable, Jubbulpur Police. Promoted to Inspector, and acted as District Superintendent of Police, and in January 1882 was made Extra Assistant Commissioner. Has served in several districts. Is a European British subject and a Native of India under the Statute. Confines his statement to the Uncovenanted Civil Service.

B. M. Greamy, Esq

I would recruit the Uncovenanted Civil Service from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty by competition among nominees. I would do so for Extra Assistant Commissioners and Tahsildars, and would promote Tahsildars without competition, but after passing departmental tests. The recruitment should be provincial. but I would not absolutely exclude men of other provinces. I would retain power for the Government to promote men of proved ability to posts in the Covenanted Service.

Mr. *White.*

What do you mean by natural-born subjects?—Any subject who makes India his permanent home. The people of the province should have the preference.

Mr. *Ryland.*

Would you retain the Statutory Ser-

Mr. *Ryland*—continued.

vice?—I would abolish it, because it is unsatisfactory; and I would give the posts to the Uncovenanted Civil Service.

Mr. *Nulkar.*

Would you include or exclude European British subjects not domiciled in the province?—I would exclude them if they were not permanent residents. Europeans from England require more pay and more leave. Among other things they lose by exchange.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

Would you pay an English bootmaker more because he lost by exchange?—No, I should not.

Is it not the principle that you must pay the market price for an article?—Yes, English Civilians must be paid higher.

WITNESS XIV.—12th January 1887.

Vithal Rao.

Examination of VITHAL RAO. Has been twenty-one years in the Central Provinces, and five in Government Service in Bombay. Is now in the 3rd Grade. Was appointed from the Education Department. Was Clerk of the Court for some time, and also in the Commissioner's Office. Appointed Extra Assistant Commissioner in 1879.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

The Statutory system is not approved by the educated classes, but is approved by the nobility or high classes. Educated classes are excluded by one of the conditions (high birth) being wanting. Educated classes belong to the middle, not highest classes. We have two Statutory Civilians and one of them, though of good family, is not quite satisfactory. I would call him educated. He is of better family than the other. I would both retain the Statutory system and have open competition for the Covenanted Service. I would leave the Statute alone. But if we get greater access to the Covenanted Service I would have the Statutory Service thoroughly amended, and manned partly by nomination and partly by open competition. I would not compel selected men to go to England: it should be optional. It is good to go to England, but there are many obstacles in the way, such as caste, religion and expense. The religious obstacles are very great with all castes of Hindus, but I don't think they apply to Mahomedans. The objections are reviving, not decreasing, since the appearance of the Theosophical Society. They have created a great regard for our ancient Shastras. These are now being studied, and we are thereby convinced that our manners and customs are the best. Many are of that opinion. Formerly people did not read their own Shastras: many now do.

Mr. *White.*

Some Europeans and Americans are at the head of the Theosophists.

Mr. *Nulkar.*

When I speak of Theosophy having this influence, I speak of the whole of India generally, and not of the Central Provinces only. I know it because I have talked with friends, and our newspapers tell us. These friends are from all parts, and I have met them in many places. Those who study the Shastras more than formerly are those who have received an English education. They are in all parts. This study strengthens the objection to crossing the sea. I say so from my own experience, which is mainly in the Central Provinces. I do not know of any young man who but for the Theosophists would have gone to England. I am not a Theosophist.

Mr. *Stokes.*

I have objections to go to England myself, and know the texts against it. They are in the *Bhagavat Gita.* One is, "One should rather die in his own religion." (Writes it for verification.)

स्वधर्मे निधनंश्रेयं, परधर्मोभयावह:

"It is well to die in one's own religion.
"Another's religion causes fear."

Mr. *Nulkar.*

Does not the word *Dharm* in the text signify duty and not religion?—It does not only signify duty, but religion also.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

No dissatisfaction is felt with the mode of recruitment for the Civil Service. I would make no changes. Natives labour under two disadvantages—examinations are held in England, and Natives are prohibited by caste and the expense from going thither. Secondly, the limit of age is too low. Sanskrit and Arabic should be raised to the same position as Latin. I would hold the examination in India at different centres. It should be simultaneous and identical with the examinations held at Calcutta, Madras, Bombay and Lahore. I would have two lists, one for England and one for India, and would in proportion appoint between England and India, and sub-divide the latter by provinces, giving a preference to Natives of the provinces. Other things being equal, I would give preference to the provincial man; but no preference should be given if his marks are less. I would not apportion appointments between Hindus and Mahomedans. For backward Hindus and Mahomedans I would retain the Statutory Service, and for others I would refer them to the open competition.

As regards the Uncovenanted, I would recruit from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, but of undomiciled Europeans I would limit the appointment to a quarter of the whole number. I would recruit partly by nomination and partly by competition. Government should have power to nominate a fixed number of persons, so as to represent all classes that are backward, and for the rest I would have absolutely open competition without consideration of birth. The appointments should be made with a preference for natives of the Province.

Vol. III. Sec II. C. P.

Vithal Rao.

Mr. *White.*

In nominating I would require, in all cases, certain preliminary qualifications.

Mr. *Nulkar.*

The educational tests should, for the present, demand only a fair amount of education. If a man has passed the Entrance Standard it would satisfy me. For the rest if men of high education pass, no doubt the nominated men would be at a disadvantage, but they would get some appointments and their

Mr. *Nulkar*—continued.

promotion would depend on their merit. Their disadvantages would stimulate them to improve themselves.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

The posts reserved for Natives of India should not be less than half of the total number of appointments reserved by law for Covenanted Civilians. Considering the population, we are entitled to more than half, but for the present half will be enough.

WITNESS XV.—12th January 1887.

Examination of SYED MAHOMMED HUSSEIN, Tahsildar of Marwara, Jubbulpur district. Has been so for eight years. Nineteen years in Government service. Was first in the Educational Department; then Deputy Clerk of the Court, and then Tahsildar. Is a Native of Lucknow.

Syed Mahommed Hussein.

The Statutory Service should be retained owing to certain disadvantages (which will be described hereafter) in the Covenanted Civil Service.

The rules under which selection is at present made should be modified.

There should be no competitive examination for the Statutory Civil Service to enable men of the lower classes to compete and get high appointments.

Those who are residents of the Province, and who belong to a good and respectable family, should be nominated by the Local Government.

They should, in the first instance, be appointed to the Uncovenanted Service, such as Deputy Collector and Extra Assistant Commissioner, &c., on probation for two or three years. When it is proved that the men are fit, honest, hard-working and healthy, during the time of the probation, they should be promoted to the Statutory Service.

It is undoubtedly true that unless these men go to England and have the benefit of the society there they cannot possibly become independent and fully civilized.

It should be made compulsory on every member of the Statutory Service to go to England after having served eight or ten years. Those who may visit England within ten years may be promoted, but those who do not do so should not get promotion beyond the grade of an Assistant Commissioner of the first class. The object in proposing the visit to England after a certain period is simply to enable the members of the Statutory Service to go when they have means and sufficient understanding to guard them against temptations to which they would be exposed to while in England and to which young and inexperienced men might yield.

In my opinion the pay of the Statutory Service in the first years of his service is small and insufficient for a member to keep up his position and have the benefit of the society of men of his rank and grade. If the visit to England be considered obligatory, they should have the same privileges as are allowed to members of the Covenanted Civil Service with regard to furlough, &c.

There is a general complaint by the Natives of India regarding the Civil Service rules, which place obstacles in their way to a certain extent.

The points regarding which there are complaints, and which deserve the attention and consideration of the present Commission, are—(1) The limit of age of nineteen years. (2) The inclusion of such subjects in the examination as are difficult for Natives and easy for Europeans to acquire. (3) The want of tuition in the public institutions in India to enable young men to compete at the examination in England. (4) The want of means to undertake the journey to England.

These can be removed as follows:—(1) The age may be raised to the period from which Government service reckons towards pension, or at which a ward, under the Court of Wards Act, attains his majority, *i. e.* twenty-three years. (2) Persian and other vernacular languages (Urdu and Hindi) may be included as subjects of the examination in the same way as English. The same number of marks may be allotted to Urdu and Hindi as are

allotted for English literature and composition (*i. e.* 300 to each). Persian should have the same number of marks as French has, *viz.* 500; the marks of Sanskrit and Arabic should be raised to that allotted for Latin (*i.e.* 800); or the marks of the three languages, *viz.*, Sanskrit, Arabic and Latin, should be equalized. (3) In every Presidency College there should be a class for Civil Service training, to which should be admitted young boys good of and respectable family. The boys should be selected by a committee consisting of European officers and natives of position and respectability. They should be subjected to a test examination at the age of seventeen or eighteen years, and those who pass the test should be sent to England to compete at the examination. (4) Those who intend to go to England but are poor and cannot afford to go, should get pecuniary assistance from Government in the shape of Tuccavi advance. The Native candidates failing at the examination in England should get an appointment in the Statutory Service or Uncovenanted Service.

The Civil Service competitive examination should not, in my opinion, be held in India lest the number of Natives should become too large.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

I have never been to England. I know one man who went to England and failed for the competitive examination and who returned and is now an Extra Assistant Commissioner.

The Uncovenanted Service generally should be for Natives of India, but Government should have power to make appointments exceptionally from all subjects of Her Majesty.

Recruitment should be by nomination always, because the men who would now succeed in competition do not belong to high families, and have not the traditions and feelings of gentlemen.

One reason why there has been so much strife lately between Hindus and Mahomedans is that the educated men in Government service are not men of good family and yield to petty feelings.

The recruitment should be provincial, as long as fit men can be found in each province.

Mr. *Nulkar.*

What classes make these religious riots?—The lower classes of course, but behind the scenes are men of the higher classes who instigate them.

Are any such men officials?—Certainly; I know it of my own knowledge,

Mr. *Nulkar*—continued.

for I went on leave this year to various places in the North-West Provinces and Oudh during the Mohurrum, and there I associated with Hindu and Mahomedan officials, and was their guest; and I there learned that Government officials, who were not men of good birth or position, had been among the instigators of these disturbances.

Do not Government officials, Deputy Magistrates and Tahsildars, think that they will be held responsible if such riots occur and they do not do their best to prevent them?—They are well aware of their responsibility, but they take every precaution to prevent the part they have taken being known.

Mr. *White.*

How did you find out how these men of low position were acting?—Men of good rank do not associate with men of the lower classes; and so I infer that if any persons have instigated the riots they must be men of low family.

Do you know that you are making a serious charge against a class of officers?—Certainly; but it is no crime to make a true indictment. It is generally the case that where the officials are mostly of low family there disturbances occur most frequently.

Before the festivals are not the low Hindus and Mahomedans friendly?—These classes are always at enmity.

Is it not the champions of the gymnasiums who invariably create these disturbances?—I do not think so. In every city there are low fellows who have bands of their own, and these take advice from officials.

To *President.*

I wish to state also that I consider the arrangement by which appeals go from lower Civil Courts to Subordinate Judges, instead of to District Judges, is a good one.

It is absolutely necessary to nominate Tahsildars, as the post is of the highest importance, next to that of Deputy Commissioner, and Tahsildars should be amalgamated with Extra Assistant Commissioners and put on the same footing with them.

Mr. *Ryland.*

Why would you have appeals to Subordinate Judges and not to District Judges?—The Subordinate Judges are better acquainted with the customs of the people than Europeans.

Vol. III.
Sec. II.
C. P.

WITNESS XVI.—12th January 1887.

Shankur Rao Madho Rao, Examination of SHANKUR RAO MADHO RAO CHITNAVIS. Is a Statutory Civilian appointed on 13th February 1885, and a B.A. of the Bombay University.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

I am a Statutory Civilian. My family held the office of Secretary to the Bhonsla family for about six generations. My father pays about Rs. 60,000 revenue to Government. I was glad to get my appointment. I am not satisfied with the Statutory system. Statutory Civilians have inferior status to Covenanted Civilians, and get less pay than an Extra Assistant Commissioner of first, second, and third grades. They are only appointed to specific posts, and are not members of a service or eligible for all posts. I would amend the rules, but am satisfied with the Statute. There should be first nomination and then competition among nominees. The pay should be raised to 80 per cent. If those who succeed go to England for probation, the pay should be the same as for the Covenanted Service. I would give them the option of going to England, but would not compel them. I am a Prabhu, and have no objection to go to England, but I would not like to be compelled to go.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

Mr. *Nulkar.*

If the advantages I advocate were granted I cannot say, without consideration, whether I would go to England.

Mr. *Stokes.*

The considerations are family considerations, not caste. I took a second class B. A.

Mr. *White.*

Men of the Uncovenanted Service can compete if they like. It would not be a good principle to promote an Uncovenanted man direct : he should compete.

WITNESS XVII.—12th January 1887.

Examination of THAKUR MAHARAJ SINGH, Secretary to the Hit Sabha of Saugor.

Thakur Maharaj Singh.

The Society has been established for objects of public utility and has been in existence twelve years. It has helped to establish girls' schools and two night schools. Twenty-one members subscribe, and eleven don't. The annual subscription is Rs. 120.

I represent the views of the Society. Notice was given in the bazaars, and there was a general meeting of the Society, at which the answers were agreed to.

The existing system is not approved.

The people do not want a separate service, which is regarded as inferior in every way to the Covenanted Service.

(*a*) The rules under which the Statutory Servants are appointed should be modified, *i.e.* the appointments should be filled up by provincial competitive examinations, to which may be added the members of the Uncovenanted Service and the profession.

(*b*) The nomination by the Local Government should be by competitive examination.

The definition of the word "Native" should be allowed to stand as it is, but the principle on which appointments are made should be altered, and preference given to those who may pass at the provincial examination.

The selected candidates should be encouraged to visit England.

The *President.*

Would you not admit subjects of Native States ?—Yes, I should.

Are the objections of Hindus to going to England very strong, and are they religious and caste objections, or what ?—The higher classes have caste objections, which are becoming less. I have no objection personally, and a man of my caste (Rajput) went to England to become a barrister. He returned, and with one exception, every one joined in a dinner given him. The exception was a man over 50.

There is dissatisfaction with the existing system of recruiting the Covenanted Civil Service. Natives are under disadvantages.

Thakur Maharaj Singh.

The *President*—continued.

There should be this change, that a competitive examination should simultaneously be held in India.

The disadvantages are—(1) disagreeability of climate; (2) excessive expenses required to be incurred; (3) caste-prejudices observed by men of higher classes.

The following changes are likely to minimize or remove the disadvantages:—

(*a.*) By the establishment of scholarships and allowance of passage money to native candidates.

(*b.*) By raising the age to twenty-two or twenty-three years.

(*c.*) By allotting the same number of marks for Sanskrit as for Latin. Persian may be included, and the same marks allotted as for Sanskrit and other languages.

(*d.*) By holding simultaneous examinations in England and in India.

The examination should be identical with that held in England.

It should be held in one centre in India. The candidates in England and in India can compete with one another, and should be selected in order of merit.

Those who pass at the examination shall be appointed.

The successful candidates should only be encouraged to proceed to England.

If there were an examination in India, are there not some provinces and some classes which are so backward that they would have no chance of success?—Very few would succeed from the Central Provinces at present; and men of my class are generally illiterate.

Mr. *Stokes.*

Is the number of educated men in your class increasing?—Yes, greatly, in comparison with former times.

The Uncovenanted Service should be recruited from Natives of India only.

The recruitment should be by competition only.

The recruitment should be made only from persons resident in the territories under such administration.

The proportion of offices should be allotted to the Uncovenanted Servants who may pass the competitive examination.

WITNESS XVIII.—12th January 1887.

Examination of ARTHUR WRIXON, Esq., Pleader in the Central Provinces, practising at Jubbulpur. A voluntary witness. Was formerly Inspector of Police.

Arthur Wrixon, Esq.

The Statutory Service is not approved. The present system is not approved by Native pleaders, because the men selected are not competent, and so Natives are discredited. I know one who is not sufficiently educated: I do not mean the one who has taken a degree. The defect is in the rules, not in the Statute. I should have a test of education after nomination. A man should be educated up to the B.A. I would certainly not compel candidates to go to England. I would appoint men of merit and ability from the Uncovenanted Civil Service and from the Bar.

Dissatisfaction is felt with the system of recruiting the Covenanted Service because the age is too low; and if the object is to admit Natives, there should be an examination in India also. Caste and cost prevent many Natives going to England. I would raise the age to twenty-one and have examinations in every province, not the same as in England, but with a substitution of Oriental languages for Greek and Latin.

I would reserve the executive appointments for Europeans, and the judicial for Natives. I don't see how Europeans could be excluded from the examination in India. I would not require selected candidates, nor encourage them to go to England. They are sometimes alienated from their own people when they return. I know one man who has not gone to England, but who has adopted English habits, and with whom his father will not eat. The father is a Hindu, and the son has ceased to be one in his habits.

The Uncovenanted Service should be recruited from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty by open competition. But open competition would not do for Tahsildars. I would promote Tahsildars to be Extra Assistant Commissioners. The competition should be provincial.

Europeans should get more pay and furlough. The present pay of the Statutory Service is sufficient. There ought to be no difference in rules and pay and pensions between domiciled Europeans and Natives.

Vol. III.
Sec. II.
C. P.

Maulvi Mahomed Nizam-ud-din Hossein Khan.

WITNESS XIX.—12th January 1887.

Examination of MAULVI MAHOMED NIZAM-UD-DIN HOSSEIN KHAN, B.A., B.L. Assistant Commissioner in the Hyderabad Assigned Districts. He was nominated on the 10th July 1881. Was a Vakil ~~at Bar~~ of the North-West Provinces High Court. Practised at the Court of Judicial Commissioner at Lucknow. He joined the Bar on the 10th May 1880. He was educated at Bareilly College. He took his degree in Arts in the Calcutta University, and his B.L. degree when in Canning College, Lucknow.

I am a Zemindar, *i.e.* my father has a five-anna share in nine villages in Unao. My father was a Sub-Judge at Shahjehanpur, and on his retirement on pension was appointed Judge of the High Court at Hyderabad.

I am a British subject and therefore interested. The Statutory System is not approved by the educated classes who understand the subject. Unqualified persons are appointed. I know intimately three or four men who have been appointed: two are qualified, one not.

The rules should lay down a standard for each province, below which no man should be selected. The test should not be merely educational. Moral and physical qualifications and social position are equally important.

The Statute does not require amendment as to definition, as that would admit all manner of foreigners to India. Considering the advantages received from a foreign Government by my father and myself, I would empower Government to appoint qualified natives of Feudatory States.

I would compel selected candidates to go to England for training with candidates at the open competition selected in that year. It will give a better training and teach them the manners, customs, and ideas of their future colleagues. There will otherwise be a great deal of friction arising from want of free and mutual intercourse.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

The principle of the Statute was to empower the Government in India to appoint men who would have no hopes of succeeding in the English competition—men of influence and good position whom it was desirable to appoint.

With the Covenanted Civil Service System there was no dissatisfaction. Persons selected should be made to undergo a University training in order to give them broader views and sympathy with the people.

A competitive system takes account merely of intellectual attainments.

The disadvantages under which Natives of India labor are that the

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*—continued.

customs, manners and languages are different. Would not alter age if Statutory Civilians are sent home.

Persian should be made one of the languages for examination.

Asiatic languages should be marked equally with Western.

A separate examination in India is not required.

Education is not sufficiently advanced at present, and there are practical difficulties in conducting an examination out here.

If an examination be held in India it should be held at all Indian Universities. There should be one test. The English should compete in India, and *vice versa.*

I would recruit the Uncovenanted Service from all natural-born subjects, but promotions should be given to Statutory Natives.

There should be no competitions, but strict qualifications should in each province be exacted.

Mr. *Ryland.*

If the Statutory Service is abolished I would absorb the one-fifth of the appointments, now reserved to that service, in the Covenanted Civil Service, because Uncovenanted Servants are men generally who have risen from ministerial appointments, and cannot associate with Covenanted Civil Servants on equal terms, but I disapprove of abolition of the Statutory Service.

No distinction of pay or furlough between the Statutory Civil Service and the Civil Service should exist, as the former have to maintain the same condition, to visit England and send their children there for education. Men of the Uncovenanted Service who have proved themselves fit may be nominated as Statutory Civil Servants, but would not require the same scale of pay, as they live cheaper. Any distinction between Statutory and Civil Servants would defeat the object of the Statute. A distinction between Uncovenanted Servants and Statutory should be based on their mode of living.

If officers of the Uncovenanted Service or of the Statutory wish to travel

Mr. *Ryland*—continued.

beyond India no distinction in furlough should be made. In India there should be a distinction.

All privileges should be assimilated as far as possible.

I would help the Uncovenanted Service by appointing them to the Statutory Civil Service.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

In the Uncovenanted Service there are many objections to competition alone. There are honourable men whom it is desirable to promote. I would not

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

promote unqualified men from the *Amla* as a class. Men might be nominated from the outside. Experience of the pleadership examination gives me such a bad idea of examinations that I don't think it brings out qualified men. Unfair means are used to pass. A District Officer would at once find out who was qualified. Difficulties are greater where the candidates are more numerous; I have no objection to a competitive examination when the qualifications of candidates are equal.

WITNESS XX.—12th January 1887.

Examination of PURSHOTTAM NARAIN, Extra Assistant Commissioner in the Berar Commission.

Purshottam Naraim.

I am an Extra Assistant Commissioner of the first grade in the Berar Commission. I am a Native of Poona, and entered Government service twenty-five years ago in the Educational Department, Bombay Presidency. I was subsequently transferred to the same Department in these Provinces; and held the office of Head Clerk to the Director of Public Instruction, C. P. I was transferred as Clerk of the Court to the office of the Commissioner, Nagpur. Having passed the Departmental examinations, by both the lower and higher standards, I was appointed an Extra Assistant Commissioner at Nagpur. Next I became Registrar of the Small Cause Court with jurisdiction to try causes under Rs. 20. After holding that office for two years I was, at Sir R. Temple's request, transferred to Hyderabad, and appointed Clerk in the Mahratta Department of the Resident's Court. In this office I remained for six years, and was then appointed to the Berar Commission, in which I have served since 1873. I now hold the office of Small Cause Court Judge at Umraotti and receive Rs. 600 pay. I am a Mahratti Brahmin. I am not a member of any Political Association.

The reservation of posts for Statutory Civilians serves to show that, up to a given limit, the appointments could be held alike by a Covenanted Civil Servant and by a Statutory Civil Servant. But Government has not hitherto so arranged the nominations as to induce the members of the Covenanted Civil Service to think that they need not necessarily look down upon a Statutory Civil Servant who holds posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service.

That not having been done, the Statutory Civil Servant finds himself belonging to no service. His position is an intermediate one. The Covenanted Civil Servant does not look upon him as his equal, while the Uncovenanted Civil Servant considers him as belonging to no service whatsoever. The result is that he is socially left in the lurch.

In fact, the Statutory appointments are not made to a regular service. The persons appointed remain at a stand-still holding the appointments conferred on them without any certainty of promotion. This would not be the case if they were appointed to an organized service.

The posts reserved as belonging to the Covenanted Service have been offered to persons without a recognized passport for merit, intellectual, physical or moral.

The result has, therefore, been to call forth general disapprobation of the system under which the nominations have hitherto been made.

The grounds of disapprobation are briefly as follows:—

That the appointments were given not for merit; that men of approved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Civil Service were not promoted, and as I have said, Statutory Civilians were not promoted into a service.

The defects of the existing system are susceptible of remedy by amendment of the rules, so as to secure men of merit and ability, either from the

Vol. III. Sec. II. C. P.

Purshottam Naram.

Uncovenanted Civil Service or from the Bar.

The Statute should be amended so as to include Natives of India born in Native States.

The expression "Natives of India" should be so further defined as to include all persons who do not object to subject themselves to the criminal law of India, in addition to the fact of domicile and the accident of birth in India.

I would not amend the Statute any further. But if it is to be so amended as to include all Her Majesty's subjects, whether born in India or whether born out of it, I would at the same time introduce such checks as would protect the just claims of Natives of India under the Statute.

One of the checks could be to insist on a competitive examination in India, with such other further and subsidiary checks as might appear desirable or called for under the circumstances of the case.

If the Statutory Service is retained, the selected candidate should be encouraged to proceed to England. He should not be required to do so, as it was not a condition antecedent to his selection.

To Mr. *Crosthwaite* : I was offered by Sir R. Temple the opportunity of proceeding to England for training. I regret that I did not accept the offer owing to the objections of members of my family. The objections are now much weaker among my castemen than they were. The Brahmans are so poor that they would go anywhere to get employment. There is nothing in the Shasters as interpreted by our high priest, the Shankar Acharya, to entail loss of caste on persons who cross the sea, and there is a well-known instance in which a Mahratta Brahmin who passed the competitive examination in England, on his return, married a lady of the highest caste at Punderpur, a sacred place of pilgrimage. He was at first an out-caste, but was purified by eating the five products of the cow and feeding a certain number of Brahmins, and distributing among them some money in charity. The reluctance of parents to allow their sons to proceed to England arises from their fear that their children would acquire foreign habits, and, to imitate their superiors, become extravagant in expenditure. Caste has become much detested, and in almost every family there are now persons of broad views.

Disapproval is felt at the existing system of the recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service, because Natives are under disadvantages. For instance, the expense of going to England, which is a serious risk when success at the examination is uncertain.

The present limit of age is specially unfavourable to Native candidates. It should be raised from nineteen to twenty-three years.

The disadvantages could be minimized by the grant of scholarships and passage-money. The disadvantages could be removed by holding examinations in India.

I would allow to Arabic and Sanskrit the same marks as Greek and Latin.

Simultaneous examinations should be held in England and in India to allow free scope to the intellect of the country to come to the front. This will also have the collateral advantage of marking, year by year, the progress made by the Native intellect towards the desired consummation of fitness for high posts in the administration. Such a gauge of the progress of a country's intellect appears desirable on grounds of political expediency, as, also, for economical considerations.

The examination should be identical with that held in England.

For some years yet to come it should be held at one centre in India. I would appoint the same set of examiners to examine the answers of candidates in England and in India. This will secure a uniform standard for testing the correctness of and for valuing the answers.

If the conditions secure one and the same standard, no apportionment of posts as between the candidates need be made, the winner being equitably left to carry away his prize.

A candidate who may be successful in India should be required to proceed to England to complete his training.

The present system does not necessarily secure the best Native officials that could be secured under any system. The character and capacity of many a man who has not visited England, if developed, might be found, for all that is known to the contrary, to excel the character and capacity of one who has passed at an open competition in England.

As to the Uncovenanted Service, it should, in my opinion, be recruited from Natives of India as described in the Statute, but if all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty are admitted, they should pass examinations in India before appointment.

I would employ in the selection of men for the Uncovenanted Civil Service both systems—competition and nomination. The system should be varied with the classes of offices.

I would favor, for some years, provincial recruitment.

The residents in the territories under each administration should have preference, all other things being equal. The preference will practically help to keep intact the prestige of each office-holder. At present a man is forgotten the moment he leaves his province.

If the Statutory Civil Service is abolished, the proportion of offices assigned to that service should decidedly be allotted to the Uncovenanted Civil Service.

All Covenanted Civil Servants who have succeeded at an open examination should have one rate of salary.

But when the standards of examination vary, then two-thirds only should be paid to members of the lower or Uncovenanted Service. The one-third should be withheld to show to the world that they had not entered the service by open competition. It is simply fair to do so.

Furlough rules should be regulated by the nationality of the officer and on consideration of the necessity of his visiting his native country.

The passing at an open examination having been held to be the pivot on which the whole Covenanted Service hinges, all other services outside that pale should be separately dealt with as to pay, pension, furlough, and annuities.

WITNESS XXI.—13th January 1887.

Examination of Leslie Saunders, Esq., of the Covenanted Civil Service, Commissioner of the Berars.

Leslie Saunders, Esq.

The *President.*

You are Commissioner of the Berars, I believe?—I am.

How many years have you been in the service?—Twenty-nine.

And you are a Haileybury man?—Yes. I was nineteen years in the Punjab, thirteen in Rajputana, and have been two years in the Berars. I have had experience of the administration in all departments, both judicial and executive. I have been Judge of a Small Cause Court, Settlement Officer, Deputy Commissioner of Jullundhur and Commissioner of Ajmere.

The Berars are, I believe, not in British India, but are administered by the Governor-General in Council under the provisions of a treaty?—Yes.

And, therefore, the Statutes relating to the appointment of Covenanted Civilians, and the Statutes relating to the appointment of Statutory Civil Servants do not apply?—No, though there are some Covenanted Civilians employed there.

Have you given much attention to the question of the recruitment for the Civil Service generally?—I have given the question considerable attention, and, without taking up the time of the Commission unnecessarily, I should like to state a few of my general views on the subject.

The *President*—continued.

Is the existing system of appointing natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—Most of the highly educated Natives disapprove of it, because they think it does not afford them a sufficient chance of getting into the service. I have not heard any great complaints myself, because, as I mentioned before, the rules do not apply to my province.

What, so far as you know, are the grounds of disapprobation?—The grounds generally are that men who have taken the highest degrees are not certain to be appointed.

Is there any objection felt because the Statute only admits of an appointment to a particular post and not to a regular service?—I have not heard of any.

Is any objection felt to the Statute itself: for instance, to the definition of Natives of India?—I think not. I think the definition ought to be as broad as it possibly can be; and it appears to be so.

You are aware that the Natives of the Berars, for instance, would not be eligible for Statutory appointments in British territory?—I believe that is the case; but I need scarcely tell you that the Viceroy, in receiving a deputation at Hyderabad a short while ago, promised that any more liberal rules that might be proposed

Vol. III. Sec. II. C. P.

Leslie Saunders, Esq.

The *President*—continued.

for admitting Natives to the general Civil Service would be extended also to the Berars, and certainly the people of the Berars understand that whatever is given to the rest of India shall be given also to the Berars.

If the Statutory system is retained, would you insist on the selected candidates going to England for training?—No, I think not. I think myself that it would be very advisable, if possible, to reduce the number of appointments for the Covenanted Civil Service to the lowest number compatible with the object of retaining the service in its efficiency, and to throw open the rest entirely to a lower service; and in that case I think it would not be advisable to require candidates for that lower service to go to England. I think the objection to their going at that time of life would be very great, unless they were under proper tutelage in England.

But you would not object to any one going who liked?—No.

Would you alter the present rules for the Statutory Service?—I think not.

Then you would not remove the objections taken to them?—I would not.

Do you know if any dissatisfaction is felt with the present system of recruiting for the Covenanted Civil Service by means of open competition in England?—If you mean dissatisfaction in India, I think there is, owing to the Natives not having more important appointments in all grades.

Is there any dissatisfaction connected with the disadvantages under which Natives of India lie, or are supposed to lie, in competing?—I think Natives generally feel that they have very little chance of getting in. They desire that equality which probably we could never give them, and are discontented in consequence. They have had hopes held out to them of being allowed to compete, and they find that competition means a great deal more than they expected.

In what way?—As regards going to England.

And as regards the age limit?—That is one of the main grounds of objection.

What is the age they usually advocate?—From twenty-two upwards: not less than twenty-two.

Is any dissatisfaction felt with the subjects of the examination?—Yes, they would have Arabic and Sanskrit admitted to the same footing as Latin and Greek, and Persian as French.

Are they under any disadvantage on the score of the expense involved in

The *President*—continued.

going to England?—That is one of the difficulties they point to, but not necessarily complain of.

What alterations would you suggest with a view to meeting these difficulties?—My idea generally is that all the service appointments held in India at the present moment ought to be gone over carefully, and it should be clearly laid down what appointments shall be held by Covenanted Servants and what appointments shall be thrown open; not necessarily to competition, because I do not think it is the best method of getting the best Indian officers: it is very good in England, but would not answer in India at all. Having gone over all the appointments that could possibly be surrendered, I would throw them open to a service not to be called Uncovenanted, because rightly or wrongly, as I believe, that has come to be looked upon as an opprobrious epithet, but to be called the "higher-lower" or "middle" service. At the present moment a *chuprassie* and a High Court Judge are very much on the same footing, in matters of leave and pay and pension rules, which undoubtedly is not as it should be. I would, therefore, have a lower Civil Service also, and would admit to it all persons drawing pay of perhaps not more than Rs. 100 or 150. Such persons should not necessarily be eligible for the "higher-lower" service. The service should be selected from persons nominated by the different local administrations, and I would also allow all matriculated students to compete for it; but each administration should be empowered to lay down exactly what proportion of officials they require according to classes, as Mahomedans, Hindus, Europeans and Eurasians. I would have a wide nomination from each of these classes, and would make the nominees compete in an examination among themselves. For instance, if I wanted four Mahomedans, I would take the four highest on the list, and in the same way I would select the number of Hindus I required. Because at the present moment, if the service is thrown open entirely to competition without limitation of some sort, only those classes who have really gone in for education, that is the money-lending or money-making classes, would get in; and, personally, I believe the worst results would happen if we allowed such a thing to occur. We do not want a large number of these particular classes, either Brahmans in the lower parts of India, or Marwaries in the Upper Provinces, who would, if open competition were allowed, certainly

The *President*—continued.

obtain the great majority of appointments. That is why I would have a limited selection in the first instance by nomination. The nomination should, as I have said, include a large number of each class, and should be followed by competition amongst the nominees. That is the general outline of my scheme.

Would your competition be provincial or general?—Provincial it must be.

And would it be competition by classes?—It must be by classes.

In that case you would require to have separate papers?—English would have to be obligatory, but in all other points the examinations need not necessarily be the same.

You would, you say, divide the service into three: lower, higher-lower or middle, and Covenanted Civil Service?—I would get rid of Uncovenanted altogether. Probably the Extra Assistants would be the lowest grade of the higher-lower service.

Would you require any qualifications antecedent to nomination?—Certainly.

What qualifications?—There would have to be a limit of age, except in cases of promotion from the lower to the higher-lower service. The competition should be as open as it possibly could be within certain limits. We know that the Government servant must begin his work early in life, therefore I would put the age at nineteen or twenty.

Would you give an antecedent preference to, for instance, good family?—Undoubtedly. I would give that preference before the competition.

And in giving the appointments would you do so absolutely in accordance with the result of the competition?—Absolutely.

What would you do with the Covenanted Service?—I would leave it exactly as it is at the present moment, with the exception that I would limit one-third of the appointments to Natives. That proportion would not, of course, be worked up to for a long time; but I think it should be clearly made known that that was the limit.

Would you in very exceptional cases promote from your higher-lower service to the Covenanted Service?—I would do so in each of the grades.

Would you promote men from outside, men who had distinguished themselves in professions?—To a very limited extent indeed, but it should undoubtedly be possible to do so.

Mr. *Ryland.*

Would you have a competitive examination in India?—Not for the Covenanted Civil Service, but for the higher-lower service: I would have it entirely in India.

Would you exclude Europeans from your Indian competition?—They would be admitted to a limited extent. We should want Europeans in the higher-lower service, for places where there are military cantonments, for instance.

The *President.*

If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of officers assigned to that service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—I think the fairer way would be to re-absorb them in the Covenanted Service. They have had hopes held out to them of its being done, and it would be only fair to do so.

How many Covenanted Civilians have you in Berar?—Only one at present. I have six districts at the present moment, all in charge of Europeans, but all our Assistant Commissioners, except three, are Natives.

You have experience both of British territory and the Berars, do you consider that the subordinate work of a district is done by Native Assistant Commissioners in the Berars as efficiently as it is done by European Assistant Commissioners in British territory?—I think it is very efficiently done. I have met one Native almost as good as any European officer I could mention.

Are the Natives you have referred to all English-speaking Natives?—The Native I have especially in my mind is not an English-speaking man.

Have you ever put any of these Natives in charge of districts when the European officers went on leave?—I have never done it.

How do you provide in such cases?—We are just now asking for European officers for that very purpose. At the present moment our Assistant Commissioners are young men and not sufficiently experienced to have charge of a district, but I see no reason why, in course of time, they should not have charge of districts.

Do you think it would be acceptable to the people of the Berars?—I think so. I think, however, that a limit should be distinctly laid down.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

You would limit the Covenanted appointments open to Natives through the competition in England to one-third?—Yes.

Vol. III. Sec. II. C. P.

Leslie Saunders, Esq.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*—continued.

And in that one-third do you propose to include the reserved appointments assigned to the Statutory Service also ?—The Statutory Service under my scheme would disappear entirely and merge into the other. I would allow no one to be appointed to the Covenanted Civil Service except through the competition in England. It is not my idea at all to throw open the Covenanted Service to persons who are not equal, or very nearly equal, to Europeans.

And your test of that would be their having undergone the same examination ?—Yes.

I believe you said you thought a proportion of Europeans was necessary in the higher-lower service ?—Yes.

Mr. *White.*

Is that with a view to the efficiency of the service ?—Yes: the general efficiency of the service. I think Natives are inclined very often not to work up to as high a standard as we wish to obtain, and by having European officers as a standard for them to work up to, we should be improving the general efficiency of the service. There are other reasons also which make it desirable to have a sprinkling of Europeans, but undoubtedly the great majority should be natives.

Is this opinion the result of your experience as a District Officer in the Punjab? Was it your opinion of the work done by European officers in the Uncovenanted Service of that Province, that it furnished a higher standard of work for the Native officials than they were likely to reach of themselves ?—I think a Native is perfectly capable of reaching quite as high a standard, but they do not always exert themselves to the same extent.

Was it your experience of the work done by those Uncovenanted officers that it was much superior to the work done by Native Extra Assistant Commissioners ?—I do not think it was ; but I am speaking now of fifteen years ago. Education amongst Natives has spread very widely since then, and no doubt we have a much better educated class of Native officials than we had then. I do not think the difference now is very great.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

You say it is desirable to have European officers in cantonments: for what duties ?—To take charge of treasuries and the like.

Have you ever known instances of English-speaking Natives having charge of treasuries in large cantonments ?—Yes.

And has any friction resulted ?—I do not think so. There should, I think, be some complimentary appointments from the lower to the Covenanted Service, but they should be entirely exceptional cases.

Although you had reduced the Covenanted Civil Service as much as possible ?—Yes. I think still there should be the power, but it should be very sparingly used.

And if the men so appointed were Natives of the country would you include them in your one-third limit ?—Yes, I think it ought not ever to exceed that one-third.

Would you put them into any post, or make them go in at the bottom of the service ?—Of course if you took a man from a higher post in the service which I have designated the higher-lower, he would expect a similar post in the higher service.

The *President.*

Should Extra Assistant Commissioners, European and Native, be on the same footing with regard to pay and promotion ?—Yes, I would have all officials in the higher-lower service on one footing.

Do they pull well together ?—Oh yes, quite well.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

What posts, or class of posts, do you propose to withdraw from the Covenanted Service?—A very large proportion of the judicial appointments, a few districts in every province, and, in very exceptional cases, I would admit a man into the Secretariat, probably into some of the lower appointments ; but certainly I would admit them into as many as I possibly could. Some of the smaller Secretariat posts might even be made over permanently to the higher-lower service.

And besides doing that, you contemplate having one-third of the Covenanted posts held by Natives ?—That is if they can go to England and compete on equal terms with us, which, I do not think, they will do for a very long time to come. I think some limit should be fixed beyond which they should not be able to go, and that is my reason for saying one-third.

How would you manage in a province like this where the judicial posts are not separate from the executive ?—I think the tendency is to divide them

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

off. For instance, it is being done in Berar at the present moment, and I think the tendency is so all over India.

Are the Native Assistant Commissioners in your province generally Natives of the Berars?—Not all.

Where are they generally taken from?—We have one, a gentleman who gave evidence before the Commission yesterday, who comes from Lucknow. They have been selected by the Viceroy from different parts of India There are also some Attachés to the Resident who have been appointed from different places. They have been good selections on the whole.

The *President.*

Is not your suggestion, that there should be a limit put to the admission of Natives, contrary to the terms of the Act 3 and 4 Will. IV and the Queen's Proclamation, which say that no Native of these territories shall, by reason of his place of birth, descent, religion, or colour, be excluded from any office for which he has proved himself qualified?—I think not, for this reason, that you might as well say that when all the appointments are filled up everybody else is excluded.

But here you make an artificial exclusion. Do you not think that your restriction of certain appointments to one class is practically in contravention of the terms of the Statute and the Proclamation?—I do not think so.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

Do you think that the exigencies of the service require a certain proportion of Europeans to be maintained in it?—I do.

And that when you have to consider the question of fitness, as the Statute allows you to do, you may have some regard to the element of nationality also?—I think so, and it is better to lay it down at once and let everybody know that there is such a limit than to do it in another way.

Mr. *White.*

When you say that in the Berars there is a certain proportion of European officers, you mean European in its broad sense?—Oh yes, Europeans and Eurasians certainly.

Mr. *Ryland.*

Is there not a very large class of Europeans and Eurasians settled in the country?—Yes, a very large and an increasing class too.

And you think it is both wise and equitable to utilize their services?—I think it most desirable. When I say a large class, I mean there is a class commencing to settle here of poorly-paid Europeans who are bringing their families out from England. I have two such instances in my mind at the present moment, where owing to the fall in exchange men have been obliged to bring their families out, and I have no doubt that such cases will increase.

The *President.*

Are they settled in India without any intention of returning?—At any rate they cannot afford to do so at the present moment.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

Is the class largely increasing of those who are compelled to remain in India, though they came out with no such intention?—Very largely increasing.

Have you had any experience of railway employés?—Yes, in Ajmere.

And amongst this class are such persons as you speak of increasing largely?—Yes.

May we take it that Europeans, engaged not only in the public service but in mercantile and railway business, are now compelled to settle in the country in large numbers, owing to their inability to maintain and educate their families in England?—Yes.

Mr. *White.*

Is it not desirable that Europeans should settle here?—If you keep them from extreme poverty, I think it is.

That is, it would infuse more English ideas into the administration?—I think they are most useful in many ways. There is one subject I desire to mention, and that is, that whatever else may be done, there ought to be some new rules with regard to pensions. My reason for saying so is that very often an officer either turns out incompetent or falls under suspicion of corruption, and we wish to get rid of him; and I know of many instances of men having to be kept on for months, and sometimes years, really at very serious loss to the Government service, and also to the reputation of the service, and, therefore, I think the pension rules should be so altered that a man might be allowed to go at any time without losing his title to some pension.

The *President.*

But why were they kept on in such circumstances?—Generally speaking, it is very difficult to prove corruption, and if a man, from ill-health or other cause,

Vol. III. Sec. II. C. P.

Leslie Saunders, Esq.

The *President*—continued.

becomes incompetent, and has only two or three years more to serve to get his pension, there are really very few officers who have the heart to turn him out, unless misconduct or wilful indolence is distinctly proved. I am perfectly certain that the service would be very much benefited if such officers were got rid of by a relaxation of the present pension rules. I have seen it in the case of Europeans as well as of Natives.

Mr. *White.*

In fact, your object is not to turn a man out destitute?—Yes, that is it. He has earned his pension to some extent, and I think he ought to get a proportionate part of what he would eventually receive. I mention that, because I think, of course, we must arrange for a flow of promotion.

You know that the present Uncovenanted Service rules do not sanction

Mr. *White*—continued.

the grant of a pension until a man has been fifteen years in the service. How would it answer if a small deduction from pay was made to provide a pension fund, so that if within fifteen years a member of the Service was discovered to be incompetent, he could be got rid of with some provision for his support?—I should think it would be a very good arrangement. I believe there is such a system in some of the railway services, and I do not see why not in ours.

Mr. *Stokes.*

Would you retain the word "Covenanted"?—I would retain it and make the higher service also a Covenanted Service. One of the conditions of the appointments would be that they should be transferable from province to province.

WITNESS XXII.—13th January 1887.

Examination of R. D. HARE, Esq., of the Uncovenanted Service, Assistant Commissioner, Berar.

R. D. Hare, Esq.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

What post do you hold?—I am at present an Assistant Commissioner in Berar. I was six and a-half years an Assistant Commissioner in the Chota Nagpur Provinces. I have been eleven years in my present appointment.

Where were you educated?—At home. I failed for the Civil Service, and joined the Uncovenanted Service out here.

Have you had any experience of what we call the Statutory Service?—No. I have never been in any part of India to which the Statute applies. We have Natives of good family appointed to our Commission in something the same way, that is directly by nomination.

Have you had experience of them?—Yes.

How do they compare with the other members of the Commission in point of work?—With one or two conspicuous exceptions, I do not think they have been satisfactory. The people of the country are not satisfied with them, because they have undergone no qualifying test. Some of them are proved to have no inclination to work.

Were they appointed without any educational test?—Without any test whatever. Some of them served a period of

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

probation, but that only means passing their departmental examination sooner or later.

In what respect have they failed?—I think some of them were by no means able men, but I should say that they chiefly failed in energy.

Are they insubordinate?—Not at all. They are men of good family and manners.

Do the people like them?—I think the educated classes have been able to point an argument from them that an educational test is the best one.

I mean the people who have had to do with them in their official capacity?—I think there have been complaints of their dilatoriness, for instance.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

Have any of the Natives who hold appointments in your province ever been to England?—No. The only man of that sort we have had was lent to us by the Hyderabad Government to learn his work.

Is he working now in the Berars?—Yes. He came out from England to the Berars.

Do you think his visit to England has improved him?—I do not know the man.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

Do you wish to say anything about the Covenanted Service?—No. I think that the status of my own, the Uncovenanted Service, ought to be improved. It ought to be made an honourable career for any man who is debarred in any way from passing the competitive examination for the Civil Service. I think it should replace the Statutory Service.

Would you recruit for it from Natives of India, which term under the Statute includes domiciled Europeans born in India of parents habitually resident here?—I would recruit it from every class. I would not exclude Europeans not domiciled here, who had been educated in England and who intend to return there.

How would you recruit for it?—Almost entirely by nomination, with either a strict qualifying test, or by competition among the different classes of nominees. A few appointments might be given by open competition as an experiment, and to satisfy the aspirations of educated natives, probably obscure persons who would never have a chance of being nominated. But I do not think open competition in India is a good means of obtaining an efficient service.

Do you not think that if the service is open, as you propose, to those domiciled Europeans recruited chiefly by nomination, it might be open to abuse of patronage?—The nominations would be made by the heads of Governments. They discharge much more important trusts than that. I don't think there is any fear of what you suggest. Besides the fierce light of publicity that is thrown on all appointments would be a sufficient safeguard.

Would you recruit provincially?—Provincially, as far as possible, as regards Natives. I mean to say that Berar, for instance, is so very small that I am not quite certain you would get a proper selection, but otherwise, and in large provinces, I certainly would have it provincial.

How would you admit undomiciled Europeans?—By nomination also.

It would be provincial then only for Natives?—Yes.

And open to all others?—Yes.

Would you allow promotion from the Uncovenanted Service to the higher posts in the Covenanted Service?—Yes. The present Statutory Service would be absorbed in this improved Uncovenanted Service, so that a man who had really proved his ability might be promoted.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

There ought to be the hope in every career that exceptional merit will lead to something better, than is attainable in the Uncovenanted Service as it is.

Would you arrange for that by keeping the Statute as it is, that is the power which Government has under it to make appointments when it chooses, or would you transfer a certain number of posts to the Uncovenanted Service?—I think it would be far more satisfactory to set aside a certain proportion of posts.

Would these posts be of one special class or some of all classes?—Some of all classes, some district charges, some Deputy Commissionerships, and a good many judicial appointments.

Mr. *White.*

Suppose there are a hundred appointments to be given among all classes of people, and a few exceptionally to a certain class, and suppose in practice the whole of those appointments were given by nomination to that certain class, would not that be an abuse of patronage?—Yes, I think it would create a great deal of dissatisfaction among the others.

Mr. *Ryland.*

You are an Uncovenanted officer and a European?—Yes.

You got in by nomination?—Yes.

How many other European Uncovenanted officers are there in the Berar Commission?—Five, I think.

Are they at all excluded from the higher posts?—No; there is at present a Deputy Commissioner, who is an Uncovenanted officer, and another, who has just gone home, officiated for years as Deputy Commissioner.

You mean to say that the appointments are quite open?—Yes.

Has any inconvenience or dissatisfaction arisen owing to that?—Certainly not on the part of the people of the country. I think they have the greatest confidence in the present Deputy Commissioner and in the other Uncovenanted officer.

Is not the number of European settlers in this country rapidly increasing?—Enormously, and may be expected to increase more rapidly every day with exchange falling as it is.

Is it wise and equitable to utilize their services in the administration of the country?—I think it is a matter which ought to be taken into consideration, because if the public service is closed to them there will be very great difficulty before long. Besides the class will furnish first-rate officers, next best to the Covenanted Civilians.

Vol. III. Sec. II. C. P.

R. D. Hare, Esq.

Mr. *Ryland*—continued.

And for certain posts, and in time of difficulty, they would as a rule be better than Natives?—Certainly. I think where energy and self-reliance are needed the European officer is superior to the Native.

Would you abolish the distinction between Covenanted and Uncovenanted ?—Yes. I think the word "Uncovenanted" has a very invidious signification now. I think that an Uncovenanted officer holding an important appointment ought not to be classed with the very lowest ministerial officers. I think, as I said before, the Uncovenanted Service ought to be made a very desirable and honourable one and its status improved as much as possible.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

Was the gentleman, you instanced as doing so well as a Deputy Commissioner, educated in this country ?—There have been several. The one who has just retired was educated in England. He was about the strongest Deputy Commissioner I know of.

And the others ?—They were also educated in England.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

Have you anything to observe in connection with pay and furlough ?—Yes, there is a very strong feeling about it in the service.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

Do you think any distinction ought to be made in the pay of a post having regard to whether that post is held by a Covenanted Civilian or an Uncovenanted appointed to it, or a Statutory Civilian ?—I think not. I would have precisely the same rules for all. But the great grievance felt is, that although the rule is that a pension of half pay can be drawn, a pension of Rs. 500 a month can never be earned unless the pay of the post is more than what practically any Uncovenanted officer ever earns. Another grievance is that furlough and sick leave do not count for service. I think that rule needs altering also. Then I believe, it is said in the code, that rules made from time to time shall govern the Uncovenanted Service, so that rules made hereafter would have a retrospective effect, and a man who had joined under more favourable rules might be prejudiced ? —I think that also should be changed.

Would you make any distinction between the furlough rules for Natives of India and those for Europeans ?—I would give Natives the same long furlough only on the understanding that they took it in Europe.

Is there anything else you would wish to bring before the Commission ?—No.

WITNESS XXIII.—13th January 1887.

Examination of ~~Sri Ram~~ Shiram Bhikaji Jatar, B.A. Director of Public Instruction, Berar, for last three years. Came to Berar in 1867 as Deputy Educational Inspector. In 1876 made Educational Inspector for the whole Province of Berar. Educated in Poona. Mahratta Brahman.

~~Sri Ram~~ Shiram Bhikaji Jatar.

The Statutory Service is not approved, because there is no guarantee that the best men will be appointed. It favours class distinction, and admits Natives without examination; but does not extend this privilege to other classes of Her Majesty's subjects. Practically, the words "proved merit, &c.," are not taken into account. I would abolish the Statute, and absorb the proportion of appointments into the Uncovenanted Civil Service. If the Statute be retained, I would compel nominees to go to England. There were caste prejudices which are fast disappearing. I would not myself object to go to England, and would send my son ; but I should hesitate if the boy were weakly and on account of expense. I have known men who have gone and returned. I know one man who did so. He was a Hindu of high caste, and on his return was appointed manager of a religious institution. The prejudice exists among the rural classes and the older men. It is very difficult for the authorities to find out who are men of "proved merit and ability." Those of the Uncovenanted Civil Service who were deserving and of proved merit and ability should get the Statutory appointments, which I propose to absorb into the Uncovenanted Civil Service.

There is dissatisfaction with the English competitive system. Natives of India labour under disadvantages. The chief one is that the examination is held in English, to master which much time is necessary. To meet this the age should be raised for all to twenty-

Sri Ram Bhikaji Jatar.

three. Natives cannot be fairly required to go to England, as the chances of their failure are so much greater. I would, therefore, have an identical and simultaneous examination in India with one list of merit for both examinations. This would minimise disadvantages. I would not alter the subjects. After passing in India I would compel passed candidates to go to England and put them through a similar training as that which English candidates have to undergo. But for Natives I would pay special attention to physical training.

The *President.*

Would there not be a risk of pressure on Government to orientalize the examination ?—Yes ; but I would resist it.

Would you admit Englishmen to the Indian examination ?—Yes.

Would there not be a risk of appointments being monopolized by the more advanced provinces or by the more advanced classes?—Yes, at least for some years. But in their own interests I would not lead backward provinces or classes to think that Government was indisposed to put more highly educated classes over them, and thus perpetuate their backwardness.

Why do you object to orientalizing the examination?—I think that the English character should not be changed for the sake of the Natives.

I would recruit the Uncovenanted Civil Service from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty. I would not object to undomiciled Europeans. I would recruit by competition and by nomination. I would nominate from lower grades and have competition for outsiders with a preliminary test. For lower grades (such as Tahsildars), I would insist on what is called the Previous Examination at the Bombay University. For higher appointments (Extra Assistant Commissioners), I would select from the Tahsildars and Clerks of Court. I would recruit provincially.

The *President*—continued.

I would pay Uncovenanted Officers promoted to posts now held by the Covenanted Service about two-thirds, when the pay is above Rs. 1,000, and give them the same pay when it is below. I would make this difference because the men have not been educated in England and have not passed the difficult tests. I would make a difference in furlough according to domicile, as Natives are in their own country. I have never taken furlough. Natives do not usually take so much furlough as Europeans.

If Government think that backward races and provinces should be improved, I would establish a College or institute scholarships for training Natives for competition for the Civil Service Examination in India. Instead of favouring Mahomedans, for instance, by giving them appointments for which they are not fit, I would train them. Rajputs and Thakurs are backward. Men of low castes, such as Chamars and Mahars, go to our schools in some places.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

The population of the Berars is 2,600,000. In our High Schools boys read up to Matriculation. Last year fourteen passed the Matriculation, and five continued their College course.

Mr. *White.*

Should a College be established in India or in each province where the higher classes should be educated alongside of Europeans and Eurasians and sons of respectable Natives, so as to encourage a better feeling among all the better classes likely to be eventually enrolled in the Covenanted Service ?—Yes : I think this is a good idea.

The *President.*

Are there not many such Colleges already ?—Yes: but the establishment of a special College would be an advantage.

Have you any other observation ?—No.

WITNESS XXIV.—13th January 1887.

Examination of Deo Rao Vinayak, Brahman, from Khandeish. A Pleader, and Vice-President, Akola Municipality. Practises in all Courts of the Berars. Has been practising twenty-five years in Berar. Educated in Khandeish.

Deo Rao Vinayak.

There are some officers appointed in the Berars in the same way as Statutory Civilians are appointed in other provinces. My opinion of them is unfavourable. There is no educational test. My opinion of their industry, with a few exceptions, is also unfavorable.

The system of appointment is unsuitable, for education is extending and the people expect superior men which they don't get. I would abolish the Statute, and have open competition for the Civil Service.

Vol. III. Sec. II. C. P.

Deo Rao Vinayak.

There is nothing in the Statutory system to prevent importing men from outside. All of the fifteen men in the Berars are Natives of other provinces. There is also a distinction in pay between the Statutory Service and the Covenanted Service, to which I object.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

Out of 2,600,000 persons, there are only fourteen men who are reading up to B.A. How do you reconcile this with your objection to outsiders?—There are 100 men who entered the College at Bombay.

Would those men afford a sufficient field for selection for the fifteen Assistant Commissioners to whose nomination from outside you object?—Many men could have been found in the Province equal, if not superior, in education to those appointed.

To what class would they have belonged?—Mahratta Brahmans, Hindus and Mahomedans; some Rajputs.

Do Hindus other than Mahratta Brahmans, and do Mahomedans, largely avail themselves of education?—Of the boys of the school-going age, 38 per cent. of Mahomedans and 18 per cent. of Hindus go to school.

Which class goes most to schools?—I don't think one class goes more than another. Mahomedans don't pursue the higher education in the desirable percentage. Of the Hindus, the greater proportion who go in for higher education are Mahratta Brahmans, and they take the highest places.

Then out of fifteen nominated officers all would have been Mahratta Brahmans under your test?—Yes, they would: at least most of them.

What is the proportion of Mahratta Brahmans to the rest of the population in the Berars?—I cannot say.

Out of 100 persons who have passed the Matriculation, is it not the case that only three are Mahomedans and over ninety Mahratta Brahmans?—Yes, three Mahomedans and 97 Hindus. But I am not quite sure of the number of those who would be Mahratta Brahmans. Certainly the great majority.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

People are not satisfied with the system of recruiting for the Covenanted Service: it is practically closed against natives. The Natives are at a disadvantage—(1) in having to send their boys some 10,000 miles to a strange country at 15 or 16 years of age; (2) in having to compete in a foreign language with persons who speak that language; (3) as a consequence, they have to ignore their own

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

language and history; and (4) having to spend money with chance of failure. To remedy these I would raise the age to twenty-three and add Indian vernaculars as subjects of examination and also Indian history, and place the classical languages, Sanskrit and Arabic, on an equal footing with Latin and Greek in respect to marks. I would also hold simultaneous and identical examinations in India open to all classes, just as the English examination is open to all. It should be only in one place. There should be one list of candidates, who should be selected by merit only without distinction of race. My own opinion is that every Civilian ought to go to England, but I would not compel them to go at present. It would tell heavily on the people. Certain classes would object to go on the ground of expense. I would encourage them to go. If allowances were given to meet expenses I would not then object, but I would not propose or advocate such an arrangement. By encouragement I mean higher appointments should be reserved for those who go: those who do not go should get lower appointments. The sentimental objections of caste entertained by some of the old people are disappearing. I have never been to England, but would not object to go, except on the ground of health or expense.

As regards the Uncovenanted Service, I would recruit from those who are really Natives of India, including domiciled Europeans, *i.e.* those who are treated equally as natives in all matters, even in criminal matters: I mean they should be subject to the same criminal law and procedure. Subjects of Native States, like Hyderabad, would be excluded by the definition, but I would have no objection to them if competition were adopted. I would object to their being nominated. For appointments to the Uncovenanted Service, *viz.* Tahsildars, I would have limited competition, with a preference to be given to a competent Native of the province. The same for Extra Assistant Commissioners. I would promote Tahsildars to be Extra Assistant Commissioners; and if there is a preliminary test for nomination, I would promote from other departments also. I would promote from Extra Assistant Commissioners to the Covenanted Service, if their service is, in special cases, meritorious and distinguished. The one-sixth or one-fifth of the reserved appointments assigned to the Statutory Service I would dispose of in this way.

Mr. *Stokes.*

I have made myself acquainted with the privileges which English-born subjects have under the law; although, if you ask me, I could not particularize them. They refer to the mode of trial. I don't know that Natives have any privileges; all, however, should be treated equally in all ways. Certain Natives have the privilege of exemption from appearance in Civil Courts. I cannot say whether any Europeans have it. I would not exclude such Natives from the definition.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

As regards pay, I think it should be equal for the same office. There should be no distinction. The pay of the service all round should be reduced to two-thirds, and European Civil Servants from England should get one-third of the present pay as an allowance. There would be no distinction as to pay; but there would be an allowance which would not be objected to. I have consulted some of my friends, and there would be no objection.

As to furlough, I do not know the rules; but if they are favorable to

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

Europeans, they should be kept as they are.

Pension should be calculated on the pay of the office, and there should be no distinction. I do not know what Covenanted Civilians now pay for their pension. But I speak on the supposition that the present rules are not complained of.

I have only one thing more to say with regard to recruitment from educationally backward provinces and classes by open competition. It is quite possible that for some time to come these classes or provinces would not succeed in obtaining appointments in the public service to the same extent as others do, and they will be thrown into the background, but the Government is liberal and educates all people alike. If the people do not take advantage of this, it is their own fault. If for political or administrative reasons it is found desirable to encourage these backward classes or provinces, I would propose some favourable arrangement for them and make them educate their children.

WITNESS XXV.—13th January 1887.

Examination of RANGANATH NARSINH MUDHOLKAR, B.A. & B.E. of the Bombay University, Pleader of the Bombay High Court, the Resident's Court at Hyderabad, and the Berar Courts.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

I know five members of the Statutory Civil Service who are serving in the Bombay Presidency, and two in the Madras Presidency. Of five, I am obliged to say that they are not fit for the service at all. Of the other two, though greatly superior to the five, I must say they have no pretention to equality with the Covenanted Civilians who come from England. I know one Statutory Civilian lately appointed in Scinde, who is quite on a par with the average of the Covenanted Civil Service. Three of the gentlemen were fellow-students with me: the others I have met in private life, and I have heard much about them from members of the Bar who practise before them.

In Berar there is a system of appointment somewhat similar to the rules of the Statutory Civil Service. There have been several appointments under this system. I have practised before

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

officers so appointed; and although there are some exceptions, speaking of them as a class, neither I nor the general public are satisfied with them. By the general public I mean litigants and those who have occasion to appear before them.

I do not wish that the Statute 33 Vic. should be repealed, but that the rules should be abolished, and that the definition should be amended so as to include Native subjects of Feudatory States and to exclude all persons who have privileges under the Criminal Procedure Code.

The rules are objectionable, because the system thereby established cannot be distinguished from organized patronage, and patronage has a tendency to demoralize both those who exercise it and those in whose favour it is exercised. The selections made are not generally happy, and this injures the estimation of the capacity which Natives possess for official life.

Ramganath Narsinh Mudholkar.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

I would recruit for one half of the posts allotted to the Statutory Service by competition among members of the Uncovenanted Service, and for one-half by competition among members of the legal profession; but in this case I would insist on some professional standing, *e.g.* that they should be pleaders of a High Court and of so many years' standing. I would, of course, include barristers among pleaders.

I would not compel a selected candidate to proceed to England if he has had a high professional training in India; otherwise I would do so.

Mr. *White.*

Would not the best test of the merit of members of the Uncovenanted Service be a long period of efficient service? —No. I think it almost impossible for the most conscientious ruler to know the relative merits of all men who may be candidates for higher employment so as to secure the most efficient. I would impose a minimum of five years' service in the Uncovenanted branch as a qualification.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

Pleaders in the Berars of good ability make from Rs. 800 to Rs. 1,500 a month after five years' practise and upwards, and in the Bombay High Court the most successful and presumably the most able make Rs. 3,000 or Rs. 4,000 a month. Men making good professional incomes would not compete for the lower posts in the Civil Service, but they would for District Judgeships or higher posts. I think that men of thirty years of age and upwards would be willing to compete at an examination for an appointment if the prize were large enough. It is possible that candidates from the Bar would be men who had failed in their profession, while good men would not risk their reputation by submitting to an examination in which they might fail.

I agree with the last witness that the Native officials brought into the Berars from outside are most of them inferior in education to some men of the Province who were also of respectable family.

I admit that until the last ten years there was not much education in Berar. The first graduate from that Province passed in 1876. The outsiders, of whom I have spoken, have been brought in, most of them subsequently to that period. I am not speaking now of the Uncovenanted officers, but of the officers who are analogous to Statutory Civilians.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

I cannot say whether the majority have been appointed by the Government of India of its own motion. Some of them say they have been appointed on the recommendation of the Resident. There are, I think, in the Uncovenanted Service men who are superior to the gentlemen of whom I am speaking.

The *President.*

Dissatisfaction is felt by the educated and literary classes at the system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service, because while the the Statutes 3 and 4 William IV. declares that no person is to be excluded from office, and the Statute for the establishment of the Covenanted Civil Service contemplates the admission of all subjects of Her Majesty, the rules framed to carry out that Act practically exclude the Natives of this country. The limit of age and place of examination are the obstacles to which I refer. The maximum age should be raised to twenty-three, and identical examinations should be held simultaneously in India and in England; Arabic and Sanskrit should be assigned the same marks as Latin; and Persian should be introduced and placed on a par with German; there should be a paper on Indian history which should receive the same marks as English history. I admit that the study of Indian history may not at present afford the same intellectual training as that of English history, but I think that it has considerable practical value for India.

There should be one list of candidates; those who obtain the highest marks should succeed.

The candidates who succeed in India should, I think, be compelled to go to England to complete their training, and should receive the allowances paid to the successful English candidates, and also their passage-money.

All selected candidates who have not already obtained a University degree should be compelled to take a degree at a University, and to attend a recognized course of law lectures. If a man failed to take a degree after the usual period, his allowance would cease, and if he failed at the ensuing examination he would lose his appointment.

I would recruit the Uncovenanted Civil Service from Natives of India, as defined in Statute 33 Vic. C. 3, with the amendments I have before mentioned.

I would recruit by nomination and by competition. Taking the posts of Tahsildars, half the vacancies should be

The *President*—continued.

filled by promotion and the other half by competitive examination, in which the technical knowledge required in the department should be an element. An educational qualification, not less than that of having passed the Entrance Examination of a University, should be required of all candidates for the examination. Similarly, in the case of Extra Assistant Commissioners, there should be nomination and competition, but in this case all, whether nominated or competitioners, should be required to have passed an examination of the same character as that for High Court Pleaders and Subordinate Judges in the Bombay Presidency.

In the case of Berar, I would select Tahsildars provincially, but as the Province is backward I would at present allow outsiders to compete for Extra Assistant Commissioners.

The *President*—continued.

While I think that furlough rules may be framed with regard to the domicile of officers, there is no reason why there should be any distinction as to pension.

I have only to add that I am altogether opposed to caste or class distinctions, but where poverty keeps certain classes backward and prevents them from resorting to the educational institutions provided by Government, encouragement might be held out to them in the shape of special scholarships. In many cases, to my knowledge, it is poverty that keeps many from completing their education.

WITNESS XXVI.—13th January 1887.

Examination of VENKATESH RAMCHANDRA, Editor of *The Berari*, Akola.

Circulation nearly 600 among the educated classes. Is published in Anglo-Mahratti.

Venkatesh Ramchandra.

Mr. VENKATESH RAMCHANDRA said :—I was educated in Umraoti. I am a Mahratta Brahman. The Statutory Civil Service does not exist in Berar, but young men are nominated to the Commission on similar principles. My age is twenty-five. I have edited the *Berari* for three years ; before that, I was at College and contributing to a paper. I have taken no degree, but only passed the Matriculation Examination.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

With regard to the Statutory Service, the appointments are not generally approved. The selections are not always happy. The men fail as regards intellectual qualities. They are always brought from outside and not from Berar. Men from Berar would, I should think, be more acceptable and efficient. I would abolish the system and the Act of Parliament, both rules and Act. The Statutory appointments should in that case go to the Uncovenanted Service, and the present Civil Service be reduced one-sixth.

The mode of recruiting for the Covenanted Civil Service is not approved on account of the pecuniary disadvantages in the case of Natives ; also the age is too low, and parents object to sending their sons to England as there are no arrangements for looking after their moral character. I would raise the age to twenty-three and add Indian History and Persian to the subjects of examination, and raise the marks for Arabic and Sanskrit from 500 to 800, like Latin. I would give Persian 600, as it is a classical language. I would examine in India as well as in England, examinations being simultaneous and identical. There should be one list for both examinations. I would not compel, but would encourage, successful men to go to England.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*—continued.

The Uncovenanted Civil Service should be recruited from Natives as described in the Statute and Natives of Feudatory States. I would appoint by free competition. In the Berars the educated classes would win the Tahsildarships. The educated classes are chiefly Brahmans and some Hindus and Mussulmans. Brahman Tahsildars would be acceptable to the people. The recruitment should be made provincial ; only from Berar for that province.

As to pay, officers who come from Europe should get more than the Natives of India. The Furlough rules should give advantages to Europeans, but there should be no distinction of pension. I have nothing else to add.

Vol. III.
Sec. II.
C. P.

Prahlad Narain Yod

WITNESS XXVII.—13th January 1887.

Examination of ~~PRUBLAD NARAIN YOD~~ Prahlad Narayan Yod, Pleader of the Bombay High Court and the Resident's Court in Berar.

Mr. ~~PRUBLAD NARAIN YOD~~ Prahlad Narayan Yod said:—I am a Native of Bombay and was for three years Subordinate Judge in the Bombay Presidency. That was three years ago. I entered Government service six years ago. I am B. A. & B. L., and a Mahratta Brahman. I am not a Member of the Sarvajanik Sabha.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

I have seen some Statutory Civilians, and know how they are appointed. The system is not approved. The Statute does not require that out of men of proved merit and ability the best should be appointed. It is difficult to say what was intended by "proved merit and ability." The expression is always misconstrued in making appointments. I would abolish the whole Statute and system, and give the appointments to the Uncovenanted Service.

Much dissatisfaction is felt by all able to think about it as to the mode of recruiting for the Civil Service. The grounds of dissatisfaction (some out of many) are—that the candidates have to study through the medium of a foreign language; the marks for Arabic and Sanskrit are not the same as for Latin; vernacular languages are not included in subjects of examination; the loss of money incurred in cases of failure in examination; the inability of a large number of the population to undergo a voyage to, and residence in, England; and the religious objections of some orthodox parents to send their children to England. To remove the first objection it would be necessary to increase the age by four years for Native candidates alone.

How would the following scheme be regarded by the Native community?—The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of European officers, admission being by competition in England confined to European candidates only. The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, Natives only being eligible. This plan would remove all objections. The examination in India should be identical with that in England, and there would have to be two lists, the candidates in each list being arranged in order of merit. The candidates in India should be encouraged, but not compelled, to go to England to complete their training. I know some of the successful candidates in Bombay. They are not the best that could have been obtained. Better men would have been got by examination in India.

The Uncovenanted Service should not be recruited from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, but from permanent residents in India. This is on grounds of economy. Appointments should be made of all officers by competition. Subordinate Judges are appointed in Bombay by competition. The plan is very successful. Their recruitment should be from all India.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*—continued.

Mr. *Stokes.*

The competition for Subordinate Judges is open. The age of appointment is about twenty-five.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

I should think that before appointment they should have practised at the Bar for at least two years: they may either practise before or after they pass the qualifying examinations. University students complete their education and take the B.A. between the age of twenty-four and twenty-six. On an average, a student fails about once in the F.A. and twice in the B.A., so twenty-four to twenty-six is the average. In Bombay the men pass at about twenty-five years of age for Subordinate Judgeships, that is before they practise at all. A man may at present become a Subordinate Judge without practice at the Bar, but he will not be able to do so when the new rules come into force two years hence. It would be desirable to appoint at a somewhat later age, say four years later. Men will by the new rules be required to practise for three years before appointment. I would appoint judicial officers by competition and not examination. Pleaders who have obtained fair practice would not compete for Subordinate Judgeships. They would get larger incomes by practice; but men who have Government service in view from the first would go through the training and accept office. It takes about five years in Bombay to get into practice. We should not get second-rate men only. Some men are tempted by status and pension, and contemplate Government service from the outset.

Mr. *Stokes.*

At the Bar it is my experience that it is always the best men that make money—I mean the best lawyers as practitioners. There are some who are more able as advocates than they would be as judges. Taking lower fees never succeeds. The best lawyer gets the largest fees and gets on fastest. A man who takes lower fees may go ahead of his contemporaries for a few months, but he never succeeds in the long run.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

I have not thought of the pay and furlough rules. I have nothing else to add.

PROCEEDINGS

OF THE

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

VOLUME III.—PROCEEDINGS RELATING TO THE CENTRAL PROVINCES.

(*Including the Hyderabad Assigned Districts.*)

SECTION III.—SUB-SECTION *A.—Replies of Societies and Associations.*

CONTENTS.

I.—The LOKA SABHA, Nagpur.
II.—The HITKARNI SABHA, Jubbulpur.
III.—The HIT SABHA, Saugor.

PROCEEDINGS

OF THE

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

VOLUME III.—PROCEEDINGS RELATING TO THE CENTRAL PROVINCES.

SECTION III.—SUB-SECTION A.—*Replies of Societies and Associations.*

No. I.

THE LOKA SABHA SOCIETY, NAGPUR.

I.—Statutory Civil Service.

Vol. III. Sec. III. Sub-Sec. A.

Loka Sabha Society, Nagpur.

1. Is the existing system of appointing Natives, as Statutory Civilians, to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—As far as the Loka Sabha has been able to ascertain, the prevalent feeling, with respect to the existing system of appointing Natives, as Statutory Civilians, to Covenanted posts, is one of dissatisfaction. In our humble opinion the present Statutory system should be entirely done away with, the Statute of 1870 being utilised only for promoting Uncovenanted officers, and for appointing persons from the legal profession, of "proved merit and ability," to Covenanted posts.

2. If it is not, what are the grounds of disapprobation?—The following are some of the grounds for the feeling of dissatisfaction:—

(*a*) The number of appointments is not sufficiently large to satisfy the growing aspirations of the people to posts of higher honor and responsibility.

(*b*) The nomination system, as at present worked, is against the spirit of the Statute of 1870, inasmuch as the nominees are not men of "proved merit and ability."

(*c*) A system, under which selections are made mainly from a consideration of the social rank and family status of the nominees and not of intellectual superiority, offers no sufficient guarantee that really good and qualified men would be appointed.

(*d*) The selections hitherto made have not, with a few exceptions, been altogether happy, and the nominees are not likely to merit higher appointments.

(*e*) The system of nomination fosters favoritism.

3. Are the defects of the existing system, (if any), susceptible of remedy—(*a*) by an amendment of the rules; (*b*) by an amendment of the Statutory provisions in that behalf; or should those provisions be repealed?—If the system is retained, then the only effectual way to make it work well is to introduce provincial competitive examinations for the recruitment of the Statutory Service.

4. If the provisions of the Statute 33 Vic., Section 6, are not repealed, nor substantially amended, so as to take away the power conferred on the local administrations, should they be amended in respect of the description of persons on whose behalf such powers may be exercised or in respect of the sanction required for appointments made thereunder?—The definition of the words "Natives of India" is sufficiently clear and comprehensive.

5. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so?—It is not considered advisable to make it compulsory on the part of the selected candidates to proceed to England; but they should be encouraged by every means to do so.

II.—Covenanted Civil Service.

6. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—A feeling of dissatisfaction prevails with regard to the existing system. It practically excludes Natives from the service by placing impassable obstacles in their way.

7. Should any, and if any what, change be made in that system?—There should be simultaneous and identical examination in England and India.

8. Do Natives of India labor under any, and, if any, what, disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the

service?—The Native candidates labor under the following disadvantages:—

(*a*) The limit of age is too low for Native students, to enable them to master foreign languages and compete with English candidates in them, at such a difficult examination, as that held for the Covenanted Civil Service.

(*b*) A journey to, and residence and education in, England are very expensive.

(*c*) A lesser value is attached to the Indian classics.

(*d*) A greater value is attached to some of the European languages, a knowledge of which the English candidates can acquire with more ease.

9. By what changes may those disadvantages be minimised or removed?—The disadvantages may be minimised by making the following alterations:—

(*a*) By holding simultaneous and identical examination in England and India.

(*b*) By raising the limit of age to twenty-three years.

(*c*) By raising the maximum number of marks in Sanskrit and Arabic, so as to place them on a par with Latin and Greek.

(*d*) By raising the maximum number of marks in English and the scientific subjects to 500.

(*e*) By giving greater prominence to such subjects as Logic, Political Economy and Mathematics.

(*f*) And if the present system of holding examination in England be retained, by establishing scholarships, and allowing passage money to selected Native candidates.

10. If an examination is held in India—

(1) Should it be identical with that held in England?

(2) Should it be held at one or more centres in India?

Should the candidates in England and in India compete with one another, and be selected in order of merit, or should a certain number of appointments be apportioned for competition to the candidates at the respective examinations?

(3) If such an apportionment is made, on what principle is it to be regulated?

(4) Should there be an apportionment between the residents in the territories of the several administrations respectively or between the members of the principal religious sects?

—The examination should be identical with that held in England. It should be held at some one central station in India.

11. If an examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—The successful candidates should be afforded every facility; but not compelled to go to, and complete their education in, England.

12. Are the young Natives obtained under the existing system of the open competition in England the best, as regards character and capacity, who could be obtained under any system?—The Native Civilians have, up to the present time, proved themselves to be worthy of the high powers vested in them. But whether they are the very best men, who could be got, is a different question altogether. The existing system of holding examination in England prevents many promising young men from competing, who might otherwise have been very useful members of the service and worthy servants of the State.

III.—Uncovenanted Service.

13. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—The recruitment should be by a system of provincial competitive examination, in which all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty should be allowed to appear.

IV.—Pay and Furlough Rules.

14. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service according as the posts are held by members of that branch of the service or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—The pay should be the same for both Europeans and Natives; but the former should be allowed some fixed personal allowance in consideration of their having to leave their own country to serve in a far distant one.

No. II.

The Hitkarni Sabha Society, Jubbulpur.

I.—Statutory Civil Service.

Vol. III. Sec. III. Sub-Sec. A.

Hitkarni Sabha Society, Jubbulpur.

1. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—The existing system is not approved. The rules under the Statute are defective. The Statute provides, that proved merit and ability should be the test of nomination, thereby, it is believed, intending to confine nominations from the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service or the professional classes; but the rules, framed under the Statute, do not make any such provision as regards first appointment. The Sabha would, therefore, confine the operation of the Statute to the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service and the professional classes, and close the service for first appointments.

2. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so?—No, it is not necessary for members of the Uncovenanted Service or the professional classes from which the recruitment is proposed to proceed to England.

II.—Covenanted Civil Service.

3. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service? Should any, and, if any, what, change be made in that system? Do Natives of India labor under any, and if any what, disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the service?—Yes, dissatisfaction is felt, and the Natives of India do labor under the disadvantage, not only of age and subjects of examination, but parents and guardians are unwilling to send their children, at so tender an age as seventeen or eighteen, to a distant country, where the chance of success is very small. Besides these difficulties there are also caste prejudices to certain sections of the community.

4. By what changes may those disadvantages be minimised or removed?—The disadvantages may be removed or minimised in the following way:—

(*a*) By raising the limit of age from nineteen to twenty-three years.

(*b*) By adding Persian, and altering the maxima marks obtainable in Sanskrit and other subjects.

(*c*) By holding simultaneously examinations in England and in India.

5. If an examination is held in India—

(1) Should it be identical with that held in England?

(2) Should it be held at one or more centres in India?

Should the candidates in England and in India compete with one another, and be selected in order of merit, or should a certain number of appointments be apportioned for competition to the candidates at the respective examinations?

(3) If such an apportionment is made, on what principle is it to be regulated?

(4) Should there be an apportionment between the residents in the territories of the several administrations respectively or between the members of the principal religious sects?

—If an examination is held in India—

(1) It should be identical.

(2) It would be convenient for the candidates to have two centres, one at Calcutta and another at Bombay. If this be not feasible, one centre of examination at any suitable place in India will suffice.

(3) The candidates in England and in India should compete with one another and be selected in order of merit.

(4) There should be no apportionment between the residents in the territories of the several administrations, nor between the members of the principal religious sects.

6. If an examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—No, but they may be encouraged to do so, if they wish.

7. Are the young Natives, obtained under the existing system of the open competition in England, the best, as regards character and capacity, who could be obtained under any system?—The Sabha is not in a position to give any decided opinion on the point.

III.—Uncovenanted Service.

8. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—The service should be recruited only from Natives of India, as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6.

9. Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or by both systems combined; and if by both combined, should one system be applied to all offices or classes of offices, or should the system be varied with the class of offices?—The recruitment should be by competition and nomination, and for this purpose the service should be divided into two branches. In the upper one, the appointments, up to the grade of Tahsildars and requiring special training, should be filled, except in special cases, for providing suitable appointments to men of high and respectable families, by some competitive test, to be prescribed by the local Government, and in the lower branch, Government may nominate desirable persons, but a graded system in it should be introduced.

10. Whatever system be adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several administrations only from persons resident in the territories under such administrations respectively or with a preference for such residents?—Whatever may be the system, the recruitment should, as a rule, be confined to all the permanent residents of the province.

11. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes, if the facilities, proposed above, for entering the Covenanted Service by means of open competition are granted.

IV.—Pay and Furlough Rules.

12. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service according as the posts are held by members of that branch of the service or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—The Sabha is of opinion that there should be some distinction maintained. A Native of India serving in his own country does not require to be so highly remunerated as a foreigner.

Resolutions of the Hitkarni Sabha on the Public Service Question.

I. "That the open competitive examination for the Covenanted Civil Service be held simultaneously in India and in England; that the examinations, thus held, are to be identical and equally open to all classes of Her Majesty's subjects, and that one classified list be prepared according to merit."

II. "That it is hoped that the Civil Service Commissioners will give fair consideration to Sanskrit and Persian among the subjects of examination."

III. "That the limit of age for the open competitive examination be raised from nineteen to twenty-three years, as recommended by Sir Charles Aitchison."

IV. "That simultaneous examinations being granted, the Statutory Civil Service must be closed for first appointments."

V. "That the appointments in the Statutory Civil Service, under the existing rules, be still left open to the members of the Uncovenanted Service and to professional men of proved merit and ability."

VI. "That the Uncovenanted appointments down to the grade of Tahsildars, and requiring special training be filled, except in special cases, by some competitive test, to be prescribed by the local Government and held in the province and confined to all the permanent residents of the province; other appointments to be filled by nomination from amongst the permanent residents of the province and a graded system in them be introduced."

No. III.

The Hit Sabha Society, Saugor.

I.—Statutory Civil Service.

Vol III. Sec. III. Sub-Sec. A.

Hit Sabha Society, Saugor.

The Sabha is of opinion that the prevalent feeling amongst the educated and intelligent men in the Central Provinces, regarding the Statutory system, is the one of dissatisfaction. The people do not want a separate service, which is regarded as inferior in every way to the Covenanted Service. The Sabha wish for the abolition of the Statutory Service altogether, and there is no need for the State to support a class of public servants, who are regarded as quite inferior in ability and education to the Covenanted Civilians. Their pay also has an effect of lowering them before the eyes of the public. The Sabha also object, (on principle), to the present mode of selections of the candidates to the Statutory Civil Service.

If the Statutory system be retained, the Sabha suggests, that a fixed number of the appointments now given to the Civilians, should be reserved annually for the Statutory Civilians. The appointments should be filled up by provincial competitive examinations, to which may be admitted the members of the Uncovenanted Service and the profession. The system of probation is necessary, and the candidates should be encouraged to visit England.

II.—Covenanted Civil Service.

Regarding the Covenanted Service the Sabha advocates a competition in India simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question papers being used at both the examinations. The maximum age should be raised to twenty-two or twenty-three years. The standard and the condition for the examinations in India and in England should be the same, but certain Indian subjects, (such as Arabic, Persian and Sanskrit), should be put on the same footing with the European classics (Latin, French and Greek). There should be free competition. The English candidates are at liberty to compete in India and the Indian candidatès in England. The educational institutions in India are not sufficient, at present, to impart the very high education necessary for the service, but this difficulty may be avoided by establishing a Civil Service College in some central part in India. The successful candidates should be encouraged to proceed to England, (at the expense of the State), to pass the usual probationary period there; but there should be no compulsion. The Sabha is of opinion, that there must be some difference in the promotion of the candidates, who go to England, and those who do not. The Sabha is of opinion, that, in the case of latter class of candidates, their promotion should be limited up to certain fixed appointment. There should be no difference of pay. A slight difference in pension, in the case of the above two classes of Civil Servants, is desirable.

III.—Uncovenanted Civil Service.

The members for the Uncovenanted Service should be recruited only from the Natives of India as defined in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6. The recruitment should be made entirely by provincial competition, which should be thrown open, under certain restrictions, as to previous qualifications, as will be fixed by the rules framed by the local Government. The Sabha is of opinion, that the separation of the Judicial from the Executive Service is necessary. The Sabha is not satisfied at the way in which the Extra Assistant Commissioners are at present appointed. The system may lead to abuse in the hands of a weak local Government. The Sabha may here mention, that some members of the Bar were appointed to this service by our substantive Chief Commissioner; and this has given some satisfaction. The Sabha is not satisfied with the present mode of appointing Tahsildars. The class of persons are not such as are desirable, and with slight care and tact on the part of the local Government a better class of men can be had. The graduates and under-graduates murmur, that the Tahsildars are exclusively recruited from amongst the Sheristadars of Commissioners and Deputy Commissioners. The Sabha strongly advocates a provincial competitive examination. All Government servants under thirty-five years of age and all graduates and under-graduates up to that age may compete. The Naib Tahsildars may be appointed by nomination, and are eligible to compete at the competitive examination for the Tahsildarship. There is no harm, if Civil Judicial Tahsildars (Munsifs) are appointed from the lower grades of Pleaders.

PROCEEDINGS

OF THE

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

VOL. III.—PROCEEDINGS RELATING TO THE CENTRAL PROVINCES.

(Including the Hyderabad Assigned Districts.)

SECTION III.—SUB-SECTION *B.—Replies of persons summoned or invited, but who were unable to attend the sittings of the Commission.*

CONTENTS.

I.—A. H. L. FRASER, Esq., C.S., Secretary to the Chief Commissioner of the Central Provinces.

II.—T. W. CHISHOLM, Esq., Commissioner, Chattisgurh Division, Central Provinces.

III.—F. C. ANDERSON, Esq., C.S., Commissioner of Excise.

IV.—G. P. GOODRIDGE, Esq., C.S., Deputy Commissioner, Sambalpur.

V.—Babu HARI DAS GHOSE, M.A., B.L., Pleader, Hoshangabad.

VI.—GOPAL RAO DONGRE, Additional Tahsildar, Khandwa.

VII.—BERESHWAR DATT, Extra Assistant Commissioner, Jubbulpur.

VIII.—BALWANT RAO BHASKAR, Jagirdar of Tummeim and Honorary Magistrate, Burhanpur.

IX.—K. K. THAKUR, M.A., B.L., Extra Assistant Commissioner, Khandwa.

X.—KASTUR CHAND DAGA, Honorary Magistrate, Kamptee.

XI.—VILKA RAM CHANDER, Extra Assistant Commissioner, Hoshangabad.

XII.—Babu BIPIN KRISHNA BOSE, Advocate, Judicial Commissioner's Court, Central Provinces.

XIII.—SADASHU RAMCHANDRA PATVARDHAN, Pleader and Editor, *Nyaya Sudha* Newspaper, Harda, Central Provinces.

PROCEEDINGS

OF THE

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

VOLUME III.—PROCEEDINGS RELATING TO THE CENTRAL PROVINCES.

(*Including the Berars.*)

SECTION III.—SUB-SECTION *B.—Replies of persons who were summoned or invited, but who were unable to attend the sittings of the Commission.*

No. I.

A. H. L. FRASER, ESQ., M.A., C.S., JUNIOR SECRETARY AND DIRECTOR OF AGRICULTURE, CENTRAL PROVINCES.

I.—Statutory Civil Service.

Vol. III. Sec. III. Sub-Sec. B.

A. H. L. *Fraser*, Esq.

1. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved ?—The existing system is not approved. It is almost universally condemned.

2. If it is not, what are the grounds of disapprobation ?—It is unpopular, because it meets the aims of so insignificant a portion of the community. It has also failed at all to meet the views of that educated community, which our own educational policy has called into existence. Selection to this service has been regarded generally by the Native community as a mere matter of interest and individual favor.

3. Are the defects of the existing system, (if any), susceptible of remedy—(*a*) by an amendment of the rules ; (*b*) by an amendment of the Statutory provisions in that behalf; or should those provisions be repealed ? If the provisions of the Statute 33 Vic., Section 6, are not repealed or substantially amended, so as to take away the power conferred on the local administrations, should they be amended in respect of the description of persons on whose behalf such powers may be exercised or in respect of the sanction required for appointments made thereunder ?—I am in favor of the abolition of the Statutory Civil Service, and the adoption of a system for the employment of Natives, which I shall endeavour to indicate as clearly as possible later. (*Vide* Note.)

4. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so ?—From my point of view it would be unnecessary to deal with this question.

II.—Covenanted Civil Service.

5. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service ?—There is very widespread dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service, because that service is regarded as the one means of advancement to the higher appointments in the public service, and Natives labor under great disadvantages in regard to the competition for entrance into that service. I do not, however, think it necessary to answer in detail the questions under this section, as I propose to treat generally of this subject in a separate note. (Herewith submitted.)

III.—Uncovenanted Service.

6. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty ?—I do not feel able to discuss the wide question of the Uncovenanted Service generally ; but I shall endeavour to state my views, regarding that part of the service, which is employed in Revenue and Judicial work. It is with this part of the service that I have mainly had to deal.

IV.—Pay and Furlough Rules.

7. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service according as the posts are held by members of that branch of the service or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches ? —I am clearly of opinion that there ought to be a difference between the pay of "Covenanted Civilians" and Native officials. But I shall best deal with this, after dealing with the questions of the services and appointments. I do not propose to attempt to deal with any part of this section except the question of pay. The other parts are matters of detail to be regulated by the same principles, as would regulate the matter of salary.

Note by A. H. L. Fraser, Esq.

I.—The Covenanted Civil Service.

It seems to me, that what is known as the Covenanted Civil Service is designed as the best means of securing the British element in the administration of India, and that this intention should be clearly recognised and distinctly stated. It is a political necessity, that certain of the highest, and some proportion of the higher, appointments in the public service of India should be held by Europeans. The original intention of the "Covenanted Civil Service" was to serve as a *corps d'élite* for these posts; and it is only on this ground, I think, that its existence can be justified. Viewed as a means of securing servants for Government it is an expensive and unequal anomaly; but viewed as a means of securing the services of young Enlgishmen for India it is, in the opinion of most, the best system that has yet been devised. This, which seems to me the true object of this "service," should be clearly recognised in dealing with the present question.

2. I think the whole discussion of the claims of the Natives of India to a due share in the administration of the country has been confused by failure to recognise this. What they want is a share in the Government, or, to put it otherwise, a share in the higher appointments; and yet they have often expressed themselves, as though they wished to obtain entrance into the "Covenanted Civil Service." And the efforts made to meet their claims have taken the form of giving them something that was intended to bear some resemblance to that service.

3. The main questions, which arise in connection with the public service in India, seem to me to be: (1) How far is it a political necessity to reserve the higher posts in the service for Englishmen? (2) How best are the Englishmen required to be obtained? (3) How far is it safe to admit Natives to higher posts? (4) How best are the Natives required for higher posts to be obtained? and (5) Should the pay of a Native be the same as that of an Englishman in a similar appointment?

4. I shall not discuss in detail the first of these questions. I am very clearly of opinion, that our position in India still renders it necessary that many of the higher executive posts in the public service must be reserved for Englishmen. I believe, that the number of these posts is less than it was a few years ago, but I have no hesitation in giving in my adherence to the proposition, that the political necessity for reserving some appointments still exists.

5. Then there arises the second question, as to how the Englishmen required are best to be obtained. In my opinion, it is by some such system as at present exists. I see no reason, in respect to the history of the "Covenanted Civil Service," since competition began, for believing, that any great change of system is necessary. But I would insist, that this is a means of obtaining Englishmen and not Natives for the service of Government in India. I would clearly avow this. Not only would I do nothing, to facilitate the admission of Natives of India into, what is called, the "Covenanted Civil Service;" but I would also advocate the distinct declaration, that it is meant to be a *corps d'élite* for posts reserved for Englishmen. It is, I think, quite absurd to declare, that certain posts must be reserved for Englishmen, and at the same time to hesitate to declare, that only Englishmen shall be admitted into the corps from which appointments to these posts are made.

6. It is surely far more in the interests of the Natives, to have it clearly defined, that certain appointments must, as a present political necessity, be reserved for Englishmen; that only the number of Englishmen necessary to fill these posts shall be brought out to India; and that all other appointments shall be given to Natives of the country. I should strongly urge, that this should be done. The "Covenanted Civil Service," as I am compelled to call it for the sake of clearness, should be reserved for those Englishmen, who are to hold the reserved posts; and it should be kept as small as possible, no men being brought out beyond the number required for these posts and for training. I believe this would be a great advantage to the Natives of India.

7. I will add this, by the way, that this frank declaration of the true object of the "Covenanted Civil Service" would not only clear the air in respect to the discussion of the claims of Natives to a share in the administration of the country, but it would also be of great advantage to the "Covenanted Civil Service" itself, in setting free all efforts made for the improvement of that service from the complications, introduced by considerations of their effect in regard to the Natives of India. For example, I consider it a great loss to the service, that men, who go through their University course at home, simply with the view of obtaining a thoroughly sound education, find, when they have taken their degree, that the door of the service is closed to them by the age-limit. Yet I am precluded from the consideration of any means for obviating this

evil by the fact, that the raising of the age-limit seems to tend to the subversion of what seems to me the only *raison d'être* of the service. I mention this, not to press the point raised, but merely as an illustration of the effect of failing, clearly to recognise, and state the true object of the English competitive service.

II.—Statutory Civil Service.

III.—Uncovenanted Civil Service.

8. I pass on now to the consideration of the third and fourth questions, as to how far it is safe to appoint Natives of India to the higher posts in the public service, and how best the Natives required for these posts can be obtained? It would be absurd in me to attempt to enter into a detailed statement of the appointments, which can be given to Natives throughout India. I shall only say in a word, what I think could, at present, be done in this province in the Executive service with which I am connected.

9. I think, that this is one of these questions in respect to which it is, not only vain, but foolish, to insist on finality. It is in the interests, not only of Government, but also of the people of the country generally, that Native officials should only be admitted to high offices after they have proved, or given reasonable ground to believe in, their fitness for those offices. It is, therefore, the duty of Government to fix the high offices to which Natives shall be eligible with due regard to their fitness for these offices. At the same time experience has shown, how little respect is paid to the just claims of the Natives, when local Governments are left to raise and settle the question of fitness in each individual case. It appears to be necessary for Government to fix, with due regard to the character and circumstances of the Native community, the exact number or proportion of the high offices, which may be safely given to Natives. It will then be left to the local Government merely to appoint the best Natives to these offices; and the number and proportion of these offices would be altered from time to time, as the Natives secured the confidence of Government in their rectitude and efficiency. It is absurd to object to this, that it lacks finality and leaves the possibility of agitation. Agitation by some will never cease, until Englishmen have ceased to have any share in the Government of India. On the other hand, the share Englishmen are to have in high office is a matter of political necessity, and must vary with the circumstances of the times.

10. Accepting this general principle, I should say, in regard to the Central Provinces, that we could safely agree to allow six of our Deputy Commissioners to be Natives of the country. We have at present, above the grade of Extra Assistant Commissioner, twenty-four Assistants and eighteen Deputy Commissioners. If we gave six of the latter appointments to Natives, we should not require to have more than sixteen European Assistants. Thus Natives would get at least eight of the Assistantships. They might quite well also get the two Small Cause Courts. This would be a total of sixteen of the higher appointments in the commission. It would be a very great stride in advance of what has ever been done here before. It would not be taken without the probability of some loss of efficiency; but it is worth while to make the experiment; and I believe, that this experiment could be safely made, though I should fear to advise more for the present. Of course the number of young Englishmen recruited would have to be reduced by one-third. Of course also the scheme would have to be carried out with due regard to the claims of young men now in the service. It would, therefore, be about ten or twelve years before we could see all our six Native Deputy Commissioners, unless vacancies were provided by Government in other than ordinary course, a step which I would not recommend.

11. Then comes the question of how these gentlemen should be appointed. I prefer not to enter on the general question, where I should probably lose myself in theories, but to confine myself to the consideration of these appointments in this province. I could not recommend the Chief Commissioner, (if I were advising him), to appoint them by competition. Of course competition, open to all India, would mean, for the present at least, the almost total exclusion of Natives of this province. This is a fatal objection to open competition. But I am not even prepared to recommend competition open to Natives of the province. Competition is not so suitable to India as to England, as a means of selection of public servants. In England the main test required is one for intellectual attainment: loyalty may certainly, and moral sense may almost certainly, be taken for granted. In India it is necessary to have some guarantee both of loyalty and moral sense, and the test of intellectual attainment takes, therefore, a less important place in this country. If competition were adopted, it would have to be limited in a way, that would to a large extent sacrifice the principle supposed to underlie that system.

12. For my own part I attach little

importance to one method of selection, as compared with another, except on the one point, as to how the best men are to be obtained. I have enquired from many Natives in this province, both official and non-official, both men of the old school and of the new; and while some have complained of the manner in which our two appointments to the Statutory Civil Service have been made, I have found general satisfaction expressed on all hands with the manner in which appointments have been made to the posts of Tahsildar and Extra Assistant Commissioner. It has been put to me in this way by more than one intelligent Native gentleman, that the appointments to the Statutory Civil Service have been simply the appointment of untried young men to high place, owing to some interest of their fathers with the Government of the day, whereas the appointments to the offices of Tahsildar and Extra Assistant Commissioner have been the selection of men for onerous and important work, in respect to which the administration has realised strongly the necessity of efficiency and trustworthiness. There is a good deal of truth in this, and it seems to me, to point out a suitable method of selection for the higher posts to be given to Natives.

13. I mean that, if we make the Tahsildarships and Extra Assistant Commissionerships of one province the first step to the higher appointments, the objections to selection almost wholly disappear. The importance of efficiency and trustworthiness is forced upon the immediate attention of the local Government; and the number of appointments available is so large, that it becomes possible to give due weight to the claims of candidates and to their educational and other qualifications.

14. What I should propose then, for the province of which I have experience is this:—

(1) That we have, as now, fifty Tahsildars, divided into four grades from Rs. 150 to Rs. 250 per mensem: all "Natives."

(2) That we have, as now, "thirty-six" Extra Assistant Commissioners in five grades from Rs. 250 to Rs. 600 per mensem: all Natives.

(3) That we have about twelve Native Assistant Commissioners in four classes from about Rs. 333 to Rs. 533. This is new.

(4) That we have two Small Cause Court Judges and six Native Deputy Commissioners in four classes from about Rs. 666 to Rs. 1,222. This also is new.

I reserve the question of pay for later consideration; and meanwhile only deal with the above classification of the appointments in the commission, which I would have open to Natives.

15. I should propose that Native gentlemen, aspiring to the higher appointments, should enter the service of Government as Tahsildars. I cannot think of any young gentleman in this province whose services it would be worth while to try to secure, who would be, by his birth or his educational qualifications, above accepting the office of Tahsildar for a year or two on Rs. 150 per mensem, if he had the hope of rising by his merit and distinguished service to the office of Deputy Commissioner on Rs. 1,200. The office of Tahsildar is one of considerable dignity; and the work of Tahsildar is an excellent training.

16. I would have promotion *among* Tahsildars by seniority; but I would not recognise any claim, based on seniority, to promotion from the grade of Tahsildar to that of Extra Assistant Commissioner. Similarly I would recognise seniority among Extra Assistant Commissioners; but no claim, but merit and efficiency, for promotion from that grade to an Assistant Commissionership. So again I would recognise the claims of seniority among assistants, but only merit would constitute a claim to a Deputy Commissionership. These promotions by merit would be made, as vacancies among the Native officers occurred, and could be subject in each case to the sanction of the Government of India, if considered necessary.

17. Although I have said that aspirants to high office must begin as Tahsildars, I do not mean, that only Tahsildars would be appointed as Extra Assistant Commissioners. Vacancies in that class of officers would be filled up, as now, from among clerks of Court, &c., as well as from among Tahsildars.

18. I provide higher grades of Tahsildars and Extra Assistant Commissioners than are required for aspirants to high office, so that men, not fit for higher appointments, would still have a fairly lucrative and honorable career as at present.

19. I need scarcely add, that I do not mean that all appointments to Tahsildarships should be made direct. Promotions to that grade from the grade of Additional Tahsildar or Naib Tahsildar would be made as at present. And, further, appointments of young men as Additional or Naib Tahsildars would be made direct as at present. All that I mean is, that the grade of Tahsildar would be the *highest* to which I would propose to make first appointments of Natives, who might aspire to high executive office. I consider it quite unnecessary to begin higher, because the office of Tahsildar is dignified and lucrative enough to attract the best young men, provided that the hope of promotion to a Deputy Commissionership is held out to merit.

20. In sketching the above scheme, I do not forget the objections, that may be

A. H. L. *Fraser*, Esq.

raised to making a European Civilian subordinate to a Native Deputy Commissioner. I do not intend, for I have not time, to discuss these objections at length. I content myself with making the following brief statement of opinion :—

(*a*) No Englishman *in England* would regard it as any objection to the service, that he might have to serve under a Native ; therefore the class of Englishmen attracted to the service would not deteriorate.

(*b*) A young Englishman coming to this country might be delivered from the unworthy feelings, which some of our junior officers sometimes have towards Natives, by the mere fact of serving under a specially selected and distinguished native officer.

(*c*) Friction, and the difficulty, which might be felt by a Native officer in keeping a subordinate European up to his work, would be much lessened by the authority of the Commissioner, which in this province is very real.

(*d*) There are now more than six districts in this province, which never have a European assistant ; at the same time I would not recommend that Native Deputy Commissioners should not have English assistants.

(*e*) The Natives cannot be expected to be satisfied with less than I propose ; and some sacrifice must be made to meet their legitimate aspirations.

(*f*) We must strive to make Englishmen and Natives work better together ; and our best "Civilians" are those to whom we must most look for assistance in this matter.

IV.—Pay, &c.

21. I come now to the last point, which I intend to touch, *viz.*, the question of pay. I am not going to attempt to enter into details about pay, furlough rules, &c. I have only to say, that I do not think that any intelligent Native will fail to see that a certain number of rupees mean less real pay to an Englishman in India than to a Native. And, therefore, apparent equality means real inequality. We must pay more to Englishmen, than we require to pay to secure good Native officers ; and we do so fairly and justly on account of the political necessity, that exists for the employment of Englishmen in certain offices. Let this necessity be honestly avowed ; and the necessary conclusion as to pay follows. I think that two-thirds of the Englishman's pay would satisfy the reasonable Native Deputy or Assistant Commissioner.

22. I think that Native gentlemen appointed to the service with reasonable hope of high office would very often make an effort to pay a visit to England. I would not compel this ; and I would only encourage it by giving furlough at an earlier stage of his service to any Native officer, who might wish to use his furlough for that purpose, that is, I would give him only the allowances prescribed by rule, but not insist on his fulfilling the conditions as to length of service. This was actually proposed in the case of Mr. Alay Muhammad, Statutory Civilian, in this province.

Conclusion.

23. I have not touched on the police service, where perhaps the higher appointments might be given to Natives more frequently than now. Nor have I dealt with the Education Department, where Natives seem fit certainly to hold District Inspectorships. Nor have I alluded to the hardship of closing all hope of an Indian career to the sons of English officers of our services, who often have, by spending their life in India, lost all influence and interest at home. I have no time to enter into these and many other questions, and can only regret the haste with which I have had to state my views, (not however hastily formed), on the subjects I have discussed.

No. II.

J. W. CHISHOLM, ESQ., COMMISSIONER, CHATTISGARH DIVISION, CENTRAL PROVINCES.

I.—Statutory Civil Service.

1. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—The system is not generally approved of.

2. If it is not, what are the grounds of disapprobation?—What is urged is, that most of the men, who enter the Statutory Service, are neither in position nor attainments superior to those who hold appointments in the ordinary line in the Uncovenanted Service as Extra Assistants or Deputy Collectors. Further the appointments can only be obtained by those, who have interest, and it is considered objectionable, that entrance into the Civil Service should be regulated as a matter of favor.

3. Are the defects of the existing system (if any) susceptible of remedy—
(*a*) by an amendment of the rules;
(*b*) by an amendment of the Statutory provisions in that behalf;
or should those provisions be repealed?—I think the best course would be to repeal the Statutory provisions and to introduce a different system for appointment to the service.

II.—Covenanted Civil Service.

4. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—The educated classes express very general dissatisfaction with the existing system of recruitment for the Civil Service.

5. Should any, and if any what, change be made in that system?—If it is intended to meet, to any considerable extent, what may be characterised as the very legitimate aspirations of the educated classes very great changes will require to be made in the present constitution of the Civil Service. The basis of the service should, I think, be enlarged, and there should be no such arbitrary limit, as at present between Covenanted and Uncovenanted appointments. The service should be open, and there should be no bar to men of proved merit and ability rising to the higher appointments. The difficulty of having to deal with a service possessing vested claims would only be temporary, for the whole service, Covenanted and Uncovenanted, could be so reorganised, as to admit hereafter of appointments being made after due consideration of the claims both of English and Native officers. A reorganisation of the service in this way, so that high appointments would be open to deserving officers, would attract the best Natives into the public service, and would be more in keeping with the existing requirements of the country, than a close service inaugurated at a time, when the higher education was not within reach of the people.

It would only be the best men, who would obtain the higher appointments, and they would have shown their fitness for promotion by actual work, which is a better test than mere quickness and efficiency in passing a competitive examination. It is a matter of experience, that competition cannot be made a certain guarantee of efficiency, and this can be more confidently asserted of Natives than of Englishmen. Men unsuited for important appointments are often found in India, who have passed excellent examinations. The general training of Englishmen from their boyhood, together with their whole surroundings and associations, protects them from so many failures in this respect as will be found among Natives.

6. Do Natives of India labor under any, and if any what, disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the service?—The expense of going to England and the loss of caste resulting therefrom, together with the risk of being alienated altogether from their own people, are great drawbacks to Natives competing for entry into the Civil Service. The number in a position to compete must always be comparatively few.

7. If an examination is held in India—
(1) Should it be identical with that held in England?
(2) Should it be held at one or more centres in India?
Should the candidates in England and in India compete with one another and be selected in order of merit, or should a certain number of appointments be apportioned for competition to the candidates at the respective examinations?
(3) If such an apportionment is made, on what principle is it to be regulated?
(4) Should there be an apportionment between the residents in the territories of the several administrations respectively or between the members of the principal religious sects?

—If an examination were held in India, it should be held at two or more central stations. The standard should be as high as for the English competition, but Sanskrit, Arabic and Persian should be substituted for Latin and Greek and modern languages. A certain number of appointments should be allotted to India, and then distributed among the different provinces. The Natives of each province should only be declared eligible to compete for the number of appointments allotted to their province, namely, Bengalis for Bengal, Punjabis for the Punjab, and so on. It would be necessary to fix a certain standard number of marks, which it would be necessary to obtain, before any candidate could be considered to have passed. In a province from which sufficient candidates failed to pass to fill the allotted appointments, these should be filled up by nomination under rules prepared for the purpose.

8. If an examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—There should not, in my opinion, be any rule requiring passed candidates to proceed to England to complete their training. If it be held, that Natives of India are not qualified to hold certain appointments in their own country, unless they have been to England, then the time has not come for making concessions such as now proposed. This is not my view. I think that a Native of India can be a thoroughly efficient public servant, without going to England, and it seems to me quite unjustifiable to impose on the public revenues heavy charges, in order to train Natives in England for service in India.

9. Are the young Natives obtained under the existing system of the open competition in England the best as regards character and capacity who could be obtained under any system?—It is probable, that no better Natives could be obtained under any system than at present enter the Civil Service by the door of public competition in England, but so far as the educated classes in India are concerned this system stands condemned, inasmuch as they regard it as designed to keep as few Natives as possible from entering the Civil Service. The result of the present system must always be, that very few Natives will be able to enter the service, and that service must continue to be, as it is now, almost entirely officered by Englishmen.

III.—Uncovenanted Service.

10. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—The Uncovenanted Service should be recruited, I think, from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty. There are some departments, for instance the Police, in which Europeans would for long require to be largely employed.

11. Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or by both systems combined; and if by both combined, should one system be applied to all offices or classes of offices, or should the system be varied with the class of offices?—I consider that recruitment for the public service should be partly by competition and partly by nomination, and that this should apply to all branches of the service. I would make an Upper and a Subordinate Civil Service. I would include in the former all Covenanted appointments and the present Uncovenanted appointments of the superior grades. In this upper service a man would be eligible for any appointment, but a fixed proportion of this service in every province would require always to be filled by Englishmen. This service would be entered by—

(1) passing the competitive examination in England;

(2) by a similar examination in India; and

(3) by nomination.

Probably one-third of the appointments might be filled up by each of the above modes of entrance into the service. In any case not less than one-third of the service should be recruited from England, as it is most important that the present class of Englishmen filling the Civil Service should continue to occupy a prominent place in an extended service, which would include a large proportion of Natives. In backward provinces not less than half the service should, in my opinion, be recruited from England. Such a scheme, however, is merely a suggestion, and no attempt need be made to work it out, as it is not likely to receive much support. Some such scheme would partially open up certain of the higher appointments to selected men, already in the Uncovenanted Service, and a career would also be opened through competition for entering the public service to the educated classes. This career would involve an entry into a reorganised Civil Service, but at the same time there would be no claim to the higher posts under a seniority system, which is practically what prevails at present. Such posts would be conferred only on those, who had proved themselves in every way zealous and efficient public servants, and who had shown that they were in every way qualified for the higher appointments.

11. Whatever system be adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several administrations only from persons resident in the territories under such administrations

respectively or with a preference for such residents?—I would only hold Natives of a province or residents therein to be eligible for appointments therein. The appointment of Natives to be made by each local Government after competition or nomination.

IV.—Pay and Furlough Rules.

12. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service according as the posts are held by members of that branch of the service, or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches? —I would give officers, who entered the service by competition in England, a fourth larger salary than I would allow to officers appointed in India.

13. If such distinction should be made, on what principle should it be regulated?—There would seem no difficulty in laying down, that a fourth more salary would be drawn in all appointments in the case of such officers. It must be remembered, that the present salaries of Covenanted officers are all fixed on the presumption, that the posts will be held by foreigners. It is true that Natives now hold these posts on the same pay, who have passed in England. I think it in every way desirable to continue this arrangement, and to encourage Natives to continue passing in England by giving them the same pay as Englishmen, who have passed there.

14. Should any distinction be made in the furlough rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches of the service according to the nationality of the officer, or on any other, and what, ground? —I think leave and furlough rules could be so framed, as to suit all classes of officers.

15. Are the privileges in regard to pay, promotion and retiring annuity and the general conditions of office belonging to the Covenanted Civil Service suitable to Natives obtaining office under the Statutory rules?—I would do away with the Statutory Service altogether, and organise one large service for each province, to include the Covenanted Service, the Statutory Civil Service and the higher grades of the Uncovenanted Service. In a service, thus constituted, it would be found that a large number of the appointments is already held by Natives, but very few of the higher posts fall to their share. I would remedy this, by allowing Natives to rise, and would regulate the promotion of the whole service by merit. The result would be, that within a decade, instead of the top half of the ladder, as regards appointments, being solely occupied by Englishmen, and the latter half by Natives, a fair sprinkling of Natives would be found occupying the higher posts, and those in this position would almost certainly be the pick of the service. In regard to pensions, I think for the future it would be a good rule to make deductions regularly from the pay of the whole service towards an Annuity Fund, and to regulate pensions accordingly. Pensions are an ever-increasing charge, which it would be well to reduce in a reorganised service by a properly constituted Annuity Fund.

No. III.

F. C. ANDERSON, ESQ., C.S., COMMISSIONER OF EXCISE, CENTRAL PROVINCES.

Public Service Commission,

Excluding special departments, such as Police, Forest, Education, &c., which I believe are outside the scope of the present enquiry, I think that for the executive and judicial administration of India there should be two services—the upper administrative and the lower administrative, the upper being recruited partly in England and partly in India, and the lower wholly in India.

There should be a corresponding division of appointments, certain appointments in each province being reserved for men of the upper service, the rest being filled by men of the lower service. The appointments, to be so reserved, would vary in the different provinces. A list of them should be prepared for each province, and, when a new appointment is created, it should be decided, whether it is to be held by a man of the upper or lower service.

In the Central Provinces I would include Commissioners, Deputy Commissioners, Assistant Commissioners, Settlement Officers, Judges of Small Cause Courts and officers invested with civil appellate powers, (Civil Judges), in the upper service, and Extra Assistant Commissioners, Tahsildars, Assistant Settlement Officers, Munsifs and Naib Tahsildars in the lower service.

I should be disposed to discontinue the use of the terms Covenanted, Statutory and Uncovenanted.

For the selection of that portion of the upper service, which is recruited in England, I would retain the present system precisely as it is, making no change in respect to the limit of age or otherwise. But in order to keep up the quality of the service *throughout*, I think that Government should reserve the power to compulsorily retire a man, either on a gratuity or on a moderate pension limited to a term of years after, say, eight years' service—when he is yet a comparatively young man—for want of efficiency. It becomes daily more important, in these days of publicity and adverse criticism, that the service should be a picked service of hard-working and thoroughly-efficient men throughout. The "bad officer," who, whether from weak health or mental indolence, takes no interest in his work, or who indulges in eccentricities, which render him unreliable, is a source of weakness. At present, there is no getting rid of a man of this kind, unless he is guilty of flagrant misconduct; if he is superseded he becomes discontented and more useless than ever, and there is no knowing what to do with him. If, under the present competitive system in England, Government occasionally finds itself saddled with an officer, who, after a fair trial of eight years' service, is found to be a bad bargain, I think that, in the interests of the public service, it should get rid of him, before he attains a position of any great responsibility, though it may cost something to do so.

For the choice of men for that portion of the upper service, which is recruited in India, I would rely mainly on selection for the lower service. I think that, as a general rule, the merit and ability qualifying for appointment to the higher posts should have been proved in the service of Government. This seems to me to be the best test of the capacity of a man for the work to be done in the higher posts. Moreover we shall almost certainly secure a better lower service, if it is regarded as the ordinary avenue to the upper service. The importance of a good lower service cannot, I think, be over-estimated. Any one, who has held charge of a district, knows how much his work is facilitated, if he has Extra Assistant Commissioners, Tahsildars and Naib Tahsildars on whom he can rely, who can be trusted to carry out orders, and have not to be constantly watched, reminded and driven. Once the general standard of the lower service has been raised, there will be no difficulty in recruiting for the upper service from it, and it should be our object to attract men of good attainments and respectable, (not necessarily high), family to the lower service by holding out to the best of their class the prospect of promotion to the upper service.

For civil judicial appointments in the upper service men of some standing in the lower service, who had proved themselves to be good Civil Judges, might ordinarily be selected, but without any claim to promotion by seniority to any of the higher executive appointments included in the upper service. Men destined to hold such appointments should, I think, be brought into the upper service at an earlier age, being selected from among the younger Extra Assistant Commissioners after five or six years' service—say three or four years as Naib Tahsildar and Tahsildar, and two years as Extra Assistant Commissioner.

I would reserve a considerable proportion of the appointments of Naib Tahsildar to young men of not more than twenty-two years of age, who had passed by the F. A. standard, as a minimum educational test, a high enough standard, I think, for the Central Provinces under present educational conditions. The best Naibs—men with a turn for executive work and possessed of good physique, as well as fair brains—might after one and a half or two years' service as such, (and subject to passing the departmental examination in revenue

and criminal law by the lower standard), be promoted to Tahsildarships, and those that did best as Tahsildars might, after about two years' service in that grade, (and subject to passing in civil law by the lower standard), be promoted, on probation, to the rank of Extra Assistant Commissioner. They might be confirmed as Extra Assistant Commissioners, on passing in revenue by the higher standard, subject of course to their continuing to be well reported of.

Under a system of this kind, we should soon have a body of young Extra Assistant Commissioners, thoroughly acquainted with the routine of administration and of proved capacity—men of about twenty-seven or twenty-eight years of age—fit for selection to the upper service and appointment, in course of time, to such of the higher posts in that service, as Government may think proper to confer in each province on men recruited for it in India. I suppose, that the number of these posts would at first be small, and be gradually increased as time goes on.

I would encourage, though I would not compel, the men who are selected in this way from among the young Extra Assistant Commissioners for promotion to the upper service to proceed to England, arrangements being made for the reception of the men from all provinces either at one of the Universities or at Cooper's Hill College, if this institution could be utilised for the purpose. A course of study should be prescribed, and a certain portion of their time should be devoted to attendance in the Law Courts. I think, that a stay of, say, one and a half years in England would enlarge their minds and enable them to acquire a more sympathetic appreciation of English institutions and English character. Undisciplined Native lads of eighteen or nineteen might pick up a great deal, that is bad, and acquire vicious habits in England, but I do not think that there need be much apprehension on this score in the case of grown-up men of formed habits, who have gone through the discipline of several years' service under Government in this country, and who have acquired strong home associations before proceeding to England.

I would not give an appointment in the upper service to a man, not belonging to the lower service, unless there happened at the time to be no one in the lower service of the province, who was in all respects qualified for promotion to the upper service. If a man, who has not been already tried in the service of Government, is appointed, the appointment should, I think, be made by the Government of India on the nomination of the local Government and be, in the first instance, probationary.

I do not think, that appointments made in India, whether to the upper or the lower administrative service, should be made to depend on the results of an open competitive examination. I would prefer to take some well-recognised educational* test, *e.g.*, the F. A. or B. A., according to the educational conditions of the province or the nature of the appointment to be filled, and nominate from among men, who had passed that test.

This system of selection might, I think, be applied to a certain proportion of the appointments in the lower service, but the claims to appointment as Extra Assistant Commissioners and Tahsildars of competent men, already holding ministerial posts, (provided they are comparatively young), should be respected. Young men fresh from College, who seek employment in the lower service, should be made to enter it as Naib Tahsildars, at the bottom of the line, with the prospect of early promotion to a higher grade, if they do well and are really promising men.

I think that we should, as far as possible, aim at recruiting the Extra Assistant Commissioner grades from the ranks of the Tahsildars, and the Tahsildars and Munsifs from the ranks of the Naib Tahsildars. Special care should accordingly be taken to select for the post of Naib Tahsildar men, who will be fit for promotion to the higher grades in the lower service, and I think, that no one should be confirmed in the appointment of Naib Tahsildar unless he has given evidence of such fitness. The best Naibs might, as I have already indicated, be promoted rapidly and brought at a comparatively early age into the upper service. Those, who are not so good, should have the prospect of rising gradually to the highest grade in the lower service. Naib Tahsildars should be a body of young, intelligent men, eager to do well in the hope of promotion to a higher grade, not, (as to a great extent at present), old men without any prospect of a rise in the service.

Appointments made in India, whether to the upper or lower service, should, I think, be confined to Natives of India as described in the Statute, and should be given preferentially to Natives of the province in which they are held.

I think, that there should be one set of pay and furlough rules for men recruited in England (whether Europeans or Natives), and another and less liberal set for men recruited in India, who, according to my view, would all be Natives of India as described in the Statute. To make the distinction depend on the place of recruitment, is a simple and easily-worked plan, and broadly fair both to Government with its eye to economy, and to the men appointed fom England and in India respectively.

* In the Central Provinces the passing in English of the pleaders' examination is a good test of a man's general fitness to be an Extra Assistant Commissioner. Two or three young Pleaders, who were appointed Extra Assistant Commissioners, have been very favorably reported on.

No. IV.

J. P. Goodridge, Esq., C.S., Deputy Commissioner, Sambalpur, Central Provinces.

I.—Statutory Civil Service.

Vol. III. Sec III. Sub-Sec. B. — J. P. *Goodridge*, Esq.

1. Is the existing system of appointing Natives, as Statutory Civilians, to posts, reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service, approved ?—The existing system of appointing Natives, as Statutory Civilians, does not meet with Native commendation, as it is thought the appointments are the result of favoritism and not sufficiently dependent on the talents and qualifications of the persons appointed.

2. If it is not, what are the grounds of disapprobation ?—More attention, it is considered, should be given to the individual appointed, and less weight to his family and friends.

3. Are the defects of the existing system (if any) susceptible of remedy—

(*a*) by an amendment of the rules;
(*b*) by an amendment of the Statutory provisions in that behalf; behalf;

or should those provisions be repealed ?—The defects of the present system might be remedied, if the local administrations nominated a certain number of young men, to compete for the appointments at their disposal, a preference being given to the inhabitants of the province in which the nominations are made.

4. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so ?—The selected candidates should be required to proceed to England for training.

II.—Covenanted Civil Service.

5. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service ?—I am not aware that any dissatisfaction is felt with the existing arrangements for recruiting the Covenanted Civil Service, except on the part of a number of educated Natives, who desire that the examinations should be held in India as well as in England, and that the limit of age should be raised, so that they and their friends may be able to compete without going to England and have a longer time for preparation.

6. Should any, and if any what, change be made in that system ?—I am of opinion, that, while many able Natives are to be found in all branches of the Government service, yet for many years to come the principal posts must be held by Europeans, if the efficiency of the service is to be maintained. Nothing, therefore, in my opinion, should at present be done, which would in any way affect the predominance of the European element in the higher posts. Efficiency must be the chief consideration. Every effort should be made to raise Natives to the highest posts of which they are capable, but fairly good Natives should not, in my opinion, be promoted to posts for which they are not fully qualified, merely because they are Natives.

7. Do Natives of India labor under any, and if any, what, disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the service ?—In competing for the Covenanted appointments Natives labor under two disadvantages: first, having to go a long distance to be examined; and, secondly, by English being the language in which the examination is held.

8. By what changes may those disadvantages be minimised or removed, *e.g.* :—

(*a*) by the establishment of scholarships and allowance of passage money to Native candidates;
(*b*) by altering the limit of age;
(*c*) by adding to the subjects of examination, or by altering the maximum marks obtainable in certain subjects;
(*d*) by holding simultaneously examinations in England and in India ?

—I would remove and lessen these disadvantages—

(*a*) by holding simultaneous examinations in England and India;
(*b*) by raising the limit of age to twenty-one.

9. If an examination is held in India—

(1) Should it be identical with that held in England ?
(2) Should it be held at one or more centres in India ?
Should the candidates in England and in India compete with one another and be selected in order of merit, or should a certain number of appointments be apportioned for competition to the candidates at the respective examinations ?

(3) If such an apportionment is made, on what principle is it to be regulated?

(4) Should there be an apportionment between the residents in the territories of the several administrations respectively or between the members of the principal religious sects?

The examination in India should be identical with that held in England. (2) It should be at each Presidency town. (3) The candidates should compete with one another and be selected in order of merit. (4). There should be no apportionment of appointments among sects or nationalities.

10. If an examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—The selected candidate should be required to undergo the same training in England as the selected English candidate.

11. Are the young Natives obtained under the existing system of the open competition in England the best, as regards character and capacity, who could be obtained under any system?—I do not consider, that the present system of open competition in England gives us the best young Natives.

The fact of a young Native being in England, and therefore able to compete, is due to the enterprise of his relatives and friends, who may themselves have visited England, and who do not, therefore, overestimate the difficulties of a journey to that country. Many better Natives are to be found at home, who, for the want of the necessary information or enterprise on the part of their friends or from want of funds, do not undertake the risks and expenses of going to England for the examination and of studying there. An opportunity to compete would be given to them by holding a simultaneous examination in India.

III.—Uncovenanted Service.

12. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India, as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—The Uncovenanted Service should be recruited from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty.

13. Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or by both systems combined; and if by both combined, should one system be applied to all offices or classes of offices, or should the system be varied with the class of offices?—The recruitments should be by nomination and competition combined, and one system should be applied to all offices.

14. Whatever system be adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several administrations only from persons resident in the territories under such administrations respectively or with a preference for such residents?—The recruitments should be made by the several administrations with a preference for the residents of such administration.

15. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

IV.—Pay and Furlough Rules.

16. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service, according as the posts are held by members of that branch of the service or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—I think there should be different rates of pay, according as the posts are held by members of the Covenanted Civil Service or the Statutory or Uncovenanted Service.

17. If such distinction should be made, on what principle should it be regulated?—I think, that the two-thirds principle would meet the case. A member of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches, according to this rule, would receive two-thirds of the pay attached to any post reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service.

18. Should any distinction be made in the furlough rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches of the service according to the nationality of the officer, or on any other, and what, ground?—A distinction is necessary; as the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches will be composed mostly of Natives, separate furlough rules are needed for them.

19. Are the privileges in regard to pay, promotion and retiring annuity and the general conditions of office, belonging to the Covenanted Civil Service, suitable to Natives obtaining office under the Statutory rules?—The privileges in regard to pay, promotion and retiring annuity are not suitable to Natives, and will need an entire recasting.

No. V.

BABU HARIDAS GHOSE, M.A., B.L., PLEADER, HOSHANGABAD, CENTRAL PROVINCES.

Vol. III. Sec. III. Sub-Sec. B.

Babu *Haridas Ghose.*

I am a graduate of the Calcutta University, and have been practising at Hoshungabad in the Central Provinces for more than nine years. I graduated at the Hooghly College, and proceeded to Honors and B.L. at the Presidency College, Calcutta, and at first practised for a year or more at Bhagulpure in Behar, so that I have had good experience of Bengal and the Central Provinces.

In my opinion the educated Native community, who virtually represent the people, would like an open competitive examination to be held simultaneously at London and Calcutta, the subjects and the questions being the same in England as in India. *Fair competition* and *no favor* is our motto. A few highly-educated distinguished graduates, a few exceptionally qualified servants in the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Service, and a few exceptionally able members of the Bar to be nominated by the Government, until the number of the competitive Native Civilians increases. Half the posts, including the nominated, to be reserved for the Natives and half for the Europeans.

The same pay, but at a reduced rate, for Natives and Europeans alike. If a visit to England be made compulsory, the caste system and consideration of costs being great drawbacks, our best men will be shut out.

The rules, regarding leave, term of pensionable service, should be more favorable for Europeans, since they cannot stand the Indian climate; besides they should be allowed their passage money.

I.—Working of the existing Statutory System.

1. What is the prevalent feeling in your province regarding the existing Statutory system? If the feeling is one of dissatisfaction, is the dissatisfaction general or is it confined to certain sections of the community?—Against the Statutory system confined to the educated classes. The masses of the people here have not yet learnt to think for themselves. They express their dissatisfaction, only when they meet with particular instances of injustice.

2. What are the grounds upon which any such feeling is based?—We want *fair competition* and *no favor*. A nominated Civilian does not possess the same prestige, as a Civilian by competition, nor is he, (except in exceptional cases), so able.

3. Is the feeling of dissatisfaction, if it exists, directed against the Statute itself (33 Vic., Cap 3, Section 6), or is it directed against the rules framed thereunder?—Against the rules.

4. If a desire is felt for enrolment in a general service, what are the reasons for this desire?—Reasons are: Emolument, honest ambition, sense of dignity and self-respect, and last, though not least, desire to do good to the people.

5. Do you consider that Section 6 of the Statute supplies such a definition of the words "Natives of India," as describes with sufficient clearness, fulness and accuracy, the various classes of persons for whose appointment to Covenanted posts it is desirable to provide?—Yes.

6. If the objections are directed against the rules framed under the Statute, do they relate to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted?—Modes of selection. From Notification No. 1534, dated 22nd August, 1879 (cl. I), after "said service," omit "after he has attained the age of twenty-five years," and after "profession" add "or exceptional educational qualifications, attained at an Indian or European University." Alter "profession" into "legal profession or Bar." Omit (cl. IV), for they should be disqualified for the same reasons that the Covenanted Civilians are disqualified now-a-days. Rules regarding disqualification should be distinct and clear.

7. Do they relate to the general conditions in regard to pay, promotion and retiring annuity under which Statutory Civilians hold their offices?—Pay should be the same for these and the Covenanted Civilians, but the scale should be reduced. It is necessity that compels one to cross the seas for service; but crossing the seas is no qualification. There should be no invidious distinction, as regards *pay*, for if any such distinction be made, prestige will suffer. Leave* (furlough) rules and the term of service, necessary to make it pensionable, should differ, since the Natives can stand the Indian climate better.

8. Assuming the Statutory system to be retained, what amendments would you suggest in the rules with a view to remove any reasonable objections which may be felt to them?—The Covenanted and Uncovenanted should get pension at the same rate.

9. Are Statutory Civilians regarded by the general public, as occupying a position, inferior to that of persons, who enter the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel?—Yes.

10. If such a feeling exists, on what grounds is it based?—Because in some cases birth and blood have been the only qualification; secondly, because people would prefer competition to nomination.

11. Do the general public view with any difference the status of Statutory Civilians and that of Uncovenanted officers?—None.

II.—Mode of Selection of Statutory Civilians.

12. On the assumption, that the Statutory system is retained, how would appointment to the Statutory Service by nomination be regarded by influential sections of the Native community in your province?—Nomination of (1) highly educated or (2) exceptionally able intelligent and experienced men in the Sub-Executive or Judicial Service, or (3) from the Bar, will be favorably regarded.

13. How would a system of nomination, to be followed by a period of probation, be regarded by the same classes?—Probation for the first class for one year, for they are only fresh from college and have had no experience of business.

14. Would a system of nomination, with or without probation, be likely to secure well-qualified persons?—See the above.

15. Do you consider that nominations should be confined to persons of proved merit and ability?—Yes.

16. If so, how do you consider, that merit and ability should be held to have been proved for this purpose?—For the first class the University certificates, coupled with the opinion of at least two professors; for the second class, the opinion of the District Magistrate or District Judge, endorsed by that of the local Government; and for the last the opinions of the officers in whose Court the candidate or rather nominee, has practised for not less than three years.

17. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons, nominated for this purpose by the local Governments or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—See the above.

18. In preference to either of the above systems, (nomination and limited competition,) would a system of open competition, pure and simple, for the Statutory Service commend itself to the Native community?—Where there is nomination, there need be no competition, for nomination must cease, when the number of the competitive Native Civilians increases; but there should be an open competitive Civil Service examination for the Natives and Europeans alike, or rather two examinations, to be simultaneously held in India and England.

19. If competition, (whether limited or open), is preferred, should there be one competition for all India or separate competitions in each province? If there were only one general competition, how would you ensure a due proportion of appointments, falling to the population of the several provinces?—I am against any competitive examination of the nominated Civil Servants, but if there is to be one, the test should be the same throughout India, the only difference being in the local languages or dialects in different provinces.

20. Having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several provinces, and the varying conditions prevalent therein, is it possible to have any one system of selection for all India which would not result in the inhabitants of some provinces being more or less excluded from a due share of appointments?—See above.

21. Under any of the three systems of nomination, limited competition, and open competition, would you prescribe any tests of preliminary qualifications on the part of nominees or candidates in regard to (1) age, (2) intellectual capacity, (3 moral, social and physical fitness?—As regards the graduates of exceptional ability I would fix twenty-five as the limit; as regards the old and exceptionally able Government servants in the Sub-Executive or Judicial Service, they must not be open to corruption. No restrictions as to their age is necessary. As regards the nominees from the Bar, they must be practising for not less than three years.

22. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—After competition there should be probation for one year. Tests should be the same in both cases as in the standard examination held for the Civilians now-a-days.

23. Should the period of probation be passed in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service, or of the Covenanted Service, or in what other manner?—The probationary period not to be counted as pensionable service, but should be passed in the ranks of the Covenanted Civil Service.

24. Do you consider, that, after selection, and before entering on probation, (or on duty), the person selected should undergo special training? If so should the special training be carried out in India or in England?—No.

25. If in India, would it be possible, and, if possible, advisable, to establish an Indian Civil Service College, on the basis of the Haileybury College, which formerly existed in England?—Establish a Civil Service College on the basis of the Haileybury College for the Natives.

26. If you do not consider special training in England essential, would you encourage nominees or selected candidates to visit England with a view to add to their qualifications for the service?—A visit to England is not at all necessary.

Vol. III. Sec. III. Sub-Sec. B.

Babu *Haridas Ghose.*

27. Do you think, that any distinction should be made between the emoluments of nominees or selected candidates, who have been trained in England or have gone to England to add to their qualifications, and those who have not?—I think there should be always the same emolument for the same amount of work of a similar quality. No distinction; no need to go to England.

28. If the opportunity of residence in England at a University for two years with a sufficient allowance were offered to nominees or selected candidates, is it likely that it would be taken advantage of to any great extent?—If a visit to England were to be made compulsory, and if sufficient allowance be offered, it would be taken advantage of by some, but not many, for the caste system is too much for the Hindus.

29. If the system of examination in England were revised with the result that Natives availed themselves of it in considerable numbers, would it still be necessary to retain the Statutory system?—If examination in England be compulsory, and if Natives availed themselves of it largely, it would still be necessary to retain the Statutory system, (for at least half the posts should be reserved for the Native Civilians), or at least, till the number of the Native Civilians largely increases.

III.—Competition in England for the Indian Civil Service.

30. Is competition of Natives in the examination in England favorably looked upon by large and important classes in India?—No.

31. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—If a visit to England, and examination there, be made compulsory, certainly additional facilities should be granted.

32. If so, what form or forms should such facilities take?—Scholarship and passage money.

33. What conditions, if any, should be attached to them?—F. A.'s recommended by at least two professors. None who have not passed it, should be granted any scholarship.

34. What is your opinion, as to giving Statutory appointments to Natives, who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition?—Yes! the Government may nominate them.

35. Assuming it to be advisable to appoint to the Statutory Service in India, Natives who have failed in the English competition, should such persons receive the same training as successful candidates in England and be subject to the same final examination?—Yes.

36. Should they, on appointment to the Statutory Service in India, be subject to the same incidents, as apply to other persons, appointed under the Statutory rules?—Yes.

37. Can you say what number of Natives belonging to your province have presented themselves annually at the competitive examination in England and what degree of success they attained?—None.

38. Are objections entertained to going to England; and, if so, what are they, and by what classes in particular are they felt?—Almost universally by all classes of the Hindu community. Caste and cost are the main objections.

39. Should the examination for Natives in England be distinct in standards and conditions from that for English candidates, or should there be one and the same examination for all?—Always assuming that examination in England be made compulsory, one and the same examination for all, only raise the marks for Sanskrit and Arabic so as to make them on the same level with European classics, (say the Latin), certainly not; there should be one examination for Natives and Europeans alike.

40. If a fixed proportion of appointments were allotted for a Native examination in England, do you consider that, in view of the objections against a voyage to England and life there, the cost thereof and the chances of failure, a sufficient number of suitable candidates from your province would be available to make the competition a real competition?—No, the caste system, the cost and other considerations will stand in the way.

41. If the examinations were distinct what should be the limits of age for the Native examination?—Examinations should not be distinct.

42. Assuming only one examination in England for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination and the conditions, as to age and other matters, in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage, as compared with English candidates?—Age of the candidates should be raised to twenty-three, and marks in Sanskrit, the most difficult language in the world, should be raised to 800.*

43. If there should be only one examination for all candidates, should the limits of age for Natives be higher than those at present fixed for European candidates; and, if so, what should the limits for Native candidates be?—Certainly the limits of age for the Natives should be higher than they are at present. The same

* Some of the subjects chosen for the Civil Service examination are of little practical use for executive or judicial purposes. The subjects of study should be so selected as to be practically useful to the Civil Servants in life.

age for both—not higher than twenty-five nor lower than twenty-three.

44. If higher limits of age were fixed for Native than for European candidates, might not the latter complain that they were placed at a disadvantage?—Certainly they would.

45. What is the average age at which Natives at the Indian Universities pass the examinations for F. A., B. A. and M. A. respectively?—The Natives generally pass F. A. at eighteen or nineteen, B. A. at twenty or twenty-one and M. A. at twenty-one or twenty-two. My experience in this matter is confined to Bengal. In the Central Provinces they pass F. A. at twenty or twenty-one. B. A. and M. A. classes have been but recently opened.

IV.—Competition in India for the Indian Civil Service.

46. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question papers being used at both examinations?—Yes! Quite so.

47. How would this method of selection be regarded by the Native community generally?—With favor.

48. If you advocate such a system, would you restrict the competition in India to Natives and that in England to English candidates, or would you admit both classes freely to either examination?—I would restrict the competition in India to Natives, and in England to English candidates.

49. If Native candidates were admitted to the competition in England, while English candidates were excluded from the competition in India, on what grounds could this distinction be justified?—For very few Natives would go to England to compete, whereas there are lots of Englishmen here whose sons would have the competition here.

50. Do you consider that the educational institutions available in India are at present capable of giving the very high class education which it was the object of the competitive system as introduced in 1855 to secure?—No.

51. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native community over others?—Open competition would be open to all classes of Natives. If any particular class won't take advantage of it, that class must suffer, and rightly so.

52. Would it be likely to lead to the undue preponderance of any one class or caste in the public service?—An open competition would give decided advantages at first to the Bengalees, Mahrattas and Parsis. The Mahomedans are yet backward in education, and so they must pay the penalty of their laziness.

53. Do you think there are any objections on political or administrative grounds to open competition in India?—None.

54. Would the introduction of an open competitive examination in India have the effect of deterring cadets of leading families from aspiring to enter the ranks of the Civil Service?—Certainly not; but quite the reverse.

55. Under such a system, how would it be possible, to provide against the Natives of a province, in which education is comparatively backward, being excluded from appointments in their own province?—They will get the Uncovenanted posts, as they have not the necessary qualifications to aspire to the Covenanted ones. Education is rapidly on the increase in every province, and in a few years this difficulty will disappear. Properly speaking, the greater part of the Central Provinces is Gondwara or Malwa. The people of the province, as we find at present, have all come from the North-Western Provinces and settled themselves in the Central Provinces. The Mahrattas, the Mahomedans and half a dozen Bengalee officers in the Sub-Executive and Judicial Service have come from outside. The Gonds, Kenkus and other barbarous tribes were the real aborigines of the place. You may as well think of nominating the Gonds, and as the Bamans and others, who form the bulk of the population here, where people would like to be governed by abler Europeans than by incapable Natives, they would certainly prefer outside able Natives to incapable Natives of their own province. The Central Provinces are not Behar.

56. Would a system of provincial examinations be preferable to one examination for the whole of India?—No.

57. Under a system of open competition in India would the successful candidates be regarded, as occupying a position, inferior to that of persons, who enter the service through the channel of the open competition in England?—No.

58. Supposing that the Covenanted appointments were allotted in fixed proportions, a certain number to be obtained by competition in England, and a certain number by competition in India, the examinations in each case being open, on fairly equal conditions to Native and English candidates alike, and the Statutory system being abolished, how would such a system be viewed?—With favor.

59. If an open competition were established in India, what should be the preliminary qualifications required on the part of candidates in regard to age?—Not less than twenty, not more than twenty-three.

60. And in regard to minimum educational attainments?—Knowledge of English should be compulsory. They must pass B. A.

61. And in regard to moral, social and physical fitness?—*Physical.*—Absence of any hereditary or constitutional disease of a serious nature. *Social.*—Not having been convicted of any serious offence in the Indian Penal Code, except hurt, nuisance and other offences under the Municipal bye-laws or other local or special laws, to be determined by the Legislature.

62. Should the subjects and conditions of the examination be the same, as those, prescribed for the competitive examination in England, or should they be different?—The same.

63. Circumstances being different in the case of persons, who enter through the examination in England, and of persons, who enter through the examination in India, is there any reason, why the rules in regard to pay, leave, pension, &c., should not also be different?—Rules regarding leave and pension should be different.

64. Should successful candidates go through a period of special study in India like the English candidates who spend two years in special preparation?—Yes.

65. Would it be preferable, (*a*) to require them to go to England, or (*b*) to give them the option of going to England, suitable allowances being given to enable them to prosecute their studies there?—(*a*) No. (*b*) Good.

66. Should successful candidates at the Indian competition be required to pass through a probationary period before final appointment? If so, what shall be the duration of the probationary period?—Yes; for one hour.

67. How should it be passed—in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service, or otherwise?—The period to be passed in the ranks of the Covenanted Civil Service.

V.—Promotion from the Uncovenanted Service.

68. What special provision, if any, do you think should be made for the appointments to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service?—Only exceptionally-qualified experienced Uncovenanted members should be promoted to Covenanted posts.

69. If such appointments are made, should they be restricted to the holders of any particular classes of appointments, in the Uncovenanted Service; and, if so, what classes?—No particular classes of appointments; only to such for which they have shown exceptional ability.

70. Should persons, so appointed, be appointed provisionally, and be required to pass through a period of probation before final confirmation?—No.

71. Should provision be made for the appointment of qualified members of the Uncovenanted Service to the *higher* Covenanted offices without requiring them to pass through the lower grades?—Yes, if so qualified.

72. If certain appointments in the Covenanted grades are set apart for the Statutory Service, should a fixed proportion of those appointments be expressly reserved for persons of proved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service?—No.

73. Should special provision be made for the promotion to Covenanted posts of European members of the Uncovenanted Service?—No.

74. Should special provision be made for the promotion to such posts of Eurasian or other members of the Uncovenanted Service who, though not Natives of pure descent, fall within the meaning attached in the Statute of 1870 to the term "Natives of India"?—No.

75. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, to be open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty who possess the qualifications that may be from time to time prescribed?—Yes.

76. If the Uncovenanted Service is closed to any natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, on what grounds, bearing in mind the terms of Acts of Parliament and Her Majesty's Proclamation of 1st November, 1858, is this to be justified?—No; the question will solve itself, when the number of the Native Covenanted Civilians largely increases.

VI.—Pay, Leave and Pension for Natives of India appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the channel of competition in England.

77. Is the rate* of pay at present granted to Statutory Civilians during probation and on final appointment respectively sufficient?—Yes.

*Two hundred rupees a month on first appointment as probationers. Two hundred and fifty rupees a month, after passing the departmental examination by the lower standard. After passing the departmental examination by the higher standard, (unless specially exempted), and after having been confirmed in their appointments, 64 per cent. of what would be the gross pay or salary of the office, if it were held by a Covenanted Civil Servant appointed after competitive examination in England.

78. Would these rates of pay be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

79. Would they be suitable, in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the professional classes?—No, if from the Bar. Where the quality and quantity of work is the same, the same pay should be allowed to all the Covenanted Civil Servants; but the rate of pay at present prevailing is too high. Rs. 300 and not Rs. 450 should be

the lowest limit English Civilians should be allowed their passage money. The rate of pay should be cut down by at least one-fourth all round from top to bottom. The question of pay and pension is a financial question, and consequently financial or economical considerations cannot but enter into it.

80. If you consider there should be no difference of pay, how do you justify the application of the same rates of pay in the case of Natives who have satisfied the very high tests required by the examination in England and Natives who have not?—The test required of both Natives and Europeans should be equally high.

81. At what age do you consider that Natives appointed to Covenanted posts, otherwise than through the competitive channel, in England, should be entitled to retire on pension* ?—The Natives must retire at fifty-five and the Europeans at fifty; the former after thirty years, and the latter after twenty-five years of service. As the climate of India is too hot for the Europeans (Englishmen) they should be allowed to retire earlier, and the rules regarding leave and furlough should also be made more favorable for them. It may be said, that the longer the service the more valuable it becomes by experience. I cannot enter into this question at length. Suffice it to say, that some option should be left with Government to decide the matter.

* The pension rules applicable to Statutory Civilians are shown in Appendix B attached to these questions.

VII.—General.

82. In 1854 Lord Macaulay's Committee were of opinion, that the best, the most liberal, and the most finished education to be procured in England was a necessary qualification for admission to the Civil Service. Do Indian schools and colleges at present supply an education of so high a standard?—If the best and most finished education be a necessary qualification for admission to the Civil Service, Indian schools and colleges, at present, do not supply an education of so high a standard; but is liberal education necessary for the public service?

83. Do you consider that Indian schools at present develope force of character and other qualities required for English administration?—The Indian schools do not develop the force of character in all the students. The phrase "other qualities" is indefinite.

84. Do we now obtain for Government service Natives of the classes who, under Native rule, carried on the civil administration of the country?—Yes.

85. How far would any system of appointment, which involves a journey to, and residence in, England, be regarded by the Native community, as open to objection, on the ground, that it requires Hindu candidates to abandon their caste as a condition of entering the Civil Service?—A system of appointment, which involves a journey to, or residence in, England would be regarded by the Hindu community with great disfavor, and will shut out our best men from the competitive arena.

86. Are the Natives, who go to England from your province for purposes of education, limited to the wealthier classes?—Excepting one, Mr. Adhor Singh Gour, an Extra Assistant Commissioner, no one has gone to England from here. From Bengal all those, who have gone to England, belong to the wealthy classes, excepting a few Gilchrist or other scholarship-holders. This remark holds good, as regards the whole of India.

87. Are they limited to any particular section of the community, or to any particular creed?—To no particular section or creed.

88. Does a voyage to, or residence in, England involve the loss of social position or other unfavorable consequences in the case of any section of the Native community?—In all sections of the Hindu community.

89. Does it result in placing those Natives, who undertake it, more or less out of touch and sympathy with their fellow-countrymen on their return to India?—Yes; but such will not be the case, when the number largely increases.

90. Would the requirement of a temporary residence in England as a condition precedent to, or following on, appointment to the Government service have the effect of excluding from such appointment any considerable or important section of the Native community?—Certainly.

91. If the Statutory system is discontinued, should special provision be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of Natives who, for religious or other sufficient reasons, are unable or unwilling to undertake a journey to, and residence in, England?—Yes.

92. If so, what provision should be made for this purpose?—Reply already given.

93. Whatever system or systems may be adopted, ought power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts candidates of high family subject to such antecedent guarantees of fitness as may be considered sufficient in each case?—Birth is no qualification.

94. Ought similar power to be reserved to Government, to appoint to Covenanted posts persons, who have proved their merit and ability in Government service, or in the exercise of a profession, without preliminary examination or competition?—Yes.

95. If a thorough knowledge of English were made an essential qualification for

appointment to Covenanted posts, would the field of selection in the case of persons already in the Uncovenanted Service, or engaged in the exercise of a profession, be unduly limited thereby?—Knowledge of English is essential, where all law is English and in English, for by translation it loses half its force and meaning. None but English-knowing men should get such posts. The field of selection will necessarily be large in Bengal and Bombay and limited in North-Western Provinces and Central Provinces; but this limitation is the result of circumstances and is necessary to secure capable men.

96. If such is likely to be the case, could the difficulty be obviated by requiring proficiency in the English language to be tested by periodical examinations *after* selection, but during a probationary period?—Knowledge of English should be made compulsory from Tahsildars to Assistant Commissioners. The probationary period of a year or two with periodical examinations in English will not do.

97. Should provision be made for the occasional appointment in very special and exceptional cases to Covenanted posts of persons of known ability and local influence whom, although they may never have held office and may not possess special professional qualifications, and although their age may exceed the limit laid down for untried candidates, it might nevertheless be considered desirable to appoint to the higher grades for political or other reasons?—If for political reasons Government wants able and influential men to be appointed to such posts, such power should remain in the Government, but for no other reasons.

98. Would it be desirable to rule, that the proportion of persons being Mahomedans and Hindus respectively, who are from time to time or over a series of years appointed to the Covenanted ranks in any province, should bear a certain relation to the number of the two classes composing the population of the province concerned?—Certainly not. Where ability and competition are the tests, such proportion should not be fixed, for it will be showing favoritism to one class at the expense of another.

99. How far should appointments in each province to Covenanted posts be restricted to Natives of the province concerned?—In the Central Provinces only two Colleges have of late been opened. Education is at its lowest ebb. It would be impossible to secure able men for Covenanted posts. Incapable Natives should not be appointed.

100. How would the following scheme be regarded by the Native community?—

(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of European officers, admission being by competition in England confined to European candidates only.

(2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, Natives only being eligible.

—(1) Competition confined to Europeans in England will be disliked by the Native community, and also (2) appointment by nomination unrestricted. In short the Native community would not like the scheme.

101. How would you regard such a scheme?— I should not like the scheme.

102. How would the Native community regard the following?—

(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of appointments to be filled by competition in England, to which Natives and Europeans alike would be admitted.

(2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, both Natives and Europeans being eligible.

—The Natives won't like it, because it involves a journey to England, but they would prefer it to the former scheme.

103. How would you regard such a scheme?—I should dislike it.

104. If either of the above schemes were adopted, how would the Native community view a proposal to combine the higher appointments of the Uncovenanted Service with the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service so as to form an enlarged Civil Service to be recruited in India? How would you view such a proposal?—I should not view it favorably.

105. How would the Native community regard the following scheme?—

(1) A certain number of appointments in the Covenanted Civil Service to be reserved for Natives;

(2) a certain proportion of that number to be filled by competition or by some other system in India;

(3) the remainder to be filled by competition in England.

—The Native community will regard it with favor. In my opinion, the whole scheme should be thrown open to competition by Natives and Europeans alike, half of the posts to be reserved for the Natives and half for the Europeans. The former half will include the nominated. When the number of able Native Civilians increases the nomination must cease altogether.

106. How would you regard such a scheme?—I should like it.

107. Assuming a system of nomination or of limited competition among nominated candidates, would Native opinion be in

favor of giving a preference, as between candidates possessed of certain preliminary essential qualifications and having on general grounds fairly equal claims in the following or any other order, to—

(*a*) members of families of tried loyalty and distinguished service;

(*b*) persons of good social status and influence in the country; and

(*c*) persons of superior educational attainments, such as persons who have taken the degree of M.A.?

—Native opinion will be in favor of (*c*) class. A very few interested men may like (*a*) or (*b*) class.

108. What is your opinion as to giving such preference?—I don't like it; I should prefer M.A.'s.

109. How would the Native community regard a system of nomination on the ground of merit and ability shown in the service of Government, or in the exercise of a profession, alternating with a system of selection by means of competition, whether entirely open or amongst nominated candidates?—The Native community would regard with favor such a system, alternating with a system of open competition, but not amongst nominated candidates.

110. How would you regard such a system?—

111. If the Statutory system were maintained, and if a probationary period were required from nominees or selected candidates before final appointment, would it be necessary to insist upon such probationary period in all cases, *e.g.*, in the case of a person who has done good service in the Uncovenanted ranks?—Not in the case of a person, who has done good service in the Uncovenanted ranks.

112. In the case of persons, nominated from the professional classes, is it desirable that a probationary period should be prescribed?—No probation for persons from the Bar, nor for persons mentioned in reply No. 111, but one year's probation for the rest of that period to be in the lowest grade of Civil Service to be excluded from pension period.

113. Would you regulate such promotion only by considerations of fitness and approved personal merit?—Yes, only by fitness and approved merit.

114. Should subjects of Native States be eligible for appointment to Covenanted posts in British India?—Yes.

115. If so, should this be extended to all Native States in alliance with the Crown, or only to those in subordinate alliance?—To all Native States in alliance with the Crown or in subordinate alliance.

VIII.—Composition, Recruitment, &c., of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services.

116. How is the present system of regulating appointments to the Subordinate* Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services respectively regarded by influential sections of the Native community?—In the Central Provinces not with favor, as most of them have been chosen from the *Amla* class, and some of them again are ignorant of English. I believe the same remark applies to the North-West Provinces. Recently some change for the better has been apparent.

117. To what sections of Native society do the persons belong who accept, under existing conditions, appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services respectively?—Mahomedans, Mahrattas, a few up-country Hindustanis and some four Bengalees. I am speaking of the Central Provinces.

118. To what extent do Natives of good family and education in your province offer themselves as candidates for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments?—Very few.

119. Do Natives, who have been to England for purposes of study, on their return to India willingly accept such appointments?—Very few have gone to England from these provinces.

120. How far are the professional classes represented in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services respectively in your province?—Very few professional men are in these services here.

121. Do members of the professional classes in your province readily accept employment in those services?—Unless educated members of the Bar be offered these posts, and the members of the old *régime* be pensioned off, no reply to this question can be given.

122. Whatever system or systems may at present be adopted for the purpose of regulating appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, are any class or classes of persons expressly or practically excluded from such appointments?—The Banians.

123. Is it the case that certain classes of Uncovenanted appointments are practically reserved for Natives of pure descent owing to the fact that conditions are imposed which have resulted in shutting out Eurasians and other Statutory Natives of mixed descent?—No.

124. Are you in favor of laying down a rule, that high educational capacity should be regarded as an essential qualification for appointment to the Subordinate Exe-

* NOTE.—For the purposes of these questions the terms "Subordinate Executive Service" and "Subordinate Judicial Service" may be held to include respectively all Subordinate Executive and Judicial offices down to and including the office of Tahsildar or Munsif, or other office corresponding to that of Tahsildar or Munsif, which are not reserved for, or not ordinarily held by, members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

cutive and to the Subordinate Judicial Services as defined for the purposes of these questions?—Yes, high educational attainment is an essential qualification for appointment to the Subordinate Judicial Service.

125. If so, what test would you apply?—The graduates of the Calcutta and Bombay Universities or educated English-knowing members of the Bar.

126. What preliminary qualifications would you require on the part of candidates for those appointments in regard to age and in other respects?—No restriction as to age; but they must be above corruption, against which their education would be a great guarantee.

127. Is it possible to devise any one system which would be equally applicable to all provinces having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several provinces and the varying conditions prevalent therein?—See reply to Query No. 126.

128. Would you require a probationary period in all cases, or would you dispense with it in certain, and if so in what, cases?—See reply to Query No.

129. If an open competitive examination were held in India for the Covenanted posts reserved for Natives, would persons who gained high marks in that examination and showed decided proficiency, but who failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, form suitable nominees for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments in the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

No. VI.

GOPAL RAO DONGRE, B.A., ADDITIONAL TAHSILDAR, KHANDWA, CENTRAL PROVINCES.

One cannot easily say, whether the system of appointing Natives to the Statutory Civil Service is appreciated by the public at large or not. In the Central Provinces, the mass of the public, (who are uneducated), are too ignorant to form any opinion as to the efficacy or otherwise of such appointments by mere nomination. The educated class do not, on the whole, quite approve of the system of such appointments by mere nomination.

The chief grounds of disapprobation are, that candidates of proved ability and merit are not selected, as contemplated in 33 Vic. Cap. 3, Section 6. There must be some principle of testing the educational, moral and physical fitness of the nominees. It is really advisable, and even necessary, on administrative and political grounds to preserve the predominance of the aristocratic families, and to allow them a sufficient share in the Government of the country; but mere noble descent does not, and would not, enable the scions of these families to discharge the duties of high and responsible offices. Such duties require, in the long run, experience, energy and tact, coupled with that force of character, which necessarily proceeds from morality of a high standard.

The provisions for nominating Statutory Civilians need not be materially modified. A certain standard of liberal education should be necessary, to qualify a man to hold the post. In short the rules under which the appointments are made should be amended. For the present, I would recommend the B. A. degree standard of the Indian Universities.

The candidates selected for the Statutory Civil Service should be encouraged, but not compelled, to go to England, because the candidates will be, in the majority of cases, persons of high rank, and such persons are prone to adhere to the old customs and religious beliefs either by reason of their own convictions or for mere form in order to keep up their position in the society in which they move. If such persons be compelled to go to England, many able and deserving gentlemen will hesitate to come forward, and the service may eventually suffer by the ranks being filled with men of inferior quality.

A great deal of dissatisfaction prevails throughout the country with the existing system of recruiting the Covenanted Civil Service. The reason is obvious. The natives of India have to pass the examination in a foreign tongue. In some cases, they have to lose the society of their relations and friends after their return from England by departing from the established customs and religious beliefs with which they have been surrounded from their childhood—nay from several generations. At an early stage of life, they have to live in a climate quite different from theirs, and hence unfavorable to their health. In many cases their pecuniary condition does not allow them to incur the high expenses of a costly life in England. To this may be added the very low limit of age and the proportion of marks allotted to such subjects, as are quite familiar to English youths, but which are totally foreign to an Indian candidate. These are the main difficulties under which the Natives of India labor, and they may be more or less remedied by.—

(1) Establishing scholarships and allowing passage money.
(2) Altering the limit of age to twenty-five years.
(3) By the substitution of Indian classics for the European classics, and appointing History of India and of England as a compulsory subject for all the candidates.

As to the examinations being held at several centres in India, I am of opinion that only one centre for the whole of India would be convenient and advisable. It will minimise all chances of fraud and mistakes, and will ensure a strict control in conducting the examination; but the examination in India must be identical with those in England. There is no reason why those who are to serve in the same capacity, who are to occupy the same position in public and society, and who are to enjoy the same protection and privileges should be examined by different standards.

Undoubtedly it would be very just and liberal to allow the candidates in England and in India to compete with one another and be elected in order of merit; but considering the backward condition and the various difficuties under which the Natives of India labor, (as mentioned above), I am inclined to think, that an apportionment in the candidacies would be most desirable. For the present I am of opinion, that the following apportionment will be equitable :—

Suppose there are forty vacancies in the Civil Service. Of these—

Twenty should be reserved for candidates in England;
twelve for candidates in India for the competitive system;
five for Statutory Civilians to be nominated;
three for nominees from the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service, being such members of the service as are found most deserving and of proved ability and merit.

Gopal Rao Dongre.

It is a matter of great difficulty to say, whether the apportionment must be made amongst the various religious sects or amongst the residents under the various administrations. At any rate there should be some such distinction, or else the vacancies will be, in all probability, filled by men of the presidency towns, where the means of education are within easy reach of the residents, and who, as a general rule, are more advanced, than the people in the interior, but who may not command a far greater capacity and force of character. As to the division by sects or provinces, I am not in a position to answer the question very satisfactorily, for I know of no particular race or sect, inhabiting a particular part of the country alone and nowhere else, nor is it possible to distinguish with accuracy between the various sects, and to allot posts to one or more members of each. I am therefore in favor of the other system of division by provinces. For suppose we reserve three places for Brahmins of all classes. In the majority of cases the Bengalee and Maratha Brahmins will secure the places. The Brahmins of Northern India may not be able to cope with the above. On the other hand, suppose two candidates to be selected from the North-Western Provinces. It is quite probable, that a Brahmin or a Kayasth of the provinces will take one of the places.

Similarly, if two places be set apart for the Bania class, the Gujrathi Banias will secure both the places and the Marwaris none.

On these considerations it is fair to allot the places, according to the political divisions or, say, the various administrations.

It is not necessary, that the successful candidates should be compelled to go to England for further training. It should, however, be left optional with them, on condition that those, who receive such further training in England, would be entitled to emoluments equal to those of English candidates. This will tend to encourage persons going to England, and at the same time will not mar their prospects, simply because they refrain from going to England.

The Covenanted service, then, should be recruited from all the natural-born subjects of Her Majesty. There is no reason why a particular race or sect should be excluded from this branch of services, when the higher spheres are open to all without any distinction. The system of nomination is always prejudicial to the public interest, and although good character and noble birth may be qualifications to command respect, still they are not the sole tests, establishing unquestioned merit and ability of the candidate. Competition and a fair competition, is the best criterion to judge, known at present. The two tests may be combined with advantage in some instances, but such instances must prove rather the exception than the rule. Again such a system of competition, and in exceptional cases of nomination, should not be restricted to the various provinces and administrations. On the one hand it gives a free scope for the development of mental, moral and physical capacity of the public at large, and on the other it gives room enough for the local Government to encourage a particular race or sect, which might be found a little backward in social and political progress, but which, nevertheless, deserves the protecting hand of Government, in order to keep pace with the more advanced communities.

The present standard of the pay of Statutory Civilians should be raised. The members of the competitive service should have no distinction of any sort, as regards pay and allowances; but persons to whom an option is given to go to England, and who decline to go to England, may draw only seventy-five per cent. of the pay as well as Statutory Civilians.

The reason of this distinction is, I think, this. In England education is imparted on a sounder footing, and it possesses a stronger tone of social, moral and intellectual development. The men who have received such a training must be superior in position to others.

It is also equitable that the furlough rules should be different according to the races. Englishmen cannot be expected to preserve their health under the tropical sun, and they should be allowed, more often than the Natives, to go to England and replenish their lost energy and health. Thus the furlough rules should be more favorable to them, than to the Natives, who have to serve in a climate naturally conducive to their health.

But there does not appear to be any sufficient reason for distinctions in the pensions. A pension is to all intents and purposes a reward for past good services and a provision for old age, or, as Burke would say—to quote his language—"a safe harbour for the weather-beaten vessels of the State." And there would be no distinction between the past good services of a Native Civilian and those of an English Civilian.

No. VII.

BERESHWAR DUTT, EXTRA ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER, JUBBULPUR.

I.—Working of the existing Statutory System.

1. What is the prevalent feeling in your province regarding the existing Statutory system? If the feeling is one of dissatisfaction, is the dissatisfaction general, or is it confined to certain sections of the community. What are the grounds upon which any such feeling is based?—The existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service is not generally approved, because (1) selection is not based on any well-designed test of merit and ability; (2) the rules as to pay and promotion give the appearance of an inferior status to the service. I would abolish the present Statutory Service, for, while it does not fulfil the expectation of the educated classes generally, those, who have obtained admission to the Covenanted Service by competitive examination in England, look down on the members comprising it.

2. Is the feeling of dissatisfaction, if it exists, directed against the Statute itself (33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6), or is it directed against the rules framed thereunder. If the Statute itself is objected to, is it because its provisions admit persons to specific appointments only and not to membership in an organised "service?" What amendments do you advocate in Section 6 of the Statute? Do you consider that Section 6 of the Statute supplies such a definition of the words "Natives of India" as describes with sufficient clearness, fulness and accuracy the various classes of persons for whose appointment to Covenanted posts it is desirable to provide? If the objections are directed against the rules framed under the Statute, do they relate to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted?—The feeling is not, as far as I have been able to gauge it, so much against the Statute, as it is against the rules for selecting candidates, as already stated in reply to question 1. I do not see any reason to amend Section 6 of the Statute, if the Statutory Service is to be retained, for the provisions are clear enough, and there is no doubt that all persons born and domiciled within the dominion of Her Majesty in India, of parents habitually resident in India, and not established there for temporary purposes only, are eligible for appointment, without any regard to caste and creed, provided they possess the requisite qualification.

3. Do they relate to the general conditions, in regard to pay, promotion and retiring annuity under which Statutory Civilians hold their offices?—The objections do not, in my opinion, relate to the general conditions, in regard to pay and retiring annuity, for we cannot expect the Statutory Civilians to draw the same pay and allowances, which their Covenanted brethren do; the great object is to reduce the cost of the administrative machinery; and having this in view, I cannot advocate any increase to the present scale.

4. Assuming the Statutory system to be retained, what amendments would you suggest in the rules with a view to remove any reasonable objections which may be felt to them?—If the Statutory Service is to be retained, the candidates selected should, after passing the University entrance test, be subjected to a course of training, similar to that imparted to their Covenanted brethren in England.

5. Do the general public view with any difference the status of Statutory Civilians and that of Uncovenanted officers? If so, on what grounds? How is the present Statutory system regarded by members of the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes. They are regarded by the general public as occupying a position inferior to that of the Covenanted Servants, because their training is not the same. The general public regard the Statutory Servants, as somewhat superior in position to the members of the Covenanted Service; but the senior Uncovenanted Servants, not holding the post of Assistant Commissioners, though exercising the full first-class powers, will not, as a matter of course, feel very happy, when placed under one by far his junior in point of powers, experience and emoluments. This is another reason for my advocating the abolition of the Statutory Service.

6. Do competitive Civilians, English and Native, and members of the Uncovenanted Service respectively, stand on a footing of cordiality with Statutory Civilians, or is there any friction between them?—I have already expressed my views on the subject mooted in this question.

7. Has the Statutory system had the effect of securing men who, in point of education or natural ability, are superior to the average of those appointed or promoted to the higher ranks of the Uncovenanted Service? Has the result of the Statutory system been to secure the services of men of better social position and better family than those who usually accept posts in the Uncovenanted Service?—No decisive opinion can be given, as to whether the Statutory system has had the effect of securing men, who, in point of education and natural

ability, are always superior to the average of those appointed or promoted to the higher ranks of the Uncovenanted Service, for we have only two young gentlemen of that service in the Central Provinces, and no doubt both of them belong to respectable families, and have been fairly selected; but they have yet to prove their superiority.

II.—Mode of Selection of Statutory Civilians.

As I am already in favor of the abolition of the Statutory system, which does not give general satisfaction, I refrain from answering the questions under this head.

III.—Competition in England for the Indian Civil Service.

8. Is competition of Natives in the examination in England favorably looked upon by large and important classes in India?—I should say that the competitive examination for the Indian Civil Service is not looked upon unfavorably by large and important classes in India; the Native candidates are, however, laboring at present under one difficulty, *i e.*, the age at which they must go to England, in order to appear at the examination, is too low; it should be twenty-two. Yes; because by that time they would not only have finished their educational course up to the standard mark, but their parents, owing to the maturity of their age, would not have much to care, as to the course they would choose to take.

9. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition? If so, what form or forms should such facilities take? What is your opinion as to giving Statutory appointments to Natives who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition? Assuming it to be advisable to appoint to the Statutory Service in India Natives who have failed in the English competition, should such persons receive the same training as successful candidates in England and be subject to the same final examination? Should they on appointment to the Statutory Service in India be subject to the same incidents as apply to other persons appointed under the Statutory rules?—I have no objections to Native candidates, who have failed to obtain a place amongst the successful candidates in England being admitted on an equal footing, if men of merit, possessing the same qualifications, which members of the Statutory and Uncovenanted Services do. Their remaining in England, after failure to undergo the final examination, I do not consider necessary, for it will only entail considerable expenditure without the satisfaction of entering the Covenanted Civil Service. They should on return to India be required, if selected, to undergo the necessary training either in a public institution, should the same come to be established, or under private tuition, or whilst in service as a probationer. The latter would be the best course for the acquisition of practical knowledge, if the candidate has received a sound and liberal education.

10. Can you say what number of Natives belonging to your province have presented themselves annually at the competitive examination in England and what degree of success they attained? What class or classes of Natives in your province readily go to England?—No Native from the Central Provinces has as yet attempted to go to England for the competitive examination.

11. Are objections entertained to going to England; and, if so, what are they, and by what classes in particular are they felt?—The orthodox Hindu parents do certainly, from fear of loss of caste, object to their children going to England; but under the benign influence of English education this drawback is disappearing fast.

12. Should the examination for Natives in England be distinct in standards and conditions from that for English candidates, or should there be one and the same examination for all? If the standards and conditions were different, how would it be possible to compare the results in the two examinations so as to bring out one list in order of merit?—The standard of examination in England for both English and Native candidates should be one and the same; the marks in classical languages—Sanskrit, Arabic and Persian, &c.—should be so readjusted, that the Indian students may not be placed at a disadvantage.

13. Would it under such circumstances be desirable to allot a fixed proportion of appointments to each of the two examinations? If a fixed proportion of appointments were allotted for a Native examination in England, do you consider that, in view of the objections against a voyage to England and life there, the cost thereof and the chances of failure, a sufficient number of suitable candidates from your province would be available to make the competition a real competition?—A fixed proportion of appointments ought to be allotted for the Native candidates, as the boon will ensure a respectable number to try their chance At first there may be a paucity, but in course of time the field will probably be overcrowded. Even from this backward province I have no doubt students will endeavour to go to England ere long. Already an enterprising Native gentleman has sent his son to be educated for the Civil

Service, whilst another has been twice there, and on the last occasion passed as a Barrister-at-Law; and a third, an orthodox Hindu, made no scruples to allow his two sons to try their luck in the English Inns of Court.

14. If the examinations were distinct, what should be the limits of age for the Native examination?—I have already stated that the limit of age should be twenty-two.

15. What should be the conditions, nature and subjects of the separate Native examination? Assuming only one examination in England for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination and the conditions as to age and other matters in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates? If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage? If ahere should be only one examination for tll candidates, should the limits of age for Natives be higher than those at present fixed for European candidates; and, if so, what should the limits for Native candidates be? If higher limits of age were fixed for Native than for European candidates, might not the latter complain that they were placed at a disadvantage?—I have practically answered these questions, and have only to add, that the age of European candidates might also be advantageously raised to the same limit, *viz.*, twenty-two.

16. What is the average age at which Natives at the Indian Universities pass the examinations for F. A., B. A. and M. A. respectively?—The average age at which candidates pass the Indian University examinations may safely be stated as follows:—

Entrance	F. A.	B. A.	M. A.
17	19	21	22

17. From what classes of Native society are the persons who graduate at the Indian Universities usually drawn in your province?—From the middle class as a rule.

IV.—Competition in India for the Indian Civil Service.

18. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question papers being used at both examinations?—I would not advocate competition for the Covenanted Service in India, provided the candidates, who compete in England, will have the same rights and privileges, as regards status, pay and allowances as their European brothers. I refrain from answering the other questions under this head, since I am not in favor of an Indian examination for the Covenanted Service.

V.—Promotion from the Uncovenanted Service.

19. To what extent does the Uncovenanted service in your province include in its ranks persons eligible on the ground of proved merit and ability for appointment to offices ordinarily reserved for members of the Covenanted Civil Service? If there are such persons in the Uncovenanted Service, could they be appointed to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service without suffering in pay? Under existing rules as to pay, &c., how would such appointment be regarded by Uncovenanted Officers? Do you think they would be willing to forego pay for the sake of the advantages which admission to the Civil Service might afterwards bring? What special provision, if any, do you think should be made for the appointments to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service? If such appointments are made, should they be restricted to the holders of any particular classes of appointments in the Uncovenanted Service; and, if so, what classes? Should persons so appointed be appointed provisionally and be required to pass through a period of probation before final confirmation? Should provision be made for the appointment of qualified members of the Uncovenanted Service to the *higher* Covenanted offices without requiring them to pass through the lower grades? If certain appointments in the Covenanted grades are set apart for the Statutory Service, should a fixed proportion of those appointments be expressly reserved for persons of proved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service?—There are no doubt some persons in the grade of Extra Assistant Commissioners of the Central Provinces, who may be considered eligible, on the ground of proved merit and ability, for appointment to offices, ordinarily reserved for members of the Covenanted Civil Service, but it is the not possible for me to give their number.

None of these, however, would benefit by appointment to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service on the present scale of pay, *viz.*, two-thirds of Rs. 500, unless the nominee is taken from the last two grades, the pay of which is Rs. 250 and Rs. 300 respectively. I do not think an Uncovenanted officer drawing Rs. 400 and upwards would be willing to forego pay for the sake of the advantages, which admission to the Civil Service might afterwards bring, unless he had the fortune to be promoted to those grades at an early age, say thirty. In my opinion a deserving officer may be promoted to such Covenanted post, as will give him at least what he was drawing at

the time of his promotion, otherwise it would be no reward to him for his past meritorious service.

Such appointments may be restricted to the ranks of Subordinate Judges, Extra Assistant Commissioners, Deputy Collectors and Magistrates, Munsifs of superior grade, Assistant District Superintendents of Police, Assistant Conservators, Assistant and Deputy Accountants-General, and upper subordinates of other departments, such as Educational and the like, if the nominee has the requisite qualifications for the post he is selected to fill. A probationary period for men of approved service, but rather advanced in age, will not be very popular; yet, considering all circumstances, it will be better, if each nominee is at the start put in to officiate, or, in other words, is appointed as substantive *pro tem* for a year and thereafter confirmed.

20. Should special provision be made for the promotion to Covenanted posts of European members of the Uncovenanted Service? Should special provision be made for the promotion to such posts of Eurasian or other members of the Uncovenanted Service who, though not Natives of pure descent, fall within the meaning attached in the Statute of 1870 to the term "Natives of India"?—No special arrangement for promoting European or Eurasian members of the Uncovenanted Service seems to be necessary, for, when once in the grades of Native Uncovenanted Servants, their promotions should be regulated on one and the same principle.

21. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, to be open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty who possess the qualifications that may be from time to time prescribed?—When Europeans have open to them the much-coveted Military Service exclusively by competitive examination at home, besides a large number of posts in the Covenanted Civil Service, it will be but fair to reserve the Uncovenanted Service only for the Natives of India, including any person born and domiciled within the dominions of Her Majesty in India, of parents Hindu, Mahomedan, European, Eurasian, Jew, or Parsee, habitually residing in India, and not established there for temporary purposes only. I would, however, make an exception in favor of Europeans, as regards the *quasi*-Military Service in India.

VI.—Pay, Leave and Pension for Natives of India appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the channel of competition in England.

22. Is the rate* of pay at present granted to Statutory Civilians during probation and on final appointment respectively sufficient? If not, on what grounds do you consider it insufficient, and what rates of pay should, in your opinion, be granted to Statutory Civilians (*a*) while on probation, and (*b*) on final confirmation in their appointments?—If the Statutory Service is to be retained, I would not, under the present financial condition of the Indian Exchequer, suggest any increase to the existing scale of pay and allowances, as I have already said elsewhere.

*Two hundred rupees a month on first appointment as probationers. Two hundred and fifty rupees a month after passing the departmental examination by the lower standard. After passing the departmental examination by the higher standard (unless specially exempted), and after having been confirmed in their appointments, 64 per cent. of what would be the gross pay or salary of the office if it were held by a Covenanted Civil Servant appointed after competitive examination in England.

23. Would these rates of pay be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the Uncovenanted Service? Would they be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the professional classes? If not, how would you treat in regard to pay persons selected from these two classes if appointed to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service? How would you treat in regard to pay such persons if appointed to any of the *higher* Covenanted posts without being required to pass through the lower grades?—No; see reply to questions above. Successful pleaders, having an income of Rs. 300 to Rs. 400 a month or more, would scarcely like to give up their profession, and with it their independence and freedom, for a post carrying the pay of Rs. 200, as a probationer, or of Rs. 333 in round figures, if appointed permanently at the onset. I would make exceptions in favor of Uncovenanted servants of the higher grades and leading pleaders, if nominated, and let them pass on to the grades, which would give them their actual income to start with. Junior pleaders, who have not established themselves fairly may be started as an Indian Civilian on Rs. 250 a month, for they have no departmental test to pass, except in Revenue and Treasury matters by the higher standard, and that they should be allowed the full pay, as soon as they shall have passed the aforementioned test. As regards such persons as are at once appointed to higher Covenanted posts, I would give them the full pay according to the scale laid down.

24. Do you consider that a difference should be maintained between the rates of pay granted to Covenanted Civilians who enter through the competitive channel in England and to persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through that channel? If so, what would you consider the fair rate of reduction to be made in the case of persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through the competitive channel in Eng-

land?—Certainly, there should be a difference of pay between the two classes; the present rate of two-thirds is, I should say, fair for those, who do not enter through the competitive channel in England.

25. Would you approve of an arrangement by which the pay of appointments would be a fixed sum to be drawn by the holder, whether he is a Covenanted or a Statutory Civilian, with an additional staff allowance to be drawn by those only who enter the service through the examination in England?—I would, provided the arrangement does not affect the retiring annuity of the Covenanted Civilian.

26. At what age do you consider that Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the competitive channel in England should be entitled to retire on pension? After what length of service do you consider that such persons should be entitled to retire on pension? At what age should they be obliged to retire on pension? After what length of service should they be obliged to retire on pension? What amount of pension should, in your opinion, be granted to Natives so appointed if they serve the prescribed period for voluntary and compulsory retirement respectively. If, before serving the prescribed period for pension, they are compelled to retire on medical certificate, what gratuity, if any, would you give them?—The present rules for officers appointed in India are fair enough, and I would not propose any change, except, as a rule, all employes of the Indian Civil Service, other than those, who enter it after competition in England, should, until sixty, be allowed to hold on, provided they are physically and intellectually fit for active service.

VII.—General.

27. How far is the existing system of education in the higher schools and colleges in India well adapted for training young men to the Public Service? Can you suggest any improvements?—There is no doubt, that University education has in every way improved the proficiency and moral character of students of the present generation, and the Universities have supplied a superior class of public servants; but whether they are well adapted to train up young men for the Indian Civil Service I cannot venture to offer an opinion, until I know the standard expected.

28. Do you consider that Indian schools at present develop the force of character and other qualities required for English administration?—Not to the full extent.

29. Do we now obtain for Government service Natives of the classes, who under Native rule carried on the civil administartion of the country?—Yes; we do.

30. How far would any system of appointment which involves a journey to, and residence in, England be regarded by the Native community as open to objection, on the ground that it requires Hindu candidates to abandon their caste as a condition of entering the Civil Service?—The orthodox Hindus have no doubt objections, on the score of caste prejudices, to send their children to England to be trained up for the Public Service; but, as I have already said in reply to question , the feeling is fast wearing out.

31. How far would such a system be regarded as open to objection on the ground that it restricts the field of selection to those candidates who are wealthy enough to undertake the cost of a journey to, and residence in, England?—The system of competitive examination in England will, at the start, restrict the field of selection to those candidates, who are wealthy enough to undertake the cost of journey to, and residence in, England; but I do not think this will last long, for I know of instances in which Native gentlemen of means have advanced funds, while others have subscribed, to enable certain young men of good parts to proceed in England, either for competitive examinations, or to qualify themselves for the Bar.

32. Are the Natives who go to England from your province for purposes of education limited to the wealthier classes?—Of residents of the Central Provinces, two Pleaders have sent their sons to England, one for the Civil Service and the other for the Bar; while the third, an Extra Assistant Commissioner, after amassing sufficient funds, risked a voyage to England, and passed as Barrister-at-Law.

33. Are they limited to any particular section of the community, or to any particular creed?—No. Of the two Pleaders one is a Bengali Kayesth, and the other a Madrasi Hindu gentleman, who has sent his two sons, and the Extra Assistant Commissioner is a Gaur Rajput of Saugor of these provinces.

34. Does a voyage to, or residence in, England involve the loss of social position or other unfavorable consequences in the case of any section of the Native community. Does it result in placing those Natives who undertake it more or less out of touch and sympathy with their fellow-countrymen on their return to India?—*Prima facie* the Hindu candidate would suffer by a voyage to, and residence in, England; but practically they lose little

or nothing, for in India of to-day the spread of English education has slackened the caste shackles to such an extent, that persons returning from England always find a sufficiently numerous community to move in.

35. Would the requirement of a temporary residence in England as a condition precedent to, or following on, appointment to the Government service have the effect of excluding from such appointment any considerable or important section of the Native community?—Yes, the orthodox Hindu community.

36. If the Statutory system is discontinued, should special provision be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of Natives who, for religious or other sufficient reasons, are unable or unwilling to undertake a journey to, and residence in, England? Whatever system or systems may be adopted, ought power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts candidates of high family subject to such antecedent guarantees of fitness as may be considered sufficient in each case? Ought similar power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts persons who have proved their merit and ability in Government service, or in the exercise of a profession, without preliminary examination or competition?—Yes, by nomination, provided the candidates be duly qualified.

37. If a thorough knowledge of English were made an essential qualification for appointment to Covenanted posts, would the field of selection in the case of persons already in the Uncovenanted Service, or engaged in the exercise of a profession, be unduly limited thereby?—Yes, to a certain extent.

38.—If such is likely to be the case, could the difficulty be obviated by requiring proficiency in the English language to be tested by periodical examinations *after* selection but during a probationary period?—No.

39. Should provision be made for the occasional appointment in very special and exceptional cases to Covenanted posts of persons of known ability and local influence whom, although they may never have held office and may not possess special professional qualifications, and although their age may exceed the limit laid down for untried candidates, it might nevertheless be considered desirable to appoint to the higher grades for political or other reasons?—Yes; it would be desirable, if required for political and other grounds.

40. Would it be desirable to rule, that the proportion of persons being Hindus and Mahomedans respectively, who are from time to time or over a series of years appointed to the Covenanted ranks in any province, should bear a certain relation to the number of the two classes composing the population of the province concerned?—For the Covenanted posts I would have no race distinctions in the form of proportions.

41. How far should appointments in each province to Covenanted posts be restricted to Natives of the province concerned?—I would not advocate any provincialism for Covenanted appointments.

42. How would the following scheme be regarded by the Native community?—

(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of European officers, admission being by competition in England confined to European candidates only.

(2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, Natives only being eligible. How would you regard such a scheme?

How would the Native community regard the following?—

(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of appointments to be filled by competition in England, to which Natives and Europeans alike would be admitted.

(2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, both Natives and Europeans being eligible.

How would you regard such a scheme? If either of the above schemes were adopted, how would the Native community view a proposal to combine the higher appointments of the Uncovenanted Service with the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service so as to form an enlarged Civil Service to be recruited in India?

How would you view such a proposal? How would the Native community regard the following scheme?—

(1) A certain number of appointments in the Covenanted Civil Service to be reserved for Natives;

(2) a certain proportion of that number to be filled by competition or by some other system in India;

(3) the remainder to be filled by competition in England.

How would you regard such a scheme?—I would adopt the second of the four schemes proposed in these questions, with the proviso that the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service should be filled by Natives and Europeans; the latter if falling under the category of the Statutory Natives.

43. Assuming a system of nomination or of limited competition among nominated candidates, would Native opinion be in favor of giving a preference, as between candidates possessed of certain preliminary essential qualifications and

having on general grounds fairly equal claims in the following or any other order, to—

(*a*) members of families of tried loyalty and distinguished service;

(*b*) persons of good social status and influence in the country; and

(*c*) persons of superior educational attainments, such as persons who have taken the degree of M.A.? What is your opinion as to giving such preference?—In the cases suggested I would not place any restrictions on the powers of Government.

44. How would the Native community regard a system of nomination on the ground of merit and ability shown in the service of Government, or in the exercise of a profession, alternating with a system of selection by means of competition, whether entirely open or amongst nominated candidates? How would you regard such a system?—I do not see any harm, if the proposal be adopted.

45. If the Statutory system were maintained, and if a probationary period were required from nominees or selected candidates before final appointment, would it be necessary, to insist upon such probationary period in all cases, *e.g.*, in the case of a person who has done good service in the Uncovenanted ranks?—Certainly not.

46. In the case of persons nominated from the professional classes, is it desirable that a probationary period should be prescribed?—Not necessarily.

47. If so, is it necessary, that the incidents of such period, as to duration and pay, should be the same as those attached thereto in the case of Statutory Civilians appointed on probation to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service?—I would refer to my answers to questions 20 to 24.

48. On what principles should the promotion of Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than by the channel of the competition in England be regulated? Would you regulate such promotion only by considerations of fitness and approved personal merit?—Once appointed, promotions should be regulated only by considerations of fitness and approved personal merits.

49. Should Natives appointed to Covenanted posts be required to pass the departmental examinations?—Yes, if they have not already done so.

50. Should they be required to pass the departmental examinations by both the lower and higher standards within their probationary period, subject to the penalty of forfeiture of appointment if they fail to pass within that time, unless the period is for special reasons extended? Should a period longer than the probationary period be allowed for passing the departmental examination by the higher standard?—Nominees, who entered the service without passing, may be allowed three years to pass the departmental test by both the lower and higher standards.

51. Should the present rule be maintained under which probationers may be confirmed in their appointments at the close of the probationary period of two years, provided that they pass within that period the departmental examination by the lower standard prescribed for Covenanted Civilians appointed in England, no obligatory period being fixed for passing the higher standard, but no promotion or increase of pay being attainable until the higher standard examination has been passed, and power being retained to the Government to dispense with the services of a Statutory Civilian who may fail to pass by the higher standard within a reasonable time?—I do not see any objection to the present rules being enforced under the circumstances suggested in the question.

52. What rule in regard to passing the departmental examinations should be applied in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts on the ground of merit and ability proved in the service of Government or in the exercise of a profession?—I have already given my views in reply to questions 20 to 24.

53. Should subjects of Native States be eligible for appointment to Covenanted posts in British India? If so, should this be extended to all Native States in alliance with the Crown, or only to those in subordinate alliance?—I am decidedly against the appointment of the subjects of Native States to Covenanted posts, unless they go to, and compete in, England.

54. What system, if any, is at present adopted in your province for bringing into the Public Service persons who, from their position or otherwise, cannot be expected to enter the service of Government in the lowest grades, and for giving them the necessary apprenticeship?—There is no organised system, as far as I am aware.

VIII.—Composition, Recruitment, &c., of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services.

55. How is the present system of regulating appointments to the Subordinate* Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services respectively regarded by influential

* NOTE.—For the purposes of these questions the terms "Subordinate Executive Service" and "Subordinate Judicial Service" may be held to include respectively all Subordinate Executive and Judicial Offices down to and including the office of Tahsildar or Munsif, or other office corresponding to that of Tahsildar or Munsif, which are not reserved for, or not ordinarily held by, members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

sections of the Native community?—In this province the Natives have not much to say against the present system of regulating appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services.

56. To what sections of Native society do the persons belong who accept, under existing conditions, appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively?—The employés are as a rule Hindus of good castes and Mahomedans.

57. To what extent do Natives of good family and education in your province offer themselves as candidates for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments?—The candidates, with few exceptions, come from good families, permanently residing in the province.

58. Do Natives, who have been to England for purposes of study, on their return to India willingly accept such appointments?—The only England returned Natives in the province are Barristers-at-Law, one of whom rejoined his post as an Extra Assistant Commissioner, and three others practise at the Bar.

59. How far are such appointments in your province restricted to persons *bonâ fide* resident in (and connected with) the province?—I cannot give the exact proportion; but the aim of the local Government has for some time been to utilise local talents, and a considerable portion of appointments are held by persons, who are *bonâ fide* residents of the province.

60. How far are the professional classes represented in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services respectively in your province?—There are at present five Pleaders holding permanent posts of Extra Assistant Commissioner; another Extra Assistant Commissioner has just rejoined after passing his examination as Barrister-at-Law. I exclude from this the appointment of Mr. B. K. Bose, a High Court Pleader, to officiate as Judge, Small Cause Court, Nagpore. There are, moreover, as far as I am aware of, three Tahsildars, who have passed the Pleaders' Examination.

61. Do members of the professional classes in your province readily accept employment in those services?—Pleaders do accept appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Services if sufficiently remunerative.

62. Whatever system or systems may at present be adopted for the purpose of regulating appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services respectively, are any class or classes of persons expressly or practically excluded from such appointments? If so, how is such exclusion justified? Is it the case that certain classes of Uncovenanted appointments are practically reserved for Natives of pure descent owing to the fact tha conditions are imposed which have resulted in shutting out Eurasians and other Statutory Natives of mixed descent? If so, how is such reservation justified?—No. I am not aware of the exclusion of any class or classes of persons from such appointments, except Europeans, who cannot be employed in any post carrying a salary of more than Rs. 200 per mensem, without special sanction of the Home Government; but I must note that European and Eurasian gentlemen domiciled in India are not excluded.

63. What has been the effect on the efficiency of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judical Services in your province of the orders of the Government of India, dated 18th April, 1879, which debar, unless with the previous sanction of the Governor-General in Council, (1) the appointment of any person, not being a Native of India within the Statutory meaning, to an office carrying a salary of Rs. 200 a month or upwards, and (2) the promotion to such an office of persons, not being Statutory Natives, who entered the Department concerned after the 1st January, 1879?—As far as this province is concerned, the efficiency of the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Services has not been impaired in consequence of the rule quoted.

64. Is it, in your opinion, necessary that there should be a proportion of Europeans either in the Subordinate Executive Service or in the Subordinate Judicial Service, or in both of those services? If so, on what grounds do you consider that an admixture of Europeans is necessary? What, in your opinion, is the requisite proportion to be maintained between Europeans and Natives in those services? How do European members of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services respectively work with Native members of those services?—There can be objection to have a fair proportion of Europeans or Eurasians permanently residing in the country in the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Services; and as far as I know, European and Eurasian members work cheerfully with Native members of the service. As to proportion I cannot give any opinion.

65. Has experience shown that Europeans serving in such capacities become dissatisfied with their position and with the general conditions as to pay, promotion and retiring annuity under which they hold their appointments, and that their efficiency as public servants is consequently impaired?—There were some Europeans of pure descent at one time in Subordinate Executive and Judicial Services; but they have since been advanced to posts ordinarily held by Covenanted Servants, and so their dissatisfaction or otherwise never became manifest.

66. Are you in favor of laying down a rule, that high educational capacity should be regarded as an essential qualification for appointment to the Subordinate Executive and to the Subordinate Judicial Services as defined for the purposes of these questions? If so, what test would you apply? Do you think that the test should vary according to the character of the office to be filled? Generally what system do you advocate for filling appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services as above defined? What preliminary qualifications would you require on the part of candidates for those appointments in regard to age and in other respects? Is it possible to devise any one system which would be equally applicable to all provinces having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several provinces and the varying conditions prevalent therein?—I would advocate the same course, that I have already chalked out for Statutory Civilians, in reply to question 12, with this modification, that a lower standard might be prescribed; but in all cases, I think it will be better to insist upon the candidates passing the departmental test in law by at least the existing lower standard. I would, however, leave the mode of selection of candidates for special training in the hands of Government, the same as I would reserve the power of nomination to higher posts with or without such training. I would also include in the Executive Service the superior appointments of Clerks and Deputy Clerks of Courts on the ministerial establishment. This system may be made applicable to all the provinces.

67. Do you advocate the requirement of a probationary period; and, if so, what should be the incidents of such period, as to duration, pay and in other respects? Would you require a probationary period in all cases, or would you dispense with it in certain; and, if so, in what cases?—By introduction of the above system there will, in my opinion, be no necessity for a probationary period, as the selected candidates can then enter the service they may be nominated to on full pay. In case of nomination without such training the probationary term ought to be kept until the nominee passes the departmental test. By this proviso I do not mean to include those, who are already in service and who might be advanced to posts ordinarily held by Covenanted servants.

68. If an open competitive examination were held in India for the Covenanted posts reserved for Natives, would persons who gained high marks in that examination and showed decided proficiency, but who failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, form suitable nominees for subordinate judicial and executive appointments in the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes, I would give them every chance; but they must undergo the special training, especially, as regards the departmental law test.

No. VIII.

BULWANT RAO BHASKAR, JAGIRDAR AND HONORARY MAGISTRATE, BURHANPUR.

I.—Statutory Civil Service.

Vol. III. Sec. III. Sub-Sec. B.

Bulwant Rao Bhaskar.

1. Is the existing system of appointing Natives, as Statutory Civilians, to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—The existing system of appointing Natives, as Statutory Civilians, to posts, reserved for the Covenanted Civil service, is almost not approved of. My answer to the very next question, and the reasons given therein, will elucidate slightly if not wholly, the reason why I hesitate to approve of the said system.

2. If it is not, what are the grounds of disapprobation?—I disapprove of this system on the following two grounds, *viz.*, first, it totally excludes educated men, born of poor parentage; and, secondly, it is likely to confer places upon illiterate persons born of noble parentage. To confer honorable posts on persons, simply because they are born of noble blood, would be detrimental to the well-being of India and her administration in general, especially, when such persons are illiterate, and consequently unfit, to do justice to the responsibilities, which may be thrown upon their shoulders.

High birth should not be made the main point of selection. If fortunately education and high birth were found in one man, he should have the preference first. I should certainly prefer a highly educated man, even if he were born of poor parentage, to an illiterate grandee. Any man, who has been endowed naturally with superior intelligence and varied capacities for doing any responsible work, and who has shown ample proof, (either to the local Government or to the majority of the literary society in which he moves), that his parts would bear him out successfully of whatever work allotted to or devolved upon him, and that he would be the fittest person to do justice to the task set to him, such a man should be included among the class of educated men, even though, he might not have received his education at any of the recognised institutions. I know such cases are very rare, and it is on account of their rareness that I should like to see an honorable exception made.

3. Are the defects of the existing system, (if any), susceptible of remedy—

(*a*) by an amendment of the rules;

(*b*) by an amendment of the Statutory provisions in that behalf;

or should those provisions be repealed?—The defects of the existing system can be remedied—

(*a*) by an amendment of the rules and

(*b*) by an amendment of the Statutory provisions in that behalf;

but I am for repealing neither the provisions of the Statute nor the Statute itself.

4. If the provisions of the Statute 33 Vic., Section 6, are not repealed, nor substantially amended, so as to take away the power conferred on the local administrations, should they be amended in respect of the description of persons on whose behalf such powers may be exercised or in respect of the sanction required for appointments made thereunder?—The provisions of the Statute 33 Vic., Section 6, should neither be repealed nor substantially amended, so as to take away the powers conferred on the local administrators. If any amendment is required at all, it should be in respect of the description of persons, on whose behalf such powers may be exercised.

5. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so?—Selected candidates being required, (in case the Statutory Service be retained), to proceed to England for training there would not be relished at all. I should like to see them encouraged by Government to do so.

II.—Covenanted Civil Service.

6. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—I need not say anything, as to whether there is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service, for the fact will speak for itself. It is no good, I humbly submit, to import dear commodities from abroad, when equally good ones can be had on the spot at a cheaper rate.

7. Should any, and if any what, change be made in that system?—Answers to this question have been embodied in the one just written above. If preference be given to persons available on the spot, and equally competent with the recruits, I think there would be no room left for complaint and dissatisfaction.

8. Do Natives of India labor under any, and if any what, disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch

of the service?—Competitive examinations for employment in this branch of the service being totally held in England, Natives of India are put to considerable inconvenience and disadvantages, their means being too narrow to cover the necessary expenses of passage and their healths too weak to enable them to bear the disagreeable influence of a climate not their own.

9. By what changes may those disadvantages be minimised or removed, *e.g.* :—

(*a*) by the establishment of scholarships and allowance of passage money to Native candidates;

(*b*) by altering the limit of age;

(*c*) by adding to the subjects of examination, or by altering the maximum marks obtainable in certain subjects;

(*d*) by holding simultaneously examinations in England and in India?

—The disadvantages, cited above, might be much minimised, if not wholly removed, if examinations were held simultaneously both in England and India; if scholarships were established as an encouragement for students in general; if an allowance for passage were given to such candidates, as would willingly undertake a voyage, and would be physically fit to cope with the climate of England; and, lastly, if the limit of age be altered, that is to say, be allowed to vary between nineteen and twenty-three.

10. If an examination is held in India—

(1) Should it be identical with that held in England?

(2) Should it be held at one or more centres in India?

Should the candidates in England and in India compete with one another and be selected in order of merit, or should a certain number of appointments be apportioned for competition to the candidates at the respective examinations?

(3) If such an apportionment is made, on what principle is it to be regulated?

(4) Should there be an apportionment between the residents in the territories of the several administrations respectively or between the members of the principal religious sects?

—If an examination were held in India, it should be identical with that held in England. It should be held at centres more than one in India; and the candidates in England and in India should compete with one another and be selected in order of merit.

In case merit is not taken into consideration, a certain number of appointments should be apportioned for competition to the candidates at the respective examinations.

If there be any apportionment at all, it should be between the residents in the territories of the several administrations respectively and not between the members of the principal religious sects, taking for granted, that the places are to be conferred on the successful candidates, according to their order of merit. The apportionment, (if made at all) should be based on the principle of equality, that is to say, an equal number of places should be allotted to those that pass in India. There should be no difference between the places apportioned to England and India. There would be no harm, if a slight difference be made in the salaries of the Natives and the Europeans, as shown in my reply to Issue No. 2, IV.

11. If an examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—If an examination be held in India, the successful candidates may or may not proceed to England to complete their training there. It should be left to their option and not made obligatory. In the case of successful candidates not going to England, some suitable provision should be made for their complete training here in India.

12. Are the young Natives, obtained under the existing system of the open competition in England, the best as regards character and capacity, who could be obtained under any system?—The young Natives obtained under the existing system of open competition in England are, (as far as I have heard of them,) the best, as regards character and capacity, who could be obtained under any system.

III.—Uncovenanted Service.

13. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—The Uncovenanted Service should be recruited only from Natives of India, as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6; but in case a qualified Native is not available, any one of Her Majesty's subjects from abroad may be selected.

14. Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or by both systems combined; and, if by both combined, should one system be applied to all offices or classes of offices, or should the system be varied with the class of offices?—Recruitment by competition is certainly preferable to that by nomination, but in the case of competitors, (persons having passed the competitive examination,) not being available, nomination may have its preference.

15. Whatever system be adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several administrations only from persons resident in the territories under such administrations respectively or with a preference for such residents?—Whatever system be adopted, the recruitment should be made by the several administrations only from persons resident in the territories under such administrations respectively, and not with a preference for such residents.

16. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—If the existing Statutory Service be abolished, (which I hope will never be), the proportion of offices assigned to that service should be allotted to the Uncovenanted Servants available on the spot.

IV.—Pay and Furlough Rules.

17. If such distinction should be made, on what principle should it be regulated?—Native candidates, who pass in England, should have their claims to three-fourths of the pay drawn by the Europeans, and those that pass their examinations in India, should get two-thirds of the same. The reason for this difference is obvious, for those who go abroad, leaving their homes, must receive a comparatively greater share of remuneration.

18. Are the privileges in regard to pay, promotion and retiring annuity and the general conditions of office belonging to the Covenanted Civil Service suitable to Natives obtaining office under the Statutory rules?—The privileges, in regard to pay, promotion and retiring annuity, and the general conditions of office belonging to the Covenanted Civil Service are, in my opinion, suitable to Natives obtaining office under the Statutory rules.

No. IX.

K. K. Thakur, Extra Assistant Commissioner, Khandwa, Central Provinces.

The Government of India Resolution, dated 4th October, 1886, has been read with great interest throughout India. A very great boon has thereby been conferred on the Indian subjects of Her Majesty.

The intentions of the Government, as regards the scope and purpose of the Commission are well pronounced, and the constitution of the Commission inspires full confidence, that these will be carried out in all integrity. The Commission is to enquire—to quote the Resolution—into "the system under which Natives of India are admitted either to the *Covenanted Civil Service*, or to *offices*, formerly reserved exclusively to the members of that service, and the *Uncovenanted* Service generally," and "to devise a scheme, which may reasonably be hoped to possess the necessary elements of *finality*, and to do *full justice* to the claims of Natives of India to *higher* and *more extensive* employment in the Public Service.

It is worthy of note, that any scheme the Commission may eventually submit is to have a *final character*, and to give to the Native subjects of Her Majesty *higher* and *more extensive* employment in the Public Service than at present. It appears, that the distinction between the Covenanted and the Uncovenanted Services is also to be retained.

No scheme can be expected to possess the necessary elements of finality, which is unnecessarily complicated by provisions for the provincial and sectarian interests of the people, and is based upon any other considerations, than those of moral, intellectual and physical fitness of the candidates. The scheme should, therefore, be simple in its character. Then, again, no scheme can be said to give to the Natives of India higher employment, though it may give them more extensive employment, which will exclude them from rising to posts to which they can now rise by entering the Civil Service, after competition in England.

Another very important question referred to the Commission is contained in the following sentences of the Resolution: "It appears to have been expressly suggested, that the Act of 1870 is unpopular, because a person appointed under it draws, according to the rules laid down, pay at a lower rate, than if he were a member of the Indian Civil Service, appointed after competition in London. This point will require serious consideration from the Commissioners, because, among other reasons, it raises an important question, as to the *financial saving*, which, it is generally supposed, will arise from the more extensive employment of Native gentlemen in the Public Service."

Undoubtedly the more extensive employment of Native agency in the higher spheres of administration should contribute—and every good Native would like to see it contribute—towards *financial saving*, but such a saving should not be effected, at the expense of efficiency and contentment. When the financial saving is effected, as under the Act of 1870, to such an extent as to render the appointment of Native gentlemen to the *higher ranks* almost honorary, it is no wonder that dissatisfaction results, efficiency suffers, and the Statute becomes unpopular. It is a well-known rule that the greater the responsibility the larger the salary. To make my meaning clearer I will give an illustration. *A* and *B* are appointed about the same time; the former a Statutory Assistant Commissioner and the latter an Extra Assistant Commissioner in the Central Provinces. Now *A* will draw 64 per cent. of Rs. 400=Rs. 256 and *B* Rs. 250. It can also be shown, (within the limits of probability), that by the time *A*, (being a Statutory Civilian), rises, (if at all), to a Deputy Commissionership, *B* will rise to the highest grade of Extra Assistant Commissionership. After the same length of service, *A* has the doubtful chance of drawing Rs. 640, (64 per cent. of Rs. 1,000), while *B* will get Rs. 600. It is clear from this, that so far as remuneration is concerned, *A* in the Statutory Civil Service has secured no appreciable advantage over *B*, though he has been put in a higher and more responsible position. His appointment, therefore, is simply honorary to the higher post.

In my replies, attached hereto, to the questions issued by the Commission, I have stated in what cases it is advisable to make a reduction of salaries and the proper proportion of such reduction. It will also appear from the following scheme, in which I combine the views expressed above.

I.—Competitive system for Recruitment of the Indian Civil Service.

Of the Covenanted posts to be filled up every year one-third should be reserved for the Subordinate Judicial and Executive Service and the legal profession in India, and the remaining should be openly competed for as follows:—

(i) All Her Majesty's subjects, without distinction of class, colour, or

creed, who are at present eligible to compete for the Indian Civil Service, should continue so.

(ii) The limit of age for competition should be raised to twenty-three.

(iii) There should be two centres of examination, one in London and the other at Allahabad or Jubbulpore; and one and the same examination should be held simultaneously at both the centres.

(iv) Indian classics and languages should be placed on an equal footing with European classics and languages, and Indian History should be added to the subjects.

(v) One list of passed candidates at both the centres, in order of merit, should be made and appointments accordingly given.

(vi) Two years' probation after selection is necessary.

(vii) Selected candidates should be encouraged, and not compelled, to go to England for further study.

(viii) Those, who compete in India and after selection do not go to England for further study, should get, irrespective of class, color or creed, 80 per cent. of the salary attached to Covenanted posts. Those, who compete in England, and, who, after selection, go to England for further study, should get the full salary irrespective of their class, color or creed. The same rule should be observed in their pensions. This arrangement will serve as an encouragement to go to England.

(ix) Scholarships and passage money, to the extent now given, should be continued for those who go to England for further study. The Indian competitors, after selection, will have to be given passage money for going to, and returning from, England.

II—Recruitment from the Uncovenanted Service.

(i) The selection of men from the Uncovenanted Service and the legal profession should be by nomination, or limited competition, and should be confined to each separate province under on head of administration.

(ii) Men of proved ability and merit should be selected, and merit and ability should be taken to have been proved by the reports of superiors and the character of the work done, or merit, ability and integrity shown in the practice of the legal profession.

(iii) If the method of limited competition is adopted, the local Government should first nominate the candidates, who have evinced merit in the service or the legal profession, and these should compete, the competition being confined to each separate province.

(iv) The subjects for competition should be (1) an original essay in English on some topic, connected with the administration, to be made known at the time of examination; (2) jurisprudence and international law; (3) Hindu, Mahomedan and other laws; (4) surveying.

(v) A list of passed candidates, in order of merit, should be made, and appointments given in that order. The rejected candidates may appear next year. There should be no period of probation for them, as merit and ability have already been proved.

These men, on appointment to Covenanted posts, should get 80 per cent of the salary of the post and pension, but should be treated with equality, as regards promotion, seniority, &c.

One serious objection to the open competion scheme No. I, given above, will be, that it will not ensure a due representation in the service of all the provinces, as the provinces backward in education will be excluded by the more advanced ones. I say, that there is now hardly any province, which is so backward in education, as to be totally excluded by open competition from securing a place in the Covenanted Service for its representative, though for the first few years, there will, no doubt, be a preponderance in the successful candidates of men from the presidency towns and places round about; but this state of things will not last long. Among other forces that are at present at work, this competition for such valuable prizes as higher administrative posts will, itself, be a potent factor in giving a stimulus to education in backward provinces. Competition open and free in this case, as in every other, must produce its effects. As any new system, which the Commission may eventually recommend, is to be invested with the character of permanence, it should not be adapted to the state of things at the present hour.

The views, expressed in the above note, and the schemes of new systems for recruitment for the Civil Service, attached hereto, will supply answers to a great many of the 184 questions at first issued; subsequent

to these a few others were issued under four different heads. These subsequent questions have been thought to be the most important of all in many influential quarters. I shall, therefore, conclude my note by specific answers to each of these latter questions.

ANSWERS TO THE ISSUES.

I.—Statutory Civil Service.

1. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—The Statutory system is not approved.

2. If it is not, what are the grounds of disapprobation?—The grounds of disapprobation are, among others, that (1) the appointments are made under it to specific posts and not to an organised service; (2) the position of Statutory Civilians is decidedly inferior to the Covenanted Civilians; (3) the mode of selecting candidates is unsatisfactory; and (4) no better prospects, as regards pay, are offered in it than those in the Subordinate Service (see above). In short, it is not the thing wanted by the educated Natives of any class, rich, poor, influential or not.

3. Are the defects of the existing system, (if any), susceptible of remedy—

(*a*) by an amendment of the rules;

(*b*) by an amendment of the Statutory provisions in that behalf;

or should those provisions be repealed?—The defects in the Statute of 1870 are not curable, and it should be repealed.

4. If the provisions of the Statute 33 Vic., Section 6, are not repealed nor substantially amended, so as to take away the power conferred on the local administrations, should they be amended, in respect of the description of persons, on whose behalf such powers may be exercised, or in respect of the sanction required for appointments made thereunder?—Not quite clear to me; but the Secretary of State's sanction should be necessary to posts to which he appoints Civilians.

5. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so?—If the Statutory system is retained, it should conform to scheme II, (see above), and candidates should be encouraged, and not compelled, to go to England for study.

II.—Covenanted Civil Service.

6. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—A competitive system for this service is highly approved; great dissatisfaction is, however, felt to the details of the existing system.

7. Should any, and if any, what, change be made in that system?—There is a great demand for change. The changes required are those, which will make the existing system conform to the scheme, I have given above.

8. Do Natives of India labor under any, and if any what, disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the service?—The Natives labor under great disadvantages; some of them are:—

(*a*) They have to cross the sea and adapt themselves to a very different climate at a very tender age.

(*b*) The very low limit of age, practically, excludes them, as they have to acquire a mastery over a foreign tongue, before competition.

(*c*) They have, in many cases, not adequate means to go so far, and live so long in England for a doubtful chance as is now required.

(*d*) The competition with candidates, who have all the advantages on their side.

9. By what changes may those disadvantages be minimised or removed, *e. g.*:—

(*a*) By the establishment of scholarships and the allowance of passage money to Native candidates;

(*b*) by altering the limit of age;

(*c*) by adding to the subjects of examination, or by altering the maximum marks, obtainable in certain subjects;

(*d*) by holding examinations simultaneously in England and in India?

—The disadvantages can be removed by adopting the schemes of recruitment, Nos. I and II, given above, *i. e.*:—

(*a*) Passage money should be given, and scholarships, now given, should be given, and no more if a centre is established in India;

(*b*) by altering the limit of age to twenty-three;

(*c*) putting the Indian classics and languages, as regards marks, on an equal footing with the European classics and languages, and adding Indian History to the subjects; and

(*d*) by holding the same examination simultaneously in England and India.

The disadvantages will be simply *minimised* by adopting clause *(d)* only.

10. If an examination is held in India—

(1) Should it be identical with that held in England?

(2) Should it be held at one or more centres in India?

Should the candidates in England and in India compete with one another, and be selected in order of merit, or should a certain number of appointments be apportioned for competition to the candidates at the respective examinations?

(3) If such an apportionment is made, on what principle is it to be regulated?

(4) Should there be an apportionment between the residents in the territories of the several administrations respectively or between the members of the principal religious sects?

—(1) The examination held in India should be identical with that held in England, as there is no reason, why it should not be so.

(2) It matters very little, whether one or more centres are selected in India, but one will be convenient for management of the examination. The candidates in England and India should compete with one another and should be selected, in order of merit in one list.

(3) and (4) I should object to both these proposals, as they will tend to make invidious distinctions and create class jealousy.

11. If an examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—The candidates successful in the examination in India should not be compelled to go to England, but should be encouraged to do so, for further study.

12. Are the young Natives obtained under the existing system of the open competition in England the best as regards character and capacity who could be obtained under any system?—Undoubtedly the best, as regards character, capacity and intellectual attainments.

III.—Uncovenanted Service.

13. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—If the Covenanted Service is really thrown open to Natives, by holding simultaneously the same examination in India and England, and by giving the facilities as proposed above, then the Uncovenanted Service should, in all justice, be recruited from all the natural-born subjects of Her Majesty; otherwise not.

14. Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or by both systems combined; and if by both combined, should one system be applied to all offices or classes of offices, or should the system be varied with the class of offices?—The higher posts in the Uncovenanted Service should be filled by competition; the rest by nomination and competition combined. By higher posts, I mean, all above the Tahsildarships and Munsifships. A certain proportion of these, say one-third, should, however, be reserved to be filled by nomination by the local Government.

15. Whatever system be adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several administrations only from persons resident in the territories under such administrations respectively or with a preference for such residents?—The several administrations should fill the vacancies from the persons resident under those administrations.

16. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—If facilities are given to enter the Covenanted Service, as proposed above, it is not necessary to allot the offices to the Uncovenanted Service on abolishing the Statutory Service; otherwise they should be so allotted.

IV.—Pay and Furlough Rules.

17. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service according as the posts are held by members of that branch of the service or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches? If such distinction should be made, on what principle should it be regulated?—The distinction in pay, &c., should be made on the principle, and as proposed, in schemes I and II.

18. Should any distinction be made in the furlough rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches of the service, according to the nationality of the officer, or on any other, and what, ground?—(See answer 19 below.)

19. Are the privileges in regard to pay, promotion and retiring annuity and the general conditions of office belonging to the Covenanted Civil Service suitable to Natives obtaining office under the Statutory rules?—The promotion of men, appointed after competition or otherwise to Covenanted posts, should be ordinarily regulated by seniority; in cases of exceptional merit the rule of seniority may be set aside. No distinction should in this respect be made on account of the manner of appointment. The rule, as regards pension, has already been given in the above schemes and answers. The Natives of India should be entitled to at least four years' furlough, if Europeans are entitled to six years.

No. X.

KUSTUR CHAND DAGA, HONORARY MAGISTRATE, KAMPTEE, CENTRAL PROVINCES.

I.—Statutory Civil Service.

1. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved? If it is not, what are the grounds of disapprobation?—There being different feelings, and conflicting ideas on this subject, in my opinion, it would be better to leave this system undisturbed. It may be made open to all, and appointments, and nomination to be made by each local Government, in accordance with the merits, position and rank of the candidates.

2. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so?—No obligatory condition should be imposed on the candidates to go to England for training, but it may be encouraged.

II.—Covenanted Civil Service.

3. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Dissatisfaction does exist among the Natives of India, specially amongst the educated sections.

4. Should any, and if any what, change be made in that system?—A new University to be opened in any one of the principal presidencies for the competitive examination for Hindus and Mahomedans, who cannot afford to go to England for the competitive examination, prescribed for Europeans in England.

5. Do Natives of India labor under any, and if any what, disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the service?—Some of the Natives of India do labor under the disadvantages based upon caste prejudices, age and means.

6. By what changes may those disadvantages be minimised or removed, *e. g.*:—

(*a*) By the establishment of scholarships and allowance of passage money to Native candidates;

(*b*) by altering the limit of age;

(*c*) by adding to the subjects of examination, or by altering the maxima marks obtainable in certain subjects;

(*d*) by holding simultaneously examinations in England and in India?—The following changes seem capable of removing the above disadvantages:—

(*a*) By establishing a new University;

(*b*) by increasing the age of the Native candidates, at least, to twenty-two years;

(*c*) by lessening the maxima marks obtainable in certain subjects;

(*d*) by holding simultaneously examination in England and in India.

7. If an examination is held in India—

(1) Should it be identical with that held in England?

(2) Should it be held at one or more centres in India?

Should the candidates in England and in India compete with one another and be selected in order of merit, or should a certain number of appointments be apportioned for competition to the candidates at the respective examinations?

(3) If such an apportionment is made, on what principle is it to be regulated?

(4) Should there be an apportionment between the residents in the territories of the several administrations respectively or between the members of the principal religious sects?—The examination to be held in India—

(1) It should be identical with that held in England, with the exception of such subjects, which are not of much importance to Natives.

(2) The examination should be held only in the University, and a certain number of appointments be apportioned for successful candidates at the respective examinations.

(3) In order of merit.

(4) The apportionment to be made between the residents in the territories of the several administrations respectively.

8. If an examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—No. It should not be made obligatory to the successful candidates to proceed to England to complete their training;

a probationary period to be allowed to them to test their abilities and moral character.

9. Are the young Natives obtained under the existing system of the open competition in England the best as regards character and capacity who could be obtained under any system ?—Yes. They are, with the usual exceptions, which are commonly found in every human being.

III.—Uncovenanted Service.

10. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty ?—Yes. It should be recruited only from Natives of India, as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6.

11. Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or by both systems combined; and if by both combined, should one system be applied to all offices or classes of offices, or should the system be varied with the class of offices ?—The recruitment should be by competition or by nomination and the system be varied with the class of offices.

12. Whatever system be adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several administrations only from persons resident in the territories under such administrations respectively or with a preference for such residents ?—Yes. It should be made by the several administrations from persons, resident in the territories under such Government, with a preference for such resident, if a person of better abilities and proved merits is available from any other parts of India.

13. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service ?—Yes.

No. XI.

VILKA RAMCHANDRA, EXTRA ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER, HOSHANGABAD, CENTRAL PROVINCES.

I.—Statutory Civil Service.

1. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—The system is not approved.

2. If it is not, what are the grounds of disapprobation?—The grounds of disapprobation are:—

(*a*) The system, not being a competitive one, debars really good men from entering the service.

(*b*) It attaches too much importance to birth and position in life, in preference to real intellectual and educational qualifications.

(*c*) Its defectiveness is exemplified by some of the selections being not happy.

(*d*) It leaves too much room for favoritism.

(*e*) The proportion of places obtainable under it by the Natives of India is too small, considering their rights and privileges to a share in the administration of their country, and also the aspirations of the educated men, that are being annually turned out by the several Indian Universities.

3. Are the defects of the existing system, (if any), susceptible of remedy—

(*a*) by an amendment of the rules;

(*b*) by an amendment of the Statutory provisions in that behalf;

or should those provisions be repealed?—The defects of the existing system are susceptible of remedy only by an amendment of the rules. It is not necessary to amend the Statutory provisions. The rules may be amended, so as to remove all the causes of disapprobation, enumerated in the answer to question No. 2 above. The chief amendments required, are to make the system a purely competitive one and to increase the proportion of appointments allotted to the Natives. The present proportion of "one-fifth" is too small; it should be raised to not less than "one-half."

These amendments will not be necessary if, in addition to the existing Statutory system, the Covenanted Civil Service be made more accessible to the Natives of India, than it is at present—

(*a*) by holding a competitive examination in India;

(*b*) by raising the limit of age;

(*c*) by doing away with the condition, requiring Indian candidates to undertake a journey to England, after passing the examination;

(*d*) allotting to the Natives of India, not less than half the number of appointments in the gift of Government, including those obtainable under the existing Statutory system.

4. If the provisions of the Statute 33 Vic., Section 6, are not repealed nor substantially amended so as to take away the power conferred on the local administrations, should they be amended in respect of the description of persons on whose behalf such powers may be exercised or in respect of the sanction required for appointments made thereunder?—It is the rules which require amendment, as mentioned above, and not the provisions of the Statute under which they were framed.

5. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so?—Proceeding to England need not be made compulsory, but the selected candidates may be encouraged to go thither. It ought to be more a matter of one's choice, than of necessity. The training, which a Native of India receives in this country, is quite sufficient for all intents and purposes.

II.—Covenanted Civil Service.

6. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—There is no dissatisfaction felt so to speak.

7. Should any, and if any what, change be made in that system?—The system of recruitment, therefore, requires no change.

8. Do Natives of India labor under any, and if any what, disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the service?—The Natives of India do labor under disadvantages:—

(*a*) The examinations being held in England, many Natives of India are prevented from proceeding thither, on account of religious and caste obstacles, and also from pecuniary considerations.

(*b*) The present limit of age, (nineteen years), is too short to enable

Indian lads to master a foreign language and to compete with their English brethren in subjects, requiring a diligent application in acquiring them.

9. By what changes may those disadvantages be minimised or removed, *e.g.*:—

(*a*) By the establishment of scholarships and allowance of passage money to Native candidates;

(*b*) by altering the limit of age;

(*c*) by adding to the subjects of examination, or by altering the maximum marks obtainable in certain subjects;

(*d*) by holding simultaneously examinations in England and in India?

—The establishment of scholarships and the allowance of passage money would enable but few to overcome religious and caste prejudices.

(*b*) The limit of age should be altered, even when the examinations are held in India. It should be raised to not less than twenty-three years.

(*c*) The subjects require no additions to be made to them, but the marks, allotted to Sanskrit and Arabic, should be raised to the number obtainable for Latin.

(*d*) This is the best and the chief remedy. It would remove all the disadvantages, arising from religious or caste prejudices, or from pecuniary circumstances, except those, arising from the limit of age being fixed at nineteen.

10. If an examination is held in India—

(1) Should it be identical with that held in England?

(2) Should it be held at one or more centres in India?

Should the candidates in England and in India compete with one another and be selected in order of merit, or should a certain number of appointments be apportioned for competition to the candidates at the respective examinations?

(3) If such an apportionment is made, on what principle is it to be regulated?

(4) Should there be an apportionment between the residents in the territories of the several administrations respectively or between the members of the principal religious sects?—The examination should be—

(*a*) Identical with that held in England.

(*b*) It should be held at more than one centres in India, for instance in Calcutta, Bombay, Madras and Lahore.

I do not advocate competition between candidates in England and India. It would be well to apportion certain number of appointments, as suggested in the question.

(*c*) The appointments should be made in equal proportion between English and Indian candidates.

(*d*) The appointments, allotted to Natives of India, should be apportioned, not by religious sects, but by territories in proportion to the number of appointments in the gift of each administration.

11. If an examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—My reply to this question is the same, as to question No. 5 under the Statutory Civil Service.

12. Are the young Natives obtained under the existing system of the open competition in England the best as regards character and capacity who could be obtained under any system?—Yes, they are the best men.

III.—Uncovenanted Service.

13. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—The Uncovenanted Service may be recruited, partly from the Natives of India, and partly from the natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, but the proportion of appointments, reserved for the latter, should not exceed "one-fourth" of the total number.

14. Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or by both systems combined; and if by both combined, should one system be applied to all offices or classes of offices, or should the system be varied with the class of offices?—The recruitment should be by competition alone.

15. Whatever system be adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several administrations only from persons resident in the territories under such administrations respectively or with a preference for such residents?—The recruitment should be made with a preference for such residents.

16. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—The loss, sustained by the abolition of the Statutory system, cannot be compensated for by the allotment to the Uncovenanted Service of offices assigned to the former service or by allotment of a greater number of offices.

IV.—Pay and Furlough Rules.

17. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service according as the posts are held by members of that branch of the service or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—It seems fair, that the members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted Service should get something less than the members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

18. If such distinction should be made, on what principle should it be regulated?—The reduction should not exceed "one-fourth" of the pay, attached to the post reserved for the Covenanted Civil Servants.

19. Should any distinction be made in the furlough rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches of the service according to the nationality of the officer, or on any other, and what, ground?—It seems fair, that some distinction should be made in the furlough rules, according to the nationality of the officers of the two services, referred to.

20. Are the privileges in regard to pay, promotion and retiring annuity and the general conditions of office, belonging to the Covenanted Civil Service, suitable to Natives obtaining office under the Statutory rules?—Not having studied the subject properly, I am not in a position to answer this question.

No. XII.

BABU BIPPIN KRISHNA BOSE, ADVOCATE, NAGPUR.

I.—Working of the existing Statutory System.

Vol. III. Sec. III. Sub-Sec. B.

Babu *Bippin Krishna Bose.*

1. What is the prevalent feeling in your province regarding the existing Statutory system? If the feeling is one of dissatisfaction, is the dissatisfaction general or is it confined to certain sections of the community?—The preamble to Section 6 of the Statute of 1870 speaks of the expediency of affording additional facilities for the employment of Natives of *proved merit and ability* in the Indian Civil Service. It is doubtful, whether the establishment of such a Native service, as the Statutory Civil Service, can be said to be within the scope of the intention of Parliament in enacting the section. In any case, employment of *untried* young men, without subjecting them to any intellectual test, is based on a different principle from what the preamble contemplates. It must, however, be conceded, that the section itself authorises the employment of *any* Native, subject to such rules, as may from time to time be prescribed by the Government.

A system, the main object of which is to provide, at the discretion of the Government, a few scions of the nobility of the country, with subordinate posts, carrying on an average about Rs. 350 a month as pay, will not, I am afraid, satisfy the just and legitimate aspirations of the people to have a fair and adequate share in the administration of their country. So far as this province is concerned, I do not think that the people generally hold any decided opinion on the subject at all. Those few, who have devoted any attention to it, do not, as far as I am aware, view with satisfaction the existing Statutory system, under which selection is primarily regulated by a regard for family status and position.

2. What are the grounds upon which any such feeling is based? Is the feeling of dissatisfaction, if it exists, directed against the Statute itself (33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6), or is it directed against the rules framed thereunder? If the objections are directed against the rules framed under the Statute do they relate to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted?—The language of the Statute itself is so broad and general, that there is hardly anything to be said against it. The rules to be framed thereunder constitute the really important matter; and the feeling of dissatisfaction with which the Statutory system is regarded is directed against the rules, regulating the mode of selection. The reasons for this feeling may be thus stated:—

(*a*) No stated number of appointments is guaranteed, and the selection is purely discretionary.

(*b*) The fitness of Natives to hold with credit high appointments, hitherto reserved for the members of the Covenanted Civil Service, will necessarily be judged by the success of the men appointed under the Statutory system. In order that the trial be a fair one, it is very necessary that the men selected should possess in a high degree all those qualities, moral and intellectual, which go to make a successful public servant. The nomination system carries with it no guarantee, that the best men available for the purpose will be selected.

(*c*) Apart from the *special* interest of the people, involved in the selection of their best men, nominated candidates, chosen mainly for considerations of family status, are not likely to come up to the standard of efficiency, required in the interests of the Public Service at large. The members of the Civil Service wield such fast and varied powers, that a very high degree of culture ought to be insisted upon in their case.

(*d*) The standard of education and culture, required from the candidates at the open competition in England, is very high, and is jealously watched; thus the successful candidates generally receive education of a most finished and liberal character. To be a fit compeer of such picked men, every Statutory Civil Servant must be a picked man himself, must have received "the best, the most liberal, the most finished education, that his country affords." High birth does not necessarily carry with it high culture. The contrary, generally, is unfortunately the case in India.

(*e*) The restrictions with which the appointments to the Statutory Service have been hedged in do not seem to be in consonance with the terms of the Acts of 1833 and 1853 and Her Majesty's Proclamation of 1858, which

lays down "education, ability and integrity" as the only tests of qualification for admission to offices in Her Majesty's Indian service.

(f) There does not seem to be any valid ground for assuming, that differences in race and nationality call for the adoption of two radically different tests of merit and qualification, in the cases of English and Indian candidates. Nothing has happened since 1855, when the Civil Service was first thrown open to unlimited competition by all classes of Her Majesty's subjects, to lead to the inference, that the policy, then deliberately adopted, is unsuited to India. The principle, enunciated by Lord Macaulay's Committee of 1854, that "the intellectual test would, in practice, be found to be the best moral test, that could be devised," has in no way been discredited by anything, which has happened since then. I believe, that it cannot be said of those, who have already entered the Civil Service by the door of open competition in England, that they are wanting in the qualifications, that are considered essential in a member of the Civil Service. The setting aside of the principle of open competition, and the adoption in its place of the system of nomination is thus another cause of the present dissatisfaction. The selections under the new method have not been so happy, as to reconcile the people to it, and to convince them of its superiority over the other method.

3. Do you consider that Section 6 of the Statute supplies such a definition of the words "Natives of India" as describes with sufficient clearness, fulness and accuracy the various classes of persons for whose appointment to Covenanted posts it is desirable to provide?—Yes, it does; the definition includes, as it ought to do, Eurasians and other non-Indian races, whose permanent home is India.

4. Are Statutory Civilians regarded by the general public as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel? If such a feeling exists, on what grounds is it based?—Inequality in the mode of original admission to the service must needs involve inequality of position. Men, who have battled their way into the service by dint of moral and intellectual superiority, necessarily occupy a higher position in public estimation, than those, who enter the service by mere nomination, and who are not subjected to any test, likely to bring forth their pluck, energy, moral courage and intellectual qualifications.

5. Do the general public view with any difference the status of Statutory Civilians and that of Uncovenanted officers? If so on what grounds?—As matters stand, at present, the people hardly draw any distinction between a Statutory Civil Servant and an Uncovenanted officer, the reason being, that there is practically no substantial difference between these two classes of public servants, as regards official status, pay and promotion.

II.—Mode of Selection of Statutory Civilians.

6. On the assumption that the Statutory system is retained, how would appointment to the Statutory Service by nomination be regarded by influential sections of the Native community in your province?—Appointment by pure nomination may be viewed with favor by those, who benefit by the system; but it will not, I fancy, give satisfaction to any large section of the people. Nomination of one out of many candidates is likely to create heart-burning among the families of those rejected.

7. Would a system of nomination, with or without probation, be likely to secure well-qualified persons?—It may, perhaps, do so; but there is no guarantee, that it would.

8. Has experience actually shown such a system to secure well-qualified officers?—If one is to judge of the success of the system by the nominations hitherto made, the result cannot be pronounced to be, as satisfactory, as could be desired.

9. Do you consider that nominations should be confined to persons of proved merit and ability?—Yes.

10. If so, how do you consider that merit and ability should be held to have been proved for this purpose?—By success at a competitive examination, which is the only test, that can be generally relied upon. In any case, the highest culture is the best, and the only sure, test.

11. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons nominated for this purpose by the local Governments or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—A system of limited competition amongst persons, nominated for this purpose by the local Government *and* the Universities concurrently, would be preferred to a system of nomination pure and simple. In order that the competition may be real, the field should be wide. I, therefore, say, that the nominations should be by the two authorities concurrently.

12. In preference to either of the above

Babu *Dippin Krishna Bose.*

systems, (nomination and limited competition), would a system of open competition, pure and simple, for the Statutory Service commend itself to the Native community?—I would advocate open competition. The wider the field, the greater the chance of getting the best men. It must, however, be conceded that, if the Universities be vested with powers to nominate candidates, all those, whose claims rest on intellectual qualifications, will have an opportunity to compete, and thus practically the competition will be, as real and effective, as if it were unconditional and unlimited.

13. If competition, (whether limited or open), is preferred, should there be one competition for all India or separate competitions in each province?—There should be one competition for all India.

14. If there were only one general competition, how would you ensure a due proportion of appointments falling to the population of the several provinces? Having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several provinces, and the varying conditions, prevalent therein, is it possible to have any one system of selection for all India which would not result in the inhabitants of some provinces being more or less excluded from a due share of appointments?—Irrespective of all other considerations, in our own interests, it is absolutely necessary, that no one class or section of the people should be allowed to have an undue preponderance in the Public Service. To provide against this undesirable result, limits should be fixed to the number of appointments to be competed for by the people of the several provinces. The maximum number, assigned to a particular province, should not be exceeded, whatever the number of successful candidates in order of merit from that province. At the same time, the adoption of a lower standard of culture, to suit the backward educational condition of any province, or class of people is to be deprecated. It is doubtful policy, to confer high appointments on inferior men, simply for the reason, that the standard of education, as it obtains in the province to which they belong, is low. Therefore, there should be no relaxation of the rule, that one must first deserve such a high prize, before he should get it; thus a certain minimum degree of competency must be exacted from every aspirant after the higher services. The result of the adoption of this principle would no doubt be, that, while the people of an advanced province would probably secure the maximum number of appointments allotted to them, those, who are still in a backward state, will have to be satisfied with a lesser number. The remaining appointments, which go to make up the maximum number, may, at the discretion of the Government, be filled up, as at present, from the ranks of the successful candidates at the competition in England, or from duly qualified candidates from the other provinces, they having failed to secure a place among the number assigned to their own province. The adoption of the latter method will, as I say, be purely discretionary with the Government, no sort of lien or right being admitted.

15. Under any of the three systems of nomination, limited competition, and open competition, would you prescribe any tests of preliminary qualifications on the part of nominees or candidates in regard to (1) age, (2) intellectual capacity, (3) moral, social and physical fitness? If so, what should be the tests under each of the heads specified?—The tests may be the same, as in the open competition in England, except that the limit of age should be twenty-two years.

16. Do you consider that, (after selection, whether by nomination or competition), there should be a period of probation? If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period? Do you consider, that after selection and before entering on probation, (or on duty), the person selected should undergo special training?—There should be a period of probation, extending to two years, during which the selected candidates should go through a course of special training.

17. If so, should the special training be carried out in India or in England?—I am of opinion, that the special training should be carried out in England, the same allowance being made, as is now done, to the selected candidates at the open competition in England.

18. If in India, would it be possible and, if possible, advisable to establish an Indian Civil Service College on the basis of the Haileybury College which formerly existed in England?—To be really efficient, it would be too costly. It does not seem to be needed.

19. If you do not consider special training in England essential, would you encourage nominees or selected candidates to visit England with a view to add to their qualifications for the service? If so, what form should such encouragement take? Should it be offered before, or during, or after, the probationary period, if any, through which nominees or selected candidates may be required to pass?—If residence in England be not made compulsory, then, as a sort of inducement, scholarships may be offered. The probationary period should be contemporaneous with residence in England. The routine work will, of course, have to be learnt after arrival in India, just as in the case of European Civil Servants; but the time spent in this should rank as service.

20. Do you think that any distinction should be made between the emoluments of nominees or selected candidates who have been trained in England or have

gone to England to add to their qualifications and those who have not?—I am inclined to think, that, if training in England be not made compulsory, then no distinction should be made. It is presumed, that the best men will get the best appointments, and this will be a sufficient inducement to the selected candidates, to have the benefits of the superior education available in England. If, however, some encouragement is considered essential, then it may take the form of an addition of a certain percentage to the ordinary pay of the Statutory Civil Servant, as a sort of personal allowance.

21. If the opportunity of residence in England at a University for two years with a sufficient allowance were offered to nominees or selected candidates, is it likely, that it would be taken advantage of to any great extent?—The old prejudice against a journey to England is fast disappearing everywhere, and I am inclined to think, that the offer will be readily taken advantage of. This will specially be the case, as regards candidates selected at a competitive examination. Scions of high and rich families, who may be nominated, will not probably care to expatriate themselves from their home for the sake of securing superior education in England.

22. If the system of examination in England were revised with the result that Natives availed themselves of it in considerable numbers, would it still be necessary to retain the statutory system?—No. It would not then be necessary to retain the Statutory system.

III.—Competition in England for the Indian Civil Service.

23. Is competition of Natives in the examination in England favorably looked upon by large and important classes in India?—The people think it a hardship, that they should be required to go to England, merely for the purpose of taking their chance, at a most difficult examination, of admission to the Public Service of their own country.

24. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—If by "additional facilities" be meant facilities special to the Native candidates, which would give them an advantage over their English compeers, then my answer would be in the negative; but all artificial barriers against the path of Native candidates should be removed, so as to place them on a practical equality with the English candidates.

25. If so, what form or forms should such facilities take? What conditions, if any, should be attached to them?—The revival of the State scholarships, established during Lord Lawrence's Viceroyalty, would go a great way to help Native candidates to get over the initial difficulty of finding the cost of journey to, and residence in, England. There were nine scholarships, three of which were open to public competition, and the other six were filled up by nomination. The conditions attached to the scholarships may be as follows:—

(*a*) That the age of the scholarship-holder should be such, as would enable him to appear at least once at the examination, after a year and a half's study in England;

(*b*) that he should be physically fit to undertake a journey to, and residence in, England, and to enter the Government service in case of his success at the examination;

(*c*) the scholarship would be held subject to good conduct and fair progress in studies. Any student, wilfully neglecting his studies, would be liable to forfeit the scholarship. Instead of three, six may be thrown open to public competition. They should be distributed amongst the several provinces, no one province being allowed to monopolise the whole.

26. What is your opinion as to giving Statutory appointments to Natives who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition?—I do not see any reason, why unsuccessful candidates at the English competition should be appointed to the Statutory Service. They would be looked down upon. They may, however, be allowed to compete for the Statutory Service, without being subjected to any preliminary test, such as may be considered necessary to impose in the case of other candidates.

27. Can you say what number of Natives belonging to your province have presented themselves annually at the competitive examination in England, and what degree of success they attained?—None from the Central Provinces.

28. What class or classes of Natives in your province readily go to England?—Only two Natives from this province have gone to England for education, as far as I am aware. They belong to high caste Naidu family of Nagpur.

29. Should the examination for Natives England be distinct in standards and conditions from that for English candidates, or should there be one and the same examination for all?—The Native candidates should be subjected to the self-same tests and conditions, as the English candidates.

30. Assuming only one examination

Babu *Bippin Krishna Bose.*

in England for both English and Native candidates do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination and the conditions as to age and other matters in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates? If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage?—The following circumstances place the Natives at a disadvantage:—

(*a*) The reduction of the limit of age to nineteen years. This necessitates their being sent to a foreign country at an immature age, and at a time of life, when very few parents would venture to trust them to live alone in the midst of strangers.

(*b*) Assigning higher marks to subjects, which Indian candidates are not likely to take up, or excel in. I would propose the following alterations:—

(1) The limit of age should be raised to twenty-two or twenty-three years.

(2) Indian classics should be on a par with Latin. The maximum number of marks for English Composition, History and Literature should be the same, as that assigned to French and German.

English is as much a foreign language to an Indian, as French and German are to an Englishman. Further undue importance is given to the European languages, as compared with such important subjects as Logic, Political Economy, Electricity and Magnetism, Heat and Light and Astronomy. This inequality should also be removed.

31. If there should be only one examination for all candidates, should the limits of age for Natives be higher than those at present fixed for European candidates; and, if so, what should the limits for Native candidates be?—The limits should be the same for all candidates of whatever nationality.

32. If higher limits of age were fixed for Native than for European candidates, might not the latter complain that they were placed at a disadvantage?—Yes, certainly.

33. What is the average age at which Natives at the Indian Universities pass the examinations for F. A., B. A. and M. A. respectively?—Twenty, twenty-two and twenty-four respectively.

34. From what classes of Native society are the persons who graduate at the Indian Universities usually drawn in your province?—Middle class.

IV.—Competition in India for the Indian Civil Service.

35. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question papers being used at both examinations?—I would strongly advocate a simultaneous identical examination in India and England. Arrangements could easily be made to send to India the examination papers, and, as to the *viva voce* examination, the same questions could be asked here by examiners, specially appointed for the purpose.

36. How would this method of selection be regarded by the Native community generally?—This system would be preferred to all others by the majority of the people.

37. If you advocate such a system, would you restrict the competition in India to Natives and that in England to English candidates, or would you admit both classes freely to either examination?—Both classes should be freely admitted to either examination.

38. Do you consider that the educational institutions available in India are at present capable of giving the very high class education, which it was the object of the competitive system, as introduced in 1855, to secure?—As far as my knowledge goes, the candidates, now generally go through a course of special training at such institutions as Wren and Gurney's. There is no such institution now in India; but, if the limit of age be raised, the Native candidates will not find much difficulty in preparing themselves for the examination.

39. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native community over others? Would it be likely to lead to the undue preponderance of any one class or caste in the Public Service?—The classes of people, who have made the most progress in education, (Bengalees, Parsis, Mahratha, Brahmins, &c.), will no doubt have the advantage over their less advanced fellow-countrymen. To provide against an undue preponderance of any one class, I would advocate the adoption of the system, detailed in my answer to question, No 14. Except that, in view of the unequal progress in education made by the people of the several provinces, an undue proportion, of the appointments may come to be secured by the people of the advanced provinces, I cannot conceive of any other objection. This, however, can be provided against by fixing the maximum number of appointments to be competed for by the people of the several provinces, as already explained in answer to question No. 14.

40. Would the introduction of an open competitive examination in India

have the effect of deterring cadets of leading families from aspiring to enter the ranks of the Civil Service?—Unfortunately in India our nobility do not think it a part of their duty to educate their sons, in a manner befitting their rank and position, and competition would have a deterrent effect on them.

41. Under such a system how would it be possible to provide against the Natives of a province in which education is comparatively backward being excluded from appointments in their own province?—The rule, that the members of the Civil Service should have a high degree of culture, ought not to be relaxed in any way, to suit the backward educational state of the people of any particular province. Until they qualify themselves, the appointments should continue to be held, as now, by Europeans.

42. Would a system of provincial examinations be preferable to one examination for the whole of India?—There should be one examination for the whole of India. Provincial examination would give inferior men.

43. Under a system of open competition in India would the successful candidates be regarded as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the service through the channel of the open competition in England?—Seeing that they will pass the same test, I do not see any reason, why they should be looked upon, as occupying an inferior position.

44. If an open competition were established in India, what should be the preliminary qualifications required on the part of candidates in regard to age? In regard to minimum educational attainments? In regard to moral, social and physical fitness? In other respects if any?—The preliminary qualifications should be the same for all candidates, Indian and English. The limit of age should be twenty-two or twenty-three.

45. Should the subjects and conditions of the examination be the same as those prescribed for the competitive examination in England, or should they be different?—They should be identical

46. If different, what should they be?—The ordinary pay of the appointments should be fixed at the same amount for all incumbents, Indians and Europeans. The latter, however, should be given an extra amount, as a sort of personal allowance, for serving in a foreign country.

47. Should successful candidates go through a period of special study in India like the English candidates who spend two years in special preparation, or would it be preferable, (*a*) to require them to go to England, or (*b*) to give them the option of going to England, suitable allowances being given to enable them to prosecute their studies there?—The selected candidates should be required to go through a course of special training in England, along with the English candidates.

48. Should successful candidates at the Indian competition be required to pass through a probationary period before final appointment?—After two years' special training in England, there should be no further probationary period. They, (Indian candidates), should be on the same footing, on arrival in India, as the candidates selected at the English competition.

V.—Promotion from the Uncovenanted Service.

49. What special provision, if any, do you think should be made for the appointments to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service?—Under the powers, conferred by the Statute of 1870, the Government can promote an Uncovenanted officer of proved merit and ability to the Covenanted Service, and the Statute should be retained and utilised for this purpose.

50. If such appointments are made, should they be restricted to the holders of any particular classes of appointments in the Uncovenanted Service; and, if so, what classes?—Executive officers of the Subordinate Service should be promoted to executive posts, and judicial officers, to judicial posts, and so on.

51. Should persons so appointed be appointed provisionally and be required to pass through a period of probation before final confirmation?—There should be a period fixed during which the person appointed would be under probation. If he gives satisfaction, he should then be confirmed; otherwise he should revert to his own substantive appointment in the Uncovenanted Service.

52. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, to be open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, who possess the qualifications that may be from time to time prescribed? If the Uncovenanted Service is closed to any natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, on what grounds, bearing in mind the terms of Acts of Parliament and Her Majesty's Proclamation of 1st November, 1858, is this to be justified? If not, on what grounds do you consider it insufficient, and what rates of pay should, in your opinion, be granted to Statutory Civilians (*a*) while on probation, and (*b*) on final confirmation in their appointments?—If the Uncovenanted Service in all its branches be thrown open to public competition, I do not think, that any particular class of Her Majesty's subjects should be excluded from such competition. The Native community will have no objection to the adoption, in a fair and ungrudging spirit, of the principle, laid down in Her Majesty's Proclamation,

that all her subjects, of whatever race or creed, shall be freely and impartially admitted to all offices in Her service, the duties of which, they may be qualified, by their education, ability and integrity, duly to discharge. But if the system of open competition is not to be adopted, then the present restrictions as to appointment of Europeans ought to stand.

Under existing circumstances their exclusion would be justifiable on the following, among other, grounds :—

(*a*) For the pay attached to the subordinate appointments, comparatively better men could be had from amongst the children of the soil. Speaking generally, equally qualified Europeans cannot be had for the same pay.

(*b*) The duties of the posts require a thorough knowledge of the vernaculars of the country and a familiar acquaintance with the manners and customs of the people, such as very few Europeans can lay claim to.

(*c*) The highly-paid appointments generally, and many subordinate appointments in certain departments, are practically reserved for Europeans; and as sort of compensation for this exclusion the people of the country have a right to claim, that the class of appointments, now held by them, should continue to be theirs. But, as I say, the demand for this exclusion would cease, as soon as all appointments, except those, which may from high administrative and political reasons be considered necessary to reserve for Europeans, are thrown open to public competition by all classes of Her Majesty's subjects.

VI.—Pay, Leave and Pension for Natives of India appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the channel of competition in England.

53. Is the rate* of pay at present granted to Statutory Civilians during probation and on final appointment respectively sufficient?—The pay on final appointment should not be less than Rs. 300, which is Rs. 50 more than the pay of an Extra Assistant Commissioner in the Central Provinces. Beyond this, the pay should be two-thirds the present pay of European incumbents.

*Two hundred rupees a month on first appointment as probationers. Two hundred and fifty rupees a month after passing the departmental examination by the lower standard. After passing the departmental examination by the higher standard (unless specially exempted), and after having been confirmed in their appointments, 64 per cent. of what would be the gross pay or salary of the office if it were held by a Covenanted Civil Servant appointed after competitive examination in England.

54. Would these rates of pay be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the Uncovenanted Service?—In some cases not; where the pay of the Uncovenanted officer, when appointed to a Covenanted post is more than two-thirds of the pay of such post, he should continue to draw his own pay. Beyond that, the two-thirds' rule should apply.

55. Do you consider, that a difference should be maintained between the rates of pay granted to Covenanted Civilians, who enter through the competitive channel in England, and to persons, holding Covenanted posts, who do not enter through that channel?—Yes.

56. If so, what would you consider the fair rate of reduction to be made in the case of persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through the competitive channel in England?—The present rate of two-thirds is not inadequate.

57. Would you approve of an arrangement by which the pay of appointments would be a fixed sum to be drawn by the holder, whether he is a Covenanted or a Statutory Civilian, with an additional staff allowance to be drawn by those only who enter the service through the examination in England?—Yes, it would be a good plan to adopt. If the distinction, as to pay, be made to depend on race or color, it might look invidious. This might be obviated, by fixing the permanent salaries at the same amount, and allowing to Europeans an extra allowance under some neutral denomination.

VII.—General.

58. How far would any system of appointment which involves a journey to, and residence in, England be regarded by the Native community as open to objection on the ground that it requires Hindu candidates to abandon their caste as a condition of entering the Civil Service?—The prejudice against a residence in England is every day losing its force; and, looking to the many-sided advantages, which Native youths would derive from education in England, I do not think, that any such objection, as is contemplated in this question, would be put forward by any large section of the Native community.

59. How far would such a system be regarded as open to objection on the ground that it restricts the field of selection to those candidates who are wealthy enough to undertake the cost of a journey to, and residence in, England?—If the

examination were to be held in England only, as at present, then, certainly, the field of selection would be very much narrowed, for the reason set forth in the question. Even those, who can afford the expense, hesitate to send their sons or wards to England in order to be examined at a most difficult examination with a total uncertainty of being selected.

60. Does a voyage to, or residence in, England involve the loss of social position or other unfavorable consequences in the case of any section of the Native community?—I do not think it does now, except, perhaps, in the view of the most orthodox, whose number and influence are fast decreasing.

61. Does it result in placing those Natives who undertake it more or less out of touch and sympathy with their fellow-countrymen on their return to India?—Not necessarily. It depends on the England-returned Native himself. If he elects to live a life of isolation from his countrymen, he of course loses touch with them. The majority of those, who have been to England, have not lost their social position amongst their countrymen.

62. Should provision be made for the occasional appointment in very special and exceptional cases to Covenanted posts of persons of known ability and local influence whom, although they may never have held office and may not possess special professional qualifications, and although their age may exceed the limit laid down for untried candidates, it might nevertheless be considered desirable to appoint to the higher grades for political or other reasons?—There could be no reasonable objection to such a provision being made.

63. Would it be desirable to rule, that the proportion of persons, being Mahomedans and Hindus respectively, who are from time to time or over a series of years appointed to the Covenanted ranks in any province, should bear a certain relation to the number of the two classes composing the population of the province concerned?—The service should be provincial, and should not depend on caste or creed. To regulate the appointments, according to caste or creed, would lead to endless complications, seeing what a large number of creeds and castes there is in India.

64. How far should appointments in each province to Covenanted posts be restricted to Natives of the province concerned?—Should be entirely restricted, "Natives of a province" being interpreted to mean all permanent residents.

65. Should subjects of Native States be eligible for appointment to Covenanted posts in British India?—There is no reason, why they should be eligible, seeing that the British subjects do not possess correlative rights in the Native States.

VIII.—Composition, Recruitment, &c., of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services.

66. How is the present system of regulating appointments to the Subordinate* Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services respectively regarded by influential sections of the Native community?—The Subordinate Services, referred to in this, are, so far as this province is concerned, recruited from amongst the class of Clerks of Court, Sheristadars and other Amlahs. I believe, there is a growing desire, that the recruitment should be by open competition.

67. Generally what system do you advocate for filling appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services as above defined?—The recruitment should be by open competition. There should be provincial examinations, in which all permanent residents should be allowed to compete. The test should vary according to the nature of the appointments.

68. What preliminary qualifications would you require on the part of candidates for those appointments in regard to age and in other respects?—Those, who are already in Government employ, should be allowed to compete, provided their age does not exceed thirty-five years. As regards others, they should be above eighteen and below twenty-five.

69. Do you advocate the requirement of a probationary period; and, if so, what should be the incidents of such period, as to duration, pay, and in other respects?—Generally selected candidates should pass through a probationary period of one year. During their probation, the pay should be somewhat less than the full pay of the appointment. It may be less by a fourth or fifth. The local Government should, however, have power to dispense with the probationary period in special cases. It is difficult to lay down any specific rule. The matter must be left to the discretion of the local Government.

70. If an open competitive examination were held in India for the Covenanted posts reserved for Natives, would persons who gained high marks in that examination and showed decided proficiency, but who failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, form suitable nominees for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments in the Uncovenanted Service?—Rejected candidates in one examination should not be allowed to override the rights of successful candidates in another examination. It will be open to such rejected candidates to compete like others.

* NOTE.—For the purposes of these questions the terms "Subordinate Executive Service" and "Subordinate Judicial Service" may be held to include respectively all Subordinate Executive and Judicial offices down to and including the office of Tahsildar or Munsif, or other office corresponding to that of Tahsildar or Munsif, which are not reserved for, or not ordinarily held by, members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

No. XIII.

BABU S. RAMCHANDRA PATVARDHAN, EDITOR, *Nyaya Sudha* NEWSPAPER, HARDA, CENTRAL PROVINCES.

Vol. III. Sec. III. Sub-Sec. B.

S. *Ramchandra Patvardhan.*

I HAVE been in these provinces since 1862, or nearly twenty-five years. I held Government service for about four years, and have been practising as Pleader in the Courts of the Central Provinces for nearly twenty years. I have had constant opportunities of coming in contact with the officers of Government, European and Native, and with the general public. I am also Proprietor of two villages in the Nagpur District, and have been the Proprietor and Editor of a local Anglo-Vernacular newspaper called the "Nyaya Sudha." I have thus had ample opportunities of forming an opinion, regarding the question of Public Service generally.

I.—Working of the existing Statutory System.

1. What is the prevalent feeling in your province regarding the existing Statutory system? If the feeling is one of dissatisfaction, is the dissatisfaction general or is it confined to certain sections of the community? What are the grounds upon which any such feeling is based?—The prevalent feeling of those, who have thought on the subject is one of dissatisfaction. The ground on which the feeling of dissatisfaction is based, is, that the system empowers local Governments or administrations to select and nominate persons to take office, without reference to their qualifications, intellectual, moral and educational. This leaves a door open for the admission of not properly qualified persons into the service. The Patronage system commends itself to no one, as it has the tendency to impair the efficiency and respectability of the service.

2. Is the feeling of dissatisfaction, if it exists, directed against the Statute itself (33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6), or is it directed against the rules framed thereunder? If the Statute itself is objected to, is it because its provisions admit persons to specific appointments only and not to membership in an organised "service"? Are the objections based on other, and if so what, grounds?—The Statute itself is objected to, as it makes no provision for an organised service, and as it is not confined solely to the children of the soil. It also contains no provision and gives no facilities for their employment in all other departments under Government.

3. Are Statutory Civilians regarded by the general public as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel? If such a feeling exists, on what grounds is it based? Do the general public view with any difference the status of Statutory Civilians and that of Uncovenanted officers? If so, on what grounds?—The position assigned by the public to the present Statutory Civilians is between the Covenanted Civilians and the Uncovenanted officers, owing to their inferior qualifications, and on account of their lower pay.

II.—Mode of Selection of Statutory Civilians.

4. On the assumption that the Statutory system is retained, how would appointment to the Statutory Service by nomination be regarded by influential sections of the Native community in your province? How would a system of nomination to be followed by a period of probation be regarded by the same classes? Would a system of nomination, with or without probation, be likely to secure well-qualified persons? Has experience actually shown such a system to secure well-qualified officers? Do you consider that nominations should be confined to persons of proved merit and ability? If so, how do you consider that merit and ability should be held to have been proved for this purpose?—I am of opinion, that the system of appointment to the Statutory Civil Service by nomination will not be favorably regarded by any section of the Native community. Competitive examination under conditions, calculated to secure persons possessing the best intellectual, moral and physical qualifications, is the only remedy, which will remove all difficulties with which the question is beset. I feel confident, that this remedy will meet with general approval.

5. If competition, (whether limited or open), is preferred, should there be one competition for all India or separate competitions in each province?—In order to guard the interests of the people of each province open competition should, so far as the Statutory and other minor services are concerned, be confined to the domiciled Natives of the province as a prohibitive measure.

6. If so, what should be the tests under each of the heads specified? Do you consider that, (after selection, whether by nomination

or competition), there should be a period of probation?—I hold, that there should be no restriction with regard to age; but all candidates for the Statutory competitive examination should, at least, be under-graduates of any of the Universities, members of the legal profession or persons of proved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service. Their position, as such, would, I consider, be a sufficient test for their intellectual capacity and their social and moral fitness.

7. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period? Should the period of probation be passed in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service, or of the Covenanted Service, or in what other manner? Do you consider that after selection and before entering on probation (or on duty) the person selected should undergo special training? If so, should the special training be carried out in India or in England? If in India, would it be possible and, if possible, advisable, to establish an Indian Civil Service College on the basis of the Haileybury College which formerly existed in England? If you do not consider special training in England essential, would you encourage nominees or selected candidates to visit England with a view to add to their qualifications for the service? If so, what form should such encouragement take? Should it be offered before, or during, or after, the probationary period, if any, through which nominees or selected candidates may be required to pass? Should it be offered before or after the nominees or selected candidates enter on their duties?—When the above mentioned qualifications are made obligatory, I would not make residence in England compulsory. I would, however, suggest that persons, declared otherwise eligible, should undergo a special departmental training, before they take up their duties. It would, indeed, be a great boon to the people of this country, if an Indian Civil Service College for preparing candidates for the Covenanted, as well as the Statutory Civil Service, be established by Government. I consider, that residence of Native candidates in England, after examination, would be advantageous to them. To encourage this, I would suggest the payment of a stipend, in addition to a free passage to England and back.

III.—Competition in England for the Indian Civil Service.

8. Is competition of Natives in the examination in England favorably looked upon by large and important classes in India?—The existing system of competition in England for the Indian Civil Service is viewed in India as unfair to the Natives. It is necessary to afford facilities to such of the Natives, who may be desirous of prosecuting their studies in England for the ultimate object of entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition, but who may not possess adequate means to do so by means of scholarships.

9. Should the examination for Natives in England be distinct in standards and conditions from that for English candidates, or should there be one and the same examination for all?—There should be no distinction, in my opinion, in standards in examination for Natives in England from that of the European candidates. In fact there should be the same examination for all candidates. I would, however, suggest a modification in the subjects, under the existing system, so as to suit the requirements of the Indian Civil Service.

10. Assuming only one examination in England for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination and the conditions as to age and other matters in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates?—It is my firm conviction, that the subjects, at present prescribed, the limit of age to nineteen years, and the residence in a foreign country place Native candidates at a great disadvantage, as compared with English candidates.

11. If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage?—To pass an examination, like the Civil Service, in a foreign language, before the completion of nineteen years is, to say the least, extremely difficult for Natives of ordinary ability. I, therefore, recommend the raising of age to twenty-three years, and the introduction of the history languages and laws of India in the place of the European languages. I also recommend simultaneous competition in India and England on the same standard and open to all classes, to be held at one or more centres in India. I am of opinion, that the candidates, passing the examination in India should be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training.

I hold a distinct opinion in connection with, what is termed the Uncovenanted or Subordinate Executive Service. At present there is no fixed principle, to guide the filling up of appointments in this service. It gives greatest latitude to patronage, and on that account alone, if on no other account, requires to be reformed by the introduction of a certain fixed system. It is this service, to which a very large number of the poorer people look for support. The reform to be introduced must be such, as to prevent the admission of incompetent and unworthy persons in it, through the favor and influence of their relations and friends

Vol. III.
Sec. III.
Sub-Sec. B.

Babu
S. *Ramchandra Patvardhan.*

in and out of office. This service should be left open to all persons, who have made India their home, without distinction of caste, creed or color. The candidates should be subjected to a competition, pure and simple. The examinations must, of course, vary, according to the nature of work in different classes of offices or departments. These examinations should be confined to each presidency or province.

PROCEEDINGS

OF THE

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

VOLUME III.—PROCEEDINGS RELATING TO THE CENTRAL PROVINCES.

(Including the Hyderabad Assigned Districts.)

SECTION III.—SUB-SECTION *C.—Selected Replies.*

CONTENTS.

I—F. W. DILLON, ESQ., *Barrister-at-Law, Nagpur, Central Provinces.*

PROCEEDINGS

OF THE

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

VOLUME III.—PROCEEDINGS RELATING TO THE CENTRAL PROVINCES.
(Including the Hyderabad Assigned Districts.)

SECTION III.—SUB-SECTION C.—*Selected Replies.*

No. I.

F. W. DILLON, ESQ., BARRISTER-AT-LAW, NAGPUR, CENTRAL PROVINCES.

Personal Statement.

Vol. III. Sec. III. Sub-Sec. C.

F. W. Dillon, Esq.

MY name is Frederick William Dillon. I am twenty-six years of age. I am a domiciled European, and was educated at the High School (Allahabad), Bishop Cotton's School (Simla), and, after I had passed the entrance examination of the Calcutta University, which I did in 1877, at the Muir Central College (Allahabad). In September, 1879, I was sent to England, and became a member of the Inner Temple, where I was called to the Bar in June, 1882. I then returned to India, and came to Nagpur at the end of July of the same year. Here I have practised as an Advocate ever since, except for one break of three months in 1883, when I returned to Europe. I may add that my father's name was Luke Dillon, and that he was a Pleader of the High Court of Judicature for the North-Western Provinces.

I.—Statutory Civil Service.

1. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—The Statutory Civil Service is disapproved here. I found this assertion, upon the result of conversations, which I have heard on the subject, with some of the leading Native members of the Nagpur Bar, among whom, I may name, Mr. Balwant Rao Govind, Mr. Gopal Hari and Mr. Preonath Dutt, Pleaders; upon the opinion expressed by several members of the Nagpur branch, (of which I am Chairman), of the Eurasian and Anglo-Indian Association of Western India; and upon the view entertained of the service by the general public, both official and non-official, European and Native, so far as I am in a position to ascertain it.

2. If it is not, what are the grounds of disapprobation?—The service is disapproved, because of the system of nomination by which it is recruited. It is felt, that the selection of nominees by the heads of local administrations is not a proper guarantee of their fitness for the service, and this feeling is, I consider, justified by the results of the system. In these provinces, two gentlemen have been appointed to the service, for no better reason, that I am able to see, than that one of them belongs to an old Mahomedan family, while the other is now the head of a large banking business, established by his late father, who, I understand, once held an appointment of some trust in the old Maharatta administration of the country. Neither of these gentlemen, in my opinion, possesses abilities of an exceptional nature. I have had a number of their judgments brought to me for purposes of appeal, and it appeared to me, at the time that these judgments differed in no degree, either, as regards their substance or form, from those of most of the Extra Assistant Commissioners of these provinces, whilst they were distinctly inferior, to what I should expect from such members of our Subordinate Judicial Service, as Mr. Bireswar Dutt, Mr. Anderson, Mr. Krishn Rao, Mr. Kashinath Thakur and others.

The system has also the disadvantage of encouraging toadyism on the part of the Natives of this country, towards those in authority, and of repressing a proper feeling of self-respect and manly independence. My opinion is, that no system, based on arbitrary selection by local administrations, can succeed. The power of selection is liable to be abused, and, where this is not the case, administrative heads are most likely, in the absence of other guides, to be influenced by considerations of social position, &c., to which men of great merit can very often lay no claim.

In conclusion I would remark, that the domiciled European and Eurasian community, a fraction of which, I now represent, has special reason to be dissatisfied with the service, as at present constituted, seeing

that, although it has many able men in its ranks, not a single nomination to the service has as yet been made from among its members.

3. Are the defects of the existing system (if any) susceptible of remedy—

(*a*) by an amendment of the rules;

(*b*) by an amendment of the Statutory provisions in that behalf;

or should those provisions be repealed? If the provisions of the Statute 33 Vic., Section 6, are not repealed nor substantially amended so as to take away the power conferred on the local administrations, should they be amended in respect of the description of persons on whose behalf such powers may be exercised or in respect of the sanction required for appointments made thereunder?—In reply to these questions, I have to say, that, if I were at all confident, that the domiciled European and Eurasian community would be treated with a greater degree of fairness in the future, than it has received in the past, I should recommend, that the rules be so amended, as to reserve all appointments to this service for members of the Uncovenanted Service, whose merits and abilities might entitle them to such promotion. Having little confidence, however, in the strict impartiality of selections made by local Governments, I would urge, in the interests of my community, that the provisions of the Statute be altogether repealed, and that, as a set off, the people of this country be afforded greater facilities, than they at present enjoy, for entering the Covenanted Civil Service. This portion of the subject, however, more properly belongs to my answers to questions under head II.

4. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so?—Should the Statutory Civil Service be retained, I think, that the selected candidates ought to be required to proceed to England for purposes of training. The propriety of this, both on political, as well as educational, grounds, seems to me to be obvious.

II.—Covenanted Civil Service.

5. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—My belief is, that dissatisfaction is generally felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service.

6. Should any, and if any what, change be made in that system? Do Natives of India labor under any, and if any what, disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the service? By what changes may those disadvantages be minimised or removed, *e. g.*:—

(*a*) By the establishment of scholarships and allowance of passage money to Native candidates;

(*b*) by altering the limit of age;

(*c*) by adding to the subjects of examination, or by altering the maximum marks obtainable in certain subjects;

(*d*) by holding simultaneously examinations in England and in India?—For one thing, the limit of age ought, I think, to be raised to twenty-one years. The present system, in addition to giving boys, trained in England, an advantage at the examinations over Indian youths, is not one, in my opinion, that can be recommended on any grounds. First and foremost, there is the objection, on physiological grounds, to boys being put through the severe course of "cramming" for the examination, which, it is a notorious fact, all of the candidates have, more or less, to undergo. Again, boys now come out to India in the Civil Service with no experience of life, with crude ideas generally of their position in this country and an inability to adapt themselves readily to their surroundings, being utterly ignorant of the people among whom they are placed, their habits, wants, modes of thought, &c. The process of "cramming" is repeated here, and, in a few months, they are invested with responsible powers as civil judges and as magistrates. The result of this state of things, so far as I am able to judge, is generally unsatisfactory. There is also another grave consideration, *viz.*, that the Natives have, (rightly or wrongly), little or no confidence in boy magistrates and boy judges.

I think also, that examinations for the Covenanted Civil Service ought to be held simultaneously in England and in India. *Primâ facie* it is an injustice, that the competition for appointments to the most important and dignified of the public services of this country should be held in England; I mean, of course, with reference to the comparatively advanced stage, which education has now reached in India. At the same time, I consider it to be expedient, on political grounds, that a certain proportion of the service should be recruited from among Europeans exclusively, and on these grounds, I would suggest, in answer to question 5, that a certain number of appointments be apportioned for competition to the candidates, at the examinations held in England and in India respectively.

7. If an examination is held in India—

(1) Should it be identical with that held in England?

(2) Should it be held at one or more centres in India?

Should the candidates in England and in India compete with one another and be selected in order of merit, or should a certain number of appointments be

Vol. III. Sec. III. Sub-Sec. C.

F. W. *Dillon*, Esq.

apportioned for competition to the candidates at the respective examinations?

(3) If such an apportionment is made, on what principle is it to be regulated?

(4) Should there be an apportionment between the residents in the territories of the several administrations respectively or between the members of the principal religious sects?—I do not think, that the Indian examination ought to be in any way identical with that held in England, or that the two sets of candidates should compete together. Should the system suggested be adopted, I think that examinations held simultaneously at provincial centres would meet with most favor, Natives of any particular province being given a decided preference over outsiders to all appointments in such province. If, on the other hand, the competition were to be an open one, in the widest sense of the term, the inevitable result would be, that the Bengalees would overrun the service or would unduly preponderate therein, which state of things, it is the general opinion here, would prove a national calamity. I do not think, however, that the principle, above expressed, ought to be pushed to the extent of making the apportionment one among the different races and sects of India. It ought, as above urged, to be strictly a territorial one.

I may add, that the change in the place of examination ought to be accompanied by a modification to some extent of the subjects for examination. Among these I would recommend the following:—

(*a*) English Literature;

(*b*) Foreign Languages. For domiciled Europeans and Eurasians—Latin, together with a colloquial acquaintance with either Urdu or Hindi: for Mahomedans—Urdu or Persian, together with a colloquial acquaintance with Hindi: for Hindus—Sanskrit or one of the Hindi languages, and a colloquial acquaintance with Urdu;

(*c*) The Histories of India and of England, together with some acquaintance with Modern History generally;

(*d*) Mathematics, pure and mixed;

(*e*) The elements of Political Economy;

(*f*) The elements of Logic;

(*g*) One or more of the Physical Sciences.

I would further add, that the possession of a University degree should not be made a necessary qualification for admission to these competitions. Any such condition, as this, would practically bar the service to the domiciled European and Eurasian community. The cost of living is much greater to members of this community, than it is to pure Asiatics, owing to their habits and wants being nearly identical with those of members of the strictly European community, and this fact makes it impossible for parents, residing in the mofussil to afford their sons an University education. In my opinion the competitive examination ought of itself to be a quite sufficient test of the respective merits of the candidates, and I see no reason, why another, (and unnecessary), test should be imposed, which finds no place at present in the scheme of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service.

8. If an examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—I am of opinion, on political, as well as educational, grounds, that successful candidates at the Indian competition ought to be required to proceed to England to complete their training; but I think that the State ought to furnish the whole, or at any rate the greater part, of the funds for this portion of the scheme. To make candidates bear the expense, would be virtually to impose a "property" qualification, which would be neither just, (to the community at large), nor popular; and I would rather that this portion of the scheme were altogether abandoned, than that it should be the means of giving the moneyed classes an advantage over all others. It may be said, on the other side, that these are practically the conditions on which the service is now recruited in England, since a boy must have a good education, (which costs money), to enable him to successfully compete under the present system. I do not think, however, that the cases are at all parallel, since there is nothing to prevent a clever boy, who has received his education, free of cost at an English Grammar School, from entering himself for the examination and passing it successfully. To find a really parallel case, we must imagine young men from England, coming all the way to Bombay or Calcutta, to obtain appointments in the English Civil Service.

9. Are the young Natives obtained under the existing system of the open competition in England the best as regards character and capacity who could be obtained under any system?—The answer to this question must depend upon theoretical considerations entirely. I should think, that quite as good men, and in some cases, perhaps, even better, could be obtained at a competition held in India.

III.—Uncovenanted Service.

10. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—From Natives of India only, as defined by the Statute, which,

however, I would amend, by expunging the words "born and" before "domiciled."

11. Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or by both systems combined; and if by both combined, should one system be applied to all offices or classes of offices, or should the system be varied with the class of offices?—The recruitment ought strictly to be by competition, but promotion, thereafter, should depend, as now, upon merit and seniority.

12. Whatever system be adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several administrations only from persons resident in the territories under such administrations respectively or with a preference for such residents?—With a decided preference for such residents, which, I understand, is at present the rule in these provinces.

13. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—I think they might; but it ought to be impressed upon local Governments, that domiciled Europeans and Eurasians are as much Natives of India, as pure Asiatics are, and that no preference over them ought to be given to the latter.

IV.—Pay and Furlough Rules.

14. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service according as the posts are held by members of that branch of the service or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches? If such distinction should be made, on what principle should it be regulated?—I am of opinion, that, in the circumstances stated, members of the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches ought to receive, say, four-fifths of the salaries, allowed to members of the Covenanted Civil Service. The former are recruited mainly from Statutory Natives of India, and the last named, almost entirely from Europeans, to whom the cost of living in this country must be greater, than it is for members of the other class. This difference cannot, of course, be justified on economic grounds, but it finds ample justification, I consider, on grounds of political expediency.

15. Should any distinction be made in the furlough rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches of the service according to the nationality of the officer, or on any other, and what, ground?—The opinion here, so far as I am able to ascertain it, of persons in Government service, is, that no such distinction ought to be made.

16. Are the privileges in regard to pay, promotion and retiring annuity and the general conditions of office belonging to the Covenanted Civil Service suitable to Natives obtaining office under the Statutory rules?—I do not feel myself competent to answer this question, and I can obtain no clear information on the subject from others.

I would wish, before closing, to say something on the subject, of what I consider to be the special claims, which the domiciled European and Eurasian community have, on the consideration of Government, in the event of the present state of things not being substantially altered, as a result of this enquiry. It is a fact, that this community consists mainly of the descendants of the men, who helped to conquer the country. These persons, as soldiers or otherwise, were granted small pensions on retiring from the service, upon which they were obliged to maintain, and educate very often large families, and this I consider to be the cause mainly, why the greater portion of the community is at this day steeped in poverty. A very different system prevailed with the Mahomedan conquerors of the country, and, in earlier times, with the Hindus, as they wrested it by degrees from the possession of its aboriginal inhabitants. In both these cases, grants of land, accompanied by proportionate shares in prize-money, were awarded to all, who had materially advanced the work of conquest, and in a large number of cases, the descendants of these persons owe their present prosperity to these causes, as witness the case of the Zemindars of Bengal, the Talukdars of Oudh, &c., &c., not to speak of the Rajahs, Nawabs, &c., who got their titles and their appanages under the same circumstances. On these grounds alone, *viz.*, that the members of this community are, in most cases, the lineal representatives of the men, who fought and bled in the conquest of the country, and that for the extraordinary services, then performed by them, they were very insufficiently requited, I think, that this community has, and must always have, a claim of an exceptional nature upon any Government of this country, which is British. The community, it ought at all times to be remembered, owes its existence at this day to past political and social considerations, which were not of its own creating. Its members are as much Natives of the soil, as the Mahomedan and Hindu descendants of earlier races of conquerors; and its present position is mainly due, not to a want of intellect and energy among its members, but, as I have already shown, to the considerate and generous treatment on the part of the Natives of this country by their European conquerors.

Another reason, in my opinion, for the present deplorable condition of the community is the tendency of late years, (a tendency which I regret to say is becoming more and more marked among the official European community), to elevate the pure Asiatic at the expense of the domiciled European and Eurasian. It is not so long ago, for instance, that the Marquis of

Vol. III. Sec. III. Sub-Sec. C.

F W. *Dillon*, Esq.

Ripon, (before he resigned the Viceroyalty of India), cancelled the obnoxious Rurki Minute, which had worked so much injustice to these classes. I am not in a position at this moment to state what the precise terms and scope of this Minute were, but the undoubted and admitted object, it had in view, was the reservation of a large proportion of the appointments to the engineering branch of the Public Works Department for pure Asiatics only, quite irrespectively of the positions taken by them at the examinations.

I am able to recall an anecdote, which rightly illustrates the feeling among heads of departments in connection with the subject under reference. A friend of mine some years ago applied for an appointment in the Police Department, on the occasion of a vacancy occurring, to a gentleman who held high office therein. At a personal interview, which followed, his qualifications for the appointment were discussed and approved, and he was requested to call again on a subsequent date. He did so, and was then informed by the gentleman, whom he had previously seen, that no hope of the appointment for which he was a candidate could be held out to him. "Don a turban, call yourself Sayyid Somebody, marry half a dozen wives," was the half-humorous advice given him, "and I may yet be able to do something for you."

The cause of this state of things is not far to seek. The educated official European regards the Eurasian as a questionable—and at any rate as a poor—relation, whom it is not desirable to own in a country like India, where his position removes him to so great a degree from that of the masses. He is also disgusted, that the average Eurasian should possess less refinement, less education, less mental and moral tone than himself, and that he should be, physically, always more or less out at elbows; and he ascribes this, not to the force of circumstances, which are in most cases beyond the other's control, but to a base degeneration of the stock. This feeling extends itself to the *community at large*, which he begins, not always secretly, to despise. Nor does Government ever try to produce a re-action of the feeling, by conferring social distinction upon worthy members of the community by the award to them, for instance, of appropriate "honors." No member of this community, to my knowledge, has found his name given a place in any list of New Year or Birthday Honors, with the solitary exception of Mr. Hamnett of the Madras Presidency, upon whom, a year or two ago, was conferred the Companionship of the Order of the Indian Empire, as a reward for a lifetime of arduous and distinguished toil. The professional Native agitator is not slow, on his part, to mark and to take advantage of the feeling, above referred to. With that lofty disregard of facts, which is characteristic of him, he classes all members of this community in Government service as "Europeans," and he then proceeds to rail at the disproportion of appointments in the Public Service held by Europeans and Natives respectively. The result is, that the unfortunate Eurasian, (or "half-caste," as he is more generally called), stands between two powerful and opposing classes, and, that he is usually sacrificed by the one as a sop to the other. I affirm that he is generally treated, as though he had no right to exist in the land of his birth, in the country he calls home, and with whose interests his own are indissolubly associated. He is regarded as *filius nullius*, and the sense of this fills him with a sickening feeling of humiliation and despair, which is very often fatal to his career in life.

That members of this community are fitted for high and responsible posts in the administration of this country is amply evidenced by the fact, that the community has its representatives in the higher departments of all branches of the Public Service. This fact is not generally recognised, because many of these persons, (I regret to say), are ashamed to associate themselves with the community, (for a reason I have already indicated), which, as a consequence, loses the influence of the powerful support which they might otherwise have afforded it.

That the members of the community, generally, are not, (as has been alleged during the course of this enquiry), apathetic, wanting in ambition and regardless of the future of their children may be evidenced from facts within my personal knowledge. For instance, of my former school-fellows, (with the careers of a minority of whom only I am acquainted), several have been sent to England, and have acquired professions which they are now honorably exercising in this country. Messrs. H. Stanyon and H. Beddy have been called to the Bar, and are now in successful practice at Jubbulpore and Agra respectively; Mr. F. L. Beddy holds a commission in the 6th Dragoon Guards, and, although a young officer, has been appointed an Instructor of Army Signalling; Mr. F. Hall, who has only recently come out, holds the commission of a Surgeon in the Army; Mr. R. W. Burke, who passed all his examinations with great credit, holds a commission in the Army Veterinary Department; Mr. A. Price has taken degrees in medicine, and is in practice in England, which, I may mention, is also the position of a connection of mine, Mr. George Grant. Others, as Messrs. A. Bagley, Neal, Hodges, Dyer and several more, also went to England for professions, but with what result I am unable to say. On the other hand, of those, who remained in the country, some entered the Engineering College at Rurki and are now in the Public Works Department as, for instance,

Messrs. Bertie Bagley, Humfress and Slane; two, Messrs. E. Parsons and C. Hoskins, are District Superintendents of Police; others entered the Postal Department, of whom I have since met two, Mr. P. Gorman, who is a Superintendent of Post Offices, and Mr. G. Stanyon, who is an Examiner of Postal Accounts.

All of the gentlemen, above named, are members of the domiciled European and Eurasian community.

I may add, that members of this community have certain advantages, for the purposes of the Public Service, over both Europeans and pure Asiatics alike. They have the advantage over the former of being thoroughly conversant with the language, habits and modes of thought of the Natives, and over the latter, in the facts, that (*a*) they usually possess more force of character than the pure Asiatic does; (*b*) they are capable of greater feats of physical energy; and (*c*) they, (rightly or wrongly), inspire more confidence among the Natives, than pure Asiatics do in their integrity, &c., whether as Judges, Barristers, Pleaders or, indeed, (so far as I have observed), in any other profession or branch of the Public Service.

I may add, finally, that this class forms the bulk of our Volunteer forces in this country, and that the loyalty of its members, which is of an enthusiastic nature, has never been questioned.